

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY OF BEIRUT

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION EDUCATION: THE CASE OF  
LEBANON

by  
NOURA GALAL EL DIN EL BADRI

A thesis  
submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of Master of Arts  
to the Department of Political Studies and Public Administration  
of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences  
at the American University of Beirut

Beirut, Lebanon  
April 2015





## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to my advisor Dr. Thomas Haase for the useful comments, remarks and engagement through the learning process of this master thesis. Furthermore, I would like to thank Dean McGreevy and Dr. Haddad for being part of the committee as they offered me support and constructive feedback. I would also like to show deep appreciation to my colleagues Hoda and Eric with whom I sailed on the same boat.

Without forgetting all my loyal friends who have encouraged with me through the entire research process: Joanne, Lara, Maria and Laila. I would finally like to thank my dearest loved ones: My father, mother, sister and Hani my fiancé who have supported me throughout the entire process, both by keeping me harmonious and helping me putting pieces together. I will be grateful forever for your love and support.

# AN ABSTRACT OF THE THESIS OF

Noura El Badri for Master of Arts  
Major: Public Administration

Title: Public Administration Education: The Case of Lebanon

According to Jennifer Bremer and Laila Baradei (2008), the Arab region faces a variety of administrative challenges. For instance, many Arab states have overstaffed bureaucracies constrained by underpaid employees, red tape, low rates of productivity and low levels of administrative innovation (Jreisat 2006). In Lebanon, the Office of the Minister of the State for Administrative Reform (OMSAR) has emphasized the significance of restructuring public institutions. The most relevant point mentioned in the OMSAR report is the need to establish a highly competent administration and hiring qualified employees (OMSAR 2011).

Although the education of public servants is a prerequisite to an effective public administration, Lebanon's Central Administration Statistics reports that public administration education is not a priority for the country (Badre and Yaacoub 2012; "OMSAR Strategy - 2011.pdf," n.d.). There are many competencies, skills and abilities that public servants should acquire in order to fill the administrative needs of any society (Perry 2005). This thesis explores the state of Public Administration education in Lebanon at aimed at suggesting the key topics of be addressed in such a contextual program. Data was collected first from the forty-three educational institutions registered with the Lebanese Ministry of Education and Higher Education; and second from six focus groups including administrative experts and students.

The findings generated by this study will benefit researchers in evaluating the state of Public Administration education in Lebanon, a country that lacks data about the discipline of Public Administration. Furthermore, the information generated by the focus groups allowed us to get a clearer picture about the curricular components of a Lebanese Public Administration program. In fact, revealed findings show that Public Administration education is partially prevalent in Lebanon and that there is a large room for improvement.

## CONTENTS

|  |    |
|--|----|
| ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....  | v  |
| ABSTRACT .....   | vi |
| LIST OF TABLES .....   | xi |
| Chapter  |    |
| I. INTRODUCTION.....   | 1  |
| II. LITERATURE REVIEW .....  | 7  |
| A. Definitions of Public Administration .....                                      | 7  |
| B. Public Administration as a Discipline .....                                     | 9  |
| C. Public Administration as a Profession.....                                      | 12 |
| D. Western Perspectives of Public Administration.....                              | 15 |
| 1. France.....   | 16 |
| 2. Germany.....  | 16 |
| 3. United Kingdom .....  | 17 |
| 4. United States .....   | 18 |
| E. Limitations of the Western Perspectives of Public Administration .....          | 20 |
| F. Public Administration Education in Non-Western Contexts.....                    | 22 |
| G. Importance of Contextual Consideration in Public Administration Education ..... | 27 |

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| H. Administrative Competencies .....                      | 29        |
| 1. Western Competencies .....                             | 29        |
| 2. Arab Competencies.....                                 | 31        |
| I. Conceptual Framework.....                              | 34        |
| <b>III. METHODS .....</b>                                 | <b>37</b> |
| A. Research Population and Sample .....                   | 38        |
| B. Quantitative Methods .....                             | 38        |
| 1. Data Collection .....                                  | 38        |
| 2. Data Coding .....                                      | 41        |
| 3. Data Analysis.....                                     | 41        |
| C. Qualitative Methods .....                              | 42        |
| 1. Data Collection: .....                                 | 42        |
| 2. Data Coding .....                                      | 43        |
| 3. Data Analysis.....                                     | 44        |
| D. Ethical Considerations and Participant Safeguards..... | 45        |
| E. Encountered Challenges .....                           | 46        |
| 1. Quantitative Methods.....                              | 47        |
| 2. Qualitative Methods.....                               | 47        |
| <b>IV. FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS.....</b>                     | <b>49</b> |
| A. Quantitative Findings .....                            | 49        |

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| 1. Overview.....   | 49        |
| B. Quantitative Findings .....                                   | 53        |
| 1. General Findings.....   | 53        |
| 2. Core Topics.....  | 55        |
| 3. Specialized Topics .....                                      | 56        |
| 4. Courses Related to Lebanon .....                              | 57        |
| C. Qualitative Findings .....                                    | 58        |
| 1. Administrative Gaps .....                                     | 59        |
| 2. Role of Universities in Public Administration Education ..... | 62        |
| D. Analysis.....   | 66        |
| E. Recommended curriculum.....                                   | 71        |
| 1. Conclusion .....  | 73        |
| <b>V. CONCLUSIONS .....</b>                                      | <b>74</b> |
| A. Research Questions .....                                      | 74        |
| B. Recommendations .....   | 79        |
| C. Future Research.....  | 81        |
| D. Conclusion.....   | 83        |
| Appendix   |           |
| <b>I. NAMES AND ACRONYMES OF CERTIFIED UNIVERSITIES,</b>         |           |
| <b>COLLEGES AND INSTITUTIONS IN LEBANON, 2012-13 .....</b>       | <b>84</b> |



|  |    |
|--|----|
| II. FOCUS GROUP QUESTIONNAIRE .....      | 86 |
| III. CONSENT FORMS FOR FOCUS GROUP ..... | 88 |
| IV. REQUEST FOR PARTICIPATION.....       | 90 |
| <br>                                     |    |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY .....                       | 91 |

## TABLES

| Table   | Page |
|---|------|
| 1: Relevant Pa Courses Presented By NASPAA (2012) .....   | 30   |
| 2: Competencies Used In AUC.....  | 33   |
| 3: Administrative Competencies Needed In The Arab World.....  | 34   |
| 4: Elements Of An Effective Public Administration Curriculum In The Arab Region.....  | 35   |
| 5: Public Administration Courses By Degree Level.....   | 51   |
| 6: Public Administration Courses By Degree Level And Language of Instruction .....  | 52   |
| 7: Frequency And Percentage Of Public Administration Advertised Courses In Lebanon<br>According To The Global Standards, 2012-13..... | 54   |
| 8: Coverage Of Important Public Administration Topics In Lebanon .....  | 67   |
| 9: Frequency And Percentage Of Public Administration Topics Considered .....  | 70   |
| 10: Modified APA Framework: Lebanese Context .....  | 78   |
| 10: Modified APA Framework: Lebanese Context .....  | 78   |

# CHAPTER I

## INTRODUCTION

This thesis explores whether the Public Administration curriculum advertised in Lebanese universities meets the administrative needs of the Republic of Lebanon. The motivation behind this research is that many Arab countries have deficient administrative systems, which prohibit national development and public sector reform. For instance, many Arab states have public bureaucracies that are overstaffed, constrained by underpaid employees, red tape, low rate of productivity and a limited range of administrative innovativeness (Jreisat 2006). Despite many attempts for reform, Jennifer Bremer and Laila El Baradei (2008, 440) state that “the success of current reform programs requires that public sector leadership build new competencies and skills for a market-based economy, while at the same time working harder to close critical deficits in education”.

For Jamil Jreisat (2011), the administrative problems in Arab countries are driven by two sets of issues. There are external issues that prevent positive change. There are also internal issues that hinder administrative performance and development. The external causes are linked to globalization. Even though there is no unique definition of globalization, globalization affects the Arab world in three ways (Jreisat 2008). The first is economic. Globalization has an impact on free trade, banking, investment and the transfer of capital. The second aspect of globalization relates to information and technology. The recent technological revolutions affected the global relationships and increased the interconnectedness between different parts of the world. Third, Jreisat (2008) argues that globalization involves trends related to the environments, human rights and education. The

environmental, social and educational trends of one country, or of one culture, can affect another society's norms and practices. Jreisat (2008) also argues that globalization has many negative consequences. Globalization has reinforced the gaps in wealth between the north and the south, and makes Arab states unable to protect their own interests. This problem is rooted in the fact that globalism is American-centric and serves the multinationals in a way that reinforces powerful countries by promoting their ideas, activities and products. Therefore, globalization promotes monopolies and hides the ill motives of domination, which create problems for human and administrative development. If Arab countries do not appropriately manage and organize their administrative systems, globalization will work to prioritize western administrative trends and developments at the expense of the Arab peculiarities and ideas (Jreisat 2008).

There are also internal problems that threaten administrative developments in Arab states. The first internal deficiency is that public administrators in the Arab world are not able to incorporate administrative elements such as long-term vision, clear values and solid knowledge and skills. These elements, if combined effectively, would help enhance administrative systems. Arab countries also suffer from poorly coordinated entities resulting in incoherent administrative outcomes (Jreisat 2011). The second internal deficiency is that administrators have an insufficient level of knowledge and a lack of access to data (Jreisat 2011). The deficit in knowledge and skills leads to the third and fourth deficiencies, which are administrative centralization and authoritative governance (Jreisat 2011). In fact, when public servants lack the facts and evidence needed to support their decisions, they will refer to higher employees for directions, which empowers administrative centralization. A high level of administrative centralization will lead to a

decrease in the level of innovativeness and creativity since the source of knowledge would be confined to a specific circle of officials. Moreover, unclear public policies can also be the result of excessive centralization. Fifth, there is also a lack of transparency and accountability. In centralized systems, deficient accountability and transparency will threaten the establishment of clear indicators of performance measurements. The last internal administrative problem is the self-serving ruling elite, where the political leaders do not allow competitive groups to pursue different types of activities (Jreisat 2011).

The Republic of Lebanon is no different than its neighboring Arab states. The administrative challenges, whether rooted in external or internal issues, are prevalent throughout the country. According to the Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform (OMSAR 2011), the Lebanese system of public administration faces many problems. These problems are found in areas such as policymaking and planning, monitoring and assessment and the inadequate use of technology in the public sector. Another issue touches upon the ineffective implementation of procedures by those employed by the Lebanese public sector. Moreover, the positions in the administrative sphere have a high percentage of vacancies because of the lack of employees with leadership and guidance skills (OMSAR 2011). The shortage in number of human resources is rooted in the lack of competent and skilled public officials who did not get the adequate education and are unable to address the administrative needs of Lebanon (OMSAR 2011).

The OMSAR (2011) report has highlighted the steps that can be taken to reform the Lebanese system of public administration. An important initiative would be to update the legislature; another would be to restructure the role of monitoring bodies. OMSAR (2011)

also emphasizes the significance of restructuring public institutions and updating their duties. Perhaps the most relevant point mentioned in the report is the need to establish a high competent administration and hiring qualified employees.

Clearly, the education of public servants is a prerequisite to an effective system of public administration. According to Susan Perry (2005), there are many competencies and abilities that public servants should acquire from Public Administration programs in order for them to be able to effectively serve the administrative system of any society. These competencies can be classified in many categories, for example, the management of public institutions, the quantitative and qualitative techniques of analysis and knowledge about public policy and the organizational environment (Perry 20,05).

To develop such expertise, masters in public administration (MPA) programs and masters in public policy (MPP) programs prepare future public sector employees for the administrative challenges that they will face (Bremer and El Baradei 2008). Although Public Administration education is important for the development of the administrative sphere, some complications linked to administrative education still exist. Some of these problems relate to the interdisciplinary nature of the field of Public Administration. Another issue is that Public Administration education does not necessarily consider the societal specificities of other cultures. Although the public administration of every country is distinguished by its own cultural characteristics (Waldo 1968), the study and practice of public administration do not consider culture, as many Public Administration textbooks describe administrative system without considering social and cultural peculiarities (Rice 2007).

In Lebanon, the OMSAR (2011) report indicates that steps must be taken to enhance the quantity and quality of public servants, the Central Administration of Statistics in Lebanon, which is responsible for generating social and economic statistics at the national level, reports that Public Administration education is not a priority for the country. Indeed, Public Administration is not among the top ten majors taught in universities in Lebanon (Badre and Yaacoub 2012; OMSAR 2011). The problem regarding Public Administration education does not only concern the limited number of programs, but also the quality of the programs that do exist in Lebanon.

The purpose of this thesis is to identify the basic elements of a Public Administration curriculum that addresses the administrative needs of Lebanon. More specifically, this thesis seeks to accomplish three goals. The first is to explore the nature of Public Administration from a Western perspective, focusing on its applicability in countries such as Lebanon. The second is to identify the current state of Public Administration education within Lebanon, focusing specifically on the programs and courses advertised by Lebanese universities. The final goal is to collect empirical data that will provide preliminary insights into how one might design a Public Administration program and curriculum for the Lebanese context. The hope is that this research will help to facilitate conversations about how institutions of higher education might begin to strengthen the capacities to enhance the Lebanese public sector.

To accomplish these goals, this thesis will address three research questions

- To what extent are Public Administration courses prevalent in universities in Lebanon?

- To what extent does Public Administration education in Lebanon reflect Lebanon's administrative needs?
- What might be the primary curricular components of a Public Administration program that takes the administrative needs of Lebanon into consideration?

The remainder of this thesis is divided into four chapters. After presenting an introductory overview, Chapter Two reviews of the relevant literature. The literature review will consider Western administrative perspectives and their applicability in non-Western countries. Chapter Three reviews the methods adopted by the study which are content analysis and focus groups. This chapter covers the following steps: Data collection, data coding and data analysis. Chapter Four presents the findings generated by the research. Finally, chapter Five presents the conclusions generated by the thesis, as well as, the steps that can be taken for future research.

This thesis is significant in three ways. First, it highlights the contextual nature of public administration, both a discipline and a practice. In doing so, the thesis will emphasize the inapplicability of individual courses across different cultural contexts. Second, this thesis explores the state of Public Administration education in Lebanon in terms of courses prevalence, the nature of topics addressed, and the language of instruction. Finally, the thesis permits us to get a clearer picture about the administrative problems in Lebanon and how these problems might be solved through education. This information includes data about relevant courses, skills and teaching methods that should be covered in Lebanon. While more work needs to be done, the findings generated by this research will contribute to discussions about Public Administration curriculum, not only in Lebanon, but the broader Arab region.



## CHAPTER II

### LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter provides a review of the public administration literature related to Public Administration education. The goal of this chapter is to show that cultural specificities should be considered when addressing public administration whether as a discipline or as a practice. This chapter is organized into seven sections. The first section sets the context and presents various definitions of public administration. The second and third sections discuss public administration as a discipline and a practice since both aspects are directly related. The fourth section presents some of the perspectives that are central to the Western study and practice of public administration, focusing specifically on the European and American perspectives. The next section explores some of the limitations of the Western perspectives and their inapplicability to other parts of the world. The sixth section reviews Public Administration education in non-Western contexts, for example, Egypt and Lebanon. The final section stresses that there are differences between countries and contexts and that Public Administration education should not follow one set curriculum. The conclusion presents a framework that can be used to evaluate the Public Administration curriculum in non-Western contexts, especially in the Arab region.

#### **A. Definitions of Public Administration**

The literature indicates that Public Administration cannot be easily defined. For example, Shafritz, Russel and Borick (2013) reveal that the meaning of public

administration is rooted in many different perspectives. As public administration is inherently related to politics, Shafritz, Russel and Borick (2013) define public administration from a political perspective, which asserts that public administration should serve the citizens and responds to their needs. This includes the decisions of governments and government employees, and how they affect the citizens' day to day lives. Based on political grounds, public administration further aims to regulate and organize individuals' behavior into shared demands that will be addressed in different policies (Shafritz, Russell, and Borick 2013). From a managerial perspective, public administration is the executive function of government, which refers to the implementation of different laws throughout a state. According to Shafritz, Russel and Borick, (2013) the executive function consists of managing existing governmental programs and running the day-to-day affairs of the bureaucracy. Consequently, public administration is also a management practice, since it refers to both administrative and managerial processes.

Whether middle public managers, top level public employees, or key policymakers, individuals who work for the public sector are labeled as public administrators. Shafritz, Russel and Borick (2013) introduce the occupational perspective of public administration which refers to the practice of public administration as a career. Based on the occupational perspective, public administration suggests that an employee should have professional qualifications, one of which is possessing effective writing and presentation skills. The professional qualifications of public officials are important because they will allow them to reach the noble cause of being public servants. To help future servants crystalize their aim of improving societies, Public Administration education plays a big role in helping

individuals acquire key administrative skills. As an academic field, Public Administration is not only limited to the public managerial aspects.

The field of Public Administration is cross-disciplinary, meaning that it addresses topics related to law, political science and management (Wright 2010). To be considered as a profession, public administration should serve the community's needs maintaining codes of ethics and sanctions (Shafritz, Russell, and Borick 2013). The political, legal, managerial and occupational definitions indicate that public administration is both a discipline and profession. As such, it is critical to explore the development of Public Administration as a discipline, and then relate it to the practical side of administration.

## **B. Public Administration as a Discipline**

It is important to explore the nature and development of Public Administration as a discipline. Doing so provides insights into Public Administration as an academic field, and uncovers realities about the practice of public administration. The discipline of Public Administration has undergone great changes and scholars have attempted to describe the chronological development of Public Administration. For instance, Nicholas Henry (1975) asserted that the discipline has experienced five different paradigms. Although Henry recognizes that the notion of "paradigm" has been used extensively by scholars, he perceives the word to be useful since it conveys a discipline's identity and changing dynamics. Despite being in a permanent state of flux, the field of Public Administration should be seen as an independent field that should retain its autonomy in universities.

The first paradigm extends from 1900 to 1926, and concerns the politics and administration dichotomy. According to this paradigm, the government has two distinct functions, the political function, which copes with the policies of the state, and the administrative function, which focuses on the execution of these policies. At the time, administration was considered to be a subfield of politics, but both spheres did not interfere with each other. According to Henry (1975), the field of Public Administration focused on bureaucracy, which was a clear and substantial subfield of politics. Academically, Public Administration eventually gained its legitimacy in 1920 as scholars shift the focus from law to management. At this time, public administration faculty taught organizational theory, budgeting and personnel, whereas political scientists taught everything else (Henry 1975).

After becoming a legitimate academic field, Public Administration scholars began to search for a focus. This was described by Henry (1975) as the second paradigm which extended from 1927 to 1950. During this time, there was an increased focus on the search for scientific principles of Public Administration. If discovered, these principles would allow administrators to become experts in their work. There was also the emergence of the idea that politics and administration are inseparable. The connection between Public Administration and political science results in the public policy process, where the formulation and implementation of policies meet (Henry 1975).

It was hard to recognize the independence of an interdisciplinary field like Public Administration. Even though there were previous attempts to define the focus of Public Administration, many scholars linked the field back to Political Science, refusing to recognize the field's autonomy. For Henry (1975), the third paradigm extends from the 1950s to the 1970s, and deals with a renewed emphasis on Public Administration as the

equivalent of Political Science. The managerial aspects of Public Administration were no longer the field's central focus, as the political realm was seen to be the essence of administration. At this time Public Administration was not considered a subfield of Political Science, but rather, both fields were perceived to be equivalent (Henry 1975).

During the same period, and while many scholars still claimed that Public Administration was nothing but a subfield of politics, others believed in Public Administration as an independent discipline. This is how Public Administration finally separated from Political Science, and was considered to be its own discipline: that of the administrative sciences. During this time, independent Public Administration programs that were separate from Political Science programs were established (Henry 1975).

The last paradigm reviewed by Henry reflects the move to institutionalize Public Administration as an autonomous field. Public Administration must borrow and redefine, the concept of public interest from Political Science and synthesize this concept with public administration methodologies and bureaucratic purposes (Henry 1975). Public Administration was in fact experiencing a growing independence, which is well reflected in governmental institutes, urban affairs and public policy and administration centers in universities (Henry 1975). Given that the study of Public Administration will help address many practical aspects of administration, as well as issues related to the economy, politics, business and civil society, it is also important to focus on the practical side of public administration.

### **C. Public Administration as a Profession**

According to Eran Vigoda (2003), modern public administration is affected by ancient administrative practices rooted in various cultures. As far back as ancient China, Sun Tzu, referred to public administration as a practice that is highly linked to the military. Indeed, the study and practice of public administration have been influenced by military principles such as the unity of command and hierarchy (Shafritz, Russell, and Borick 2013). Later, ancient Greece played a big role in advancing the practice of public administration. Plato and Aristotle, for example, wrote about administrative matters such as training, competencies of officials, and the relationship between government and the polity (Shafritz, Russell, and Borick 2013). There were also other inspirations. During the time of Augustus Caesar, governments started to sponsor large public works. To succeed at their projects, the Romans introduced units of functional specialization that became the heart of modern administrative systems. These units include organizations that dealt with military affairs, finance, justice and police (including responsibilities such as public order, safety and securing the cooperation of citizenry). These ancient foundations of public administration continue to influence modern public administration.

It is also important to focus on the founders of contemporary public administration. In more recent times, Woodrow Wilson, Frederick Taylor and Max Weber are considered to be the founders of modern public administration. The systematic study of Public Administration emerged with Woodrow Wilson, who argued in 1887 that scholars must study how governments should be administered rather than only focusing on the legal aspect of administration. According to Wilson (1887, 200), “it is getting harder to run a

constitution than to frame one”. Wilson (1887, 197) also argued that administration is the most essential part in any government, since it represents governmental actions and decisions.

Four decades later, Max Weber made bureaucracy an important concept in the study of administration. He viewed the state as a legitimate entity that can impose its authority over its people. The bureaucratic administration, according to Weber, is based on functions such as impersonality of officials and neutral competence (Weber 1947). Weber also linked bureaucracy to rational legal authority, which refers to definite organizational structure, principles and characteristics. Bureaucratic work structures are predetermined by a set of official duties and tasks distributed among employees. The commands to discharge these duties are given away in a stable manner as it is defined by rules concerning the coercive and physical means that can be used to motivate people. To make sure that a methodological provision of duties is fulfilled, only the persons with corresponding qualifications are employed (Weber 1991). Weber also argued that the rational-legal bureaucracy includes a hierarchical arrangement of offices which is found in all hierarchical structures. This principle of hierarchy refers to a system of supervision of the lower offices by the higher ones. In bureaucratic systems, Weber argued that all rules should be formalized, exhaustive, and stable. Knowledge of these rules represent specific technical education which the employees possess (Weber 1991).

Another contributor is Frederick Taylor, who aimed to find the one best way to design and execute tasks in order to maximize the efficiency as a guiding criterion for managerial theory and practice (Taylor 1971). Taylor argued that scientific management is more effective than traditional managerial styles. Taylor’s main idea was that “the initiative

of the workmen, their hard work, their goodwill, their best endeavor is obtained with absolute regularity” (Taylor 1971, 124). According to Taylor scientific management is based upon four principles.

The first is the systematic study of different work methods, which will allow management to find the one best way to perform tasks. The next principle is the study of workmen, and more specifically, to train them and offer them higher incentives so they become motivated to perform better. The third principle encourages management to offer the workforce the tasks they would like to work in order to increase the productivity and bring the best in their employees. The last principle is that teamwork is essential, which helps to ensure the involvement of workers and managerial body in any organization (Taylor 1991).

Throughout the rise of the modern study of Public Administration, American scholars developed what is known as the three pillars of public administration: effectiveness, efficiency and economy (Perry 2005). Effectiveness refers to the extent to which an agency achieves its set objectives. Efficiency copes with the relationship between the inputs and outputs. Economy is the use of resources at the lowest possible cost while still maintaining the organizational objectives and goals (Perry 2005). A fourth pillar is arguably social equity, as it is seen to be an essential value to the field. Public administrators are urged to be socially sensitive in terms of considering the forces of change, the needs of citizens and of the society as a whole along with the economic and political circumstances of a given society (Perry 2005).

According to Eran Vigoda (2003), even though there are similarities between public administration of our times and public services of the past, many changes have occurred.



Public administration systems of today have a bigger and ever expanding impact on our communities. In modern democracies, public administration is one of the most important institutions in terms of addressing individuals' needs and governmental issues. Public administration is increasingly complex and holds more responsibilities to the citizens. In such a complex context, where different groups of individuals have different needs and demands, the public administration of a country should not overlook the traditional governmental functions. The basic administrative functions adhere to standards of equity, justice, social fairness and accountability (Vigoda 2003).

Not all systems of Public Administration are the same. Different countries have different needs and expectations, which may have consequences on research and practice. Given the history of the discipline of Public Administration, it is important to continue our inquiry by reviewing Western perspectives of public administration.

#### **D. Western Perspectives of Public Administration**

While there is no unified perspective about that constitutes the focus and practice of public administration, Western models of public administration are extremely influential. The industrial revolution in Europe began to shed light on social aspects such as social welfare, democracy and even political reforms (Vigoda 2003). Such developments were not initiated by social scientists, but rather, by "engineers, industrial entrepreneurs and technical professionals" (Vigoda 2003, 5). These professionals used statistical methods and linked them to management. Even though the development of modern public administration emerged from Europe, one should still consider that each country had its own

circumstances, needs and expectations. For example Rong Tan and Lifang Hao (2013) argued that when studying the public administration of a country, the national peculiarities and specificities should be considered. It is therefore important to explore the public administration of various countries.

### ***1. France***

In France, the development of public administration is linked to a model of state and ideology that is associated with political institutions. Public administration is, in other words, is the result of culture and traditions. France displays a clear profile of an integrative society that values the collective benefits. The French state possesses a wide range of political, social and economic functions. Administrative science was developed to help improve administrative efficiency and to promote the social welfare. Administrative science in France reflects these trends. For example, the legal trend stresses the study of legal texts, the managerial trend highlights the techniques that should be applied to administrative tasks, and the sociological trend focuses on the cultural and societal phenomena that should be considered when studying administration (Tan and Hao 2013).

### ***2. Germany***

Another European country that helped advance administrative developments is Germany. In Germany, the development of public administration was linked to the processes of modernization process that took place in the early eighteenth century. The

German national identity is based on principles of public law and a coherent administrative organization (Tan and Hao 2013). This identity helped to stabilize the governmental administration. After the Second World War, the government undertook administrative reforms that accelerated the influence of the study of Public Administration. When it comes to the study of Public Administration, the literature indicates that at the beginning of the establishment of the administrative discipline, the focus was more on laws and less on management. Later on, Public Administration in Germany became the academic backbone of governmental civil service system. Covering the development of public administration as a discipline and as a practice from the continental Europe perspective is not enough. One should also look at the case of countries such as the United Kingdom.

### ***3. United Kingdom***

Perspectives on public administration in the United Kingdom differ from continental Europe. In the United Kingdom, public administration is dominated by the study of government, public policy, and public management. In the 1960s and 1970s, traditional Public Administration was replaced by public policy and governmental studies. Since then, public management started to highlight issues of management, competition and technique. Tan and Hao (2013) argue that British Public Administration scholars conducted a great deal of theoretical research, especially after the administrative reforms of the 1980s. Their theoretical efforts resulted in a productive period of British public administrative works. British public administrative scholars were, however, able to contribute to the

discipline and practice of public administration by focusing on management and advancing the New Public Management (NPM) principles (Tan and Hao 2013).

#### ***4. United States***

After covering the case of France, Germany and the United Kingdom, it would be important to shift the focus to the United States a country that learned from the European experience. Many American scholars addressed key administrative issues. At its core, American Public Administration traces its origins back to the 1887, when Wilson wrote “The Study of Public Administration,” which focused on the way that governments should be administered. Wilson’s goal was to create a separate scientific field of Public Administration. This field would address the organizational and managerial sides of governing, as he distinguished between politics and administration. The emergence of the “politics-administration dichotomy” replaced the “spoils system” partisan politics that had dominated the American system of public administration for more than a century (Wilson 1887).

In 1937, Luther Gulick shifted the focus of the field towards organizational theory. The essence of Gulick’s rationale is based on the division of work, since a single man cannot simultaneously perform multiple tasks. The division of work is inseparable with concepts such as organizing and coordinating. Gulick discussed the concepts of: planning, organizing, staffing, directing, coordinating, reporting, and budgeting (POSDCORB) (Gulick 1991). If administrative scientists could identify the core elements behind these principles, the administrative sector could maximize its contributions to the general public.

Even though Gulick's perspective broadened the scope of Public Administration, the field was still perceived to be limited, as it focused more on the technical aspect of administration and less on the substance of administration (Henry 1992). To address one of the gaps of POSDCORB, the comparative perspective was developed by Riggs (1967), who argued that the cross-cultural perspective was a milestone in the study of Public Administration (Riggs 1967). According to Riggs (1967), there is a relationship between the administrative characteristics of a country and its social, economic, political and cultural development.

Thirty years later, NPM became the focus of administrative scholars and politicians. The goal of NPM was to redesign bureaucracy so that it would become dynamic, efficient, result-oriented, responsive, and sensitive to public needs. Implementing a NPM program aimed to improve public service in a way that promotes accountability, effectiveness and efficiency. New public management is an approach that many western countries adopted in the 1980s and the 1990s along, with the economic, political and social changes that were occurring for the first time (Heyer 2011).

The purpose behind the introduction of NPM was the implementation of performance management systems that would improve the efficiency, effectiveness and accountability of public organizations. Heyer (2011) argues that NPM had seven steps. The first step is to develop a strategic plan; the second step would be to specify the organizational goals and objectives. Third, a public organization should develop performance indicators that will fourth help in the execution of planning framework. Fifth, the following goal of NPM is to make sure employees are generating performance appraisals. Sixth, as a result of this delicate process of NPM, different organizations have to

achieve the ultimate purpose of delivering the assigned objectives. Finally, the process would undertake management reviews and performance evaluations that would provide feedback and help the organization in its future plans (Heyer 2011).

According to the literature, the Western world made substantial contributions to the development of public administration both a discipline and practice. However, many argue that the western perception and practice of public administration have many downsides worth of exploration.

### **E. Limitations of the Western Perspectives of Public Administration**

Western perspectives of public administration have several limitations. First, the western field of Public Administration suffers from an identity problem. This is because there are a variety of viewpoints concerning understandings about Public Administration. The interdisciplinary nature of Public Administration has also had an impact on the way the discipline is offered by universities. For instance, a study of American public affairs schools reveals that only about 40 percent of faculty is from Political Science or Public Administration. The remaining 60 percent come from a variety of other disciplines (Ventris 1991). This mix may present problems concerning the clarity of Public Administration programs. This trend suggests that a "pedagogical diffusion" has taken place. In other words, "Public Administration programs are slowly coming to resemble a disoriented educational octopus, with appendages moving in all directions, lacking a sense of normative coherent" (Ventris 1991, 8).

According to Ventris (1991), the second problem with the Western perspective is its discrepancy between theory and practice. Theories are supposed to be practical since the idea behind theory in research is that they refer to generalizations that are descriptive of reality and phrased in a testable way. The problem is that there are built-in tensions between theorists and practitioners. The latter argue that theorists pull too far into the world of abstraction. While theories are impressive intellectual statements, practitioners argue that theories show no relation to the operation of social systems in a modern world, argue practitioners. The split between theory and practice is not new. This state of affairs, to a large extent, is simply the result of different reward systems used by academicians and practitioners. The purpose, content, and relevance of public affairs education has been attacked from all sides as either atheoretical or, at best, an enlightened form of on-the-job training. Exacerbating this tension is another salient factor. The professionalization of public administration is connected with the natural life of bureaucracy that tends to favor knowledge accentuating efficiency, expediency, and calculation.

The next problem deals with the field's pedagogical focus. Public Administration programs educate students to become public leaders and/or administrators (Ventris 1991). One of the interesting aspects of public affairs education is the inclination to be "very much interested in educating students to do public service, but not necessarily to be public servants" or to be preparing students to be servants, but not administrative leaders (Ventris 1991). While the academic field of Public Administration must prepare citizens for a variety of public roles, educators overemphasize administration and analysis (teaching students to cope with complexity, planning, budgeting, and problem solving) and underemphasize leadership (teaching students to cope with change, communicating a

vision, and motivating them). What is implied, is the necessity to teach students to perform administrative, managerial and policy functions, while also teaching them about leadership roles they might perform vis-à-vis public issues (Ventris 1991).

Another problem is that the Western perspective does not consider differences in cultural contexts. As Waldo (1968) mentioned, “as long as the study of Public Administration is not comparative, claims for a science of Public Administration sound rather hollow” (Waldo 1968). In other words, public administration systems vary across societies (Waldo 1968). However, the study and practice of public administration does not consider culture, as many Public Administration textbooks describe administrative systems from the Western perspective without considering local peculiarities (Rice 2007).

This lack of cultural consideration is even prevalent in the standards of the National Association of Schools of Public Affairs and Administration (NASPAA), the accreditor of Public Administration masters programs in the United States (Perry 2005). The NASPAA president for year 2012 mentioned that it is important for such an association to get engaged with other schools from other countries (Knott 2012). Knott (2012) has also pointed out that NASPAA, as the global standard in public service education, should not only identify foreign Public Administration best practices, but also learn from their experiences and ultimately accredit the top foreign programs (Knott 2012). As the western Public Administration education has many limitations, one of which is omitting the importance of different context, it would hence be significant to shed light on the particularity of Public Administration education in the non-western world.

## **F. Public Administration Education in Non-Western Contexts**



Teaching Public Administration in different cultures is difficult (Walsh 2006). To address this challenge, Public Administration educators should consider various pedagogical aspects such as communication, teaching traditions, texts, and case contexts (Walsh 2006). Thomas Barth (2002) argues that MPA programs have a variety of goals. First, a MPA program must prepare students to contribute to the design, implementation, and oversight of public programs (Barth 2002). Second, a MPA program must promote public service as a career that goes beyond the salary and prestige of public administrators (Barth 2002). Third, a MPA program must embrace the perceived dichotomy in the discipline of Public Administration and encourage the debate between faculty members that spark creativity. This suggests that the design of a MPA program should be an integrative, not specialized, since the world demands the broad perspectives of areas such as Human Resources, Political Science, and Finance (Barth 2002). Furthermore, it has been advocated that the alignment of faculty and program needs is a continuous process of mutual adjustment, since everything is in a state of never ending change (Barth 2002).

The first attempt to offer a Public Administration program in the Arab region was initiated by the American University of Beirut (AUB) (Beckett and Bent 1953). In 1951, the United States Technological Cooperation of Administration (TCA) financed AUB to develop a program in Public Administration. The basic provisions included the opening of a Public Administration department, with a curriculum of courses in administration that led to the pursuit of a Bachelor of Arts degree. Furthermore, the contract between TCA and AUB was not precise, but yet mentioned that the Public Administration curriculum should include basic courses. These courses include introductory courses in Public Administration, public personnel administration, fiscal management, organization and methods and finally

municipal administration courses. Moreover, another objective was to train students who wanted to become public officials. Trainings were also part of the TCA-AUB agreement, since the focus was also a six-week training program aiming to train junior government officials in Arab countries to help cover general principles and problems of public administration.

Despite these measures, Beckett and Bent encountered difficulties related to the curriculum, enrollment, student orientation, language problems, cultural problems, and the availability of relevant materials. Concerning the difficulties related to the curriculum, the course offerings were limited to basic courses. The main courses consisted of an introductory course in basic theories, public personnel administration, in addition to courses related to political parties and pressure groups with finally a course counting as a graduate seminar. It is true that students were enrolling in the TCA programs, but they still did not know what the focus of Public Administration was about. The next problem related to student orientation, meaning that few students knew what they would do after graduation.

The students brought their own unique challenges. Students enrolled in this program belonged to three categories. The first comprised of students who had little idea about what to expect from such a program. The second consisted of students who were on leave from their governmental positions and had practical experience. The last category referred to students who belonged to other university programs and were just attracted by the fact that if enrolled in the Public Administration program in AUB, they would be granted a fellowship. The language problem was rooted in the fact that the Public Administration program was initially based in an English speaking institution, but applied to a foreign soil. Since different students belong to different countries, they all spoke different languages. As

such it was difficult to find a unique way to address students in the classroom. Lebanese students were not as proficient in English as were the American students. Dealing with a multi-cultural classroom was quite difficult (Beckett and Bent 1953).

The next obstacle depicted by Becket and Bent, was the cultural barrier. The English administrative terminology differed from Lebanese administrative jargon and vocabulary. While teaching Public Administration in the United States, one could assume that concepts such as political neutrality, merit system and the mentioning of institutions such as Civil Service Commission, would be familiar to American students. One could not expect that Middle Eastern students would be familiar with these ideas and concepts. American professors teaching Public Administration in the Middle East also had difficulties addressing the administrative system of a country was not familiar to them in terms of history, economy, and governmental operations.

The last obstacle discussed by Becket and Bent (1953), related to the lack of available materials. American textbooks might not apply to the Arab and more specifically to the Lebanese administrative context. The Western texts might not be illustrative of the Arab environment. The issue is that the amount of Lebanese and Arab related administrative texts was limited (Beckett and Bent 1953).

Another case of developing a master's in Public Administration has occurred in Egypt. Bremer and El Baradei (2008), attempted to strengthen the masters of Public Administration and Policy programs at the American University of Cairo (AUC), aiming to provide those working in the government and those supporting it from different sectors with relevant competencies and skills. The ultimate objective of AUC's MPP and MPA programs was to help realize the government's developmental goals, and to do so with

greater efficiency and effectiveness. The study aimed to check whether the MPA and MPP programs in Egypt addressed the administrative needs of the country. The study assessed four programs in terms of structure, curriculum, enrollment and list of thesis titles.

To assess whether the Egyptian MPA programs provided students with the skills they need to respond to the country's administrative needs, Bremer and El Baradei (2008) assessed the competencies valued by employers in the Egyptian administrative apparatus. To compare the existing four MPA programs in Egypt, both scholars conducted an exploratory evaluation of programs comparing the programs' current curricular structure and content against international research priorities and professional standards. The aspects that were considered in this case were structure, curriculum, the sectoral focus of graduate research and the need match of the skills taught to the needs of the market.

Based upon the literature and the experience of practitioners, a list of twenty six competencies was developed to determine whether the four MPA programs in Egypt fit to the marketplace and offer the competencies needed by administrators. These competencies would serve the Egyptian administrative sphere. In depth interviews were then conducted with representatives of different organizational bodies in Egypt. The first goal was to get the participants' opinions about the importance of the twenty six competencies. The second goal was to assess the degree to which the representatives believed that master's holders possess of these competencies. The results suggest that there was a poor match between the employers' stated needs and current administrators' capacities. The findings also suggest a lack of clarity in the perception of the MPA skill sets in the Egyptian market (Bremer and El Baradei 2008).

These two attempts to develop Public Administration programs represent opposite ends of a spectrum. On the one hand, the program at AUB encountered difficulties teaching Public Administration to a foreign audience. These difficulties were not easily overcome, as Henderson indicated in 1964. On the other hand, the program at AUC also encountered difficulties. Bremer and El Baradei (2008), sought to overcome the difficulties by undertaking a study of the administrative needs of Egypt, the administrative context of Egypt which consists of an over staffed and under-funded bureaucracy, and came up with a set of educational competencies appropriate for the Egyptian context. Both cases demonstrate the importance of culture in the Public Administration education context.

### **G. Importance of Contextual Consideration in Public Administration Education**

According to Waldo (1968, 10), “The concept of culture is used in the social sciences to denote the complexity of beliefs and ways of doing things of a society”. When it comes to public administration, it is essential to consider culture since there is a connection between the belief system of the society, the administrative needs and the “way of doing things” (Waldo 1968). Students of Public administration should understand that there are important differences between administrative systems according to location, task, the environment and the inhabitants of the system (Waldo 1968). It is also essential to make the intercultural comparisons when studying administration; one should hence distinguish between different cultures and countries (Waldo 1968). Public Administration programs must offer basic skills to all students in order to confer a degree, and it is imperative that cultural competencies fall within these basic skills.

According to Perry (Perry 2005, 10): “A true multicultural curriculum integrates cultural content throughout subjects and grade levels, placing new content where it is pedagogically and contextually appropriate.” Perry (2005) indicates that there are five elements that contribute to a system's ability to become more culturally competent. The system should value diversity, have the capacity for self-assessment, be conscious of the dynamics inherent when cultures interact, institutionalize cultural knowledge, and develop programs and services that reflect an understanding of diversity between and within cultures (Perry 2005). Public Administration educators should also consider cultural peculiarities when designing Public Administration courses. Cultural competency is:

A set of congruent behaviors, attitudes, and policies that come together in a system, agency, or among professionals that enable them to work effectively in cross-cultural situations. It is the acceptance and respect for difference, a continuous self-assessment regarding culture, and attention to the dynamics of difference, the ongoing development of cultural knowledge, and the resources and flexibility within service models to meet the needs of minority populations (Perry 2005, citing Cross et al 1989, 3).

Being competent in cross-cultural situations requires to learn about new patterns of behavior and implementing them in the suitable settings (Rice 2007). Cultural competency is concerned with the understanding of and respect for various societies’ traditions, values, histories and beliefs. Different activities and practices should integrate the specific standards and policies that should be applied in the specific setting. Cultural competency refers to the effective consideration of different societal norms, patterns and influences. Being culturally competent enables administrators to reflect on the way that that different services are provided and the activities that are performed (Rice 2007).

Rice (2007) deduced that there are many reasons why cultural competences should be considered in the study and practice of public administration. Understanding a specific culture of a society will help in understanding the administrative system in that society. Another reason is that the specific knowledge and awareness of societal characteristics prepares public administrators to effectively perform their tasks and address the particular needs (Rice 2007).

It is clear that teaching public administration should not follow one overarching strategy and curriculum. While there may be a core set of important topics, to effectively invest in the development of future public administrators, educators must not detach themselves and their students from the societal and cultural issues present in communities in which they are situated. Culturally competent public administration recognizes the importance of societal differences. These differences should be addressed through cultural knowledge and the adaptation of services targeting the unique needs (Rice 2007).

## **H. Administrative Competencies**

This literature review presented some of the main definitions of public administration and identified some of the most important educational and practical aspects of the discipline. The most influential approaches were advanced by Western countries.

### ***1. Western Competencies***

NASPAA, being the major association for graduate programs in Public Administration has a twofold mission. The first is to ensure excellence in service. The second is to promote the ideal of public service. Even though NASPAA only addresses graduate Public Administration programs, one cannot deny that it still serves as the backbone of Public Administration education. According to NASPAA (2012), the MPA is a professional degree for those interested in a management career in the public sphere. The curriculum is thus designed to help students to develop the skills the techniques used by managers and leaders. The advertised courses should help students learn how to implement policies, projects, programs and even solve societal issues. According to NASPAA (2012), a Public Administration graduate has to be able to work in all levels of government, as well as non-profit organizations, international organizations, consulting firms and in the private sector. The list of core and specialized courses are presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Relevant PA Courses Presented by NASPAA (2012)

| <b>Core Courses</b>  | <b>Specialized Courses</b>  |
|--|---|
| Introduction to Public Administration<br>Budgeting/ Finance<br>Managerial Economics<br>Political and Legal Processes<br>Quantitative Methods<br>Ethics | Public Management<br>Non-Profit Management<br>Health-Care Management<br>International development<br>Urban Affairs<br>Human-Resource Management<br>State/ Local Government Administration<br>Financial Management |



Although NASPAA (2012) presents a list of core and specialized courses that should be addressed in a masters degree of Public Administration, no description was provided to the courses. NASPAA's list reaches, its goal which is listing two categories of courses but it does not describe each of the mentioned courses (NASPAA 2012). We will accept these courses at face value, without describing the finer points of focus, for example what is meant by Ethics.

## ***2. Arab Competencies***

Since the main approaches to study Public Administration are based upon Western experiences, it is important to realize that the Western perspective may not always work in non-Western contexts. There are many limitations in the European and American systems of Public administration education, one of which is their lack of focus on culture as a central element. This suggests that non-Western Public Administration programs must be designed to address the specific cultural context within which they operate.

Indeed, as indicated by the study conducted at AUC, there have been some attempts to develop context-bound Public Administration programs. Beyond stressing the role of culture, however, a program must also provide students with the knowledge and skills they need to address the administrative problems in their respective countries. There is a wide variety of skills and competencies that can be addressed. In their study, Bremer and El Baradei (2008) identified more than a dozen core competencies. Bremer and El Baradei (2008) divide the administrative competencies into three areas: situational analysis; program development; and implementation. Situation analysis is comprised of

competencies such as data collection, quantitative and qualitative methods of data analysis and the drafting policy papers.

The second competency area is program development. This category entails the development of overall program strategy and objectives, the development of alternatives to achieve objectives, and the development of budgets to implement alternatives. The last competency area concerns program implementation. This category involves leadership skills, decision-making skills, managerial and motivational skills. It also includes legal competencies and the ability to evaluate results (Bremer and El Baradei 2008). Table 2 presents the competencies and sub-competencies that were developed during an assessment of the Public Administration and Public Policy programs (Bremer and El Baradei 2008). Although divided into three categories of competencies, the different sub-competencies were not thoroughly explained by the scholars.

In more generic terms, Jreisat (2011) mentions that there are six administrative elements that should be addressed in the Arab region (Jreisat 2011). First, students need to understand the budget and financial processes, referring to the transparency and accountability of the allocation of financial resources. Second, there is a need to develop human resource abilities, referring to the importance of training of the future public officials and keeping them motivated.

Table 2: Competencies Used in AUC

| <b>Competencies</b>           | <b>Sub-Competencies</b>  |
|-------------------------------|--|
| <b>Situational Analysis</b>   | Synthesis of situational or problem analysis for decision-makers<br>Quantitative, economic and statistical analysis of data<br>Definition of problem in form suitable for analysis<br>Writing policy papers/ reports<br>Qualitative analysis of data   |
| <b>Program Development</b>    | Development of overall program strategy and objectives<br>Development of alternatives to achieve objectives<br>Analytic comparison of alternatives<br>Projection of impact of various alternatives<br>Development of budgets to implement alternatives<br>Development of implementation plans<br>Development of strategy to gain acceptance of alternative(s)<br>Proposal writing for donors or others |
| <b>Program Implementation</b> | Leadership skills<br>Decision-making skills<br>Motivation skills<br>Time management skills<br>Financial management of program<br>Legal competencies<br>Monitoring and follow-up<br>Collaboration with partners/ donors<br>Preparing project progress reports<br>Oral presentation skills<br>Interpersonal communication skills<br>Evaluation of results  |

Third, students should be provided with an understanding of how to utilize data and technology, since the internet is a powerful tool for communication and information exchange. Fourth, there is the need to understand the role of measurement as a component of performance management. Fifth, there is a need to teach students about citizenship and the dangers of performing corrupt actions. Finally, students in the region should develop leadership skills that will enable them to steer the system towards innovation and

constructive change (Jreisat 2008). Table 3 presents the main competencies provided by Jreisat and their definition (Jreisat 2011).

Table 3: Administrative Competencies Needed in the Arab World

| <b>Competencies</b>                       | <b>Meaning</b>  |
|---|---|
| <b>Budget and Financial Process</b>       | Ensure accountability and transparency and allocate financial resources where need is the highest |
| <b>Investment in Human Resources</b>      | Training is important: ethical culture with needed skills   |
| <b>Utilization of Data and Technology</b> | Internet and social media: the exchange of information  |
| <b>Measurement of Results</b>             | Allocate responsibility for the performance of a system, and accountability for its results       |
| <b>Trust and Confidence of Citizens</b>   | Public officials should behave ethically: equate equitable, effectively and efficiently           |
| <b>Leadership</b>                         | The responsibility for sustaining and integrating the various                                     |

## **I. Conceptual Framework**

The literature review discussed the main perspectives of Public Administration which are the political, legal, managerial and occupational definitions. Based on the various meanings of Public Administration, one can see the interconnectedness between the study and the practice of the administrative sciences (Shafritz, Russell, and Borick 2013).

Although the practice of public administration can be traced back to ancient times, the study of the administrative sciences did not mature until the 1800s in the Western part of the world. In the centuries that have followed, Western Public Administration became

influential and affected the administrative discipline and activity throughout the world. The rapidity of this process has only increased with globalization (Tan and Hao 2013).

Although Western Public Administration provides many insights about the state, trends and development of the administrative field and practice, one cannot assume that Western public administration can be applied to different parts of the world. Each country has its own administrative problems and peculiarities. For example, Arab region is has high levels of corruption due to the incompetent staff, some attempts to enhance the administrative education were made in Egypt for example (Jreisat 2006; Bremer and El Baradei 2008). To meet the objectives of this study, this conceptual framework was generated based on the reviewed literature. The conceptual framework referred to as the Arab Public Administration framework (APA framework) is presented is Table 4.

Table 4: Elements of an Effective Public Administration Curriculum in the Arab Region

| <b>Core Courses</b>                   | <b>Specialized Courses</b>             |
|---------------------------------------|--|
| Introduction to Public Administration | Public Management                      |
| Budget and Finance                    | Non-Profit Management                  |
| Managerial Economics                  | International Development              |
| Political and Legal Processes         | Human-Resources Management             |
| Quantitative Methods                  | State/ Local Government Administration |
| Ethics                                | Financial Management                   |
| IT Systems                            | Health-Care Management                 |
| Qualitative Methods                   | Urban Affairs                          |
| Leadership and Decision- Making       |  |
| Communication                         |  |
| Citizenship                           |  |

The APA framework presents the components of an Arab Public Administration curriculum which consists of a list of eleven core and eight specialized courses. The APA framework will be the basis against which we were able to compare the Public Administration courses advertised in Lebanon. This list is mainly based on NASPAA's curriculum (international standards) because it focuses on courses rather than competencies. These standards are complemented by key elements mentioned by Jreisat, Bremer and El Baradei. No meaning is associated with the categories since most of the courses were not described by the cited authors. We did not differentiate between the undergraduate and graduate levels, since the literature does not present different lists. In other words the APA framework presents an international/ regional perspective on the type of Public Administration key courses that should be offered in the Arab world.

This chapter helped us develop the APA framework which made us get a picture about the courses that should be taught in the Arab world. We will now employ this framework to evaluate the Public Administration related courses in Lebanon, an Arab country. The next chapter will present the methods used in this thesis including the data collection, coding and analysis.

## CHAPTER III

### METHODS

According to Onwuegbuzie and Leech (2007), mixed-methods research enables researchers to develop new conceptual frameworks, and validate the quantitative findings by referring to data collected from the qualitative phase of the study. A researcher should be able to combine both types of research within a single investigation (Leech and Onwuegbuzie 2007). Given its exploratory nature this thesis adopted a mixture of quantitative and qualitative research design strategies.

This chapter reviews the methods used to collect, code and analyze the data central to this study. In this study, quantitative methods were used to identify and describe the nature of Public Administration programs advertised by universities in Lebanon. In contrast, qualitative methods were used to determine whether these Public Administration programs adequately prepare students address Lebanon's administrative needs of Lebanon. More precisely, the methods employed in this study are content analysis (quantitative) and focus groups (qualitative).

The preceding chapter suggests that there might be a mismatch between the curriculum being taught in Public Administration programs in the Middle East and the needs of communities in the Middle East. Building upon this suggestion, and focusing on the Republic of Lebanon as a case study, this thesis will address three research questions:

- To what extent are Public Administration courses prevalent in universities in Lebanon?
- To what extent does Public Administration education in Lebanon reflect Lebanon's administrative needs?

- What might be the primary curricular components of a Public Administration program that takes the administrative needs of Lebanon into consideration?

### **A. Research Population and Sample**

This study pursued two target populations. For the first stage, the target population consisted of the pool of Public Administration courses advertised by institutions certified by Lebanon's Ministry of Education and Higher Education. For the second stage, the target population involved students and who had knowledge about Lebanon's administrative needs. These professionals and students were purposefully sampled by making use of publically available contact information. Those who were contacted were asked to participate in focus groups that explored the state of public administration practice and Public Administration education in Lebanon. A total number of twenty- nine individuals participated in the focus groups. Additional information about the methods employed by this study is discussed below.

### **B. Quantitative Methods**

This research applied quantitative techniques to address the first and the second research questions. Content analysis was used to gather data related to the state of Public Administration education in Lebanon which allowed me to evaluate the extent to which it considers the local administrative needs.

#### ***1. Data Collection***



The quantitative data was collected from documents that provide details about Public Administration programs and courses advertised by universities in Lebanon. The first step was to generate a list of Lebanon's certified universities and educational institutions. This information was collected from the website Ministry of Education and Higher Education. After creating the list, steps were taken to collect background information about these institutions. This information included: the full name of each institution, their phone numbers, their locations, and their websites. We then visited the websites of the relevant universities to collect information about their courses. Namely we downloaded softcopies of university catalogues and lists of course offerings. If necessary, we gathered the hardcopies of these catalogues and course offerings through site visits. The catalogues were advertised during the 2012-2013 academic year. If not available, the most recent catalogue was used for our research.

From these catalogues, we collected information such as: the names of courses related to Public Administration, course numbers, course descriptions, the relevant faculty and departments, the language of instruction, and whether these courses are part of a programmatic core. Courses were considered relevant if they met Bradley Wright's definition of Public Administration (Wright 2011, 96).

Public administration is an interdisciplinary field that builds on a variety of disciplinary approaches and values. Even so, there are three disciplines that form the underlying foundation of the field. In addition to the traditional managerial emphasis on efficiency and effectiveness, the field of public administration is heavily influenced by the representative and responsive nature of our political system, as well as our legal system's emphasis on individual rights and social equity. Thus, public administration is an interdisciplinary field, defined by the need to address conflicting political, legal, and managerial values and processes.

We decided to use this definition because it is broad and it reflects the interdisciplinary nature of Public Administration. Courses that fell within this definition were coded as relevant. This means that we also included courses in the data set that were not advertised by Public Administration programs. We examined the title of the course. If this was not enough to determine whether the course should be coded, the next stage was to read the course description. An example is an undergraduate International Affairs course advertised by the Lebanese American University (LAU) called *Government and Politics in Lebanon* (Lebanese American University 2012a). The course explored the Lebanese governmental institutions post-independence, which is directly related to Public Administration definitions provided above. Another example is the graduate business course advertised by the Olayan School of Business (OSB) in the American University of Beirut (AUB) is *Government and Non-profit Accounting*. This course dealt with the accounting process of state institutions, the expenditures of the government and the contemporary financial reporting issues (American University of Beirut 2012a).

There were many courses that did not meet the definitional requirements. For example, consider the international affairs undergraduate course advertised in LAU: *International Organizations*. This course was determined not to be relevant because its primary focus was not Public Administration. The course covers the development and evolution of international actors, peacemaking settlements and international social and economic developments. A second example is a graduate business course advertised by OSB called *Introduction to Transport Economics and Policy*. Even though this course copes with policies, its primary emphasis it is not Public Administration, but rather,

transport company policies and management (Lebanese American University 2012b; American University of Beirut 2012b)

To deal with ambiguous courses, we referred to the original location of the course, which allowed us to assess the focus of a course based on the program in which it was advertised. If the program is related to Public Administration or Public Affairs, we included the courses in the data set. If the program was not centrally related to Public Administration, then the course was excluded from the data set.

## ***2. Data Coding***

We created a list of all relevant courses in an Excel spreadsheet. We then reviewed the titles and descriptions and compared the courses to the APA framework. If relevant the courses were marked with a “1”. Each course could fall within one or more topical categories. For example the course *Human Resources and Personnel Administration* offered at AUB covers both the human resources and public policy aspect. As such it was coded in two categories political and legal processes and human resource management (American University of Beirut 2012f).

## ***3. Data Analysis***

Data analysis began with the generation of descriptive statistics. This permitted the researcher to determine the number of Public Administration courses advertised by certified universities across Lebanon. The second step was to assess number of courses advertised, and whether the coded courses were core programmatic courses. We also considered the

location of the program, for example, whether it resides in a specific faculty, school, or department. The analysis considered the extent to which coded courses reflect what should be taught regionally and internationally according to the APA framework. The coding schema is the same for the undergraduate and graduate levels, because no difference was drawn in the mentioned literature. We also analyzed the different languages of instruction; the distribution of courses by degree level and universities. What was also examined was the frequency of various topics and the number of courses that focus on Lebanon.

### **C. Qualitative Methods**

This study also employed a qualitative method to address the second and third research questions. The method consisted of focus groups with Lebanese professionals and students who had knowledge about the state of public administration practice and education in Lebanon. For the purpose of consistency, the same questions were asked to all focus groups. A copy of the focus groups questionnaire is attached as Appendix II.

#### ***1. Data Collection:***

Focus groups are useful because they allow a group of research participants to share information about a specific topic (Morgan 1996). In this sense, group interactions can enrich the data about a particular subject. To investigate the state of public administration Lebanon, six focus groups were conducted. These focus groups relied on the selection of individuals based on their position. The experts were identified from publically available information. Students were contacted via email by the Political Studies and Public

Administration departmental chair, who received the approval of the Dean of Students Affairs of AUB. The focus groups allowed the participants to speak about the state of public administration in Lebanon, the administrative problems, the courses that should be taught to help solve these problems, the teaching methods that should be adopted to teach the courses and the skills and competencies that students should to have upon graduation.

The first focus group involved eight public officials. The second focus group involved six private sector experts. The third focus group consisted of five experts who worked in civil society and international organizations. The fourth focus group was a mix of individuals from all three sectors, which enabled them to interact and reflect upon each other's responses. The two last focus groups included AUB Public Administration undergraduate and graduate students. (In total, we met with twenty nine individuals). The questions that were asked during the focus groups concentrate on the state of public administration practice and Public Administration education in Lebanon.

## ***2. Data Coding***

The information disclosed during the focus groups was audio recorded and transcribed into separate word documents. These word documents were then uploaded to MAXQDA for analysis. MAXQDA is a computer program that allows the researcher to assign codes to different sections of the written text (VERBI 2013). The transcripts were coded by identifying the themes combined in the data. More precisely, thematic analysis was applied to group codes into themes (Braun and Clarke 2006). The transcripts were reviewed, line-by-line to identify the extent to which those who participated in the focus

groups referred to the different created categories combined in the conceptual framework and questionnaire. Even though the focus groups questionnaire helped to establish the sixteen categories used in the coding, we also generated themes inductively. This means we let the data shape the development of new themes (Braun and Clarke 2006).

Once all of the transcripts were coded, the data was recoded. According to Saldana (2013), recoding is a necessary step in the coding process. In fact, it allows for the reclassification and rearrangement of data. For instance, the focus groups questionnaire suggested that we create two independent categories for the competencies of students at both the undergraduate and graduate levels. However, after we finished coding the transcripts, we realized that the focus groups members did not make such a differentiation. The final analysis was not completed until the recoding is done since modified categories emerged and information was re-categorized throughout the coding process (Saldana 2013).

### ***3. Data Analysis***

Data analysis proceeded in several steps. At the first stage, we identified the key qualities that any candidate for administrative jobs in Lebanon needs to possess. The answers were grouped with the list of needed skills at both the undergraduate and graduate levels. The aim behind the analysis of this data was to weigh the importance of the skills that are considered by our focus groups members to be vital in the Lebanese administration.

The second step of the analysis was to present these courses and compare between what the members claim to be important and what is actually being taught in Lebanon, based on our content analysis section. An overlap implies that universities in Lebanon are

teaching what should be offered to address the Lebanese governmental and administrative needs. A gap would suggest that universities are not addressing the areas needed in Lebanon. To analyze this aspect, a list of topics mentioned by the twenty-nine focus groups members was generated. This list served as a basis against which all courses were compared. It was then relevant to conduct a statistical approach to assess the percentage of courses that abide by the focus groups suggestions. Secondly it was also relevant to assess the percentage of areas mentioned by the focus groups that were not taught in Lebanon.

The next step in our analysis was to compare the focus groups findings to the APA Framework presented in the previous chapter. In other words, to compare what should be taught in Lebanon (focus groups) to what should be taught regionally and internationally according to the APA Framework. Although the courses mentioned in the literature are not defined in detail; the topics to which the findings were compared are presented in conceptual framework. Secondly, it was also relevant to assess the percentage of areas mentioned by the literature and more precisely by our conceptual framework that were not taught in Lebanon. Focus groups members were also asked to suggest what they thought might be the most effective teaching methods for undergraduate and graduate public administration courses. To evaluate this aspect, it was important to sort out the most recommended ways to teach by highlighting the frequency of each teaching method throughout the focus groups.

#### **D. Ethical Considerations and Participant Safeguards**

This research did not present any risk to the participants beyond those risks encountered in everyday life. The participants were not part of any at-risk population. The contact information for the participants came from publically available data such as websites and government reports. Moreover, data collected only preceded with the signed consent of participants. A copy of the consent for participation is attached as Appendix III.

The focus group questions did not cause any physical, emotional, or psychological discomfort or harm. The focus group questions asked about the study and profession of public administration. The subjects were informed that the focus groups would be audio recorded. All potential subjects could refuse participation, either via email or by not showing up to the scheduled focus group. The participants were also allowed to discontinue their participation at any time. Before the start of the focus group, the researchers, after reading an overview of the research to the participants, secured verbal consent. A copy of the request for participation script is attached as Appendix IV. After the research was completed, the audio recordings were transcribed. Once transcribed; the audio recordings were destroyed. Meanwhile, the audio recordings and transcripts were held in a password-protected file and stored in a locked drawer. All data collected by this study is confidential, and neither the names of the interviewees nor any identifying marker (such as their organizational affiliation) would be included in the written thesis or any other output generated by this research.

## **E. Encountered Challenges**



This study provides insights into the state of public administration as a matter of education and practice. One, however, cannot deny that this research has limitations. These limitations, organized by methods, will be discussed in the subsequent sections.

### ***1. Quantitative Methods***

Difficulties related to the quantitative content analysis are rooted in the collection, coding and also analysis of the data. Going through all the courses advertised across the Republic of Lebanon was not simple since not all universities publish their course offerings or even post their academic catalogues online. We had to call many times or visit the institutions in person to get the minimum needed to proceed with the research process. After pursuing as much information as possible, coding the collected data posed other types of challenges. The first encounter was to adopt a Public Administration definition to have a solid basis against which the courses will be compared. The challenge was to always make sure that the courses abide by Wright's definition (2011) and code according to the primary focus of a course. If the core of the course is Public Administration, then the course must be coded, otherwise the course should be disregarded. The challenge here was that many course descriptions did not exist. Moreover, if they did exist, they were often vague or outdated.

### ***2. Qualitative Methods***

The focus groups also presented their own challenges. The first difficulty was related to data collection. Organizing focus groups is not easy as it requires bringing experts and students together who may not be interested in the research. Moreover,

professionals may either refrain from answering recruitment emails, or declare that they are busy. The key solution was to be as flexible as possible and try to consider the preference of the candidates in order to maximize the rate of participation. It was difficult to secure a large number of participants; we ended up with three to eight members in group. During the meetings, some participants perceived the questions as too broad and simplistic. Another problem that we encountered in data collection was confidentiality, as some candidates asked to stop recording because they wanted to refer to sensitive issues.

This chapter reviewed the methods used to conduct the quantitative and qualitative research, the ethical considerations and participant safeguards, and the challenges encountered during the study. The next chapter will present and discuss the findings generated at both the quantitative and qualitative levels.

## CHAPTER IV

### FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

This chapter presents and analyses the quantitative and qualitative findings generated by this study. The findings are divided into two sections the quantitative and the qualitative findings. The quantitative data will present information about the institutes, course offerings and about Public Administration education. The qualitative findings will present some of the problems related to the Lebanese administration and the structure of Public Administration education. The second part of this chapter aims to analyse the findings by comparing the Public Administration advertised courses in Lebanon to what is suggested by the APA Framework. The analysis will also allow the comparison between the courses advertised in Lebanon to what should be offered in Lebanon as per the focus groups suggestions.

#### **A. Quantitative Findings**

This section provides the findings generated by content analysis. This will include an overview of the data and general quantitative findings.

##### ***1. Overview***

The following sections will explore background information about Public Administration education in Lebanon. This includes information about the institutions, programs and concentration, and the language of instruction of courses.

a. Institutions

According to the quantitative results, there are forty-three educational institutions in Lebanon that are accredited by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education. The most general finding relates to the nature of institutions that advertise Public Administration courses. There are thirty- three establishments labeled as universities by the Ministry, which constitutes 76.7% of all academic bodies. The remaining ten (or 23.3%) establishments are listed as accredited colleges and institutions. According to the conducted descriptive statistics, establishments labeled as universities advertise almost all Public Administration courses and more specifically 98.65% of all detected courses. Institutes and colleges advertise the remaining 1.35% of courses. The names of the universities and the degree level of the courses considered in the analysis are represented in Appendix I. Table 5 presents the courses advertised by degree and level of certification.

b. Programs and Concentrations

There are only three undergraduate Public Administration programs in Lebanon, which are offered at AUB, NDU and USEK. These three universities represent less than 7% of the total pool of accredited establishments, but advertise more than 42% of all Public Administration courses. This means that students who want to acquire a bachelor in Public Administration in Lebanon should go to one of these three universities which limit the enrollment choices of students. The focus group participants highlighted the fact that long term administrative change in Lebanon depends, in part, on the education of future public officials. As such, the fact that there are only three universities that offer Public

Administration programs might not be enough to allow the Lebanese administration to recruit qualified officials.

Apart from programs, there are sixteen universities that advertise sufficient numbers of courses to be considered to offer concentrations in Public Administration. According to Wish and Mirabella (1998), universities were considered to offer a concentration in a field when they offer three or more courses related to a specific subject. A university does not have to offer a Public Administration program or degree to propose a concentration on this particular discipline. In other words, 37.2% of universities that advertise Public Administration can be considered to offer a concentration in the field. These universities include University of Balamand, Islamic University of Lebanon and the Lebanese University. These universities guarantee the minimal knowledge about Public Administration provided to students, despite that they do not offer a major in the field.

Table 5: Public Administration Courses by Degree Level and Certification Class, 2012-13

|                                  | <b>Degree Level</b>  |            |                 |            |              |            |
|----------------------------------|----------------------|------------|-----------------|------------|--------------|------------|
|                                  | <b>Undergraduate</b> |            | <b>Graduate</b> |            | <b>Total</b> |            |
| <b>Certification Class</b>       | (N)                  | %          | (N)             | %          | (N)          | %          |
| <b>University</b>                | 155                  | 98.10      | 65              | 100.00     | 220          | 98.65      |
| <b>College &amp; Institution</b> | 3                    | 1.90       | 0               | 0          | 3            | 1.35       |
| <b>Total</b>                     | <b>158</b>           | <b>100</b> | <b>65</b>       | <b>100</b> | <b>223</b>   | <b>100</b> |

c. Language of Instruction

As shown in Table 6, our analysis then aimed to identify the language of instruction used in the advertised courses. The analysis revealed that Arabic is only employed in 14.34% of all Public Administration courses, despite the fact that Arabic is Lebanon’s official language. In fact 56.95% of all Public Administration courses are offered in English. An example of these courses is *Public Administration* which is an undergraduate course advertised at Haigazian University (Haigazian University 2012).

This is followed by French with 29.15% of the total number of courses. For instance, *Public Policies and Social Work* is one of those French graduate courses advertised at USJ (Saint Joseph University 2012). The remaining 0.45% represents a single course advertised in both English and French, which is advertised by LCU. The course is entitled *Analysis of Public Policies* (Lebanese- Canadian University, n.d.).

Table 6: Public Administration Courses by Degree Level and Language of Instruction, 2012-13

|                  | Degree Level  |            |           |            |            |            |
|------------------|---------------|------------|-----------|------------|------------|------------|
|                  | Undergraduate |            | Graduate  |            | Total      |            |
| Language         | (N)           | %          | (N)       | %          | (N)        | %          |
| English          | 82            | 51.90      | 45        | 69.23      | 127        | 56.95      |
| French           | 51            | 32.28      | 14        | 21.54      | 65         | 29.15      |
| Arabic           | 24            | 15.19      | 6         | 9.23       | 32         | 14.34      |
| English & French | 1             | 0.63       | 0         | 0          | 1          | 0.45       |
| <b>Total</b>     | <b>158</b>    | <b>100</b> | <b>65</b> | <b>100</b> | <b>223</b> | <b>100</b> |

This finding is validated by the fact that two out of the three programs advertised across the country are in English. These are the programs taught at AUB and NDU. The remaining program advertised at USEK is in French. None of the advertised Public Administration programs are in Arabic which delineates the official language of the country when teaching such a contextual focused discipline. The marginalization of Arabic might have a negative effect on the practice of Public Administration in Lebanon; however, these findings suggest the need for further research.

## **B. Quantitative Findings**

It is first important to reveal the quantitative findings generated based on content analysis. This section will present the general findings generated based on content analysis.

### ***1. General Findings***

The evaluation of the advertised courses in Lebanon began by assessing the results of the content analysis, which were generated by comparing the courses to the APA Framework. To maintain consistency, no differentiation between undergraduate and graduate courses was made since the literature does not differentiate between levels in terms of course offerings. Before discussing the data, it is important to mention that the grand total is not equal to the number of advertised courses. In fact, a course could have been coded in different categories. Each course could have been coded as covering one or more topics. As a result, the coding of the 223 relevant courses generated 475 codes across 19 coding categories of Public Administration topics.

Table 7: Frequency and Percentage of Public Administration Advertised Courses in Lebanon According to the Global Standards, 2012-13

| <b>Required Topics</b>                | <b>N</b>   | <b>%</b>   |
|---------------------------------------|------------|------------|
| Political and Legal Processes         | 141        | 29.7       |
| Budgeting and Finance                 | 59         | 12.4       |
| Introduction to Public Administration | 40         | 8.4        |
| Managerial Economics                  | 29         | 6.1        |
| Leadership and Decision Making        | 21         | 4.4        |
| Ethics                                | 14         | 2.9        |
| Quantitative Methods                  | 11         | 2.3        |
| Communication                         | 10         | 2.1        |
| Qualitative Research                  | 9          | 1.9        |
| Citizenship                           | 5          | 1.1        |
| IT Systems                            | 3          | 0.6        |
| <i>Sub-Total</i>                      | <i>342</i> | <i>72</i>  |
|                                       |            |            |
| <b>Specialized Topics</b>             |            |            |
| Public Management                     | 40         | 8.4        |
| International Development             | 26         | 5.5        |
| State/Local Government Administration | 21         | 4.4        |
| Financial Management                  | 15         | 3.2        |
| Non-Profit Management                 | 13         | 2.7        |
| Human Resources Management            | 9          | 1.9        |
| Health-Care Management                | 7          | 1.5        |
| Urban Affairs                         | 2          | 0.4        |
| <i>Sub-Total</i>                      | <i>133</i> | <i>28</i>  |
| <b>Grand Total</b>                    | <b>475</b> | <b>100</b> |

It is also clear that 72% of advertised Public Administration courses are core whereas only 28% are specialized courses. The last finding has both positive and negative connotations. The positive aspect lies in the fact that the overall distribution of courses matches international and regional general expectations such as Finance or Law. Indeed, Barth (2002) stresses that Public Administration should be an integrative rather than a specialized field. The negative aspect, however, is that the number of specialized topics



leaves students with no area of specialization this applies to topics such as Non-Profit Management or even Public Management. Table 7 presents the frequency and percentage of the topics addressed by the Public Administration courses advertised in Lebanon.

## ***2. Core Topics***

Based on the APA framework, some topics were coded more than others. We can notice that Political and Legal processes constitute almost 30% of topics covered in Lebanese Public Administration courses, which confirms Wright's definition mentioning that Public Administration is a combination of Law, Politics and Management. Budgeting and Finance come next, representing 12.4% of the topics covered. Most of the focus groups members mentioned the strong Ministry of Finance in Lebanon and more specifically, a participant who works in this ministry highlights the fact that it is one of the solidest ministries in Lebanon.

However, other core topics were less prevalent. For example only 4% of the topics covered address issues related to Ethics or Citizenship. More specifically, at the graduate level, there is only one Ethics course in all of Lebanon. This means that Public Administration graduate students can only learn about ethics related to the Lebanese public sector if they are enrolled at AUB. In major part, this may help to explain why corruption and fraud persist in the Lebanese public sector, which was argued to be a main issue by the focus groups participants. The quasi absence of graduate courses that address issues of Citizenship may also have consequences. It may reflect, and even lead to the lack of citizen

engagement regarding issues related to the performance of the public sector and even to the community well-being.

### ***3. Specialized Topics***

Based on the APA framework, some specialized topics were advertised more than others. This is the case of Public Management and International Development, for example. Public Management represents 8.4% of topics covered, while International Development is represented in 5.5% of the topics covered. This means that students can, to a certain extent, learn about the managerial processes related to the public administration while being updated about the administrative and political global developments. Other specialized topics are less prevalent. For example, only a 1.9% of the topics deal with Human Resource Management, which reflect the state of human resources in Lebanon's public sector.

In Lebanon, there is one centralized body responsible for human resources practices called the Civil Service Board. This board is supposed to be responsible of the human resources functions at least at a basic level including hiring based on the merit system for instance, however this body is not fulfilling its intended role. To illustrate this problem, the focus groups informed us that there is a test that employees should pass before getting a job in the public sector. The problem according to the focus groups is that the top candidates are not selected for the particular job, but rather, the ones who have a "wasta" are recruited. The only body responsible for public sector human resources is not fulfilling its duties. This is reflected in the limited number of Public Administration Human Resources Management courses. This means that if the civil society board is not doing its job, then there is no need to teach Human Resources because students will not benefit from the knowledge if it is not

being applied. This is in fact a huge problem that affects the quality of the employed human elements through the Lebanese public sector. We recognize that a course on human resources will not eliminate the use of waste in hiring; education is seen to be an important component in the strengthening of Lebanon's public sector. It is also important to note that there are only two courses that address Urban Public Policy; this reflects the weak community development and service delivery in the country, and the ineffective administration of public and private agencies in urban settings. One can mention the case of the electricity issue in Lebanon. Different focus groups members discuss policy issues related to decision-making and even implementation. It has been argued that Electricite du Liban would be more effective if handled by the private sector since the government is not able to manage it, however, no real decision to privatize is actually being advanced.

#### ***4. Courses Related to Lebanon***

It is also important to assess how many courses focus on Lebanon and how many of these courses are taught in Arabic. When it comes to assess the contextualization of all the courses, only twenty-three or 10% of 223 courses focus on Lebanon. Of these twenty-three courses, thirteen are taught in English, which represents almost 56.5% of all Lebanon focused courses and 5.8% of all Public Administration courses. An example of a Public Administration course about Lebanon that advertised in English is *Public Administration in Lebanon* which is advertised by the American University of Beirut (American University of Beirut 2012d). This is followed by eight courses advertised in French, which represents

around 35% of Lebanon focused courses and 3.5% of all advertised courses. An example of a Public Administration course about Lebanon that is advertised in French is *Finance Publique* advertised by La Sagesse University (La Sagesse University, n.d.). Arabic is only used as the language of instruction in two of the courses about Lebanon. This represents less than 1% of all Public Administration courses. One of these courses is advertised by UL and belongs to the Political Science program. The course is entitled *Public Administration in the Renewal of the Lebanese Administration: a New Developing Country* (Lebanese University, n.d.). The second course is advertised at La Sagesse University and is entitled *Lebanese Constitutional Law* (La Sagesse University, n.d.). Unfortunately, neither course has a description.

The previous section provides insights into the nature of Public Administration courses advertised by Lebanese university. At the most general level, we could identify only three programs that offer a degree in Public Administration. The preceding set of data also allowed us to analyze the substantive of Public Administration courses, which indicates that most courses only address the core topics in the field. The next section reflects on the challenges and needs of the Lebanese administration. It also provides insights into the type of Public Administration courses that should be taught in Lebanon.

### **C. Qualitative Findings**

It is now important to reveal the qualitative findings that are generated based on the focus groups discussions. This section will address the administrative gaps prevalent in Lebanon and the areas that universities need to fill to be able to address those gaps.

## ***1. Administrative Gaps***

The focus group participants agreed that neither the Lebanese government nor administrative systems are fulfilling their roles or responding to the needs of the Lebanese. This section will review the different problems encountered by the Lebanese government and administration. These problems fall into three different categories

### **a. Structural Process**

The Lebanese government and administration face many structural issues that are embedded in the administrative or political system of the country. All the focus groups mentioned corruption as a big umbrella under which many issues reside. When asked to be more specific about defining what corruption is, many aspects were discussed. For example corruption is linked to problems caused by lack of law enforcement, since politicians and administrators have no interest in stopping corruption. Years of civil conflict has enabled political actors to infiltrate many aspects of the Lebanese administrative system. This penetration enabled some authorities to take advantage of their positions, which weakened the government and the bureaucratic system. A second obstacle was red tape and rigid processes, which undermine the effective and efficient administration. Corruption, however, is not only caused by the authorities. Citizens are also responsible for the development of the passive culture and mentality that allows the corrupt systems to continue. A second issue relates to the obsolete physical and systemic tools and apparatuses. The focus group participants emphasized the old administrative structure that is still governing the Republic of Lebanon until today. This old structure is characterized by

a dysfunctional legal body that prohibits administrative reform and development. The structure also relates to obsolete settings, buildings and facilities such as the lack of technological equipment that would help in making administrative improvements. The weakness of systems and tools is related to the scarcity and misuse of resources and information. This is all rooted in the economic problems resulting in a big national debt prohibiting reforms to occur.

b. Management and Decision-Making

Another problem mentioned by the focus group members concerns the managerial aspects of the Lebanese administration. Participants discussed two main points: the lack of evaluation and the lack of leadership. First, the lack of monitoring and evaluation is seen as a threat to the Lebanese administrative development. According to a participant citizens “need to monitor and evaluate the work of administrators, there should be a sector in the government responsible to oversee the work of administrators with no interruptions, it has to be apolitical, no biases, it may be hard to accomplish such a thing but administrators need to minimize error and accomplish what they promise, need to be held accountable” (Respondent 1 2015). Second, the absence of leadership was argued to be a demotivation for administrators, as it negatively affects the decision-making process. Having an ambiguous decision making process will eventually result in an unclear process of who should do what. This will create unclear and missing administrative outcomes. The lack of leadership will entail an absence of vision and a lack of sacrifices aiming to do what is right for the citizens.

### 3. Human Resources

Another problem discussed by the focus group participants relates to human capital. Problems relating to the human element can be categorized into two different categories. The first category relates to the corrupt behaviors of public administrators. Many of the focus group participants emphasized that public administrators were corrupt or incompetent. Public officials are seen by the various sectors and even by students as lazy, ineffectual and indifferent to serving the citizens. Lebanon's economic problems limit the country's ability to invest in the human element within the Lebanese administration. The low pay of public officials is often perceived as a motive that justifies their corrupt attitudes such as bribery, "wasta", nepotism and even the false promises they give to citizens if officials do not get offered something in return. It is interesting to note that all focus groups tackled the lack of integrity that public administrators in Lebanon suffer from. The lack of incentives results in the empowerment of a self-interested group of public administrators who lacks seriousness, motivation and ethics. Due to a non-transparent system, all focus groups agreed that a large number of public administrators abuse their positions in order to maximize their personal interests. As mentioned previously, the lack of integrity and ethics may be the result of lack of awareness and lack of administrative education.

The second problem with public officials relates to the incompetence of public officials, which was discussed by all focus groups and specifically highlighted as one of the major obstacles prohibits the Lebanese public administration from making any progress. One focus group member, who has worked for the public sector, stressed that the world is

changing, but the rigid nature of the Lebanese public sector does not allow the accommodation of developments and reforms. This rigidity reinforces a weak human resources system that lacks the tools it needs to improve performance. One of the biggest issues is that officials are not selected on the basis of merit. Lebanon's civil service board was criticized for not considering the potential performance of employees, but rather makes appointments based upon political affiliations and "wasta". Since corruption and the lack of accountability are intertwined and to a great extent present in Lebanon. This can explain the highly ineffective performance of public officials. A financial inspector affirmed during the focus group that "public officials are not scared of inspection anymore" (Respondent 9 2015). Inspection gets marginalized and is not wanted by either the authorities or subordinates. Tenure for life would further strengthen the resistance of officials to learn new information or acquire new skills such as technology skills or even learning new languages that would allow a better performance.

## ***2. Role of Universities in Public Administration Education***

To address the structural, managerial and human resources related problems, universities should promote different aspects of Public Administration education. The focus groups participant also discussed the long term strategies that should be taken to improve the performance of public administrators in Lebanon and hence to improve the quality of the public sector in the country. To understand such performance management tactics, public officials must be enlightened about performance strategies. Consequently, education was noted to be the main solution to many administrative problems in Lebanon.



a. Promote Citizenship and Ethics

Universities should be promote topics such as Citizenship and Ethics which together only constitute 4% of all coded topics. The first argument was to encourage active citizenship participation including highlighting the importance of studying Public Administration. Public Administration education was argued to strengthen the ethical background of future officials as it highlights the dangers of corruption and the benefits of transparency and accountability. Focusing on education was described as a key strategy allowing young students to become effective public officials.

b. Promote Leadership and Decision-Making

Universities should also emphasize on Leadership and Decision-Making in order to solve some managerial problems embedded in the Lebanese administrative system. Having students with leadership skills will enable employees to make better decisions that will affect the administrative outcome. Further, acquiring leadership skills will allow a clearer vision of work which will enable the leaders to do the right things to reach the best for their communities.

c. Promote Non-Profit Management

Universities should also promote Non-Profit Management. Students should learn about the operations and programs, but also about of the structure and challenges of civil

society. People need to understand what is civil society, how it operates, and the characteristics and status of civil society in Lebanon. As one participant mentioned, students and future officials need to understand what it means to be an advocacy organization, and what it means to be a service deliver and a grass-root organization? “You cannot expect this knowledge to be learnt or picked up by doing it. You need to have basic knowledge and education about this sector within your undergraduate program. Otherwise, the graduate will not be interested in moving to that sector because they do not know anything about it” (Respondent 23).

d. Promote Theory

The focus group also emphasized the importance of acquiring theory before entering an administrative job in the public sector. For instance, one member who participated in the private sector focus group and who works in a consulting firm focused on policy and management and mentioned that theory gives future administrators good standards. In fact, a public official should ideally bridge between the theories learnt and use them as standards against the daily encountered administrative experience. Generally speaking to improve Public Administration education in Lebanon, the focus groups members suggested that books should be complemented by historical and current trends. These trends include the Zoamaa [زعماء] culture, which refers to sectarian culture where each sect follows a specific leader. The trends also include the effects of war on the Lebanese public sector, the role of donors when they seek to improve some departments

and the importance of strengthening the judiciary. Finally, the trends include managerial measures such as learning about project management and performance management.

e. Promote Practice

While some participants mentioned the importance of acquiring theory at the undergraduate level, others argue that the reinforcement of practical knowledge was also argued to be significant. Having practitioners delivering courses was seen as a way to enhance practical learning. One respondent affirmed that “you need to bring in practitioners to deliver courses. Who said that only academicians can teach courses? Who said that a professor who never managed a team of people can teach HR?” (Respondent 22 2015). Practical learning also includes field trips, bringing guest speaker to classrooms, analyzing case studies, enrolling in credited internships. Another focus group member mentioned the importance of blended learning. This member works in a private firm and teaches a Public Administration course at AUB. Blended learning mainly consists of online forums allowing e-discussions between the professor and students reinforcing the blend between theory and practice to reach the praxis of administration. It is argued that this makes learning simpler, as learners get to focus on practical and current affairs while using new technology tools. Experts also highlight the importance of involving the teamwork spirit in classrooms, attending conferences and encouraging students to conduct research in different areas in order to motivate them by showing them the relevance of Public Administration education.

f. Promote the Local Context

Universities should also promote the education that focuses on the local context. According to an undergraduate Public Administration student “it really bothers me when they say that AUB has one course about Public Administration in Lebanon. One course is not enough; we need to add more courses about public administration in Lebanon. Especially that the course offered is not obligatory [...] and we need to add more courses about the Lebanese administration” (Respondent 2). Universities should offer more Lebanese specific courses, where the students where students will be given the opportunity to bridge the theories learnt and the local practical world. According to another focus group participant, we need both theories and practice. He affirmed “You need to know the theories well, the most updated theories, theoretical debates for instance change management is a theory and it can be taught and also tested practically. In human resources now there are new theories that should be taught. It is not my field but I know from the practical point of view, and you can mix this theoretical and academic knowledge with practical knowledge. For instance you can always bring HR talent or management for a company to come and interact with students” (Respondent 24). Having courses that address the Lebanese context will help students to bridge between the theories learnt in the classrooms and the practical administrative context.

#### **D. Analysis**

This section analyzes the findings related to the quantitative and qualitative aspects of the study. To analyze the findings, we compared what was advertised in Lebanon during 2012-2013 academic year to the evaluated needs in Lebanon, as highlighted by the

recruited focus groups members. The next section compares the advertised courses to the courses highlighted by the focus groups. The focus groups participants identified twenty-seven topics relevant in Public Administration education in Lebanon. The result of this analysis is presented in Table 8.

Table 8: Coverage of Important Public Administration Topics in Lebanon

|  | <b>Topics</b>                                  | <b>Covered in Lebanon</b> |
|--|--|---------------------------|
| <b>Mentioned by<br/>APA &amp; Focus Groups</b> | Introduction to Public Administration          | Y                         |
|  | Budgeting/Finance                              | Y                         |
|  | Economics                                      | Y                         |
|  | Law and Public Policy                          | Y                         |
|  | Research Methods                               | Y                         |
|  | Ethics   | Y                         |
|  | Citizenship                                    | Y                         |
|  | Leadership and Decision-Making                 | Y                         |
|  | Communication                                  | Y                         |
| <b>Mentioned by<br/>APA Only</b>               | Political Science                              | Y                         |
|  | IT Systems                                     | Y                         |
|  | Health Care Management                         | Y                         |
|  | International Development                      | Y                         |
|  | State/Local State Administration               | Y                         |
|  | Financial Management                           | Y                         |
| <b>Mentioned by<br/>Focus Groups Only</b>      | History / Structure of Lebanese Administration | Y                         |
|  | Modern Lebanese Administration                 | Y                         |
|  | Basic Accounting.                              | Y                         |
|  | Public Procurement and Funding                 | <b>No</b>                 |
|  | Organizational Theory and Management           | Y                         |
|  | Marketing                                      | Y                         |
|  | Project Management                             | Y                         |
|  | Psychology                                     | <b>No</b>                 |
|  | Sociology                                      | Y                         |
|  | Business English                               | Y                         |
|  | Privatization                                  | Y                         |
|  | Disaster Management                            | Y                         |
|  | Comparative Administration                     | Y                         |

The data indicates that there is overlap between the curriculum recommended by the APA Framework and the focus group participants and the topics covered by the courses advertised in Lebanon. To a certain extent, this makes sense. For example, students that study the public policy cycle, regardless of their country, are likely to be introduced to topics such as agenda setting, policy design, and policy evaluation. Likewise, students who are taught Administration will likely address concepts such as bureaucracy and hierarchy. The data also indicate that there are two topics that are considered to be important for the Lebanese context, but do not seem to be directly covered by public administration related courses in Lebanon: public procurement and funding and psychology.

Despite this overlap, there are three factors that may have a negative influence on the state of public administration education in Lebanon which are not revealed in the data presented in Table 8. The first factor relates to how these courses are taught, which is presently unknown. Based on the focus groups discussions, however, we know that the teaching methods used by professors can help students to apply the concepts learned in class to their specific contexts. For instance, incorporating case studies regarding public policy in Lebanon is what helps students understand the difference between foreign policy making actors and Lebanese policy making actors. There are various other ways to practice theory and to further link them to the Lebanese context. Some of these ways are to bring in guest speakers to the classrooms who work in the public sector to share their work experience with students. This way, students would be exposed to the theoretical and practical aspect of the course. In other words, the historical and current Lebanese contexts can only be understood by students if their professors help engage them in what is happening across the country in relation to the topics being taught in class.

The second factor relates to the types of skills actually being taught in class. Again, the focus group participants indicated that Public Administration students should graduate with two sets of skills and competencies: soft skills and hard skills. Soft skills comprise communication skills both oral and writing, teamwork, time-management, problem-solving skills, motivational skills, leadership skills and compassion skills. To be ready to work for the Lebanese administration, professionals should also have hard skills such as technical skills, planning skills, policy making and legal skills. The participants also mentioned the importance of acquiring skills such as accounting and finance, which would help future public employees to secure employment in specialized administrative departments. Research skills such as data collection and analysis were also mentioned to be worth acquiring at the undergraduate level, as well as project management skills, result-based management skills, grant writing and management skills.

The final factor relates to the extent to which the relevant topics are actually being covered by the courses advertised by Lebanese universities. For example, the prevalence of the topics considered important for Lebanon by the focus groups, presented in Table 9 below, indicate that many topics are only covered sparingly<sup>1</sup> Most revealing is that topics such as *Human Resources Management* only represents 2% of all coded topics; *Ethics* only represents 3.2% of all coded topics; and *Project Management* only represents 0.9% of all coded topics. Furthermore, and as mentioned previously, topics such as *Public Procurement and Funding* and *Psychology* do not appear to be offered at all. The fact that

---

<sup>1</sup> To generate this data presented in Table 9, the coding of the 223 relevant courses generated 440 codes across the 27 coding categories of Public Administration topics.

some courses considered important by the focus groups are not covered, or covered in low numbers, indicates that universities do not address all of Lebanon's administrative needs.

Table 9: Frequency and Percentage of Public Administration Topics Considered Important by Focus Group Participants, 2012-13

| <b>Topics</b>                                    | <b>N</b>   | <b>%</b>   |
|--|------------|------------|
| Law  | 66         | 15         |
| Corporate/ Public Finance                        | 49         | 11.1       |
| Public Policy                                    | 45         | 10.2       |
| Introduction to Public Administration            | 40         | 9.1        |
| Public Budgeting                                 | 27         | 6.1        |
| Local Economics                                  | 25         | 5.7        |
| Organizational Theory and Management             | 25         | 5.7        |
| Leadership and Decision Making                   | 21         | 4.8        |
| History and structure of Lebanese Administration | 17         | 3.9        |
| Privatization                                    | 17         | 3.9        |
| Ethics   | 14         | 3.2        |
| Non- Profit Management                           | 13         | 3          |
| Comparative Administration                       | 13         | 3          |
| Modern Lebanese Administration                   | 11         | 2.5        |
| Research Methods                                 | 11         | 2.5        |
| Communication                                    | 10         | 2.3        |
| Human Resources Management                       | 9          | 2          |
| Basic Accounting                                 | 7          | 1.6        |
| Sociology  | 7          | 1.6        |
| Project Management                               | 4          | 0.9        |
| Citizenship                                      | 4          | 0.9        |
| Disaster Management                              | 2          | 0.5        |
| Public Management in Lebanon                     | 1          | 0.2        |
| Marketing  | 1          | 0.2        |
| Business English                                 | 1          | 0.2        |
| Public Procurement and Funding                   | 0          | 0          |
| Psychology                                       | 0          | 0          |
| <b>Total</b>                                     | <b>440</b> | <b>100</b> |



## **E. Recommended curriculum**

According to content analysis and to the focus groups, the Public Administration curriculum in Lebanon should be comprised of twenty-six courses. These courses can be categorized under six categories. The first category is management. The management courses would address courses concerned with decision- making, evaluation and the overall operational aspect of administration at the long and short terms. This category would address the managerial problems pointed at as part of the administrative problems residing in Lebanon. Examples of course that call into the category would be Public Management and Human Resources Management. The second category is history and structure. The courses in this category would address with the historical development of the Lebanese administration, the different hierarchical systems and all that shapes the contemporary administrative structure. This category would help address structural problems mentioned by focus groups such as corruption and having an ineffective bureaucratic administrative system in Lebanon. This category includes four courses such as the History and Structure of Lebanese Administration and Modern Lebanese Administration. The third category is law, and deals with the legal knowledge that students should acquire. Addressing law helps in understanding the foundation of administration as many authors who attempted to define Public Administration stressed. Law was in fact an important component of the operationalized definition of Wright (2010). This category comprises two courses which are Law and Public Policy.

Table 10: Modified APA Framework: Lebanese Context

| <b>Categories</b>            | <b>Courses</b>  |
|------------------------------|---|
| <b>Management</b>            | Human Resources Management<br>Ethics<br>Leadership<br>Organizational Theory<br>Public Management in Lebanon<br>Project Management<br>Disaster Management  |
| <b>History and Structure</b> | History and Structure of Lebanese Administration<br>Modern Lebanese Administration<br>Introduction to Public Administration<br>Comparative Administration |
| <b>Law and Policy</b>        | Law<br>Public Policy  |
| <b>Budgeting and Finance</b> | Corporate/ Public Finance<br>Basic Accounting<br>Local Economics<br>Public Budgeting  |
| <b>Research</b>              | Research Methods<br>Business English  |
| <b>Others</b>                | Procurement and Funding<br>Non-Profit Management<br>Psychology<br>Sociology<br>Citizenship<br>Communication<br>Privatization                              |

The fourth category is budgeting and finance dealing with knowledge concerning the budget cycle and the management of large amounts of money by the government. This category includes courses such as Corporate/ Public Finance and Basic Accounting. The fifth category is about research and copes with how will students will use quantitative and qualitative techniques to gain knowledge. This category includes only two courses entitled

Research Methods and Business English. The final category is called “others.” This category includes a variety of courses that belong to various fields. However, since Public Administration is an interdisciplinary field, the mentioned courses would still be relevant when addressing Public Administration, for example, Sociology and Psychology.

### ***1. Conclusion***

This chapter was divided into two parts. The first presented the findings and the second analyzed the findings. Based on the research, there are 223 Public Administration courses at the undergraduate and graduate levels. English was found to be the main language of instruction and the native language of Lebanon is not extensively used in Public Administration education. The main advertised topics are Law and budgeting while some of the less prevalent topics are Ethics and Citizenship. The next chapter offers the concluding remarks and some recommendations for universities and faculty members.

## CHAPTER V

### CONCLUSIONS

This thesis provides insights into the nature of the Public Administration courses advertised by Lebanese universities, the needs of the Lebanese administration, and the role of education with respect to Lebanon's administrative context. Through a content analysis of the courses advertised by Lebanese institutions of higher education, we generated descriptive statistics related to the state of Public Administration education in Lebanon. We also conducted focus groups that allowed us to understand the administrative needs of Lebanon. These two methods were complementary, and enabled us to answer the three research questions central to this study.

#### **A. Research Questions**

The following sub-section is organized into three parts. It will first answer the research questions. It will second provide recommendations on how to improve Public Administration education in Lebanon. Finally, it presents three areas of future research.

*RQ1: To what extent are Public Administration courses prevalent in universities in Lebanon?*

This study reveals that Public Administration education in Lebanon stands on firm grounds. However, the data indicates that more can be done to strengthen the public administration education that is received by students in Lebanon. With respect to prevalence, three of Lebanon's forty-three universities advertised Public Administration programs during the 2012-13 academic year. These three universities advertise a total of

ninety-four Public Administration related courses, fifty-six at the undergraduate level and thirty-eight at the graduate level. These universities are the American University of Beirut (AUB), Notre Dame University (NDU) and Universite Saint- Esprit de Kaslik (USEK). The remaining 129 courses were advertised by remaining forty universities. Apart from programs, there are sixteen universities that advertise sufficient numbers of courses to be considered to offer concentrations in Public Administration. The focus group participants highlighted the fact that long term administrative change in Lebanon depends, in part, on the education of future public officials. As such, the fact that there are only three universities that offer Public Administration programs might not be sufficient to enable the Lebanese administration to recruit qualified officials.

This point is supported by the fact that 72% of the topics coded from Lebanese courses in Public Administration are core topics within the field, as indicated previously in Table 7. Further, many of the courses analyzed in this study simply dealt with topics such Budgeting and Finance, and Political and Legal Processes. Less than one-third of the courses address more specialized topics, for example, Non- Profit Management, Urban Affairs and International Development. The fact that two thirds of Lebanon's Public Administration courses cover core topics has both positive and negative implications. The positive aspect lies in the fact that the overall distribution of courses seems to match international expectations with respect to Public Administration education. The negative aspect is that the limited number of specialized courses leaves students without the opportunity to take courses in the areas of specialization most needed in Lebanon, for example, ethics and public management.

*RQ2: To what extent does Public Administration education in Lebanon reflect Lebanon's administrative needs?*

Lebanon's administrative needs are only partially addressed by the courses advertised by Lebanese universities. Again, looking at the combined data presented in Table 7, there are three points are worth mentioning. First, the Public Administration courses advertised in Lebanon do not place equal emphasis on the nineteen topics included in the APA Framework. The most prevalent topic is Political and Legal Processes, which constitutes 29.6% of all coded Public Administration topics. This is followed by Budgeting and Finance, which is 14.2% of Public Administration topics. The seventeen remaining topics represent a combined 56.2% of all coded topics. Some of these topics are barely covered, if at all, for example, topics such as ethics and quantitative methods. This may explain why some of Lebanon's administrative problems persist, for instance nepotism and bribery. Furthermore, Human Resource Management also received scant attention, representing only 2% of all coded Public Administration topics, despite the fact that there are human resource related obstacles within the Lebanese administration.

A second point is related to the language of instruction. This study revealed that English is the primary language of instruction for Public Administration courses advertised in Lebanon. More specifically, English is used in almost 57% of the Public Administration courses. This is followed by French, at 29.15% of the total number of courses, and finally, Arabic, which is used in less than 14% of all advertised Public Administration courses. While most Lebanese students are multilingual, this may create problems since the range of courses in a specific language may be limited. While it is true that some Public Administration courses are advertised in Arabic, the data suggests that Public

Administration programs advertised in the Lebanon's official language are almost nonexistent. This may pose serious problems for Lebanon's public sector, especially considering that Public Administration is highly contextual and depends on the history and structure of each country. Likewise, gaps may exist between the public administrators and the members of the public, who may only speak Arabic and not understand administrative terms. As such, not offering programs in the official language of the country may create cultural and contextual gaps and undermine attempts to bridge theory and practice.

The third point relates to the contextual focus of the courses that are advertised. While we did not examine the syllabi of the courses included in this study, the course titles and descriptions suggest that only 10% (23 of 223) of the advertised courses address topics that are specifically related to Lebanon, the Lebanese administration or Lebanese society. What is more problematic is that only two of the courses about Lebanon are advertised in Arabic, further reinforcing the point made in the previous paragraph. Once again, this means that Lebanese students that want to take courses on Lebanese Public Administration in Arabic have almost no opportunity to do so.

*RQ3: What might be the primary curricular components of a Public Administration program that takes the administrative needs of Lebanon into consideration?*

The data indicates that the Public Administration curriculum advertised by Lebanese universities should blend international and domestic topics. These topics are in majority covered by our APA framework meaning that there is an overlap between what is globally considered as part of Public Administration curriculum and what is perceived worth addressing by experts and Public Administration students. The general components

of this curriculum are presented in Table 9 below. Again, for the purpose of this thesis, no distinction was made between undergraduate and graduate levels.

Table 10: Modified APA Framework: Lebanese Context

| <b>Categories</b>            | <b>Courses</b>  |
|------------------------------|---|
| <b>Management</b>            | Human Resources Management<br>Ethics<br>Leadership<br>Organizational Theory<br>Public Management in Lebanon<br>Project Management<br>Disaster Management  |
| <b>History and Structure</b> | History and Structure of Lebanese Administration<br>Modern Lebanese Administration<br>Introduction to Public Administration<br>Comparative Administration |
| <b>Law</b>                   | Law<br>Public Policy  |
| <b>Budgeting and Finance</b> | Corporate/ Public Finance<br>Basic Accounting<br>Local Economics<br>Public Budgeting  |
| <b>Research</b>              | Research Methods<br>Business English  |
| <b>Others</b>                | Procurement and Funding<br>Non-Profit Management<br>Psychology<br>Sociology<br>Citizenship<br>Communication<br>Privatization                              |



The quantitative and qualitative findings indicated that the curriculum should offer twenty-six courses, which can be grouped into six categories. The first category is management. The courses in the category would address the operational aspects of administration at every level, including the long and short term. Examples of courses that call into the category would be Public Management and Human Resources Management. The second category is history and structure. The courses in this category would address the historical development of the Lebanese administration, the different hierarchical systems, and the contextual factors that shape the Lebanese administrative structure. This category includes four courses such as the History and Structure of Lebanese Administration and Modern Lebanese Administration.

The third category is law and deals with the legal knowledge that students should acquire. This category comprises two courses: Law and Public Policy. The fourth category is budgeting and finance dealing with knowledge concerning the budget cycle and the management of large amounts of money by the government. This category includes courses such as Corporate / Public Finance and Basic Accounting. The fifth category is about research and copes with how will students will use quantitative and qualitative techniques to gain knowledge. This category includes only two courses entitled Research Methods and Business English. The final category is called “others.” This includes general categories of courses that relate to public administration, but belong to different fields, for example, Sociology and Psychology.

## **B. Recommendations**

Three things can be done to strengthen the Public Administration curriculum advertised in Lebanon. First, Lebanese universities need to strengthen their curriculum. To do so, universities need to teach more specialized courses, for example, State and Local Government Administration and Financial Management. Teaching more courses about Lebanon such as Ethics will also help in addressing Lebanese administrative challenges and help solve them through the education of future officials. Universities are also advised to teach more Public Administration courses in the Arabic language which may help to bridge the gap between students and the administrative system in an Arab country such as Lebanon.

Similarly, universities should develop their curriculum in order to focus on the practical aspects of learning. To bridge between theory and practice, students should do internships as part of their training, and faculty members should include more contemporary case studies in the classrooms. Professors are also advised to bring in guest speakers who would share their administrative experiences directly with the students. Likewise, faculty members should always offer Lebanese case studies to highlight the relevance of theory to the context in which future public officials will engage in. Finally, professors are recommended to use blended learning as a new way to make students constantly discussing matters of their interest while using new forms of technology.

The second recommendation extends beyond the class room. Universities could take steps to secure the resources needed to strengthen their public administration activities. For example, additional resources could be used to recruit specialized faculty members that could expand the size and scope of Public Administration programs. As the focus groups indicated, enthusiastic and motivated faculty members are needed to restructure Public

Administration programs so that they better address Lebanon's administrative needs. Universities are also advised to use funding to create academic scholarships, which would attract students to enroll in public administration programs. Finally, resources could be used to organize workshops, conferences and community engagement activities that would help universities to advance and reinforce the study of Public Administration.

Third, universities could take steps to market Public Administration education as noble and honorable field of study. Universities can advertise the major as being an opportunity for citizens to make a difference in their society since the study, of Public Administration knowledge is practical and can help be have a better community. Marketing the major can take place through awareness campaigns for instance that shed light on the issues that the Lebanese Public Administration is facing and the necessity to evaluate students who have the skills and commitment needed to address these issues.

### **C. Future Research**

There are many ways that future research can continue in filling gaps in Public Administration knowledge in nonwestern countries. Despite what we have learned, this study is far from complete. Indeed, the material covered in these pages only scratch the surface. To this end, there are several paths available to those interested in further research.

The first line of research would evaluate how Lebanese citizens and students perceive the field of Public Administration. As argued throughout this thesis, Public Administration is a field with an interdisciplinary focus. It would be interesting to explore how the Lebanese view Public Administration and what they would expect from Public

Administration related courses. Such research could take place through a series of random surveys, which would be sent to Lebanese universities and to citizens. The findings generated by this line of research would provide us with additional information that could be used to develop a Public Administration curriculum.

A second line of research would explore the content of Public Administration courses and the enrollment rates in relevant advertised courses to determine the extent to which university students are actually interested in Public Administration courses. If the enrollment rates are expanding, and if more Public Administration related courses and programs are being offered, it might indicate that Lebanese universities and students are interested in Public Administration education. Alternatively, to focus on the courses descriptions and syllabi of relevant courses would allow us to evaluate the substantive content of courses to determine whether the topics taught actually reflect Lebanon's administrative needs. Such research would also help us to distinguish between the content that should be offered in undergraduate and graduate Public Administration courses.

The third line of research would expand upon the information collected during our focus group discussions. For example, researchers could conduct follow up interviews with a larger numbers of professionals. There are many areas worthy of examination. For example, one question would be whether the lack of Arabic as a language of instruction in the Public Administration courses advertised by Lebanese universities deepens the gaps between administrative theory and practice. This line of inquiry would also enable us to explore whether, in comparison to western institutions, Lebanese universities encounter unique challenges related to the design and implementation of Public Administration courses and the recruitment of qualified students and scholars.

## **D. Conclusion**

The Arab region faces a variety of administrative challenges. Many Arab states are constrained by under-qualified employees, rigid bureaucracies, low rates of productivity, and low levels of administrative innovation (Jreisat 2006). In Lebanon, OMSAR stressed that there is a need to restructure public institutions. Especially important is Lebanon's need to establish a highly competent system of public administration that employs highly qualified employees (OMSAR 2011). Although the education of public servants is a prerequisite to an effective public administration, Lebanon's Central Administration Statistics reports that public administration education is not a priority (Badre and Yaacoub 2012; OMSAR 2011). There are many competencies, skills and abilities that public servants should acquire in order to fill Lebanon's administrative needs. (Perry 2005).

This thesis explored the state of Public Administration education in Lebanon, and considered to what extent the universities fill Lebanon's administrative needs. The collected data indicate that Public Administration education has a strong foundation in Lebanon, but there remains room for improvement, especially when it comes to the nature of the courses that are advertised by Lebanese universities. At the simplest level, the universities could offer courses that tackle legal and managerial issues. While there remains much work left to be done, the findings generated by this exploratory study provide insights into the state of Public Administration education in Lebanon, a country that lacks data about the discipline of Public Administration. More importantly, this thesis challenges us to think critically about how to design a Public Administration curriculum in a nonwestern country, taking the context and administrative needs into consideration.

## APPENDIX I

### NAMES AND ACRONYMES OF CERTIFIED UNIVERSITIES, COLLEGES AND INSTITUTIONS IN LEBANON, 2012-13

| <b>Universities</b>                                |                |   |                |
|--|----------------|---|----------------|
| <b>Name</b>  | <b>Acronym</b> | <b>Name</b>   | <b>Acronym</b> |
| Al Kafaat University                               | AKU            | Lebanese American University                                  | LAU            |
| American University of Beirut                      | AUB            | Lebanese Canadian University                                  | LCU            |
| American University of Culture and Education       | AUCE           | Lebanese French University of Technology and Applied Sciences | LFU            |
| American University of Science and Technology      | AUST           | Lebanese German University                                    | LGU            |
| American University of Technology                  | AUT            | Lebanese International University                             | LIU            |
| Antonin University                                 | UPA            | Lebanese University   | LU             |
| Arab Open University                               | AOU            | Makassed University of Lebanon                                | MU             |
| Arts Sciences and Technology University of Lebanon | AUL            | Manar University of Tripoli                                   | MT             |
| Beirut Arab University                             | BAU            | Middle East University  | MEU            |
| Beirut Islamic University                          | BIU            | Modern University of Business and Science                     | MUBS           |
| Global University                                  | GU             | Notre Dame University   | NDU            |
| Haigazian University                               | HU             | Saint Joseph University                                       | USJ            |
| Hariri Canadian University                         | HCU            | Sainte Famille University                                     | SFU            |
| Islamic University of Lebanon                      | IUL            | Universite Saint-Esprit de Kaslik                             | USEK           |
| Jinane University                                  | JU             | University of Balamand  | UB             |
| La Sagesse University                              | ULS            | University of Tripoli   | UOT            |
| Lebanese Academy of Fine Arts                      | ALBA           |   |                |

| <b>Institute / College</b>                    |                |   |                |
|---|----------------|---|----------------|
| <b>Name</b>                                   | <b>Acronym</b> | <b>Name</b>                                     | <b>Acronym</b> |
| Dawaa University Institute of Islamic Studies | DUIS           | Saidan University Institute                     | SUI            |
| Ecole Superieur des Affairs                   | ESA            | St. Boulos Institute of Theology and Philosophy | SBITP          |
| Imam Ouzai College                            | IOC            | Tripoli University Institute of Islamic Studies | TUIIS          |
| Joyaa University Institute of Technology      | JUIT           | University Institute of Technology              | UIT            |
| Near East College of Theology                 | NECT           | University Institutes for Religious Studies     | UIRS           |

## APPENDIX II

### FOCUS GROUP QUESTIONNAIRE

#### **Context**

1. Could you tell us about yourself: for example, your educational background, your profession, how long you have lived and worked in Lebanon, why you decided to join us today?
2. What does the word “public” mean to you?
  - a. How do you distinguish between what is public and what is not public?
3. What does the phrase “public interest” mean to you?
  - a. What do you believe qualifies as being in the public interests?
  - b. What are the responsibilities of the government with respect to the public interest?
  - c. What are the responsibilities of the bureaucracy with respect to the public interest?
4. When you think of the Lebanese public sector, specifically its bureaucratic and administrative system, what are the first three things that come to mind?
5. What do you believe are the three most significant bureaucratic and administrative problems that are encountered by those who live in Lebanon today?
6. Why do you believe these bureaucratic and administrative problems exist?
  - a. Can you identify the political reasons?
  - b. Can you identify the bureaucratic and administrative reasons?
  - c. Can you identify other reasons?
7. What do you believe should be done to moderate or eliminate these problems?
8. Assume you are in a position to hire a new recruit for a job located in Lebanon, other than substantive knowledge, what are the qualities that will be possessed by the successful candidate?



## **Substantive**

9. Assume you were given the opportunity to design a undergraduate program in Public Administration or Public Affairs in Lebanon:
  - a. What specific subjects should students know about upon graduation?
  - b. What specific skills should students possess upon graduation?
  - c. What specific competencies (set of behaviors) should students possess upon graduation?
  - d. What teaching methods do you believe are the most appropriate for students?
10. Would your answers to these questions change if you were asked to design a graduate program in Public Administration or public Affairs in Lebanon:
  - a. What specific subjects should students know about upon graduation?
  - b. What specific skills should students possess upon graduation?
  - c. What specific competencies (set of behaviors) should students possess upon graduation?
  - d. What teaching methods do you believe are the most appropriate for students?
11. How might the culture of the Middle East strengthen the program's mission and activities?
12. How might the culture of Lebanon strengthen the program's mission and activities?
13. How might the academic programs support Lebanon's non-academic community?

## **Conclusion**

14. Are there any other points that we have forgotten to ask you about that you believe are important for us to know about?

Thank you.

## APPENDIX III

### CONSENT FORMS FOR FOCUS GROUP

**Public Administration Education in Lebanon**  
**An Exploratory Study**  
**Principal Investigator: Dr. Thomas W. Haase**  
**Student Investigator: Noura G. El Badri**

We are asking you to participate in a research study. You have been chosen to participate in this research because you are an expert in the administrative field in Lebanon.

The research is under the supervision of the Primary Investigator Dr. Thomas Haase, who can be reached at [th30@aub.edu.lb](mailto:th30@aub.edu.lb) and 01-350000 ext. 4344; his office is located at the AUB campus, Jessup-204D. For further inquiries you can contact the Institutional Review Board of the University at [irb@aub.edu.lb](mailto:irb@aub.edu.lb) and 01-350000 ext. 5445.

Please read the information below and feel free to ask any questions that you may have. This research attempts to design a Public Administration program in Lebanon. You are invited to give information that will be a valuable contribution to this research.

Please read the information below and feel free to ask any questions that you may have.

#### **A. BASIC INFORMATION**

This aim of the research is to conduct an exploratory study about Public Administration education in Lebanon. After gathering the relevant literature, the research will employ quantitative and qualitative methods of enquiry. The quantitative content analysis will focus on gathering information about Public Administration programs in Lebanon mainly referring to courses catalogues and courses descriptions. The qualitative aspect of the study aims to conduct focus groups comprising professionals from the public, private and third sectors. The goal behind these focus groups is to gather information about the administrative competencies needed throughout the country of Lebanon. Personal interviews may be employed if a member of the focus group was not able to attend the event. Both the focus groups and interviews will be completely confidential and will only take place upon the consent of the interviewees.

#### **B. BENEFITS AND RISKS**

The benefits, which may reasonably be expected to result from this study, are to determine the competencies needed in the administrative sphere in Lebanon and to attempt to address them in an educational curriculum within the Public Administration program.

Your participation in this study does not involve any physical risk or emotional risk to you beyond the risks of daily life. Your decision to withdraw will not involve any penalty. Discontinuing participation in no way affects your relationship with AUB. You have the right to withdraw your consent or discontinue participation at any time for any reason.

### **C. CONFIDENTIALITY**

To secure the confidentiality of your responses, your name and other identifying information will not be attached to your answers. All codes and data will be kept in a password-protected computer that is kept secure. Data access is limited to the Principal Investigator and the researchers working directly on this project. All collection instruments will be destroyed responsibly after the search is done. Your personal privacy will be maintained in all published and written data that result from this study. Your name or other identifying information will not be used in our reports or published papers.

### **D. CONTACT INFORMATION**

1. If you have any questions or concerns about the research you may contact me at 70-659645, or nge08@aub.edu.lb
2. If you have any questions, concerns or complaints about your rights as a participant in this research, you can contact the following office at AUB: Social & Behavioral Sciences Institutional Review Board 01-374374 ext: 5445 or irb@aub.edu.lb.

### **E. PARTICIPANT RIGHTS**

Participation in this study is voluntary. You are free to leave the study at any time without penalty. Your decision not to participate is no way influences your relationship with AUB. If desired, the researchers agree to provide you with a copy of the final research report.

## APPENDIX IV

### REQUEST FOR PARTICIPATION

**American University of Beirut**  
**Political Studies and Public Administration Department**  
**Principal Investigator: Dr. Thomas William Haase**  
**Student Investigator: Noura Galal El Badri**

Dear \_\_\_\_\_,

Hello. My name is Noura El Badri. I am a graduate student in the Department of Political Studies and Public Administration at American University of Beirut.

I would like to invite you to participate in a research study about Public Administration education in Lebanon. The research is under the supervision of the Primary Investigator Dr. Thomas Haase, who can be reached at [th30@aub.edu.lb](mailto:th30@aub.edu.lb) and 01-350000 ext. 4344; his office is located at the AUB campus, Jessup-204D. For further inquiries you can contact the Institutional Review Board of the University at [irb@aub.edu.lb](mailto:irb@aub.edu.lb) and 01-350000 ext. 5445.

You have been chosen to participate in this research because you are an expert in the administrative sphere in Lebanon.

This study attempts to design a Public Administration program in Lebanon by relying on the competencies needed to meet the administrative needs of Lebanon.

You have been invited to participate in a focus group. If you interested in contributing to the study please inform us within 10 days.

Thank you,

Noura

Telephone Number: 70-659645

E-mail Address: [nge08@aub.edu.lb](mailto:nge08@aub.edu.lb)

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Al Kafaat University. 2013. "Management of Human Resources." In *University Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012a. "Government and Non- Profit Accounting." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012b. "Introduction to Transport Economics and Policy." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012c. "Human Resources and Personnel Administration." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012d. "Public Administration in Lebanon. " In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012e. "Leadership and Management of Public Organization." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012f. "Human Resources Management and Development." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012g. "Foundations of Public Policy." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012h. "Public and Non-Profit Program Evaluation." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012i. "Ethics of Public Administration." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- American University of Beirut. 2012j. "Foundations of Organization Theory." "Public Administration in Lebanon." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Badre, Lara, and Najwa Yaacoub. 2012. *Education in Lebanon*. Lebanon: Central Administration of Statistics.  
[http://www.cas.gov.lb/images/PDFs/SIF/CAS\\_Education\\_In\\_Lebanon\\_SIF3.pdf](http://www.cas.gov.lb/images/PDFs/SIF/CAS_Education_In_Lebanon_SIF3.pdf).
- Barth, Thomas. 2002. "Reflections on Building an MPA Program: Faculty Discussions Worth Having." *Journal of Public Affairs Education* 8 (4): 253- 161
- Beckett, Paul, and Fredrick Bent. 1953. "Letters from Beirut." *Public Administration Review* 13 (1): 1–11.
- Braun, Virginia, and Victoria Clarke. 2006. "Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology." *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 3 (2): 77–101.
- Bremer, Jennifer, and Laila El Baradei. 2008. "Public Administration and Public Policy Master's Programs in Egypt." *Journal of Public Affairs Education* 14 (3): 439–62.

- Gulick, Luther. 1991. "Notes on the Theory of Organization." In *Classics of Organization Theory*, 3rd ed., 87–95. California: Wadsworth.
- Haigazian University. 2012. "Public Administration." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Henry, Nicholas. 1975. "Paradigms of Public Administration." *Public Administration Review* 35 (4): 378.
- Henry, Nicholas. 1992. *Public Administration and Public Affairs*. Fifth. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Heyer, Garth den. 2011. "New Public Management: A Strategy for Democratic Police Reform in Transitioning and Developing Countries." *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management* 34 (3): 419–33.
- Jreisat, Jamil. 2006. "The Arab World: Reform or Stalemate." *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 41 (5-6): 411–37.
- Jreisat, Jamil. 2008. "Administration, Globalization, and the Arab States." *Public Organization Review* 9 (1): 37–50.
- Jreisat, Jamil. 2011a. "Commentary-Comparative Public Administration: a Global Perspective" 71 (6): 834–38.
- Jreisat, Jamil. 2011b. "Rethinking Administrative Capacity Development: The Arab States." *Public Organization Review* 12 (2): 139–55.
- Knott, Jack. 2012. "Looking Outward: The Changing Context of Public Service Education." *Annual Conference, Austin, Texas*.
- La Sagesse University. n.d. "Finance Publique." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- La Sagesse University. n.d. "Lebanese Constitutional Law." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Lebanese American University. 2012. "Government and Politics in Lebanon." In *Undergraduate Catalogue* Beirut. Lebanon.
- Lebanese American University. 2012. "International Organizations." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Lebanese Canadian University. n.d. "Analysis of Public Policies." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Lebanese University. n.d. "Public Administration in the Renewal of the Lebanese Administration: a New Developing Country." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Leech, Nancy L., and Anthony J. Onwuegbuzie. 2007. "An Array of Qualitative Data Analysis Tools: A Call for Data Analysis Triangulation." *School Psychology Quarterly* 22 (4): 557–84.

- Modern University of Business and Science. 2012. "Introduction to Social Works." Beirut. Lebanon.
- Morgan, David L. 1996. "Focus Groups." *Annual Review of Sociology*, 129–52.
- NASPAA. 2012. "The Global Standard in Public Service Education."
- Notre Dame University. 2012a. "Bureaucracy and Public Management." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Notre Dame University. 2012b. "Civil Society, NGOs, Networking and Advocacy." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- Notre Dame University. 2012c. "Civil Society in the MENA-Region." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut. Lebanon.
- OMSAR. 2011. *Strategy for the Reform and Development of Public Administration in Lebanon*. "OMSAR Strategy - 2011.pdf." n.d.
- Perry, Susan White. 2005. "Social Equity for the Long Haul: Preparing Culturally Competent Public Administrators." Virginia: Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University. <http://scholar.lib.vt.edu/theses/available/etd-11282005-141500/>.
- Respondent number 1. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 2. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 4. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 8. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 9. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 22. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 23. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 24. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Respondent number 27. 2015. Focus Group: Public Administration Education: An Exploratory Study
- Rice, Mitchell. 2007. "Promoting Cultural Competency in Public Administration and Public Service Delivery: Utilizing Self-Assessment Tools and Performance Measures." *Journal of Public Affairs Education* 13 (1): 41–57.
- Riggs, Fred. 1967. *Administration in Developing Countries: The Theory of Prismatic*

*Society*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.

- Saint Joseph University. 2012. "Public Policies and Social Work." In *Graduate Catalogue*. Beirut, Lebanon.
- Saldana, Johnny. 2013. *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*. 2nd ed. Sage.
- Shafritz, Jay, George Russell, and Christopher Borick. 2013. *Introducing Public Administration*. eighth. Pearson.
- Tan, Rong, and Lifang Hao. 2013. "An Analysis on Development of Public Administration Study in Western Countries." *Canadian Social Science* 9 (2): 21–27.
- Taylor, Frederick. 1971. "Scientific Management." In , 124–46. *Organization Theory*: Pugh.
- Taylor, Frederick. 1991. "The Principles of Scientific Management." In *Classics of Organization Theory*, 3rd ed., 69–80. Shafritz and Ott.
- Universite Saint-Esprit de Kaslik. 2012. "History of Lebanese Institutions." In *Undergraduate Catalogue*. Beirut, Lebanon.
- Ventris, Curtis. 1991. "Contemporary Issues in American Public Administration Education: The Search for an Educational Focus." *American Society for Public Administration* 51 (1). <http://www.jstor.org/stable/976631?origin=JSTOR-pdf>.
- VERBI. 2013. "MAXQDA The Art of Data Analysis Introduction." [http://www.maxqda.com/download/manuals/MAX11\\_intro\\_eng.pdf](http://www.maxqda.com/download/manuals/MAX11_intro_eng.pdf).
- Vigoda, Eran. 2003. "Rethinking the Identity of Public Administration: Interdisciplinary Reflections and Thoughts on Managerial Reconstruction." *Public Administration & Management: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 8: 1–22.
- Waldo, Dwight. 1968. *The Study of Public Administration*. New York: Random House Inc.
- Walsh, Roberta. 2006. "Exploring the Case Study Method as a Tool for Teaching Public Administration In a Cross-National Context: Pedagogy in Theory and Practice." *Public Administration Education*. [http://www.pa-education.eu/public/upload/papers/36/Roberta\\_Walsh.pdf](http://www.pa-education.eu/public/upload/papers/36/Roberta_Walsh.pdf).
- Weber, Max. 1947. *The Theory of Social and Economic Organizations*. Henderson and Pearson.
- Weber, Max. 1991. "Bureaucracy." In *Classics of Organization Theory*, 3rd ed., 81–86. Shafritz and Ott.
- Wilson, Woodrow. 1887. "The Study of Administration." *Political Science Quarterly* 2 (2): 197–222.
- Wright, Bradley. 2010. "Public Administration as an Interdisciplinary Field: Assessing Its Relationship with the Fields of Law, Management, and Political Science." *Public Administration Review*, 96–101.



