

T  
805

IN-SERVICE TRAINING OF  
HIGHER CIVIL SERVANTS  
IN PAKISTAN

BY  
INAYAT ILAHI MALIK

A Thesis

Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements  
for the Degree of Master of Arts in  
the P.S.P.A. Department of the  
American University of Beirut  
Beirut, Lebanon

August, 1966

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The completion of present study has only been possible due to the unreserved cooperation, wise guidance and healthy criticism of my advisor, Professor Elie Salem. I am indeed immensely grateful and deeply indebted to him for his appreciative encouragement, at all stages of this work.

I am thankful to Prof. Adnan G. Iskandar, Chairman of the P.S.P.A. Department who always helped me in all my academic problems. I am also grateful to Prof. Ralph Crow and Prof. Iskandar Bashir for their advice and encouragement during my academic career at the American University of Beirut.

I owe a deep sense of gratitude to Mr. Inayatullah C.S.P., Secretary to the Government of West Pakistan, Services and General Administration who sponsored my study of the training institutes in Pakistan, which culminated in the presentation of this thesis. My specific thanks are due to Mr. Abdul Majid a former graduate of P.S.P.A. Department for reading the manuscript and giving some useful suggestions at places.

## A B S T R A C T

The purpose of the present thesis is to make a critical and analytical study of the existing arrangements for the in-service training of higher civil servants in Pakistan.

The first chapter presents, briefly, the general trends and concepts of training, in the contemporary literature on Public Administration, and the specific training needs of the developing countries.

In the second chapter origin and evolution of in-service training in the Indo-Pak subcontinent has been traced, in order to understand the training policies and practices of the government.

In the third and fourth chapters a critical and analytical study of the institutes catering for the initial and advanced training of higher civil servants has been made by examining their fundamental objectives, clientele, curricula, training methodology, staff and research activities.

In the fifth chapter an evaluation and assessment of the entire training programme for higher civil servants in Pakistan has been made and some weaknesses of the present arrangements for in-service training have been identified. The writer is of the view that the

present in-service training arrangements in Pakistan are inadequate and limited in scope; there is a lack of planning and coordination, dearth of professional literature, shortage of qualified instructional staff and improper evaluation system of the trainees. The chapter also indicates the possible directions which the institutes may take or the modifications needed to bring them in line with future needs of personnel developments.

The study is based on individual studies of the training institutes, government policies and personnel practices supplemented by information obtained from directors/principals of the institutes in Pakistan and existing studies and reports prepared by the foreign experts.

To collect and appraise facts regarding the training institutes a three-month trip to Pakistan was made by the writer, in the summer of 1965. In each institute one or more senior members of the instructional and research staff were contacted. On these occasions very helpful material of much significance was placed at the disposal of the writer. Thus a critical appraisal of the policies and practices of the institutes as they were actually working was made possible.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements .....	iii
ii. Abstract .....	iv
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
a. Concept of in-service training	
b. Training needs of developing countries	
II. The background of in-service training in Pakistan .....	8
III. Initial training of the civil servants .....	18
a. Civil service Academy	
b. Finance services academy	
c. Police training college	
d. Secretariat training institute	
IV. Advanced training of the civil servants .....	44
a. Rural development academy	
b. National institute of public administration	
c. Pakistan administrative staff college	
V. Evaluation and conclusion .....	82
Appendix I .....	99
Appendix II .....	102
Appendix III .....	103
Bibliography.....	104

## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTION

#### 1. The Concept of Training

The training of Government officials is important for effective administrative systems. The content and method of training varies in accordance with the socio-political conditions and the educational system obtaining in society. "In particular it varies with the way in which policies are made, the content and manner in which such policies are delegated, indeed, with the general character of political systems."<sup>1</sup>

In the past government was mainly a question of the maintenance of order and unity. In other words it was concerned more with the "behaviour" of the people than with their "welfare." As a consequence its functions were simple and limited. Today the idea of the 'welfare state' has given a multi-dimensional and complex character to the activities of governments.

The growing needs of modern societies, which the scientific and technological revolutions brought in their wake, have necessitated the development of specialised skills among public administrators to enable them to prove equal to the magnitude of their task.

---

<sup>1</sup> Fred W. Riggs, Administration in Developing Countries (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1964), p. 323.

After the second World War training assumed greater importance for practitioners and scholars of Public Administration alike. Traditional curricula of universities are no longer sufficient for the dynamic and varied responsibilities of modern government. Any successful administrative system is in need of training, "the process of aiding employees to gain effectiveness in their present or future work through the development of appropriate habits of thought and action, skills, knowledge and attitudes."<sup>1</sup>

Training, then, is the most effective tool for the rational implementation of politically determined policies of a modern state. The administrators belonging to the traditional school considered administration to be all practice, a trial and error method requiring personal hunch.<sup>2</sup> In many countries the civil service is still struggling to overcome the traditional belief of learning by doing.<sup>3</sup> This

---

<sup>1</sup> Milton Hall, Employee Training in the Public Service (Chicago: Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1941), p. 2.

<sup>2</sup> This attitude is illustrated by a quotation from the O & M Bulletin, a periodical devoted to organization and methods, and issued by Her Majesty's Stationary Office. Says the Bulletin: "One of the amusing differences between civil servants, or businessmen, in America and England lies in our respective attitudes towards administration, public and private. In America the subject is taught as a science; in England it is hardly taught at all and is regarded semi-humourously as an art, but as one scarcely to be discussed in good company.... if (our universities) teach the subject at all, (they) do so almost with a blush." Organization and Methods Bulletin (London: Her Majesty's Stationary Office, December, 1955), p. 22.

<sup>3</sup> A good study of the training of administrators in European countries will be found in Brian Chapman's, 'The Profession of Government'. (See next page)

has been reinforced by the nature of the discipline of public administration itself. As compared to other applied sciences like medicine and engineering public administration has very few generalizations to its credit and these too are extremely limited in their scope of application.

Sometimes it is argued that an executive recruited on merit basis and through competition is qualified enough to perform the functions for which he is recruited and therefore, training, in such cases, is a waste on the part of government. The advocates of this opinion perhaps do not recognise the fact that people are recruited to civil services "for broad categories of jobs, not for each specific job, and therefore, require orientation in the work of a particular agency or unit."<sup>1</sup>

Since government institutions are never static, and certain changes in the administration make it necessary that we do more in the development of executive talent for the higher administrative posts in an

---

The following quotation will show the divergence of views on the subject: "Different countries hold divergent views on this subject. They range from the complete rejection of all training for administrators in Switzerland to the complex arrangements in France; from the marked suspicion in Scandinavia that administration has to be assimilated and cannot be taught to the growing pressure in Spain for a properly organised administrative college." Brian Chapman, The Profession of Government (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1963), p. 100.

<sup>1</sup> O. Glen Stahl, Public Personnel Administration (New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1962), p. 277.



organization. As it is practically impossible to appoint persons who possess complete knowledge of the various skills they will need during their services, most of the governments are organizing training programmes for their employees to make sure that civil servants learn the skills they need to know. Training "encompasses the total process by which the employee aids himself and is aided by the organization to better perform in present and possible future positions."<sup>1</sup> Training is not only vocational but also instructional on a broad basis to develop the official's capacity for higher work and greater responsibilities.

According to Dimock, motivating needs for executive development depend on the stages of economic growth and the development of governmental machinery of a particular country in which such programmes are taking place. In developed countries like the United States of America and Great Britain the need for executive development is induced by a combination of over specialization and bureaucratic procedures which are threatening to deprive the organizations of their initiative. In the developing countries, on the other hand, emphasis should be on developing skills to facilitate the economic and industrial growth and overcoming the social and cultural obstacles that limit administrative effectiveness.<sup>2</sup>

&

---

<sup>1</sup> Sidney Mailick, "University's Role in Executive Development," Public Administration Review, Vol. 18, (Spring, 1958), p. 275.

<sup>2</sup> Marshal E. Dimock, "Executive Development after Ten Years," Public Administration Review, (Spring, 1958), pp. 91-97.

The exact nature of training will depend, again on the nature, volume and variety of the political system. In the relatively more democratic and developed countries where fundamental policy decisions are made through political processes administrators may only be trained in the requisite skills and techniques to carry out the policy decisions. In transitional or developing societies "administrators", according to Riggs, "behave like semi-politicians, making their own policy decisions, largely on the basis of their private value systems."<sup>1</sup> Consequently a training programme designed for more stable democratic industrialised societies may not produce the desired results, in transitional societies, because modern skill-oriented training is best suited for rational policy implementation. In the opinion of Riggs, therefore, training in a developing country "should" give considerable attention to ethical and social values, requisite to policy making without sacrificing the study of techniques and knowledge needed for policy - implementation."<sup>2</sup>

## 2. Training needs of developing countries

Most of the developing countries of Asia and Africa were under foreign rule for a considerable period of time. Their administrative systems retained their colonial, authoritarian characteristics. Execu-

---

<sup>1</sup> Riggs, Op. cit., p. 336.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid., p. 348.

tives who came to occupy senior appointments in the post-independence period were products of the colonial era.

On independence the activities of these states increased manifold as they struggled to realise the implications of a 'welfare state.' Programmes of socio-economic development were initiated with the assistance of the aid giving nations. With the initiation of these programmes the public administrator was called upon to shoulder a different kind of responsibility - the preparation and implementation of development plans embracing the totality of the lives of the citizens - a responsibility for which he lacked the requisite capacity. The inexperience of the administrators for this changed role worked often as the single most effective factor in defeating the implementation of development plans. The re-orientation of public administration as to develop the desired skills and attitudes among public personnel becomes imperative. This is only possible through a systematic effort of training. According to a report of the United Nations, the three factors which give urgency to training for government servants in developing countries are: the need for innovation in administration to meet changes in the economic and social system, the rapid expansion of the functions which government is called upon to perform, and the shortage of trained personnel which is the general characteristic of these countries.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> United Nations, A Handbook of Public Administration (New York: Department of Economic and Social Affairs, United Nations, 1961), p. 57.

The process of development is thus contingent on well planned programmes of training so formulated as to equip administrators with the necessary wherewithal for being effective instruments of change through the initiation and implementation of development plans.

Almost all developing countries are conscious of the need for planned and systematic training and it has generally been accepted as a long term investment.<sup>1</sup> A substantial number of personnel of the many departments of government of these countries have been trained in the more developed countries under the auspices of technical assistance programmes of the United Nations and through bi-lateral agreements entered into by individual governments. In the long run, however, there can be no substitute for the provision of training facilities within these countries, and the bulk of the responsibility for personnel development of the public service will have to devolve on the training programmes which can be arranged and carried forward inside the particular country.

Already institutes of Public Administration have mushroomed in the developing countries.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> This is borne out by the tone and recommendations of the papers presented by delegates of some of the developing countries at a symposium on management training held at Lahore, Pakistan, in 1964. Central Treaty Organization, Symposium on Management Training in Public Administration (Ankara: United States Economic Co-ordinator, 1964).

<sup>2</sup> For a detailed analysis of their structures and functions see: United Nations, Teaching in Public Administration (New York: United Nations Technical Assistance Administration, 1958). Fletcher Cooke, Sir John Institutes of Public Administration in Commonwealth (London: Royal Institute of Public Administration, 1963).

## CHAPTER II

### THE BACKGROUND OF IN-SERVICE TRAINING IN PAKISTAN

In order to understand the training policies of the Government of Pakistan, it is important to have some idea of the background against which the services perform their duties and to analyze this work in its historical perspective.

#### A. Pre-Independence period

The education and initial training for the Indian civil service goes as far back as the year 1800 when Lord Wellesley (then Governor General of India) observed that "the duties of the European Civil Servants of the East India Company have become of greater importance and magnitude."<sup>1</sup> This was the time when the employees of the Company were no longer considered as the agents of a commercial concern, but, in fact became the civil servants of a powerful sovereign. In his minute, concerning the regulations of the proposed college for the initial training of the civil servants at Fort William (Calcutta) Wellesley anticipated the principles upon which the service would operate under the British rule and broadly described the type of education which was to obtain for the

---

<sup>1</sup> Marquis Wellesley, Minute No., 86, 1800, as reproduced in S.V. Owen, (ed.), A Selection from Wellesley's Despatches (Oxford, 1877), p. 39. Cited from Leo M. Snowiss, "The Education and Role of the Superior Civil Service in India," Indian Journal of Public Administration, Vol. VII (March, 1961), p. 6.

coming one hundred and forty seven years:

Their education should be founded in a general knowledge of those branches of Literature and Science which form the basis of the education of persons destined to similar occupations in Europe. To this foundation should be added an intimate acquaintance with the history, languages, customs and manners of the people of India. With the Mohammadans and Hindu codes of law and religion and with the political commercial interests and relations of Great Britain in Asia.<sup>1</sup>

Thus the first significant development in the history of civil servants training came with the opening of the Fort William College at Calcutta, in November, 1800. A three-year course of a mixed and comprehensive character was drawn up. The curriculum included history, literature, ethics and various Indian languages. The College as conceived by Wellesley set a new tone in the civil service. Besides developing the mental faculties of the civil servants the college "gave them an insight into the social institutions of the people over whose destiny they were to preside."<sup>2</sup>

However the college was short lived. It was set up in anticipation of the sanction of the company's court of Directors who had their own plans to establish in England a suitable institution for the training of the young cadets in its civil service in India. Accordingly in February, 1806, the East India College at Hertford Castle was opened

---

<sup>1</sup> Ibid.

<sup>2</sup> N.C. Roy, The Civil Service in India (Calcutta: Firma K.L. Mukhopadhyay, 1960), p. 55.

(and was later on moved to Haileybury in 1809). Thus the Fort William College after running for about seven years, was reduced to a language school, restricting its scope to training in Oriental languages.<sup>1</sup>

Although Wellesley's scheme for the elaborate and comprehensive training, in a sense, proved to be a failure it did establish one fundamental principle "that the civil servants must no longer be sent to their duties in the Cutchery (court) without a proper education and training."<sup>2</sup>

Haileybury College like Fort William was designed to impart a uniform training for the civil service. The syllabus drawn up by Wellesley for Fort William College was followed in substance in this institution. The course at Haileybury included classical and general literature, principles of jurisprudence, natural philosophy, history, mathematics, political economy and the rudiments of Indian Legal Codes and regulations. The curriculum was given in four terms lasting for a total of two years.

The Indian civil service, for the next fifty years, was the product of Haileybury College. The college put its own stamp on young civil servants and became noted for its corporate life and the spirit of comradeship which kept the inmates of the institution united and bound together, throughout their career in the civil service. In spite of its

---

<sup>1</sup> The college was later on abolished by Lord Dalhousie (then Governor General of India), in 1854.

<sup>2</sup> Roy, Op. cit., p. 60.

merits the corporate spirit proved to be a double-edged weapon. Though it infused into the Indian Civil Service an esprit de corps and sense of solidarity it brought an equal amount of despotic spirit. "The civil servants looked upon themselves as the members of the governing corporation and as such the masters of the country. Consequently they became despotic in outlook and dictatorial in behavior."<sup>1</sup>

The Haileybury system had one great drawback that the civil servants had to be nominated as usual by the individual Directors of the Company. It was found that those who won laurels in the Haileybury College became proficient also in the duties entrusted to them in India.<sup>2</sup> Hence it was inferred that if only the most distinguished of the British youths were enrolled to the Indian Civil Service administration would gain much in efficiency. It was realised by the members of the select committee that if a high standard of ability and qualification was to be secured, some other method of selection (instead of the patronage system in vogue) should be adopted.<sup>3</sup> This, for the first time in the history of Indian Civil Service, gave birth to the principle of open competition for the recruitment of civil servants.

Macauley, who had greatly influenced the training of civil servants

---

<sup>1</sup> Ibid., p. 64.

<sup>2</sup> Report of the Select Committee of 1831-32, Parliamentary Papers Vol. 8 of 1831-32, p. 24. (Cited in Roy, Op. cit., pp. 64-65).

<sup>3</sup> Ibid., p. 23.



in the middle of the nineteenth century, forcefully impressed upon Parliament the inherent value of doing away with the patronage system and instituting the open competitive examination for recruitment in Indian Civil Service.<sup>1</sup> He finally succeeded in his mission and the Charter Act of 1853 ended the practice of patronage giving way to competitive system in 1855.<sup>2</sup> The competitive examinations were concerned only with the subjects of liberal study like the European sciences and arts, requiring generally a degree from Oxford or Cambridge.

According to the new system the probationers were required to attend often the courts of law and consequently to live in London. Again the other subjects could be better pursued in London than at Haileybury. In the changed order of things the need for Haileybury College no longer existed and consequently it was closed in 1857.<sup>3</sup>

Between 1855 and 1947 numerous changes in the age limits and the subjects offered for the open competitive examinations were made. It should be pointed out, however, that even after the closing of Haileybury College the competitive examinations required for entrance into the Indian Civil Service assured the continuation of a generalist, humanistic education.<sup>4</sup> After 1857 the period of training also varied

---

<sup>1</sup> Macaulay, Works of Lord Macaulay (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1897), p. 131.

<sup>2</sup> Snowiss, Op. cit., p. 9

<sup>3</sup> Roy, Op. cit., p. 77.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid., pp. 78-94.

with the age of recruits from one to three years. During this period the probationers were attached to a British University for a period of two years in the case of those selected in India<sup>1</sup> between the ages of twenty one and twenty three, and a year in the case of those selected in England between the ages of twenty two and twenty four.<sup>2</sup> This period of attachment with a British University was utilized to study Indian History, Indian Laws and Indian Languages. One important aspect of the probationary course as regards the Indian recruits was to bring them in close touch with the British way of life and to give them an opportunity to broaden their outlook by being attached to a British university.

The real training of the probationers, however, began after their

---

<sup>1</sup> Indianization of Civil Service began as early as in 1853 with Macauley's proclamation to the Parliament:

In my opinion we should not secure or prolong our domain in India by attempting to exclude the natives of that country from a share in its government...

Hansard's Parliamentary Debates, Vol. 128, for 1853, Col. 751. (Cited in Snowiss, Op. cit., p. 11.)

In 1869 Indians were admitted to only a few listed superior posts. The Lee Report (1924) recommended that the Indian Civil Service should be 50% Indianized. This, in fact, did not occur till 1939 and even then these 759 Europeans and 540 Indians. Ibid., p. 14.

<sup>2</sup> Ashok Chanda, Indian Administration (London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd., 1958), p. 119.

arrival in India. They were attached to districts and were expected to pick up the technique of work under the supervision of a district magistrate. This training on-the-job lasted for nearly two years.<sup>1</sup>

In 1944, a committee was constituted Chancellor of the Exchequer to review the question of the training of civil servants in a comprehensive way.<sup>2</sup> The Assheton Committee Report, as it is commonly known (after the name of its chairman<sup>3</sup>) while emphasizing the need of training pointed out that:

the disadvantages, more especially on the long-term view, inherent in the policy of learning the recruit to learn his job by trial and error are very formidable. They not only include a delay in his becoming a fully effective member of the department, but also a risk of dissipating the enthusiasm with which he enters on his job.<sup>4</sup>

The Assheton Committee laid down five main aims of training:<sup>5</sup>

- i. Attainment of precision and clarity in the transaction of business;
- ii. Continuing of the official outlook and methods to the new needs of time;

---

<sup>1</sup> Ibid., p. 120.

<sup>2</sup> Report of the Committee on the training of Civil Servants (London: Her Majesty's Stationery Office, 1959), p. 5.

<sup>3</sup> Ralph Assheton, M.P. then Financial Secretary to the Treasury.

<sup>4</sup> Report of the Committee, Op. cit., p. 27.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid., pp. 10-11.

- iii. Inculcation of broad views to counter-act the tendency towards robot-like efficiency and machuzation by machines;
- iv. Vocational training not only to fit the individual to his present work but also to develop capacities for higher work and greater responsibilities, and
- v. Payment of special regards to staff morale.

In accordance with the recommendations of this committee, a training and education division was set up in the Treasury. In 1945, a central school was also established<sup>1</sup> for the initial training of new entrants in the administrative class.<sup>2</sup>

#### B. Post-Independence period

After acquiring its independence from British rule Pakistan had to face manifold problems in the field of administration. In the early days, conditions were almost chaotic. Most of the British officers left the country and Hindu civil servants migrated to India, leaving most of the services below their cadre strength. The number of Indian Civil Service<sup>3</sup> officers who opted for service in Pakistan at the time

---

<sup>1</sup> But this arrangement, like Wellesley's Fort William was short-lived and was the first causality in the economy drive of 1951 (in England).

<sup>2</sup> Chanda, Op. cit., p. 119.

<sup>3</sup> The Indian Civil Service, contrary to the connotation that the term suggests, was a corps of picked elite administrators, about thirteen hundred strong on independence, which manned the more important of the Secretariat, Judicial, and Executive posts of the Government of British India, both at the Centre and the Provinces. It is in this context that the designation must be understood. It is misleading to think of it as embracing the totality of the civil bureaucracy.

of partition was 120 as against a cadre strength of 350.<sup>1</sup>

Independence brought with it new responsibilities and duties. These called not only for an increasing number of trained personnel but also for a radical change in the attitudes of the civil servants. A law and order administration had to be given a development orientation; the gulf that existed between the administrator and the people had to be bridged. The ruler-ruled relationship had to give way to ideals of 'service' to the people; authoritarian ways of doing things were to be replaced by democratic ones. All this could not possibly be brought about by administrative fiat. Attitudes and orientations die hard and at best but change slowly, under the pressure of circumstance and conscious effort of inculcation. This inculcation of a different set of values could best be effected through a well and realistically planned in-service training programme.

As a result a whole structure of various training institutes has been established, for training officers at various levels, in the country. In the following pages an attempt has been made to study and assess:

a. The existing training potential, i.e. nature and scope of facilities available for in-service training of the civil servants in Pakistan;

---

<sup>1</sup> G. Mueenuddin, "Recruitment and Training Policies in Pakistan," Symposium on Management Training in Public Administration, Op. cit., p. 49.

b. The curricula or programmes of the institutes, catering to the training needs of the country;

c. Possible over-laping, lacunae, in the training programmes of the existing institutes; we shall also indicate the direction which the institutes may have to take or the modification needed to bring them in line with future needs of personnel development.

### CHAPTER III

#### INITIAL TRAINING OF THE CIVIL SERVANTS

As discussed in the previous chapter, prior to independence there was no institutional in-service training facilities for public functionaries in the sub-continent. In fact the concept of training as we conceive of it today was absent. Training was mostly a question of learning on the job. "... training was primarily for British probationers who had little or no knowledge of the conditions prevailing in India. There was ... elementary training in the laws which the officer would be called upon to administer on his first posting. But most of the training was left to experience in the field."<sup>1</sup>

Experience, though perhaps a sure teacher, is nevertheless a slow one, and more often than not wasteful. Time was of the essence in the tasks which post independence Pakistan set itself and waste was out of the question in the context of the limited resources, both of trained manpower and capital, available. Therefore the question of leaving the education of the public administrator to the hazards of experience on job was felt to be rather a dangerous venture, and in-service training

---

<sup>1</sup> G. Mueenuddin, "Professionalization of Public Administration," Selected Papers from the First Seminar on Public Administration (Lahore: University of the Punjab, 1962), p. 29.

assumed importance in the consideration of the authorities.

At present, government has divided the training into two phases; the first phase provides for initial or probationary training of newly recruited employees and the second phase provides for advanced training in public administration as distinct from technical and purely departmental training. The training institutions concerned with the first phase are Civil Service Academy, <sup>Finance Service Academy</sup> Police Training College and Secretariat Training Institute.

#### I. Civil Service Academy

The Civil Service Academy was set up in 1948 at Lahore, West Pakistan.<sup>1</sup> The speed with which this new institution was set on foot

---

<sup>1</sup> The Academy caters for the initial training of the Civil Service of Pakistan which is considered to be the top administrative service in the country and is the counterpart of the former British Indian Civil Service. It is a corps of generalists whose members usually occupy the senior administrative positions such as Deputy Commissioners (a Pakistani counterpart of the Prefect in France), Commissioners, Heads of non-technical departments and public corporations and secretaries to the Provincial and central governments.

Entry to the Civil Service of Pakistan (hereafter referred to as C.S.P.) is made through a nation-wide combined superior services competitive examination, held by the Central Public Service Commission. For taking the examination the candidate should at least possess a bachelor's degree, should be between ages of 21 and 25 and a national of Pakistan. On being declared successful they are appointed to the C.S.P. as probationers. Immediately after their appointment they are admitted to the Academy for their initial training.



is to be explained by the urgency of the task the young Muslim State had to face,"<sup>1</sup> at the time of the partition. The most serious administrative problem encountered by Pakistan was the acute shortage of senior officers. This vacuum in the administrative field was filled by the appointment of twenty six officers to the newly established Pakistan Administrative Service (renamed as the Civil Service of Pakistan, in 1950). These recruits were sent to the Civil Service Academy for a period of nine months training. Thus the Civil Service Academy can rightly be designated as the foundational training institution of the Civil Service of Pakistan.

Establishment of the Academy did not completely solve the personnel problems of the country. Any change in government's policy, structure or function causes a repercussive shift in the roles of its officers. The various socio-economic development plans undertaken by Pakistan, as an emerging state called for multiplicity of new and additional functions to be performed by its officials. As such a nine months training at the Academy could not equip the young officers with knowledge sufficient for an entire career. Therefore, the initial training at the Academy was supplemented by additional training in foreign countries.

---

<sup>1</sup> A. Bertrand, "The Civil Service Academy of Lahore and the Training of the Members of the Civil Service of Pakistan," International Social Science Bulletin, Vol. VII, (June, 1955), p. 265.

The 1949 batch received training in Australia and from 1951 to 1960 all probationers in the Civil Service of Pakistan were sent to Oxford and Cambridge to attend a specially devised course<sup>1</sup> in Public Administration, development economics, constitutional law and history, for a period of one year.<sup>2</sup>

The system of training was again revised during the year 1961 when the training of the C.S.P. probationers in England was discontinued and the subjects which were previously taught in England were included in the syllabus of C.S.P. probationers training at the Academy. Consequently the period of training at the Academy was increased.

The training of Pakistan Foreign Service probationers has also been introduced at the Academy with effect from October, 1963 which extended the very scope and activities of the Academy, since then.

The training programme at the Academy has the following objectives:<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> During their stay in England they had to acquaint themselves with the working methods and techniques of the British Administration, learning how British government offices are run and the techniques of inter-departmental co-ordination, in a course of training conducted by the Education and Training Division of the Treasury. Muzaffar Ahmad Choudhuri, The Civil Service in Pakistan (Dacca, East Pakistan: National Institute of Public Administration, 1963), pp. 202-203.

<sup>2</sup> M.R. Inayat (ed.), Perspectives in Public Administration (Lahore, West Pakistan: Society for Public Administration, Civil Service Academy, 1962), p. 95.

<sup>3</sup> Inayat, Op. cit., p. 96.

- i. Developing probationers into well rounded individuals and developing in them the necessary qualities of the officers of a welfare state.
- ii. Imparting them basic knowledge of law and administration which will enable them to function then as members of the district staff.
- iii. Providing them an intellectual foundation which will enable them to fill jobs of higher responsibility later in their career.

The first task of the Academy is to integrate the heterogeneous batch of probationers, having the diversity of education background<sup>1</sup>, into a coherent group. This is partly achieved by making their residence and messing in the Academy compulsory. Side by side with this integration goes the all round development of the probationers and the inculcation of attitude appropriate to an administrator such as hard work, punctuality, discipline, and sympathy for others points of views.

The Academy imparts the basic knowledge and skills of an administrator with special emphasis on district administration but the overall

---

<sup>1</sup> It is not uncommon to have a doctor (there was one in 1957) or engineer (there were two in 1961) while there are many who have taken their Master's Degrees in economics, political science, history, English literature, physics and chemistry. Several of them have already served as lecturers or executives and quite a few give up even better paying jobs to join the civil service. In addition, a number of young army officers are selected and appointed to the C.S.P. and sent to the Academy for training. Inayat, Op. cit., p. 97.

role of the C.S.P. as an administrative leadership is kept in mind by providing a base on which the probationers should be able to build up later on through practical experience and fill jobs of higher responsibility.

At present, the C.S.P. probationers undergo training for a period of eighteen months, divided into three phases. The first phase is the academic training in the Civil Service Academy at Lahore from October to June; the second phase is three months practical training in East Pakistan;<sup>1</sup> and the third phase is six months course in the Academy from October to March (of the following year).

The subjects which are being taught in the first and the third term are: Public Administration, Pakistan Penal Code, Evidence Act, Revenue System, Development Economics, Islamiat, and Riding.<sup>2</sup>

The second term consists of District Administration, Criminal Procedure Code, Civil Procedure Code, Minor Acts, Local Bodies, Revenue Laws and Required Readings.

Syllabus for the training of C.S.P. probationers is common in the first term. During the first year P.F.S. probationers follow the same course except that in place of Pakistan Penal Code they are required to attend classes with the senior batch of C.S.P. probationers in Dis-

---

<sup>1</sup> The Scope of present theses is limited to the in-service training provided by the governmental institutions in Pakistan.

<sup>2</sup> Information provided by the Director of Civil Service Academy.

strict Administration and Local Bodies. The subjects included in the P.F.S. syllabus for the second year are International Law, (a) International Economic Relations, (b) Comparative Economic systems, Diplomatic practices and Protocol, International Politics, International Organization, Foreign Politics of Selected Countries, Indo-Pakistan History, Precis Writing and French Language.

The class-room teaching is supplemented with occasional visits to development projects, regular visits to courts to see the actual operational set up, and special lectures by eminent scholars and senior officers arranged at the Academy. As soon as they join the Academy each probationer is required to give a subject for Group Discussion. On one's turn every one has to present a comprehensive analysis of the subject.

Teaching of Public Administration in the syllabus was included in 1960. Prior to this the training imparted by the Academy was, more or less, an Anglo-Oriented and "it was inevitable in the traumatic circumstances of the 1947 partition of India that Pakistan continued the traditions and structure of the Indian Civil Service."<sup>1</sup> The system of 'learning by doing,' prevailing in the pre-independence era did produce a number of able civil service executives but "in the tough

---

<sup>1</sup> R. Braibauti "The Civil Service of Pakistan: A theoretical Analysis," The South Atlantic Quarterly, Vol. LVIII (No. 2, 1959), p. 280.

school of experience as much is learnt by successful trial as by disastrous error."<sup>1</sup> The basic knowledge of the principles and techniques of public administration has become a necessary tool in the equipment of every responsible administrator. Hence the teaching of public administration should certainly increase the chances of success and minimise the risk of errors.

In the early years of the Academy Economics was made a part of the syllabus but was excluded in 1951. When the training abroad was discontinued a new course in Development Economics introduced "which is an M.A. standard course"<sup>2</sup> dealing with the problems developing countries with particular reference to Pakistan. While teaching the subject practical application of the economic principles is stressed with special reference to the implementation of the Five-Year Plans.<sup>3</sup>

The teaching of Islamiat (Islamic Studies) does not consist of theology; rather it deals with the historical role of Islam and social problems confronting the Moslems. In a predominantly religious country

---

<sup>1</sup> S.B. Bapat, "The Training of the Indian Administrative Service," The Indian Journal of Public Administration, Vol. I, (April-June, 1955), p. 124.

<sup>2</sup> Inayat, Op. cit., p. 211.

<sup>3</sup> The introduction of a course in Public Administration supplemented by development economics (instead of pure economics as it used to be) shows the gradual change from 'Haileyburian' concept of literary education aimed at producing a Corps d'elite to correlating the teaching of the Academy with the experience in the field, although the change is very slow.

like Pakistan it is necessary for the future administrative leaders to have a proper understanding of these problems.

Law subjects take up major portion of probationers' time. After having a look at the curriculum one may say that why the training of an administrator in a welfare state is so much law-oriented? One reason is that the probationers on their postings to the districts are required to administer justice and maintain law and order.<sup>1</sup> Members of the C.S.P. during their career are also appointed to the judiciary where knowledge of law is essential. Secondly "legal study has a bearing upon how to deal with conflicting interests, which is the heart of public affairs."<sup>2</sup> However, the teaching of law is acquiring gradual relegation in the curriculum<sup>3</sup> of the Academy as the functions of the administrator are changing.<sup>4</sup>

On the informal side of training are the required readings on

---

<sup>1</sup> It may be pointed out incidently that in order to acquaint the probationers with the procedures of administration of law, Mock trials and Law moots are arranged every week in the class under the supervision of a fairly senior legal expert.

<sup>2</sup> Fritz Morstein Marx, The Administrative State (Chicago, Illinois: The University of Chicago Press, 1957), p. 112.

<sup>3</sup> At present the law subjects take nearly twenty five per cent (9 out of 32 total study hours) of the teaching time in the weekly schedule as compared to nearly 70 to 80 per cent at one stage.

<sup>4</sup> Inayat, Op. cit., p. 102.

various subjects. The probationers are expected by the end of second term, to have read very thoroughly, eight books of different kind.<sup>1</sup>

As soon as they join the Academy each probationer is asked to give a subject for group discussion. On one's turn every one has to present a comprehensive analysis of the subject.<sup>2</sup>

The training at the Academy is sufficiently heavy and comprehensive. Here lies the difference between the Academy and the other training institutes in Pakistan. The probationers are made to participate in a very wide range of experience. Their day starts at six in the morning with horse riding and physical training, followed by classes in the forenoon, and games in the afternoon. At various stages they undergo small arms training, motor driving lessons, visits to jails and courts, study tours of the districts, social get-together and examinations.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The list is drawn up by the Director of the Academy and may be changed from year to year. In 1955, the list included the memoirs of Sir Winston Churchill, a work on the government and politics of America, a book on Stalin, a survey of the British Rule in India, etc. Bertrand, *Op. cit.*, p. 265.

<sup>2</sup> All this is graded and added towards fixing seniority of the probationers.

<sup>3</sup> The courses of formal lectures, in the American context of training, occupy 32 'credit hours', a week. Of these 13½ are devoted to general courses; 9 hours to Criminal and Civil Law; 4½ hours to Revenue law and Administration and 5 hours to teaching of languages. (Derived from the daily schedule of the Academy, supplied by the Director of Academy).



The Academy is headed by a Director who is a senior member of C.S.P. and "its administrative structure is simple, indeed modest."<sup>1</sup> The rest of the staff consists of a Deputy Director, two lecturers in law and part-time lecturers in languages and Islamiat.

Although the formal assessment of the Academy's training is made by the Central Public Service Commission, in a final passing out examination, given at the end of the probationary period, the Academy itself conducts an evaluation study<sup>2</sup> at the end of the training of every batch in order to make adjustments necessary for keeping up with the national requirements of the Civil Service of Pakistan.

Very recently an innovation has been introduced in the field of training of probationers. Previously, on passing out of the Academy they used to sever all ties with this institution. "It has now been arranged that for the first two years of their service they will remain in contact with the Academy and director of Academy will take an active

---

<sup>1</sup> Bertrand, Op. cit., p. 265.

<sup>2</sup> Director of the Academy makes a confidential evaluation of each probationer. He is also required to submit two reports to the Central Personnel Agency (Establishment Division President's Secretariat), on each probationer - one when a probationer has completed four months in the Academy and the other when he leaves the Academy. Thus the "young executives appointed in any given year, rank in seniority according to the score on this (competitive) examination, the grade given while a probationer at the Civil Service Academy and score attained in a final passing out examination." Inayat, Op. cit., p. 217.

interest in their training."<sup>1</sup> He will also prepare seminars to pinpoint their difficulties which they are encountering and also "to assess how far the training at the Academy is of real help to them in the field."<sup>2</sup>

Although the Academy has a research centre which "will gradually assist in evolving proper educational materials"<sup>3</sup> but these programmes are somewhat ambitious. So far not a single research project has been taken up by the Academy.

## II. The Finance Services Academy

The Finance Services Academy started functioning in February 1957. It is organized on the pattern of the Civil Service Academy. The Finance Services Academy is a residential institution, and trains about 25 probationers of the Finance Services<sup>4</sup> of the Central government, every year.

The training program of the Academy is based on the view that the highly specialized work of the Finance and Revenue departments demands both special aptitude and proper skills, and that the formation of the

---

<sup>1</sup> G. Mueenuddin, "Government and Recruitment Training Policies in Pakistan," Symposium on Management Training in Public Administration (Ankara: Office of the United States Economic Coordinator for CENTO Affairs, 1964), p. 51.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

<sup>3</sup> Inayat, Op. cit., p. 104.

<sup>4</sup> The Finance Services comprise of Audit and Accounts, Railway Accounts, Custom and Excise, Income Tax and Military Accounts. Government of Pakistan, Finance Service Academy (Karachi: Ministry of Finance, 1963), p. 20.

higher ranks of a Civil Service cannot be left to chance, but must be the objective of an organized effort by the government.<sup>1</sup> To achieve this objective a course for nine months is given at the Academy. It includes Economics, Public Finance, Public Administration, Financial Administration and the functions of world bodies such as the International Monetary Fund and the world bank, and some lectures on book-keeping, civil and criminal procedure codes and current affairs.

The course tends towards what in France is called "Professional Formation."<sup>2</sup> In other words the training is designed to turn the probationers into fully-formed civil servants. This training occupies the first nine months of the total probationary of two years. The next year consists of departmental training in the particular Finance and Revenue Services to which the Probationers belong; and this is also to be carried on systematically under the general direction of the Academy. Finally, the Probationers are attached to business firms, commercial banks and the State Bank of Pakistan, and the Pakistan Industrial Development

---

<sup>1</sup> "The assumption underlying the course at the Finance Academy is that since the probationer will be engaged during his career in technical, detailed, financial work, the Academy should give him a breadth of outlook he may not otherwise get." Ralph Braibanti, "The Civil Service in Pakistan: A Theoretical Analysis" South Atlantic Quarterly, Vol. LVII, No. 2, 1959, p. 281.

<sup>2</sup> "The ideal aimed at is the formation of the technocratic administrator, the person eminent in his own field of specialization yet not bound by its frontiers." Chapman, Op. cit., p. lll.

Corporation for three months of business training to enable them to see and learn something of the private sector at first-hand and to become acquainted with the part which commerce and industry play in the economic life of the State.<sup>1</sup>

The training in the Academy is imparted through lectures, seminars, small-group supervised classes, essay writing and intensive individual readings. There is too much emphasis on class work, particularly on General Economics.<sup>2</sup> In seminars, arranged regularly, a short paper on a given subject is followed by discussion in which all the probationers participate.

A comparative analysis of the curricula shows that the training method is exactly on the same lines as that of the Civil Service Academy, except that the main subjects vary to suit the requirements of the particular type of work the probationer be required to do in his service career.

The academies reflect the exaggerated independence of the parts of the public services. Although located a few miles, the aca-

---

<sup>1</sup> The advantages of the probationers being sent to Banks and other concerns are manifold. It is not their knowledge of Economics or book-keeping in theory alone that is enough. It is necessary for them to know first hand and to observe in detail how bankers and other businessmen organize their institutions, what problems they have to face and how they achieve efficiency in their organization.

<sup>2</sup> Formal class lectures on Economics occupy 10 hours out of 27 3/4 hours, a week. Govt. of Pakistan; Finance Service Academy; Brochure (Karachi: Ministry of Finance, 1964-65). p.21.

demies conduct no joint classes in subjects taught at both institutions, and there is little social contact between the two groups of probationers or the faculties.<sup>1</sup>

The trainees thus develop service consciousness and consider themselves a class apart and distinct from other services. They carry this impression throughout their career. They adopt themselves to a way of thinking and living which are not common to the majority of civil servants. As such there is no mutual understanding among the members of various civil services.<sup>2</sup>

The whole-time staff of the Academy is a Director, an Assistant Director and a resident economist with a doctorate in agricultural economics from an American University. The Assistant Director is responsible for the over all administration of the Academy.<sup>3</sup> Thus the resident economist is the only whole-time instructor, at the Academy. He is responsible for giving ten elaborate lectures in a week on various economic aspects of theory and practice, and of the functioning of the international organizations. The number of periods which the Economist

---

<sup>1</sup> Braibanti, Op. cit., p. 283.

<sup>2</sup> Rowland Egger's report bears testimony to the view:

"Officers tend to be obsessed with service membership, title, class and rank, and too little concerned with particular job responsibilities. Old I.C.S. officers barely tolerate new comers in the C.S.P., both look down on Audit and Accounts, all three take a dim view of the Police, and hesitate to be seen in company a member of one of the other services." The Improvement of Public Administration in Pakistan (Karachi, Pakistan: The Inter Service Press, 1953), p. 51.

<sup>3</sup> Finance Services Academy: Brochure, Op. cit., p. 4.

is required to take each week may not be a big burden if the subject matter is the same or closely related, but in this case he is required to lecture on varried subjects of the discipline which puts him under heavy pressure. This shows the acute shortage of training staff at the Academy and becomes a limiting factor to maintain a high standard of instruction, required for the probationers of the vital government services.

No regular evaluation system is followed during the training period. A passing out examination is held by the Central Public Service Commission at the end of the academic session, success in which is obligatory for retention in service. There is no research cell in the Academy and the library is inadequately stocked "even though the courses of study are somewhat empirical oriented."<sup>1</sup>

### III. Police Training College

The development of professional academic training of the police executive is of relatively recent origin in Pakistan. Here to before, it has been largely a concern of the Central and the Provincial Police Departments. The Police Training College, Sardah, East Pakistan, was established to cater the training needs of Police Service of Pakistan.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Braibanti, Op. cit., p. 280.

<sup>2</sup> Government of Pakistan, Careers in the Pakistan Central Superior Services (Karachi, 1954), p. 5.

The main objectives of the one year training programme at the College is "to teach the probationers their powers and obligations under the law, the general duties they will have to perform as police officers and the sources of information to which they should refer to guide them in the correct performance of those duties."<sup>1</sup> The particular emphasis of training is on Criminal Law, Medical Jurisprudence, Equitation, Scientific Investigation of Crimes and Accounts. Hence the training attempts "to inculcate in them those habits of discipline, self-reliance and observation which are essential for a police officer."<sup>2</sup>

The training arrangements and the courses of study for the probationers are defective and inadequate in many respects. The police officer of today is confronted with an ever increasing complexity of duties and responsibilities. There is no doubt that the enforcement of law is the major sphere of police service but "the problems of law enforcement can be satisfactorily described and made real only to persons who have had some experience with Public Administration."<sup>3</sup> The task of law enforcement is a problem of management and lies beyond the comprehension of those who are not experienced in it. Thus the absence of a course in

---

<sup>1</sup> Information supplied by the Principal of the College.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

<sup>3</sup> A.C. Germann, Police Executive Development (Springfield, Illinois: Charles C. Thomas, Publisher, 1962), p. 4.

Public Administration from the curriculum of the College is a serious deficiency. If the Police Service of Pakistan is to develop adequately the method of training police executives must be changed, for it is no more sufficient for the challenging task of police administrator.

It is advisable to divide the curriculum, for the training of the probationers into two types: the first term consisting of general courses in Public Administration, Social Psychology,<sup>1</sup> Public Finance Administration, Communications and Public Relations and Orientation in Criminal Law; and the second term consisting of specific police executive courses in philosophy of police (legality, morality and efficiency), Medical Jurisprudence, Functional Orientation in Investigations, Traffic, Civil Defence and other required subjects, being taught at the present.

The principal of the College is assisted by three members of the staff. Where as a sound knowledge of Criminal laws and procedures is essential for the P.S.P. probationers, the standard of legal instruction in the college is inadequate. The members of East Bengal Committee, which was appointed by the government of East Pakistan in 1953, observed that:

---

<sup>1</sup> At present, nothing much is done to stimulate the probationers to view their task in wider setting of a modern welfare state. Course in sociology and social psychology might be of great help in giving them a proper perspective.



As regards the instructions in law, the Principal pointed out that there were two Deputy Superintendents of police as law Instructors for the P.S.P. officers; but we were told that neither of them was a graduate in law.<sup>1</sup>

The Committee suggested that legal courses must be delivered by legal practitioners having wide experience of criminal work but the recommendations of the Committee are still awaiting implementation.

A superintendent of police<sup>2</sup> - an officer in charge of police administration in a district - is a drawing and disbursing officer in respect of salaries of the employees working under him, and for the funds on different kinds of expenditure in his department. In the discharge of this function large sums of money pass through his hands. Therefore knowledge in accounts is another essential part of his training; but the lectures on account are given by the Head Clerk of the college.<sup>3</sup> The Head Clerk is not only unqualified as an instructor but this also interferes with his primary duties of routine office work.

The inaccessability of the place,<sup>4</sup> where the college is located,

---

<sup>1</sup> Government of the East Pakistan, Report of the East Bengal Police Committee (Dacca, 1953), p. 42.

<sup>2</sup> After a few years of service, a police service probationer is appointed to this job.

<sup>3</sup> He is being paid an honourarium of ruppees 10 (a little more than 2 U.S. dollars) per month. Report of the Committee, Op. cit., p. 42.

<sup>4</sup> The College is located at Sardah, East Pakistan, which is far away from Dacca, the Provincial headquarters of East Pakistan government.

does not allow the proper utilization of University professors in law or the high ranking officers who could otherwise share their experiences with the probationers.

The Principal has wide authority not only to evaluate the probationers but also to discharge them from service, while under training. Confirmation, promotion and retention in service depends upon the assessment of the Principal, by service regulations.

Although there is no proper research staff, employed by the college but instructional staff is working on a research project on "whether drill and discipline deminishes personal initiative and sense of responsibility and how to balance the two for police work."<sup>1</sup>

#### IV. Secretariat Training Institute

The need for providing training facilities to the employees of the Central Secretariat of the government of India was recognized long ago.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Information supplied by the Principal of the college.

<sup>2</sup> (i) "We recognize that there are distinct advantages in putting men through some preliminary training in office procedure." Report of the government of India Secretariat Procedure Committee, 1920, Llwellyn Smith Report (Karachi: Reprint series, National Institute of Public Administration, 1963), p. 32.

(ii) "We think that it should be definitely recognized that a new recruit ought to be put through the different stages of office procedure definitely (sic) for training under the supervision of the Chief Superintendent before being entrusted with individual work." Report of the government of India Secretariat Committee, Wheeler Report, 1935-36 (Karachi: Reprint series, National Institute of Public Administration, 1963), p. 50.

In 1937, on the recommendations of the Maxwell Committee,<sup>1</sup> then Home Department prepared a scheme for the departmental training of secretariat employees, and suggested to other departments that the scheme should be introduced with such variations as might be necessitated by the particular requirements of the individual departments.<sup>2</sup> Neither the Maxwell Committee nor the Home Department realized the necessity of setting up an organization to train the employees of the Central Secretariat. The scheme was confined to on-the-job training. However the system worked satisfactorily until the outbreak of the second World War when it became evident that, due to the ever increasing tempo of work and large number of entrants in the Secretariat Services, effective on-the-job training was no longer possible.<sup>3</sup>

Subsequently, as a result of the partition of India in 1947, a small number of employees of the pre-partition secretariat opted to serve in the newly born state of Pakistan. Immediately on inception, the government of Pakistan was confronted with acute shortage of experienced employees at all levels. To meet the situation, the government

---

<sup>1</sup> A high level committee of Secretaries to the Central Government, under the chairmanship of R.M. Maxwell. The Committee reviewed the position of the Central Government's Departments; status and function of the secretaries; internal set up, staffing and training. Report of the government of India secretariat Organization and Procedure, Maxwell Report (Karachi: Reprint, series, National Institute of Public Administration, 1963).

<sup>2</sup> Gopeshwar Nath, "The Secretariat Training School," Indian Journal of Public Administration, Vol. VII No. I (January-March, 1961), p. 171.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid.

had to recruit people who had hardly any experience or training. On account of paucity of qualified people, lack of financial resources, and other immediate problems at hand, government could not give due attention to the training of the new entrants.

The training of the secretariat employees, at the institutional level, remained a neglected sector of government's in-service training programmes till 1956 when the Secretariat Training Institute was set up by the government of Pakistan, under the establishment Division of the Cabinet Secretariat.<sup>1</sup>

For the first three years the Secretariat Training Institute concentrated on holding whole time refresher courses for superintendents<sup>2</sup> and Assistants<sup>3</sup> from the Central Secretariat and attached departments,<sup>4</sup> for a period of two to three months. The organizational set-up and functions of the institute continued more or less unchanged until about the end of 1959 when the section officer's scheme was introduced.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> A portfolio then of the Prime Minister, and now under the President of the Republic.

<sup>2</sup> A "Superintendent" is a supervisor in-charge of a section consisting of different grades of Clerical Staff.

<sup>3</sup> An "Assistant" is a clerk, with better scales of pay than other clerical grades.

<sup>4</sup> The Secretariat has "attached departments", directorates and subordinate offices. These are the operational units of the government, which perform their functions through a net-work of field offices. The relationship between the Secretariat and its departments is based on the "staff" concept.

<sup>5</sup> The scheme provided for both direct recruitment and promotion to the new posts of section officers (Assistant Superintendents). Baribanti, Op. cit., p. 401.

Shortly after the implementation of the section officer's scheme, which necessitated a change in the training programme, the Institute arranged special courses for the recently promoted section officers. These courses were devoted mainly to refresh the officer's knowledge and understanding of the rules, regulations, and secretariat procedures.

At present, the Institute is running two types of courses; regular courses for the training of probationer section officers, recruited on the basis of an all-Pakistan competitive examination held by the Central Public Service Commission, and refresher courses for the different categories of employees of the Secretariat and its attached departments.

The Institute has evolved a comprehensive syllabus, divided into two terms of six months each; for the probationer section officers, During the first six months training instructions are given to the probationer section officers in the structure and functions of the government of Pakistan; the constitution and laws to administration, the Principles of Economic Development, conference techniques, and Human Relations.

The refresher courses last for about three months<sup>1</sup> and cover such subjects as Organization of the government of Pakistan, office procedures, government servants conduct rules and disciplinary rules. In the past,

---

<sup>1</sup> It is, however, worth mentioning here that the government has not so far specifically fixed the duration of any course, except for directly recruited section officers.

the Institute has conducted a series of courses on Public Relations for employees of public dealing departments such as Directorate of Immigration and Passports, Karachi Port Trust, and Karachi Customs.

From a study of the course contents it appears that courses are too much rule and procedure-oriented and that the main emphasis is on government's Organization and structure. There is no doubt that conformity to a standard-rules and procedures - brings in harmony and also puts a check on irregularities and disorganized actions. But in case where we have to deal with human beings, sheer supremacy of rules without giving due weight to human factors involved makes one think that governmental organization is a machine, which works automatically. Rules, regulations and procedures are only the means which administrator employs in carrying out the job. Giving more value to the rules and procedures very often creates apathy and "redtapism" with the result of belated decisions at the secretariat level and as long as the training remains to be rules and procedure - oriented "its red tape will continue to harrass and impede the doing part of the government."<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Egger, *Op. cit.*, p. 30.

Redtapism which is fairly common in governments offices was dramatised late in 1961 by an extremely frustrated officials murder of his daughter and his subsequent suicide. Pakistan Times (Lahore: November 11, 1961), p. 1.

The training consists almost exclusively of formal sessions. The method employed is the lecture method, though to the extent time and other factors allow, attempt is made to encourage discussion in class. Field trips are organized occasionally but lack of transport facilities and of funds do not permit these as often as desirable. The Institute has none of audio-visual training aids, though some use is being made of training films.

It will be helpful to arrange special lectures by experienced senior officers of the central secretariat and heads of departments. These lectures may give the officers under training a unique opportunity of learning from top officials, almost the over-all purposes of the government and help them to broaden their outlook. There is not much emphasis on seminars, group discussions and study tours which can provide the probationers with opportunities for self development, specially during the second phase of their attachment to the Institute.

Whereas the first half of the training programme is too much rule and regulations oriented the second half consists of too broad training. During the total period no effort is made to develop the supervisory skills of the probationers which is very essential to the job of a section officer.

As compared to other institutions, concerned with the probationery

training of civil servants, secretariat training institute has the sufficient strength of faculty which consists of one Director, three Deputy Directors and seven Assistant Directors.<sup>1</sup> The members of the staff are experienced employees of government but most of them did not have any training for the job.

No proper evaluation system of the training has been adopted by the Institute. At the end of each course participants' reactions are obtained in writing, but it is not always possible to examine and analyse the responses, and or to bring in changes which are suggested as desirable. As for the impact of training on promotion there has been no policy decision so far.

There is no research cell or even a library at the institute. The absence of research and publication division does not allow the institute to produce training material or publications based on its experience.

---

<sup>1</sup> Though they work in the capacity of instructors their designations such as Deputy Directors and Assistant Directors seem to be inappropriate. According to their functional duties they may be designated as senior instructors and instructors.



## CHAPTER IV

### ADVANCED TRAINING OF THE CIVIL SERVANTS

The present chapter deals with the second phase of advanced training in public administration. It is the policy of government of Pakistan that initial training at the departmental institutions may be followed by advanced training, though it may be selective at the higher level where officers of demonstrated potential for growth may be selected for training specially designed for the improvement of the administrative abilities.<sup>1</sup> The aim is to get them acquainted with the developments in the administrative practices and to have a better understanding and appreciation of their responsibilities in the implementation of successive Five Year Plans.

The authors of the First Five Year Plan sensing the indiscretion of having to entrust the implementation of the plan to the care of inadequately trained and equipped administrators voiced their apprehension in these words, "in the period immediately ahead, the inadequacy of Pakistan's Administrative Machinery will operate as the most serious single impediment to the maximum economic use of the country's financial

---

<sup>1</sup> Cabinet Secretariat, Establishment Division, Notification No. 1/23/60 EX, 1960.

and material resources."<sup>1</sup>

Though well conscious of this need for the in-service training of its personnel, Government could not take immediate action for the launching of an over-all training programme mainly for the want of enough funds and the absence of the requisite number of training staff, a problem that was and is being faced by most developing countries. To partially overcome this difficulty the first stage in the development of in-service training reflected a reliance on sending officers of the superior civil services to the United States and other western countries for training.

The results of this were not too happy. "Since the program got under way in the United States at the beginning of 1958 one principle became evident and was always emphasised in the course of the program. This was the clear and explicit belief that a program of executive Development for officers of the government of Pakistan conducted in the United States, would not be related in any way to the political or administrative problems of Pakistan."<sup>2</sup> The officers thus trained found on their return that the duties they were called upon to perform, had no relation to the training they had received abroad. It was therefore

---

<sup>1</sup> Government of Pakistan, The First Five Year Plan (Karachi: National Planning Commission, 1955), p. 100.

<sup>2</sup> Robert H. Berkob, "Executive Development for Pakistan," NIPA Reporter (Karachi: 1962), p. 5.

felt that complete reliance could not be placed on the training abroad and the need for a pyramidal structure of in-service training institutes imparting training geared to the specific needs of Pakistan was realised. As a consequence a number of institutes were established to cater to the training needs of government officials belonging to the higher echelons of the administrative hierarchy. These are the West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, which provides training in the rural development administration and orientation of approach in field work; the National Institute of Public Administration, intended for officers of middle level seniority associated with public administration in the secretariat sphere and in the field, and the Administrative Staff College which is meant for senior executives expected to occupy posts involving higher responsibilities, in the near future.

#### I. West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development

The First Five Year Plan of the Government of Pakistan included the establishment of two Academies for Rural Development, one in the East Wing and the other in the West Wing of the country. The academies were intended to be for advanced training of the officers of Village Agricultural and Industrial Development Administration<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The Village Agricultural Industrial programme (commonly known as V-AID) was started towards the beginning of 1953. The specific objective of the programme was to channelise the extension activities (see next page)

and other nation building and administrative departments.

The Academies were established in 1957 at Camila in East Pakistan and Peshawar in West Pakistan under a Resolution<sup>1</sup> of the Pakistan Government.<sup>2</sup> As a first step the Government established autonomous Boards of governors for the Academies to formulate general policies

---

of the nation building departments, directly involved in the socio-economic development of the country, through one single agency on self-help basis. The first Five Year Plan attached the highest importance to V-AID programme:

"Because of the overriding importance of the rural development programme and the crucial role of V-AID in stimulating it, we have given the highest priority in the plan to this programme." Government of Pakistan, National Planning Board, The First Five Year Plan 1955-60 (Karachi: 1957), ch. XIII, paragraph 5.

A case study of what happened to a highly ideal democratic reform movement (V-AID) when it encountered the bureaucratic legacy of colonialism has been made by Jack D. Mezirow who asserted that "it was the second largest enterprise of this kind in the world, involving an expenditure of over 35 million and a staff of some 5,000 persons" Jack D. Mezirow, Dynamics of Community Development (New York: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1963), p. 3.

<sup>1</sup> "... The government of Pakistan wide their order dated 4th July, 1957, have approved a scheme for establishing two Pakistan Academies for Village Development to conduct research and provide advanced training in rural development administration, for the administrative and supervisory personnel of the Village AID Administration and for other Nation Building Departments as well as for C.S.P. and Provincial Civil Service Officers." Government of Pakistan, Cabinet Res. No. 18 (i) V A - 1/57 - A (Karachi: 4th July, 1957).

<sup>2</sup> The Ford Foundation, in consultation with the government of Pakistan and the International Cooperation Administration (AID), selected the Michigan State University to help the faculties of the two Academies in defining their role and drawing up a blue print of their programme.

and programmes.<sup>1</sup> The Boards have both official and non-official representation on them.<sup>2</sup>

The task before the Academy is to create in the administrators a new outlook, by giving a new orientation to administrative techniques and practices so that:

Waste and duplication due to lack of coordination between the various branches of government, is eliminated; confusion and frequent delays are reduced to the minimum by establishing proper communication between different levels of administration.<sup>3</sup>

To achieve these objectives, the Academy provides an executive level training employing the latest scientifically developed techniques and attempts to "instil in the participants the spirit of community development and an awareness of the new arts and sciences of modern public administration, employing skills in human relations."<sup>4</sup>

Two types of courses are offered at the Academy - Orientation courses and training courses. The orientation courses are generally for a maximum duration of four weeks or less, and the regular training courses are for a maximum duration of twelve weeks but not less than

---

<sup>1</sup> The present study is confined to West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development at Peshawar only.

<sup>2</sup> The Central Minister of Health, Labour and Social Welfare is the Chairman of these Boards. Three out of twelve members of the Board for Academy at Peshawar have been taken from the public. West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, Announcement of Training Programme (Peshawar: 1964-65), p. 7.

<sup>3</sup> West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, Op. cit., p. 11.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid.

four weeks.<sup>1</sup> The method of training, which the Academy has evolved, is team approach. It is intended to bring about and reflect an inter-disciplinary approach to the problems of administration in the sphere of national development. This leads the Academy to experimentation in various techniques such as presentation of subject matter by a panel of specialists, small group session and individual consultations.<sup>2</sup>

Though the curriculum outline has been drawn up with the intention of providing a base to the various disciplines represented in the Academy yet an ideal rather than a realistic image of participants<sup>3</sup> has been developed by the Academy.<sup>4</sup>

A participant is expected to assume the roles of a citizen, of a community development proctitioner and of a Public Administrator.

---

<sup>1</sup> As a matter of fact, the duration of a course is determined according to the time for which the government officers of various categories are spared by their parent departments, for training purposes.

<sup>2</sup> The abondenment of traditional lecture-listener relationship in the classroom and adopting the problem-centred inter-disciplinary teaching approach is impressive indication of progress made by the Academy in this behalf. Mezrów, Op. cit., p. 181.

<sup>3</sup> The term 'participant' to the term 'trainee' because, according to the faculty, a training programme of the type taken by them would not be effective and fruitful unless the faculty and the participants share their knowledge and experience effectively.

<sup>4</sup> The Academy's image becomes fully visible in a draft manual which its faculty prepared for deputy directors of the National Development Organization. West Pakistan Academy for the Rural Development, A Draft Manual for Deputy Directors N.D.O. West Pakistan (Peshawar: Academy for Rural Development, 1964), p. 8.

The curriculum has therefore been divided into three phases, corresponding to the roles of the participants.<sup>1</sup>

The first phase of training programme lays stress on the participant to acquire knowledge of self and the community he lives in. The subject matter of the section comprises of social and cultural expectations and commitments of a citizen, his receptivity to new ideas and practices and their effective communication; awareness of the need of the community and the need for organizing the community in accordance with the resources of the community and their developmental potential, including political and social; and finally the need and role of government in community organizing.

The second phase highlights the role of the participant as a community development practitioner. It emphasises, those aspects of the job requirements of an administrator which bring him into close contact with the people whose participation and involvement in an effective implementation of all types of development programme is most essential. This phase of the training programme concentrates on community organization as an instrument for producing lasting results leading to national progress and welfare of the people. The syllabi

---

<sup>1</sup> West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, Op. cit., pp. 14-18.

include theory and principles of community development, history of Community Development in India and Pakistan, community development in other countries, knowledge of the structure of rural society and techniques of community development.

In the last phase attention is focussed on the role of the participant as a Public Administrator with a view to preparing him for the type of administrative behavior, Role of the Administrator in the process of social change and application of human relations in administration and development administration.

From a critical point of view, at the first phase, a training programme of this character cannot be confined merely to the imparting of knowledge through a prescribed course of studies. It has to be more comprehensive in its scope. Moreover, any training programme designed by an academic institution should take into account the requirements of those groups which participate in the training. While "attempting to introduce enduring democratic behavioral changes in a training or classroom, it is essential that the learner sees the educational experience as a way of satisfying his personal needs and goals," vis-a-vis his role as an administrator.<sup>1</sup> Secondly to achieve its broad objectives and to cater for its wide ranged clientele, the

---

<sup>1</sup> Mezirow, Op. cit., p. 180.



Academy should engage in many other allied activities rather than to confine itself merely to academic training. These activities may include promotion of research, evolving of a set of operational principles for the guidance of the participants so that they may function as agents of change and to prepare the participants intellectually and socially to enable them to bring scientific objectivity to problems of development.

To have a fuller and more effective impact training has to be imparted in a way that brings out the best in the participants. It should go beyond their mere role requirements, prescribed in their employment terms and conditions. In other words a method of training has to be evolved which is flexible enough to include as well ensure the maximum involvement of the participant in the different phases of the training programme. The participants should be invited to contribute to the discussion in the form of illustrations, field experiences and problems. This will make the participants actual contributors in the process of training rather than mere recipients of knowledge.

Besides the Director, the Academy's faculty may include instructors in Rural Economics, Public Administration, Community Development, Rural Business Management, Education, Rural Sociology, as well as research specialists. The Michigan State University helps the Academy

not only in determining the composition of its staff and their training but also placed the services of two resident advisors at its disposal.<sup>1</sup> The faculty members, though highly qualified and well trained<sup>2</sup> in their respective fields are not fully aware of the real problems confronted by the participants (who had worked for many years in the rural areas). It was observed by the West Pakistan Village AID Administration that "the faculty of the Academy in Peshawar initially lacked sufficient experience with problems of the development areas to provide the technical level training required by development officers and supervisors."<sup>3</sup> If training for rural development is to be fully effective, the trainers must themselves closely observe the working of community development programmes, and collect first hand information, which would help them in giving final shape to the training programme.

The last phase of the training programme comprises tests and evaluations. During this phase the participants also evaluate and

---

<sup>1</sup> The Academy has had the opportunity of having Dr. Albert Levak, Dr. Cole Brambeck, Dr. Harry Friedman and Dr. Daniel Stuart as advisors. Dr. La Palombara also paid courtesy visit to the Academy.

<sup>2</sup> The faculty members spent nearly nine months at the Michigan State University campus and another two months in selected countries, under the auspices of the I.C.A. (now AID) observing the community development programme in action.

<sup>3</sup> Mezirow, Op. cit., p. 176.

comment on the activities of the Academy by showing the effects of the faculty. However, these are favourable indications, but in fact such evaluations prove no more than that the officers who have undergone the training course feel that they have benefited from it. "To change one's attitude is never easy, and for senior officers with many years experience of formal administration it can be very hard indeed."<sup>1</sup> It is true that one can formulate questionnaires and quantified the answers received, but it is doubtful whether one can precisely measure a change of attitudes, because most of the answers will reflect no more than the mere opinions of the participants.

All members of the instructional staff have dual responsibility for training and research.<sup>2</sup> Furthermore, two positions, that of research specialist and research associate, are exclusively with the organization of research in the Academy. During the past few years, a research cell with three Research Investigators, has been established around these two positions. Although the research projects initiated and completed during the last two years have not emerged as part of any set master plan, however, the research so far completed can be classified into two categories; that which is designed to analyse

---

<sup>1</sup> T.R. Batten, Training for Community Development: A critical Study of Method (London: Oxford University Press, 1963), p. 8.

<sup>2</sup> West Pakistan Academy, Op. cit., p. 21.

the specific problems of the clientele of the Academy, and that which provides descriptive and analytical material for understanding the general problems of administration in Pakistan.<sup>1</sup>

In the final analysis, the importance of research in a country like Pakistan which is undergoing a planned social change can hardly be overemphasised and if the Academy's commitments to give empirical bias to the training are to be fulfilled the planned research activity is indispensable for it.

## II. National Institute of Public Administration

The National Institute of Public Administration, Lahore, West Pakistan, caters to the training requirements of those officials who are in the middle of their careers. The proposal for such an institute was originally made by Rowland Egger:

Pakistan needs an institution to encourage and to facilitate systematic attention on the part of its civil servants to problems of Public Administration. No better model for such an instrumentality can be found than the Institute of Public Administration in London.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Most of the research projects are underway which include, impact of V-AID on Rural Development, Study of Family Planning, Attitudes of Farmers towards self-help and Studies of Basic Democracies.

<sup>2</sup> Egger, Op. cit., p. 68.

To apprise the public servants of the changed circumstances,<sup>1</sup> to orientate their outlook towards developmental programmes and to make them aware of the goals set out in the First Five Year Plan, and the role they were required to play in the national development. The Planning Board also suggested establishment of such training institute:

In order to stimulate interest in Public Administration as a subject of study and research in Political, Administrative, professional and academic circles, it is necessary to establish a subsidised but autonomous institute of Public Administration.<sup>2</sup>

However, the idea of the National Institute of Public Administration assumed a concrete shape in the form of an agreement reached

---

<sup>1</sup> Soon after partition the government of Pakistan realized that the system of administration inherited from the British needs a searching analysis. To review the overall organizational structure and administrative system, government appointed various committees/commissions from time to time. These bodies were required to review and recommend changes in the context of a development administration. Some of these committees/commissions were: the Federal Reorganization Committee, The West Pakistan Council of Administration, the Central Administrative Reorganization Committee, the Provincial Administration Commission and the Provincial Reorganization Committee. To this one may add such factors as the integration of the provinces and states in Pakistan and establishment of new public agencies and public corporations. All this readjustment of the administrative machinery, the additions and alterations and the new synthesis emerging out of these changes, demands a clear understanding on the part of government servants.

<sup>2</sup> Government of Pakistan, The First Five Year Plan (Karachi: National Planning Commission, 1956), p. 125.

between the governments of Pakistan and the United States. The agreement provided for the establishment of a National Institute of Public Administration with divisions at Lahore, Dacca and Karachi. Each of these institutes works under a separate semi-autonomous board. The Board for NIPA Lahore is headed by the Additional Chief Secretary to the government of West Pakistan.<sup>1</sup> The Senior American Advisor to the Institute and the Director of the United States Agency for International Development or his representative act as Advisors to the Board.

The National Institute of Public Administration has been established primarily to improve the efficiency of the government officials. "Its main purpose is to re-orientate the officials in ideas and outlook and to prepare them well with new techniques and skills which would be needed when they are called upon to fill the higher posts."<sup>2</sup>

The Government officers who receive training at NIPA are of the status of Deputy Secretaries, Deputy Commissioners or equivalent rank; Senior Assistant Commissioners likely to be considered for promotion to the rank of Deputy Commissioner or a post of equivalent rank.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> A.M. Sanaul Haq, "Middle Management Training," Symposium on Management Training in Public Administration (Ankara: Central Treaty Organization, 1964), p. 135.

<sup>2</sup> Haq, Op. cit., p. 135.

<sup>3</sup> It is relevant to mention that the Central Government has made training in NIPA obligatory for all such officers who are likely to be considered for promotion to the posts of Commissioners of division, joint secretary to the Central Government and equivalent appointment. (See next page)

The activities of the NIPA are not restricted to training programmes only. It is also committed to a study of the process of public administration in its different aspects and phases at various levels in Pakistan. Thus the NIPA is concerned with the training of government servants, research in Public Administration and building up of consultation services. It is within the framework of this training policy that the NIPA has been engaged in the past five years.

Although the in-service course of the NIPA is restricted to the teaining of middle management through a basic course, known as 'Advanced Management and Development Programme,' short refresher courses are also organized to meet the specific requirements of officers both of top management and lower management.<sup>1</sup>

---

Government of Pakistan, letter No. 2/17/61 A IV, dated 31st October, 1961, President Secretariat, Establishment Division, Rawalpind. Major objective of the NIPA is to impart training to the middle level officers with six to thirteen years seniority but the institute is not committed to this group alone.

<sup>1</sup> Leonard D. White has distinguished three levels of administrative responsibility; general management, involving duties of policy making and the coordinating governmental machinery at the department level; intermediate management, relating to the leadership of agency sub-divisions and the preliminary preparation of policy; and first line supervision, involving maintenance of out and preservation of morales. Introduction to the Study of Public Administration (New York: the Macmillan Co., 1955), chs. 14-15.

The basic course is of three months duration, seventy two days to be precise. Each institute runs two of these courses a year. Although there is a single basic syllabus for this course, there is some variance at each institute. The broad objectives of the training courses are to increase knowledge of participants regarding the principles and process of Public Administration; to impart to the participants new approaches and improved management skills and procedures; to provide basic knowledge of some of the salient elements of Development Economics, and finally to afford government officers an opportunity to share their ideas, experiences and insights with each other and thus develop in them a feeling of fraternity and a spirit of mutual cooperation.<sup>1</sup>

The distinctive feature of the training course at NIPA is its programme contents. In these programmes emphasis is on Development Economics and Management. The three months basic course is divided into four phases. The first phase, called Introduction to Public Administration is devoted to the historical background of administration and the comparative study of Public Administration, with special reference to Indo-Pak sub-continent.

---

<sup>1</sup> National Institute of Public Administration, Brochure (Lahore: 1964-65).



The second phase, designed as 'Development Economics,' deals with factors in economic development, human and natural resources and their management and administrative requirements for economic development such as the planning process, preparation of development schemes and implementation of the plans, according to the broad objectives laid down by the Five Year Plans.

The third phase is concerned with the Management Process including policy formulations, organization and Methods, Leadership and human relations and the use of statistics in Public Administration.

The last phase ~~titled as~~ Public Administrator and the Public Interest comprises of the nature of public interest, the Administrator and the Citizen, control of corruption in public administration, social welfare and national integration. During this phase group discussions and seminars are arranged on special areas, such as private enterprise, concept of administration in Islam, and emerging role of civil servants. This phase is also highlighted by seminar papers on participants' study projects.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Each of the participants, in addition to attend the regular classes, is responsible for doing a research project or study. This gives them experience in selecting topics of significance in Public Administration and in collecting, analysing and writing a report, and making recommendations, wherever necessary.

Besides the regular training programmes, special courses of varying types and durations are also run by the institute. Most common and of significance among these is the Management Analysis Course.<sup>1</sup>

As for the training methodology, the institute does not restrict itself to a particular technique. "It plans to make use of all such modern methods of instruction as are appropriate to the attainment of its training objectives."<sup>2</sup> Though the main aim is to reduce the lecture method to minimum but so far the NIPA has not succeeded in it.<sup>3</sup>

Initially almost entire teaching staff consisted of the American professors. Most of them were members of the University of Southern California who carried the main bulk of the courses. Later on, the instructional staff was gradually replaced by Pakistani

---

<sup>1</sup> The management analysis course differs from the regular Advanced Management course in two major aspects. First, the scope of the subject matter of the advanced course is much wider and includes extensive and intensive study of Public Administration and Development Economics. The Management Analysis course, in contrast, is a specialized course oriented towards Management Analysis techniques. The second difference lies in the training methodology. Advanced course employs on an extensive scale, the research project method, tutorials, field trips, besides seminars and lectures.

<sup>2</sup> Inayat Ullah, Bureaucracy and Development in Pakistan (Peshawar: Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1963), p. 430.

<sup>3</sup> During the third Advanced Management course the lectures took 167 hours, practical exercises or work sessions 22 hours and seminars or group discussions 28 hours. Haq, Op. cit., p. 142.

universities, senior government officers, and other prominent members of the public are invited as guest speakers to give talks on their respective fields of interests. From a critical point of view such guest speakers are often of no help to the institute in developing its programme. They fail to maintain the theme of the course. Hence a gradual reduction of the guest speakers would be desirable as and when the professional staff at NIPA mature and develop.<sup>1</sup>

A distinctive feature of the training method at NIPA is the most effective use of modern Audio-visual teaching aids, such as documentary films, film strip projector, slides, tape recorder, over-head projector and stencilling equipment.

Of all the participative methods used in the institute, seminar type of training allows, comparatively speaking, more active participation and involves every one in the discussion under the guidance of instructors. The participants receive greater benefit through this process than by the traditional classroom approach. But the problem in the use of this method is that "the participants do not generally read the literature and material required to be

---

<sup>1</sup> Agency for International Development, Public Administration Program in Pakistan (Los Angeles: University of Southern California, 1965), p. 74.

studied by them in advance."<sup>1</sup> This renders the discussions less meaningful and the method of training less effective.

Field trip is also employed as a training method. During the last phase of the training programme the participants go out on field trips in the interior of the country. The objective is to relate the classroom sessions to the actual problems of the socio-economic changes taking place in the country. It also provides an opportunity to acquaint the participants with the difficulties and problems experienced by the various agencies in the implementations of the national development plans. For this purpose, the participants are divided into four or five groups of five members each. Each group, after making on-the-spot studies of the various development projects, is required to submit a joint report on an assigned topic. The purpose of this report is to test the power of application of the skills and techniques acquired during the training.

Though the NIPA Lahore has a research section comprising of a few Research Associates and Research Officers, "research still continues to be one of the weaker aspects of the activities of the NIPA."<sup>2</sup> The

---

<sup>1</sup> Ibid.

<sup>2</sup> Agency for International Development, Op. cit., p. 12.

main functions of this section is to arrange studies in administrative problems in general and those peculiar to Pakistan in particular, and preparation of basic documentation concerning the teaching of public administration. The fact that the NIPA started with a series of training programmes, in quick succession, has tended to obscure, to some extent, its other basic objectives such as research in public administration, consultation services to the government and publication of teaching and reference material, drawn from Pakistan's experience in Public Administration.

At the end of every training programme review and evaluation sessions are held. The purpose is to assess the degree to which participants are absorbing the principles and methods given and to know their ideas for the improvement of training courses. Furthermore participants behavior and their reaction to the different topics under discussion is closely observed by the NIPA staff.

At the conclusion of each course a questionnaire is drawn up by the faculty members the results of which are compiled. The Institute keeps a file for each participant in which his rating sheets are kept. At the conclusion of each course the final rating is compiled from the various rating sheets and a report is submitted to government (and other agencies to which the participants belong) of

course performance and an assessment of each participant.

### III. Pakistan Administrative Staff College

The Pakistan Administrative Staff College forms the apex of the pyramidal structure of in-service training institutions in Pakistan.<sup>1</sup> Before the college came into being there was a big gap in the arrangement for the training of higher civil servants. The National Planning Board held that this gap should be filled up immediately with the establishment of an Administrative Staff College "to provide refresher courses in Public Administration or in particular aspects of it,"<sup>2</sup> and suggested that "such an institution can also usefully serve industry and business, which in Pakistan suffer greatly from lack of administrative skills."<sup>3</sup>

The idea of the Planning Board was further emphasized and supported in early 1960 by two eminent scholars namely, Dean Harlan Cleveland of Syracuse University and Sir Noel F. Hall, then Principal, Administrative Staff College, Henley-on-thames. In their report

---

<sup>1</sup> Ultimately the success of the training programmes of all other institutions in Pakistan is inextricably linked with the programme of Administrative Staff College in as much as the training product of other institutions would be working under the higher administrators coming for training to this college.

<sup>2</sup> First Five Year Plan, Op. cit., p. 126.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid.

they stated that Pakistan requires,

More than any other one thing, an expanding number of broader-gauged executive leaders or men able to mould the efforts of more and more type of specialists into workable and dynamic patterns of administration.<sup>1</sup>

Another factor that lead to the creation of Administrative Staff College was that on account of acute shortage of officers junior officers, without proper training, were being rapidly promoted to higher posts to fill up the gap which occurred in the administrative machinery after independence.<sup>2</sup> Moreover the rapidly growing demands for skilled and experienced administrators, as in other developing countries, made it imperative that capabilities and effectiveness of those already in leading positions should be improved to the greatest possible extent.

The policy of the government of Pakistan is to provide training facilities for officers in all major sectors of administration including field and secretarial officers, scientific and technical staff and business executives.<sup>3</sup> In accordance with this policy the Administrative Staff College was established in December, 1960.

In all its essentials, the college is patterned on the principle and model of Administrative Staff College at Henley-on-Thames, in

---

<sup>1</sup> Pakistan Administrative Staff College, The College at Work (Lahore: Administrative Staff College, 1963), p. 6.

<sup>2</sup> Egger, Op. cit., p. 67.

<sup>3</sup> First Five Year Plan, Op. cit., pp. 111-113.

England,<sup>1</sup> with some modifications to suit the circumstances in Pakistan. It may be relevant in this connection to discuss some of the distinguishing features of the Administrative Staff College, at Henley.

The college was founded in 1946 and started functioning in 1948. The major purpose of the college is not, primarily, to extend or impart knowledge, but to cultivate administrative skills and talents, and to develop an awareness among the participants (known as the members) which may help them in tackling their own jobs with a broader vision and deeper understanding.<sup>2</sup> The college provides a new approach to leadership training in that the members are drawn from both public and private sectors on the presumption that problems of administration in these sectors have common features

---

<sup>1</sup> The model of administrative staff college at Henley has been adopted in widely scattered parts of the world. India established an Administrative Staff College at Hyderabad on the basic ideas and procedures of Henley. J.W.L. Adams, Henley and Hyderabad, "Indian Journal of Public Administration, Vol. IV (March, 1958), pp. 66-78.

In Australia a similar institution was set up in 1957. Sir Douglas Copland, "The Australian Administrative Staff College," Public Administration, Vol. XVI (Sydney: March, 1957), pp. 105-108.

For a detailed analysis of the college see: Marshal E. Dimock, "The Administrative Staff College: An Executive Development in Government and Industry," The American Political Science Review Vol. L (March 1956), pp. 166-176.

Sir Noel F. Hall, "The Administrative Staff College," Public Administration, Vol. XIV (Sydney, March, 1955), pp. 1-21.

<sup>2</sup> Adams, Op. cit., pp. 67-68.



which require the constructive skill and techniques of leadership, policy making and planning.

As specialization and hierarchical increase in scope and as business administration becomes more and more political - that is concerned with policy decision, group relations, and institutional influence and survival the bureaucratic problems and executive needs of business and government become increasingly alike.<sup>1</sup>

Thus the significance of the Henley programme is its recognition that government and business executive should be trained in common problems of policy and administration so that they may understand each other and take independent but consistent decisions.<sup>2</sup>

The Henley college managed by an independent Board of Governors is free from political and economic bias. It is financed by private funds from business institutions and individuals and tuition fees is paid by the employers on behalf of their employees under training. Although the college at Lahore is also run by an independent Board of Governors but unlike Henley college it is financed by the Government of Pakistan. However the employers contribute to the boarding and travelling expenses of the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> Dimock, Op. cit., p. 167.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid., p. 166.

The College at Henley holds three sessions of twelve weeks each, in a year. Each session is attended by a group of sixty persons. Out of these only six are from the Civil Service and the rest from the broad field of industry and commerce. Most of the participants at Lahore College, on the other hand, are drawn from government departments.

The main parts of the course at the Henley College are comparative administrative structures, interval organization and administration, external relations and constructive administration. The training is imported through 'syndicate' method which first developed at Henley College is a form of mostly self education of mature executives by means of small working groups called syndicates.<sup>1</sup> At Lahore, in addition to syndicate method, the college employs seminar in its training methodology. At Henley, "the subject matter of the course of studies is divided not in the way that a professor would divide his subject, designed to advance the boundaries of knowledge."<sup>2</sup> It is divided into seventeen parts and each part could be handled by a student chairman, and is coherent in itself. Each member of the syndicate in turn acts as chairman of the syndicate for a subject.

---

<sup>1</sup> Ward Stewart, "Recent Trends in Teaching Methods," Education in Public Administration (Brussels: International Institute of Administrative Sciences, 1963), p. 177.

<sup>2</sup> Hall, Op. cit., p. 11.

The college has already won international reputation for its work and in the words of Professor Dimock, "the most interesting experiment in the world today for the student of comparative administration and business and government is the Administrative Staff College at Henley-on-Thames in England."<sup>1</sup>

The chief aim of Administrative staff college at Lahore is "to widen the experience of those who already occupy senior positions in government, in public corporations and in the private sector of industry and commerce."<sup>2</sup> The twelve weeks course is designed to provide an opportunity for thirty higher executives participating in it to obtain a better understanding of the new environment in which they work, to study the administrative problems involved in the national development programme, to examine some of the new plans and projects now underway and to develop awareness of the complexity of development administration and, finally, in this entire process to develop an appreciation for the importance of personal initiative and enterprise.

The participants are generally of the ages between thirty five and forty five. This age group commensurates with the governments policy regarding the level of officers to be trained at the college such as Joint Secretaries and officers of equivalent status, senior

---

<sup>1</sup> Dimock, Op. cit., p. 166.

<sup>2</sup> Symposium on Management Training, Op. cit., p. 165.

deputy secretaries and deputy commissioners or officers of equivalent rank likely to be considered for promotion to the rank of joint secretary (Appendix I).<sup>1</sup>

At the staff college Lahore, the courses of studies both in content and method, have been specially prepared to meet the needs, age and experience of the men under training. The idea is to give participants a fresh understanding of the significance of their present work and to prepare them for higher responsibilities which they will assume in near future.<sup>2</sup>

For the civil servants it provides opportunities to re-examine their present work in the larger setting of the work of government as a whole by examining a wider range of public policies and practices and to acquire an awareness of the problems of private sector. On the other hand, for business executives it provides opportunities to

---

<sup>1</sup> The selection of candidates further depends on availability, suitability and requirement of the college that there shall be in each session a well balanced mixture of members with different working experience and from different regions. In the case of public corporations and the private sector, the college keeps in touch with individual organizations and representative bodies such as Chamber of Commerce and the nominations by such bodies are scrutinized by the college in consultation with the establishment division of the Cabinet Secretariat. At the present three vacancies are reserved for the overseas candidates belonging to public services only and provided they have at least fourteen years of experience in positions of responsibility.

<sup>2</sup> Symposium, Op. cit., p. 166.

compare business practices with those in the public service by presenting their views on the issues discussed and acquainting themselves with the views of the participants from public sector. Both have to work in the same developing environment and need to be aware of the political, economic and social changes that are taking place around them and the way these changes may effect their work. Both need to follow the path set for development by the Five Year Plans, and to see their responsibilities in perspective within the plans, understand the policies of government and the way they effect their daily work. Moreover, both have to make use of the growing body of knowledge available in them and the techniques that can help them do their jobs.

The major areas of work covered by the syllabus are general Administration, programme administration (the constitution and local government), development administration, development economics, biographical studies in leadership and field research.<sup>1</sup>

In designing the training methodology the college has drawn inspiration from two internationally known and well established institutions of the world; the Administrative Staff College at Henley in Britain and the Maxwell Graduate School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, in the United States.

---

<sup>1</sup> Pakistan Staff Administrative College, Op. cit., p. 7.

From the Henley College comes the syndicate method. For syndicate work, which covers about two third of the session, the college is divided into three groups of at least ten each. Though each group consists of a balanced mixture of the available experience within the session it is not as heterogenous as that at Henley.<sup>1</sup> The syndicates thus formed discuss, during the entire session, thirteen subjects divided into five parts.

The first part entitled "National Development," is an examination of the aims of national economic development and some of the problems it raises. The second part deals with "Use of National Resources" and has been splitted into three divisions: key problems in education, local government and social welfare. The third part consists of such topics as recruitment, training and promotion, administrative responsibility, the public corporations, organization for development, financial control, budgeting and accounting, planning and development fields such as food, agriculture and industry. The last part covers only one subject, namely the role of the admi-

---

<sup>1</sup> At Henley, in each session there are thirty places for representatives from commerce and industry and the rest include six from the central civil service, two from local government, two from armed forces, two from banking and eight from the national industries. Dimock, Op. cit., p. 170.

The average number of participants from private sector at the Lahore College, so far, has been two to three members per session. Pakistan Administrative Staff College, Brochure, Op. cit., p.

nistrator in the public and private sector. In this part the work done in the session is reviewed as a whole and the responsibilities of the senior administrators with particular reference to the practical problems of administration are discussed.<sup>1</sup>

The syndicate works under a chairman and a secretary nominated from amongst its members. The chairman and the secretary change for each subject, which a syndicate may at any time be dealing with. The chairman leads and conducts the work of the syndicate on the subject for which he is responsible and the secretary records the minutes and generally prepares the reports. The chairman and the secretary are handed over copies of the "brief" which is a short statement of the field to be studied, prepared by the staff, along with an extract from the main college time table. They are also briefed by the members of the directing staff orally with regard to the scope and implications of the subject and other allied matters. A brief reading list on each subject is also given to all members who then take up the discussion in the light of their own experience and whatever they are able to glean from the literature on the subject. One member of the directing staff attends every syndicate meeting to provide guidance.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Ullah, Op. cit., p. 420.

<sup>2</sup> Generally, member of the directing staff acts as an observer and consultant, intervening only to contribute ideas or experience of his own, if he thinks he has a point which has not been brought out by some member of the syndicate, or to help the chairman if he has got into difficulties. To emphasize this detached role of the Directing Staff, they sit, away from the main table, at a desk of their own, in the syndicate room.

✓  
desk

At the opening meeting of the syndicate the chairman explains to the members, briefly, the scope of the study; a tentative plan for conducting the study; and delegates the work to be undertaken. While a subject is under discussion of the syndicate distinguished guest speakers are invited to speak. The college staff also arranges for the benefit of the members, talks by and discussions with the distinguished visitors, and visits to government departments, industrial establishments and other places of interest.

At the end of the assigned period for the subject each syndicate is required to come to definite conclusions and make recommendations which the chairman submits in the form of a report. The final report of each syndicate is circulated to all members of the college, including the Principal and the directing staff. The reports then are discussed in a general session of all the syndicates where the college staff is also present. At this session, the reports are discussed with particular reference to any controversial or significant problem in the reports, for further exchange of views. The chairman of each syndicate defends the report submitted by him on behalf of his syndicate.

In syndicate method the emphasis is on group work; and because of the special character of the syndicate method of self instruction, the college, more than any other training institution in Pakistan,



depends for its success on the variety of the candidates coming forward. It is equally important that the college should make the right selection to ensure that it gets a right balance of members in each session. At Henley, the candidates are nominated by the employers and selected by the college, if possible, after an interview and assessment of the candidate whether they would fit well into the college programme. This object is promoted by the fact that all interviews are held at the college.<sup>1</sup> In Pakistan this is very difficult; the journey to Lahore from most parts of the country, is long and expensive.

There is much merit in this group method, provided it is applied in its entirety. It induces the members to draw on their own resources by encouraging originality and innovation. It provides a working equivalent of what is found in actual administration. "But most of all it teaches men, through long hours of knock-down and drag-out discussions, to respect each others opinions."<sup>2</sup> The college at Lahore has modified the syndicate method employed at Henley."<sup>3</sup> Such deviations have, to some extent, hampered its merits. The emphasis,

---

<sup>1</sup> Adams, Op. cit., p. 76.

<sup>2</sup> Dimock, Op. cit., p. 172.

<sup>3</sup> Sumposium, Op. cit., p. 169.

in courses of study at Lahore, is on theory<sup>1</sup> whereas "the non-parading of the theory or doctrine that lies under the courses are the significant features of the method,"<sup>2</sup> followed at Henley.

The essential thing is the mixing - the essential thing is that they do it themselves - the essential thing is that during the period of twelve week that they are with us at least forty people, very highly qualified from all walks of life come down and spend as much time as is necessary working with these men around the table.<sup>3</sup>

Again the period devoted to syndicates, at Lahore, is insignificant. It is obvious that the longer period is one secret of Henley's success.<sup>4</sup> "A quickie (sic) may impart information but is unlikely to change attitudes or to ripen one's reflections and insights."<sup>5</sup> Moreover, it is an essential requisite of the syndicate system that there should be a carefully thought out plan for each syndicate to achieve its proper effectiveness but the shortage of directing staff at Lahore<sup>6</sup> does not allow such planning and unless this is not done painstakingly the college will not be able to make its full impact on the members attitudes.

---

<sup>1</sup> Appendix II, The Courses of Studies at the Staff Administrative College.

<sup>2</sup> Hall, Op. cit., p. 11.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid., p. 12.

<sup>4</sup> Dimock, Op. cit., p. 169.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid.

<sup>6</sup> At present there are only two members of the directing staff.

The second type of methodology is the seminar on the lines of similar work done at the Syracuse University in the United States.<sup>1</sup> In the seminar the emphasis changes to a combination of the two, individual work and group, with emphasis on the former. The substance of the work done in seminar is the theory and the practice of Development Administration and Development Economics and every member is required a paper on either of them. The object of the exercise is to encourage the members to develop the habit of precise thinking and to get his ideas crystalised. It also provides an opportunity to secure a background and understanding of the economic policies which effect them as administrators.

In the seminar the study is conducted under the leadership and guidance of a member of the directing staff. Here again, the framework of each task is prepared by the staff, which includes brief outlining of the study, questions for consideration and a list of suggested reading material. Each member is required to prepare, a preliminary report of about 1200 words. The report is circulated

---

<sup>1</sup> The College also works in close liaison with a distinguished group of American scholars of the faculty of Maxwell Graduate School of Citizenship and Public Affairs of Syracuse University, to promote an active comparative study into problems of development administration, based primarily on Pakistan and American experience but also incorporating materials available from other developing countries with similar problems. This work involves a mutual exchange of survey data, reports and findings.

to the other members of his seminar, two days in advance of the consideration of the report by the group. Following this presentation each member continues to work on his subject until the submission of a final paper of approximately 5000 words. This final report presents the member's own research, contributions made by his fellow participants and insights gained from the lectures by members of the directing staff.

The college has an independent section of research as well. Two staff members and a research director assist the members as well as conduct their own independent research projects.

In each session the college prepares the ground for two major exercises which entail exclusive research and study in the field, one in East Pakistan and the other in West Pakistan. The group is divided into two teams of equal strength for the purpose. The underlying idea to send the members in the field to study a programme or project for a period of nine or ten days and familiarize them with the techniques of research; and develop in them the skill to assess the value of a project or a programme in a short period. They are called upon to analyse a situation critically, to find out how it is being administered, to consider the problems that arise, to draw their own conclusions and make recommendation.

The research staff conducts investigations into specific problems of administrative and current development projects. The college has to its credit various research publications. The studies in progress are "Corruption in Administration," "A Study of Official Contact with Villagers" and "A Study of Delegation Practices in Pakistan."

The establishment of the Administrative staff college has contributed a great deal to the programme for developing higher administrators. Since the initiation of the college in 1960 up to the present nine sessions have been held at which 219 members have been trained (Public Sector 164; Private Sector 32; Public Corporations 13; Foreign 10).<sup>1</sup>

The college does not hold any terminal examinations. However the college staff observes and watches the performance of each member in the syndicate, the seminar, the conference room and the field where he goes out for field research and an assessment of their work is prepared by the college.

Though the college has not adopted any regular system of follow up to judge the influence of training on the job performance of those who have received training but it maintains close contacts with

---

<sup>1</sup> The figures produced here have been taken from: Conference on Public Administration "Working Paper on the Pakistan Administrative Staff College," (Lahore: Administrative Staff College, 1965), p. 1.

its ex-participants. Very recently a 'Review Course' lasting for three days and attended by members of the first and second sessions was held. However, it has been observed by the faculty of the College that every participant does grow during the training although some register higher growth than others:

Some of them come to us with the idea that they, being senior administrators with long years of experience behind them, cannot possibly learn anything new regarding administration within a period of three months. By the time they finish, the truth begins to dawn on them that they did not actually know what they had thought they knew.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Symposium on Management Training, Op. cit., pp. 169-170.

## CHAPTER V

### EVALUATION AND CONCLUSIONS

We may now review critically some of the important features of the existing arrangements for the training of civil servants in Pakistan. So far as the training institutes, in this study, are concerned they cater to the training needs of specified and mutually exclusive categories of officers and there is little overlapping in the training programmes laid down by them. There is, however, considerable scope for greater and more effective utilization of the training facilities available and of greater contribution towards the training programme.

#### Lack of planning and improper selection of trainees

The extent to which these institutions may be required to expand their training programmes would depend on the determination of specific training needs and the total number of officers available for training. In the absence of such information no planning can be developed effectively. There are three factors which determine the nature of planned purposive training, firsts, the objectives to be achieved by the training; second, the capacity of the persons to be trained; and third, the methods of training to be employed.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Lynton K. Caldwell, Improving the Public Service through Training (Washington 25, D.C.: Agency for International Development, 1962), p. 16.

Determination of training priorities and job responsibilities are both essential to effective training. The normal end-products of unplanned training are either irrelevant training or under-training or over-training. In any of these cases, the returned trainee is a square peg who effects the entire organization by trying to fit all others to himself. This phenomenon is substantiated by the oft-heard criticism of returned trainees as disruptive and dissatisfied.

To ensure that the training provided at these institutions is closely related to the needs of Pakistan a survey of the training needs may be undertaken.<sup>1</sup> Each department of government may be required to undertake, so far as possible, a complete assessment of its training needs, specifically for each category of officers, and appropriate measures may then be taken by the central personnel agency, in collaboration with the heads of the training institutions, to provide increased facilities for in-service training at these institutions. This appraisal should, of course, take into consideration the future circumstances and requirements and also provide for periodic reappraisals as no estimate of training needs can remain valid for an indefinite period. From such a limited survey at least

---

<sup>1</sup> Symposium on Management Training in Public Administration, Op. cit., p. 25.



the prime requirements could be determined.

The lack of planning and absence of a survey of training needs of various departments has hampered the systematized selection and regular inflow of officers to the training institutions. The present system of selection of officers for training at Civil Service Academy, Finance Service Academy, Police Training College and Secretariat Training Institute may be sound but the other institutions are confronted with many problems - not enough notice is given to the agencies and departments to make alternative arrangements in place of selectees and the would be trainees do not get adequate notice to prepare themselves mentally and physically to attend the training programmes. For training to be successful, the candidates must be properly screened and selected before hand.

An allied problem arising out of deficit planning is that of sub-optimum utilization of training facilities which are now available in the country. Two of the training institutes namely Rural Development Academy and National Institute of Public Administration are running short of the required strength of trainees.<sup>1</sup> These

---

<sup>1</sup> During the first three months training segment in 1964, the Rural Development Academy offered six courses designed to give training exposure to about 180 persons. Only 52 persons participated in these courses. West Pakistan Rural Academy, Op. cit., p. 21.  
(See next page)

institutes have been set up with a lot of investment, human, material and financial, on the part of government. In order to make the optimum utilization of all this investment it is necessary to devise a mechanism whereby nominations are made well in advance for each training course and nothing may be allowed to impede the proper flow of participants to these institutions.

Although, according to government policy,<sup>1</sup> training at one of these institutions for all level of officers is regarded an important condition not only for their future promotion, but also for retention of their present rank, yet the implications of the policy have not been grasped down the line by those concerned.

#### Coordination and cooperation among the institutes

At present, four of the training institutions, concerned with the initial training, are organized as integral parts of their parent departments. The other three are established as semi-autonomous bodies with their own Boards of governors. It seems that all the institutes enjoy considerable autonomy in academic matters but

---

National Institute of Public Administration is running a three months Advanced Management course for 25 participants, twice a year, but it never had more than 20 so far. In the sixth course held in May, 1965 it had only 14 participants. National Institute of Public Administration Inaugural Address of 6th Advanced Course in Management (Karachi, 1965), p. 2.

<sup>1</sup> Appendix I.

majority of them seems to be less autonomous in administrative and financial matters.

There is hardly any cooperation and coordination among these institutions, having the basic and common goal of imparting the training to civil servants. One might say that there are some physical difficulties in the way of effective coordination as some institutes are in West Pakistan and some in East Pakistan. But even among the six most important and leading institutions of in-service training in West Pakistan there appears to be hardly any cooperation and coordination. Regarding the lack of coordination among the Civil Service Academy and Finance Services Academy, Professor Braibanti observed that "although located only a few miles apart, the academies conduct no joint classes in subjects taught at both institutions and there is little social contact between the two groups of probationers or the faculties."<sup>1</sup> This is by no means a satisfactory state of affairs.

The Government of Pakistan set up an Administrative Training Council under the Establishment Division of Cabinet Secretariat in 1960, to provide broad policy guidance for all the administrative training institutions in the country and to ensure coordination in the field of training at all levels but since its inception, it remained most of the time inactive and could not keep the training

---

<sup>1</sup> Braibanti, Op. cit., p. 283.

institutions directed toward their original goals by allowing them to become side-tracked in activities which are important but not directly related to the major purpose for which they were created.<sup>1</sup>

There is a very strong need in Pakistan for a policy making body to meet systematically to define the goals for the institutions working in the field. This body exists but has not met since 1962.<sup>2</sup>

#### Decentralization of training

It has not been practicable to meet all the staff training needs of the country through a single central training agency such as National Training Council, due to the size of the Provinces and a considerable large number of the training institutions. Moreover any effective training scheme must necessarily provide for properly coordinated arrangements for in-service training at the Provincial levels. In view of the decentralization of the training arrangements it would be necessary that for the purposes of policy guidance and coordination of various training institutes, Provincial training

---

<sup>1</sup> One example of this was the acceptance of the NIPA's of the foreign orientation programmes. Another example is their acceptance of responsibilities for agency training. NIPA's would be better off by providing consultative services and developing trainers, with the present limited budget and staff rather than trying to provide all the training necessary for the entire government of Pakistan. Public Administration Program in Pakistan, Op. cit., p. 22.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

Councils, as counterparts of the National Training Council maybe set up in the Provinces. These Councils may undertake the responsibilities of Planning in the field of training, determination of personnel training requirements of Provincial government departments, selections of officers for training in their jurisdictions and maintenance of classified record of trained personnel and their proper utilization.

Training objectives and courses of studies

The training of civil service of Pakistan's probationers is geared to produce a general administrator with a bias of specialization in Revenue Administration and Laws, suitable for secretariat as well as field jobs. Since the entire administrative structure is largely built around the frame of this elite corps their training is to be intensive and prolonged. From this point of view, the syllabus followed at the Civil Service Academy is limited and inadequate. The courses of study may be changed and redesigned accordingly. At present their training at the Academy is law-oriented. The present syllabus is more or less similar to that of the Indian Civil Service, in the British India, when the main functions of the government were confined to collection of revenue and maintenance

of law and order.<sup>1</sup> These are important functions, no doubt, but much more important, significant and essential to-day, are the increasingly complex functions of government in the social and economic fields. The implementation of successive Five Year Plans would continue to increase the responsibilities of administration in these fields. It is, therefore, essential that the training of the future administrators must be related to the purposes and functions of the government. It should give a comprehensive background of the entire range of government activities of the services in an integrated manner by inclusion of the fundamentals of social sciences - political science, sociology and social psychology.<sup>2</sup> Sociology has a major contribution to make to an understanding of

---

<sup>1</sup> "In summary every effort was made to train the C.S.P. officers in the traditions of the British Indian Civil Service." Henry Frank Goodnow, The Civil Service of Pakistan (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1964), p. 172.

The British orientation has been severely criticized by Farid Ahmad, an East Pakistani member of the National Assembly: "It is that you are going to train your own people to hate your own system, to hate your own civilization and culture? Are you going to give to the country out of this manufacturing laboratory of the Civil Service Academy at Lahore some more anglicized officers? Ibid., pp. 172-73.

"It is further criticized on the ground that the training of the service is oriented more to the needs of the colonial period than to those of an independent state. Doubts have been expressed about the competence of the service to discharge technical or otherwise specialized duties called for by development administration." S.S. Hsueh (ed.), Public Administration in South and Southeast Asia (Brussels: International Institute of Administrative Sciences, 1962), p. 130.

<sup>2</sup> For a detailed discussion see, A.D. Gorwala, The Role of the Administrator: Past Present and Future (Poona, India: Gokhale Institute of Politics and Economics, 1957), pp. 27-28.

administrative process.

Combined initial training for central superior services

Initial training is imparted to officers in Civil and Finance Services Academies, Police Training College and Secretariat Training Institute. These institutions, at present, work independently and there is no mixing of participants, who from the very beginning are virtually put into airtight compartments from which they do not normally emerge during their entire career. There are several aspects which are common to the training of probationers, in various institutes, who are going to man posts of equivalent rank in central superior services. They have common ideology and common loyalty. Subjects like Public Administration, Development Economics, Development Administration, Financial Administration, Constitution of Pakistan and Structure and Functions of the government are common among the curricula of these institutions.

It is therefore desirable that all entrants to the central superior services may receive a combined training for an initial period of six months at the civil service academy. A full range of socio-economic subjects and Public Administration may form the major part of the curriculum. It will not only be economical but may also develop a common outlook and infuse a esprit 'd corps which appears

to be wanting in the civil services.

This esprit d'corps is a positive factor in the training of future civil servants: it may give them a cohesion, a unity of view and a solidarity which, transferred to the framework of the state of public communities in general, may assist the smooth working of the administrative machinery.<sup>1</sup>

In view of certain common elements, of basic knowledge required for all central services, there is much weight in favour of combined training forums for the first phase of probationary training. On completion of this period of training the entrants to various services could go to their respective institutes for training in their special fields and the period of training in the Academies may be extended to one year or more for a fuller and comprehensive training in skills and knowledge according to the particular requirements of each service.

Provincial civil services - a neglected sector of in-service training in Pakistan

Training policy of the government provides for initial training of officers belonging to certain central superior services like C.S.P., Police Service of Pakistan and Finance Services but is silent about training of entrants to senior Provincial Civil Services. At the

---

<sup>1</sup> Andre Molitor, Public Administration (Paris: UNESCO, 1959), p. 128.



provincial level, no institutional training is given to the provincial civil service officers in West Pakistan. In East Pakistan they undergo a training course in Revenue work only, on ad hoc basis. The scope of its activities may be widened to embrace subjects directly related to socio-economic development. However, at present, the training of the staff of Provincial Government Departments generally is neglected.

Need for the extension of training facilities at higher level

The existing arrangements for advanced training as provided by NIPA's and Pakistan Administrative Staff College meet the needs of higher civil servants to some extent, but they may be further expanded, provided the training needs of the various departments are well planned and a regular flow of the participants is ensured, as indicated above. At present NIPA and Administrative Staff College are running only two courses of three months duration, in a year. If the training system is properly planned both the institutions can conveniently arrange three such courses a year, with one months gap in between the courses for evaluation and preparation purposes.

Inadequate and under-qualified instructional staff

Turning to the availability of instructional staff, majority of the training institutes have limited number of qualified instructors.

Particularly police training college and civil and finance services academies are understaffed.

There are two categories of instructional staff at the institutions - civil servants on deputation and direct employees of the institutes. There is no clear cut career line for direct employees who "feel that they have no real guarantee for the future."<sup>1</sup> Without a training cadre, additional attrition of the instructional staff is expected.<sup>2</sup> Only NIPA and Rural Development Academy have systematic arrangements for development of the needed staff through A.I.D. others are still trying to meet the situation through improvisations.

It seems that if training is to grow along scientific lines in Pakistan, more attention should be paid to the availability of trained personnel to undertake executive development and supervisory training programmes. Conference members of Management Training in Public Administration also noted the problem of producing skilled instructors for the training of subordinate staff."<sup>3</sup>

#### Training methodology

The training methods used by these institutions vary from class-

---

<sup>1</sup> Public Administration Programme in Pakistan, Op. cit., p. 14.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

<sup>3</sup> Symposium on Management Training, Op. cit., p. 14.

room lectures to participative methods. Majority of them however, have to content themselves with reliance on lecture method which seems to be the easiest, particularly in case of NIPA, Secretariat Training Institute and Civil and Finance Services Academies, where heavy reliance is placed on guest speakers. Lack of training material, particularly those based on Pakistan's experience, is a common problem faced by all institutions. Majority of them have to depend on foreign publications and even these are not always available. Only NIPA and staff Administrative College have well-stocked libraries and proper facilities for the provision of reading material to the participants.

The training methodology should be directly related to the objectives of training programmes, taking into consideration the level of participants being trained and subject to the availability of the instructional staff. Usually senior officers do not react to the direct instructions. In the institutions like NIPA, Administrative Staff College and Rural Development Academy the 'case method' which had been developed in the United States might be usefully followed.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> "A case study describes how one or more officials made a governmental decision or dealt with a particular governmental problem," Stone, *Op. cit.*, p. 176.

A full discussion regarding the use of 'case method' for teaching in public administration is included in, Edwin A. Bock, editor Essays on the Case Method (Brussels: International Institute of Administrative Sciences, 1962). A useful collection of case studies is the, Harold Stein, editor, Public Administration and Policy Development (New York: Harcourt Brace and Co., 1952).

Although that system could not be readily adopted in Pakistan, nevertheless a beginning in that direction might be made.

#### Evaluation of trainees

All institutions undertake, in some form or another, the evaluation of their trainees. Civil and Finance Services Academies hold the passing out examination, Police Training College and Secretariat Training Institute rely on written tests while the rest give more emphasis to observations and individual counselling.

In fact mere exposure to training programmes does not establish that actual training in the sense of knowledge, skills or attitudes has taken place. The criteria is that whether the training has achieved the objectives for which it was imparted. Evaluation of training effectiveness requires two points of reference:

a base point which represents the level of performance before training begins, and a standard of performance or accomplishment toward which the training is directed. Unless an adequate base point is selected before training commences, subsequent attempts to measure progress will have little meaning.<sup>1</sup>

At present, in Pakistan there are neither such devices to evaluate the impact of training on probationers and trainees nor these institutions have adopted any systematic follow-up procedure. In the absence of such methods one cannot evaluate and measure the effective-

---

<sup>1</sup> Caldwell, Op. cit., pp. 81-82.

ness and utility of these training programmes, in the strict sense.

As to the follow-ups, there is, at present, no institution that concerns itself with the progress and performance of trainees after they have completed their courses. All of them seem to be serious to develop some system to this purpose. An effective method, perhaps, would be to make on-the-spot observation about the performance of the trainees by the members of the instruction staff. This will have two-fold advantage. First, the proper effectiveness of training will be judged by studying how far it is being applied to the job assigned. Second, the trainer will be in a position to pin point objectively the deficiencies, if any, existing in the training programmes, and in consequence the future training programmes may be improved accordingly. But it should be remembered that evaluation is a difficult task. It is particularly difficult to assess management effectiveness as it involves not only knowledge and skills but also attitudes.

#### Research

A great deficiency of the training system in Pakistan is the dearth of research in the field of Public Administration. "One might almost say the absence of the tradition of research."<sup>1</sup> At present,

---

<sup>1</sup> Symposium, Op. cit., p. 52.

there are small training cells in the Administrative Staff College, National Institute of Public Administration and the Rural Development Academy. Most of their Research Staff is almost exclusively engaged in training activities.<sup>1</sup> No efforts have been made on the part of government to intensify and coordinate whatever research work they are carrying out and to make arrangements for the publication of results. The biggest problem facing research in Pakistan is the conceptualization of what research and a research programme really are.<sup>2</sup>

A decision, which is still to be implemented, was taken in 1962 to set up a Public Administration Research Council as a consultative body to act as clearing house for the research done by the various member institutions and to initiate research projects in public administration.

According to the third Five Year Plan an attached department of the Establishment Division designated as the 'All Pakistan Administrative Research Centre' and an advisory body known as the 'Pakistan Council for Research in Public Administration' are to be set up at Lahore, during the Third Plan period.<sup>3</sup> The proposed

---

<sup>1</sup> Public Administration Program in Pakistan, Op. cit., p. 52.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

<sup>3</sup> National Planning Board The Third Five Year Plan (Karachi: Government of Pakistan, 1965), p. 178.

centre may fulfil the long felt need of an effective medium to ensure the conduct of administrative research in the country in an organized manner. However, if training is ever to develop a domestic flavour, research is a prime need.

## APPENDIX I

No. 1/23/60-EX, dated Karachi, the 3rd May, 1960, from Mr. J.D. Hardy, Establishment Secretary, Government of Pakistan, President's Secretariat, Establishment Division, Karachi, to the Chief Secretary, Government of East/West Pakistan, Dacca/Lahore,  
Subject - PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION TRAINING POLICY

I am directed to state, for the information of the Provincial Governments, that the Government of Pakistan have recently reviewed, in the context of our present rapid nation-building drive, the existing facilities for training in Public Administration and have approved the adoption of the following Public Administration Training Policy which is designed to provide training in Pakistan and training geared to Pakistan's own needs:-

1. Under-graduate pre-entry to Service training facilities in "Public Administration" and "Citizenship" should be provided as an integral part of the Courses at the Universities of the Punjab and Dacca.
2. Graduate level training facilities in "Public Administration" should be provided by setting up Institutes of Public Administration in Rawalpindi, Dacca and Lahore. Besides providing graduate level pre-entry to Service training for student,



these Institutes should also be used for the training of  
Gazetted Public Servants at the junior and intermediate levels.

In addition, post-entry to Service training should be provided at  
the junior and intermediate levels at the Village Develop-  
ment Academies at Comilla and Peshawar.

3. Training facilities at the highest level should be provided  
at the Administrative Staff College.

2. The Government of Pakistan have also decided to set up an Admi-  
nistrative Training Council under the Establishment Division to en-  
sure coordination in the field of Public Administration training at  
all levels and to advise on future planning. This Council will be  
presided over by a Cabinet Minister and will consist of the following:

1. Secretary, Finance,
2. Secretary, Education,
3. Secretary, Establishment,
4. Provincial Chief Secretaries,
5. Principal of the Administrative Staff College, and
6. Director, Civil Service Academy,

3. As a corollary to the above Policy, steps are being taken to  
review existing overseas training programmes which have tended to  
multiply unjustifiably in recent years and which are not always re-  
lated to Pakistan's own needs. In this connection, a decision has

already been taken to discontinue Project 105 (Executive Development Programme at the University of Southern California under the auspices of I.C.A.) after sending out the present batch of trainees.

4. The Ministry of Education will be responsible for arranging the facilities at (1) under paragraph 1 above.

With regard to (2), it is hoped that aid will be forthcoming from the I.C.A. to set up the Institutes of Public Administration at Rawalpindi, Dacca and Lahore and a separate letter is under issue asking for the views of the Provincial Governments regarding the size, etc., of these Institutes.

With regard to (3) of paragraph 1 above, a Principal has already been appointed and it is hoped that the College will start functioning next winter.

APPENDIX II

A Panoramic View of the Course of Studies for Session 7

Time	Syndicate Subjects	Seminar on Development
First half of the Course	<p>I. GENERAL ADMINISTRATION</p> <p>(a) Organization Structure</p> <p>(b) Internal Cooperation and Communication</p> <p>(c) Personnel Management, Recruitment, Training and Incentives</p> <p>(d) Delegation, Control and Accountability</p> <p>(e) Project Planning; Budgeting &amp; Financial Control</p>	<p>Development Administration</p> <p>Introduction:</p> <p>Formal Organization</p> <p>Major Administrative Concepts</p> <p>Informal Organization</p> <p>Specialist and Generalist</p> <p>Decision-Making</p> <p>Power</p> <p>Policy and Administration</p> <p>Aids for the Administrator</p> <p>Personnel</p> <p>Financial Process</p> <p>Research</p> <p>Statistics</p> <p>Development Economics</p> <p>Problems of Economic Growth</p> <p>Economic Disparities and Regional Balance in Development Planning in Pakistan</p> <p>Resource Allocating and Economic Planning in Pakistan</p> <p>Socialist Economic Planning</p> <p>Money, Price Levels, Inflation</p> <p>Pakistan's Foreign Trade and Commercial Policy</p> <p>Fiscal and Monetary Policy</p> <p>Capital Formation, Savings and Investment</p> <p>Government's Economic Role</p> <p>The European Common Market, Britain and the Commonwealth</p> <p>Foreign Aid and Investment in Pakistan</p> <p>Economic Statistics-Concepts, Methods and Uses</p>
Second half of the Course	<p>III. PROGRAMME ADMINISTRATION</p> <p>(a) The Constitution and Local Government</p> <p>(b) Education</p> <p>(c) Agriculture</p> <p>(d) Industry</p> <p>(e) Social Welfare</p>	<p>II. FIELD RESEARCH</p> <p>Administrative Problems in Project Planning and Execution</p> <p>(a) Study of Mangla Dam Project in West Pakistan</p> <p>(b) Study of Ganges Kobadak Projects in East Pakistan</p>
<p>IV. BIOGRAPHY -</p> <p>(a) A Study of Administrators</p> <p>(1) Lord Curzon</p> <p>(2) Sir Syed Ahmad Khan</p> <p>(3) Henry Ford</p> <p>(b) The Role of the Administrator</p>		

APPENDIX III

(List of the persons contacted)

1. Inayatullah, C.S.P., Secretary to Government of West Pakistan, Services and General Administration, Lahore.
2. M.A.K. Beg, C.S.P., Director National Institute of Public Administration, Lahore.
3. Anwer Tahmasp Khan, P.C.S., Instructor NIPA, Lahore.
4. Zohra Waheed, Research Associate, Pakistan Administrative College, Lahore.
5. Raja Mohammad Afzal, P.C.S., Director Rural Development Academy, Peshawar.
6. S. Malik, Civil Service Academy, Lahore.
7. Dr. Nassar Islam, Department of Public Administration, University of the Panjab, Lahore.
8. Abdul Mueed Siddiqi Finance Services Academy, Lahore.
9. Asgar A. Sheikh, Assistant Director, Secretariat Training Institute, Karachi.
10. Dr. Aslam Niaz, Instructor, NIPA, Lahore.

## B I B L I O G R A P H Y

- Agency for International Development. Public Administration Program in Pakistan: Los Angeles, California: University of Southern California, 1965.
- Batten T.R. Training for Community Development. London: Oxford University Press, 1963.
- Bock, Edwin A. (ed.). Essays on the Case Method. Brussels: International Institute of Administrative Sciences, 1962.
- Caldwell, Lynton K. Improving the Public Service Through Training. Washington 25, D.C.: Agency for International Development, 1962.
- Central Treaty Organization. Symposium on Management Training in Public Administration. Ankara, Turkey: Office of United States Economic Coordinator for CENTO Affairs, 1964.
- Chanda, Asok. Indian Administration. London: George Allen and Unwin, 1958.
- Chapman, Brian. The Profession of Government. London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd., 1963.
- Chaudhuri, Muzaffar Ahmad. The Civil Service in Pakistan. Dacca East Pakistan: National Institute of Public Administration, 1963.
- Egger, Rowland. The Improvement of Public Administration in Pakistan. n.p. Karachi: 1953.
- Fletcher-Cooke, Sir John. Institutes of Public Administration in Commonwealth. London: Royal Institute of Public Administration, 1963.
- Germann, A.C. Police Executive Development. Springfield, Illinois: Charles C. Thomas, Publishers, 1962.

- Goodnow, Henry Frank. The Civil Service of Pakistan. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1964.
- Gorwala, A.D. The Role of the Administrator: Past, Present and Future. Poona, India: Gokhale Institute of Politics and Economics, 1957.
- Hall, M. Employees Training in the Public Service. Chicago: Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1941.
- Hsueh, S.S. Public Administration in South and South-East Asia. Brussels: International Institute of Administrative Sciences, 1962.
- Inayat, M.R. (ed.). Perspectives in Public Administration. Lahore, West Pakistan: Society for Public Administration, 1962.
- InayatUllah (ed.). Bureaucracy and Development. Peshawar, Pakistan: Academy for Rural Development, 1963.
- India, Government of. Report of the Government of India Secretariat Committee 1920. (Lewellyn Smith Report). Reprinted. NIPA Reprinted Series No. 4. Karachi: National Institute of Public Administration, 1963.
- 
- . Report of the Government of India Secretariat Organization and Procedure 1937. (Maxwell Report). Reprinted. NIPA Reprinted Series No. 2. Karachi: National Institute of Public Administration, 1963.
- 
- . Report of the Government of India Secretariat Committee 1935-36. (Wheeler Report). Reprinted. NIPA Reprinted Series No. 3. Karachi: National Institute of Public Administration, 1963.
- La Palombara, Joseph (ed.). Bureaucracy and Political Development. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1963.
- Macauley, Lord. Life and Works of Lord Macauley. London: Longman Green and Co., 1897.
- Marx, Fritz Morstein. The Administrative State. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1957.

Mezirow, Jack D. The Dynamics of Community Development. New York: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1963.

Molitor, Andre. The University Teaching of Social Sciences: Public Administration. Paris: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, 1959.

Mueenuddin, G. "Professionalization of Public Administration," Selected Papers from the First Seminar on Public Administration. Lahore, West Pakistan: University of the Punjab, 1962.

National Institute of Public Administration, Brochure of the Programme 1965-66. Lahore, West Pakistan, 1965.

Pakistan Administrative Staff College. Pakistan Administrative Staff College at Work. Lahore, West Pakistan, 1963.

Pakistan, Government of. Careers in Pakistan Central Superior Services. Karachi: Cabinet Secretariat, Establishment Division, 1954.

\_\_\_\_\_. Finance Services Academy. Karachi: Ministry of Finance, 1963.

\_\_\_\_\_. The First Five Year Plan. Karachi: Manager of Publications, National Planning Commission, 1957.

\_\_\_\_\_. The Second Five Year Plan. Karachi: Manager of Publications, National Planning Commission, 1960.

\_\_\_\_\_. The Third Five Year Plan. Karachi: Manager of Publications, National Planning Commission, 1965.

Riggs, Fred W. Administration in Developing Countries. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1964.

Roy, N.C. The Civil Service in India. Calcutta, India: Firma K.L. Mukhupadyay, 1960.

Stahl, O. Glen. Public Personnel Administration. New York: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1962.

- Stein, Herold (ed.). Public Administration and Policy Development. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1952.
- Stone, Donald C. (ed.). Education in Public Administration: A Symposium of Teaching Methods and Materials. Brussels: International Institute of Administrative Sciences, 1963.
- United Nations. A Handbook of Public Administration. New York: United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 1961.
- \_\_\_\_\_ . Training in Public Administration. New York: United Nations, Technical Assistance Administration, 1958.
- West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development. Announcement of Training Programme. Peshawar, Pakistan: Academy for Rural Development, 1965.
- West Pakistan, Government of. Report of the East Bengal Police Committee. Dacca, East Pakistan: Manager of Publications, 1953.
- White, Leonard D. Introduction to the Study of Public Administration. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1955.

Periodicals, Journals and News Papers

- Adams, J.W.L. "Henley and Hyderabad," The Indian Journal of Public Administration, IV (January-March, 1958).
- Bapt, S.B. "The Training of the Indian Administrative Service," The Indian Journal of Public Administration, I (April-June, 1955).
- Berkou, Robert H. "Executive Development for Pakistan," NIPA Reporter, (Karachi: December, 1962).
- Bertrand, A. "The Civil Service Academy at Lahore and the Training of the Civil Service of Pakistan," International Social Science Bulletin, VII (June, 1955).



Braibanti, Ralph J.D. "Civil Service of Pakistan: A theoretical Analysis," South Atlantic Quarterly, LVIII (June, 1959).

Copeland, Sir Douglas. "The Australian Administrative Staff College," Public Administration, XIV (Sydney: June, 1957).

Dimock, Marshall E. "Executive Development after ten years," Public Administration Review XIX (Spring, 1958).

\_\_\_\_\_. "The Administrative Staff College: Executive Development in Government and Industry," American Political Science Review, L (March, 1956).

Hall, Noel F. "The Administrative Staff College," Public Administration, XIV (Sydney: March, 1956).

Her Majesty's Stationery Office. Organization and Method Bulletin. (London: December, 1955).

\_\_\_\_\_. Report of the Committee on the Training of Civil Servants (London: 1959).

Mailick, Sidney. "University's Role in Executive Development," Public Administration Review, XVIII (Autumn, 1958).

Nath, Gopeshwar. "The Secretariat Training School," Indian Journal of Public Administration, VII (January-March, 1961).

Pakistan Times. Lahore: November 11, 1961.

Snowiss, Leo M. "The Education and Role of the Superior Civil Services in India," Indian Journal of Public Administration, VII (January-March, 1961).