AMERICAN UNIVERSITY OF BEIRUT

THE DEVELOPMENT OF PEDAGOGICAL CONTENT KNOWLEDGE OF TEACHING-ARTISTS IN HIGHER EDUCATION: THE CASE OF THE THEATRE DEPARTMENT AT THE LEBANESE UNIVERSITY

by
KARIM SAMIR CHEBLI

A thesis
submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Master of Arts
to the Department of Education
of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences
at the American University of Beirut

Beirut, Lebanon
June, 2020

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY OF BEIRUT

THE DEVELOPMENT OF PEDAGOGICAL CONTENT
KNOWLEDGE OF TEACHING-ARTISTS IN HIGHER
EDUCATION: THE CASE OF THE THEATRE DEPARTMENT AT
THE LEBANESE UNIVERSITY

by
KARIM SAMIR CHEBLI

Approved by:

_____

Dr. Rima Karami Akkary, Associate Professor   Advisor
Department of Education

_____

Dr. Saouma BouJaoude, Professor   Member of Committee
Department of Education

_____

Dr. Walid Sadek, Associate Professor, Acting Chairperson   Member of Committee
Department of Fine Arts and Art History

Date of thesis defense: June 3,2020

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY OF BEIRUT

THESIS, DISSERTATION, PROJECT RELEASE FORM

Student Name: ___Chebli_____Karim_____Samir___
                     Last   First   Middle

⊘ Master's Thesis   ◯ Master's Project   ◯ Doctoral Dissertation

⊘   I authorize the American University of Beirut to: (a) reproduce hard or electronic copies of my thesis, dissertation, or project; (b) include such copies in the archives and digital repositories of the University; and (c) make freely available such copies to third parties for research or educational purposes.

◯   I authorize the American University of Beirut, to: (a) reproduce hard or electronic copies of it; (b) include such copies in the archives and digital repositories of the University; and (c) make freely available such copies to third parties for research or educational purposes after:

One ---- **year from the date of submission of my thesis, dissertation, or project.**
Two ---- **years from the date of submission of my thesis, dissertation, or project.**
Three ---- **years from the date of submission of my thesis, dissertation, or project.**

Signature _____   Date June 18, 2020

This form is signed when submitting the thesis, dissertation, or project to the University Libraries

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

needed a ride, for hosting me abroad when I needed a vacation, for hearing me out when I needed to talk, for every memory, for your helping hands, for being you, for existing. Thank you.

AN ABSTRACT OF THE THESIS OF

Karim Samir Chebli   for   Master of Arts
                                                    Major: Educational Administration and Policy
                                                    Studies

Title: The Development of Pedagogical content knowledge of Teaching-Artists in Higher Education: The Case of the Theatre Department at the Lebanese University

A teaching-artist's role is complex as it encompasses the development of a hybrid professional identity (Hall, 2010). Globally, theater teaching-artists in higher education are being offered few specialized professional development opportunities (Schuttler, 2010) however local artists at the Lebanese University require institutional support that is not available. This study aims at contributing to the literature on the development of pedagogical content knowledge of theater teaching-artists through exploring from their own perspectives their continuous professional learning journeys and identities following a qualitative case study design. This study reports findings about a group of ten diverse theatre teaching-artists at the theatre department at the second branch of the faculty of fine arts at the Lebanese University, and transforms their views into a descriptive, and explanatory understanding of the nature and characteristics of their professional journeys. Our findings report on the latter's initiation and constituents, while highlighting the challenges teaching-artists encounter and the factors that contribute to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge. In the end, the study marks the major institutional impediments to professional learning bombarding teaching-artists as they pave their self-initiated professional learning journeys within the chosen context and later re-envisions the profiles of successful teaching artists. Drawn from the study results framing the teaching of theatre as an intuitive drive to serve students we recommend supporting such professionals through implementing institutional support for their continuous professional learning. This entails establishing and developing this hybrid field of study, and revisiting the pedagogic recruitment criteria for teaching-artists.

CONTENTS

Chapter

xiii

ILLUSTRATIONS

TABLES

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Background

Progressively, institutions of higher education have been assigning teaching

responsibilities to professionals drawn from outside the world of academia (Honeyfield & Fraser,

2012). Often, such educators have a wealth of invaluable subject expertise but a dearth in

pedagogical knowledge (Honeyfield and Fraser, 2012). Such is the case in the faculties of fine

arts in higher education, where the roles of educators are being assigned to artists lacking

teaching qualifications (Hall, 2010). Fortunately, educators often develop their teaching skills by

learning from their experiences (Grossman, 1990) and many agree that good teaching of art

might be attainable through a commitment to ongoing professional development (Anderson,

2004; Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Accordingly, this study explores the case of theatre teaching-

artists as they attempt to shape their own professional learning journeys.

Statement of the Problem

The term "teaching-artists" is a hybrid terminology indicative of the complexity and

shifting characteristics of the dual career-professional artists working as educators (Kim, 2015).

These, teaching-artists, alongside mastering their artistic disciplines, develop pedagogical

approaches for effectively supporting their students as they learn how to perform, produce, and

respond to art (Simpson Steele, 2018). In the context of this study, the term refers to the artists

lecturing at the level of tertiary education. Such a role is complex as it encompasses the

development of an educator's hybrid professional identity, as both a teacher and an artist (Hall,

2010) resulting from the interaction of teachers, learners, pedagogy, and the subject matter

(Zepke, 2013). Although educational professionals across a range of workplace contexts are progressively being expected to advance their pedagogical practices through enrolling in professional development programs (Daniels, 2017), specialized programs on the teaching of arts remain in a formative state as the particular needs of teaching-artists remain unidentified (Charland, 2006). Such is the case for theater educators being offered few specialized professional development opportunities in spite of the growing universal need for such incentives and postgraduate programs for teaching-artists (Schuttler, 2010).

  Locally, the current state of the Lebanese University illustrates a similar need, as some under qualified individuals are being assigned the roles of educators. This situation has been complicated since the unfortunate partitioning of the Lebanese University, permitting the branching of faculties away from the main campus (Bashshur, 1997). The decision for the partitioning of the University led different religious sects to claim their shares of the university's growing number of branches resulting in what was described by Bashshur (1996) as inner institutional enclaves, which led to an avoidable speedy increase in the number of employees with minimal attention being given to the qualifications and readiness of faculty members. For instance, the central administration of the Lebanese University has formed a political and sectarian committee to study the tenure of educators, doing so it excluded sovereign applicants that met the tenure criteria and has favored ineligible ones based on their political or sectarian affiliations (Hajjar, 2018). The findings of an unpublished exploratory field inquiry with the director of the Theater Department, illustrate the matter; as they conveyed the lack of formal recruitment procedures, the influence of political nepotism on the selection process of instructors, and the lack of institutional professional development incentives (Achcar, personal communication, October 4, 2017). However, the Theater Departments' teaching-artists were

reported to engage in different forms of self-initiated professional development (Achcar, personal communication, October 4, 2017). Within the current recruitment procedures and the un-bounding professional development incentives at the level of the sole public higher education institution in Lebanon, teaching-artists might be vulnerable to possessing outdated knowledge in both pedagogy and their own disciplines. For instance, the educators at each of the two branches of the Lebanese University's Faculty of Fine Arts, assigned the role of educating the young aspiring actors in Lebanon, are found to be failing to graduate alumni capable of initiating schools of thought and theatrical troops that might lead to the development of the country's theatrical culture (Bakhos,2012). More to the point, this crisis facing the theatrical scenery was said to be influenced by the absence of academic and methodological work emerging from what was identified as academic, professional, and cultural imbalances (Bakhos, 2012). Accordingly, this paper addresses the professional development of higher education instructors in the field of the performance arts, often found to be undermanaged in terms of its human resources practices (Leadbeater, 2005). This study explores how theatre teaching-artists develop their pedagogical content knowledge along their professional learning journeys at the Lebanese University.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of the study is to explore the professional identities of theatre teaching-artists at the second branch of the Lebanese University and to inquire about the continuous professional learning experiences and initiatives enabling the development of their pedagogical content knowledge. It also aims to understand the conditions that support the professional learning of those theatre teaching-artists.

Rationale of the Study

Since the early 90s several organizations have emerged with the purpose of advancing arts education and erecting novice directions in theatre education policy (Weltsek, Duffy, & Carney, 2014). Out of these organizations, the Association for Theatre in Higher Education (ATHE) has been founded to explore the disciplinary models framing the studies on performance arts in higher education (Abrams et al., 2012). In reflection to the 25th jubilee conference of the ATHE, Abrams et al. (2012), identified the present as a fraught moment in the unripe discipline's history constrained by the bifurcation of theory and practice. Similarly, Risner (2012), identified the absence of research in this area and highlighted the need for conducting basic quantitative and qualitative research studies aiming towards the development of a rich body of knowledge on arts education. Additionally, Weltsek, Duffy, & Carney's (2014) study problematized the limitations of the current research on theatre education and identified a dearth of relevant qualitative and quantitative work. In light of the existent scarcity of research in literature, this study aims at enriching the fledgling field's knowledge base.

Despite the scarcity of research on teaching-artists, the few available studies exploring the different facets of theatre education offer a foundation for informing the conceptualization of this study and its research questions. For instance, Risner (2012), after conducting a study on teaching-artists, identified the existence of shared common values between artistry and pedagogy. This comes in congruence with the study of Carillo & Baguley (2011) who identified that artists tend to transfer their resilience and high levels of commitment needed to succeed in the arts into their roles as educators. Considering that, the mastery of the arts was said to inform the dual identities of teaching-artists at the university level (Carillo & Baguley, 2011). However, in reference to Lansing (1976), Carillo and Baguley (2011) proposed that accomplished artists

4

might not necessarily make effective educators, marking the importance of a teaching-artists' teaching experience.

As the mastery of a discipline might be insufficient in the process of preparing an instructor; pedagogical content knowledge was presented to refer to the effective pedagogy relevant to and exceeding the mastery of a particular discipline (Stover & Veres, 2013). As a theoretical concept, pedagogical content knowledge, presented by Shulman (1986) has stimulated substantial research and has been refined by scholars in response to a paradigm gap in research on the domain-specificity of teaching (Depaepe et al., 2012). For instance, the assessment of the concept of pedagogical content knowledge, elaborated as the transformation of subject matter knowledge per se into subject matter knowledge for teaching, was illustrated as interwoven with the educators' beliefs, practices and knowledge within their teaching contexts (Park & Oliver, 2008). Nonetheless, the concept of pedagogical content knowledge and other school-based theoretical literature marginally influence the practices of university instructors (Fraser, 2016). Accordingly, this study aims at prolonging the available research on pedagogical content knowledge into the context of tertiary education by attempting to understand the nature of a theatre teaching-artists' pedagogical content knowledge.

This study is informed by the theoretical framework on Pedagogical content knowledge presented by Park &Oliver (2008) and the literature on arts education and teaching-artists. After conducting a comprehensive literature review on the different aspects of pedagogical content knowledge in science, Park &Oliver (2008) presented an evolutionary modification of the representation of Shulman's (1986) concept, associating its' development with the educators' orientations to teaching the subject area, their knowledge of the students' understanding in the subject area, their knowledge of the curriculum, their knowledge of instructional strategies for

5

teaching the subject area, their knowledge of assessments of learning and their efficacy as teachers.

Moreover, this study inquires on the process of developing a teaching-artists' pedagogical content knowledge along their unique continuous professional learning journeys constituting various stages of professional growth contributing to their dual professional profiles as artists and teachers. While, the term "professional journey" designates one's teaching experience the term "professional development" encompasses more of the educator's life (Anderson, 2004). Accordingly, the teaching-artists' professional development journeys involve the mutual advancement in both their personal and professional identities (Anderson, 2004). However, scholars agree that professional identities of teaching-artists develop through a complex matrix of external and local demands (Kempe,2009) interrelated with their prior and on-course professional, artistic and pedagogical knowledge and experiences (Pitfield, 2012), this study extends Anderson's (2004) study on the professional development journey of drama educators in schools, based on Hargreaves and Fullan's (1992) categories of professional development, those of knowledge and skill development, self-understanding and ecological change, and explores the professional development journeys of theatre educators in tertiary education.

Even though professional development might support an educator's career (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012), advances their knowledge and ensures their effectiveness, programs on the teaching of arts remain in a formative state (Charland, 2006). Fortunately, university professors are capable of learning on the job and developing their skills (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995). Similarly, theatre educators tend to shape their own professional development opportunities (Anderson, 2004). In view of that, this study inquires on the organizational conditions that enable or hinder the pedagogical professional learning of teaching-artists. Moreover, this research study

aims on extracting the factors that influence the professional learning of teaching-artists focusing on how they autonomously blaze their professional learning trails in the absence of institutional support.

Research Questions

This study investigates, from the perspectives of theater professors' artists, the professional learning journey leading to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge by addressing the following research questions:

- What is the nature of the pedagogic content knowledge that theater teaching artists develop?

- What is the professional learning path (stages from being novice and beyond) that theater teaching-artists follow to develop their pedagogical content knowledge?

- What are the factors (personal, professional, societal) that shaped their professional learning?

- What are the organizational conditions that enable or hinder their pedagogical professional learning?

Significance of the Study

The international research on the role of tertiary education urges higher education institutions to foster ongoing professional growth through the implementation of relevant and innovative professional development programs and policies (Anderson, 2004; Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012). However, there is a limited number of research studies on arts education (Risner,2012). More precisely on theatre education (Abrams et al., 2012), the discipline characterized by a dearth in both qualitative and quantitative studies (Weltsek, Duffy, & Carney, 2014). Accordingly, through the application of a qualitative case study approach, this study aims on enriching the

realm of both the global and local Lebanese research context, as it provides insights into the professional learning paths of theater teaching-artists and the personal meanings they attach to their work. Such interdisciplinary research focusing on the continuous professional learning of theatre teaching-artists in higher-education accepts Webster-Wright's (2009) call for encouraging interdisciplinary research across various fields. Webster-Wright (2009) elaborated the need for such form of inquiry as it enables the understanding and sharing of imperative findings that would provide insights on the complex learning experiences of professionals and support their authentic, peculiar and continuous learning journeys within their professional contexts. Moreover, the proposed study, once completed and reported, may be also relevant to teaching-artists in other artistic disciplines. Hence it might stimulate other researchers in the field of arts to conduct additional studies on the advancement of the pedagogical content knowledge of higher education instructors.

Specialized induction, in-service and pre-service professional development incentives addressing the development of the pedagogical content knowledge of teaching-artists might sustain the quality of tertiary education institutions (Charland, 2006). Yet, such institutions are failing in targeting the needs of teaching-artists, as the professional development programs balancing artistry and pedagogy remain in a formative state (Anderson & Risner, 2012; Charland, 2006). Fortunately, theater educators are able to craft their own professional developmental paths (Anderson, 2004). By examining their professional learning paths, we hope to understand the factors that shape, hinder or facilitate the advancement of the pedagogical content knowledge of theatre teaching-artists at the Theater Department of the Lebanese University. Understanding these factors informs the process of effectively supporting the continuous professional learning of teaching-artists through designing and integrating

professional development, induction and mentoring programs that foster and support the professional growth of both experienced and novice educators. Accordingly, the proposed study would reduce the rift between theoretical & practical knowledge production as it might inform the process of planning and aligning specialized professional development incentives for practitioners, in ways that would build their professional profiles, the faculties' curricula and improve the students' achievements.

Additionally, addressing such blank spots might help in understanding the nature of the teaching-artists' commitment to their professional growth and how they individually perceive and develop their roles as educators at the Lebanese University. Out of their individual beliefs a shared converging understanding or a set of deviated esoteric perceptions of the role of a teaching-artists might surface. This informs policy-makers, scholars and administrators, at the level of the only public higher education institution in the country, on the importance of supporting higher education educators in their continuous professional learning journeys that foster the development of a learning community and strengthen the institutional culture on the basis of collegial collaboration.

CHAPTER II

LITERATURE REVIEW

Teachers and their teaching are among the most important factors that positively impact the student's academics (Lee et al., 2013). Ignoring the needs of teachers mislays the opportunity of enriching generations through an effective education (Anderson, 2004). Locally, the young generation of graduating theatre artists is failing to evolve the theatrical culture (Bakhos, 2012). Accordingly, this review inquires about the significance of developing the professional profiles of theatre teaching-artists at the level of tertiary education. In view of the existing limited number of research studies on arts education (Risner,2012), this literature review targets the unripe discipline of theatre education (Abrams et al., 2012) characterized by a dearth in qualitative and quantitative studies (Weltsek, Duffy, & Carney, 2014). Furthermore, as this study targets an emerging research topic, detecting relevant reviews of the literature on professional development in the Faculties of Fine Arts was challenging even after the use of different keywords, database sources and engaging in both staged and independent literature reviews. The search yielded not a single literature review on the professional learning of teaching-artists in higher education highlighting a need for carrying additional studies in this domain.

Pedagogical content knowledge, the transformation of content knowledge into a more practical form for teaching (Major & Palmer, 2006) is considered to be expandable in specific learning environments (Zepke, 2013) and fundamental for a professor's success (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995). Lee et al. (2013) in their study used the term pedagogical conceptual

change, by applying the notion of conceptual change from the field of cognitive psychology in reference to Thorley and Stofflett (1996) into a teacher's conceptions about pedagogical content knowledge. In view of that, a teacher's pedagogical conceptual change refers to the meaningful translation of new conceptions about teaching into their teaching practices (Lee et al., 2013). However, such a path to pedagogical conceptual change is complex requiring the educators' practices to change through pre-service education and professional development (Lee et al., 2013). Considering this, the following sections discuss the approaches, limitations, and conclusions of relevant and accessible studies targeting the pedagogical content knowledge and the professional development of theatre educators and artists in both K-12 and higher education institutions.

In their book's introduction on the process of understanding teacher development, Hargreaves and Fullan (1992) emphasized considering the teachers' skills and knowledge, the teachers as individuals and the context in which they teach (Hargreaves & Fullan,1992). In a more recent study the authors associated teaching with the concept of professional capital and called educational systems to appraise their professional capital by spending on education and invest in developing the individual and collective expertise of their professional capital comprised of the human, social and decisional capital (Hargreaves & Fullan, 2013). The authors highlighted the impact of such an approach on the effectiveness of an educator yet highlighted its difficulty as it requires technical knowledge, high levels of education, strong practice and continuous improvement (Hargreaves & Fullan, 2013). Furthermore, the fundamental elements for addressing the professional capital were elaborated, that of the human capital was associated with the capabilities of the individual teachers requiring continuous nurturing (Hargreaves & Fullan, 2013). Such a definition comes in congruence with that of professional development and

professional learning elaborated in the following section of this literature review. The definition

of the social capital as the total collective professional worth of a faculty emerging from the

formal and informal interactions among colleagues (Hargreaves & Fullan, 2013) mirrors the

descriptions of collaborative professional development in a learning community which will be

elaborated in a further section as well. And finally, the decisional capital elaborated as the

experience and wisdom contributing to the educators' abilities to problem solve and make

judgments about the students (Hargreaves & Fullan, 2013), comes in congruence with that of

pedagogical content knowledge that follows the discussion on professional development.

Professional Development

Some teaching-artists consider a career in the field of academia as it provides them with

the opportunity to simultaneously value the arts and impact people's lives through upholding

their respective art forms, while others consider the teaching profession as a reasonable career

progression (Risner, 2012). Yet, the mastery of a discipline is seen as insufficient in the process

of preparing an instructor (Stover & Veres, 2013). Thus, supporting teaching-artists through

professional development that builds their pedagogical content knowledge (Stover & Veres,

2013; Pitfield, 2012) becomes essential for some artists lacking teaching qualifications (Hall,

2010). In a review of publications on the professional development of teachers for the 10-year

period preceding 2010, Avalos (2011), defines professional development as the complex process

calling for the individual and collective as well as the cognitive, and emotional involvement of

teachers, leading to the transformation of their knowledge into practices that enable their

students' growth. Furthermore, professional development prevents the educators' knowledge and

effectiveness career growth curve from flattening (Charland, 2006), as it is characterized by the

progression of potential in both their personal and professional lives (Anderson, 2004). In other

words, the professional development of teaching-artists is associated with their dual-identity interconnected with their personal and professional profiles (Anderson, 2004) which encompass their skills and experiences (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009).

Hargreaves and Fullan's (1992) book introduction on the process of understanding teacher development emphasizes considering the teachers' skills and knowledge, the teachers as individuals and the context in which they teach. Similarly, in an article emerging from a doctoral study constructing narratives after examining the influences of the personal and professional factors encountered by four drama educators along their professional journeys in Sydney's public education system, Anderson (2004) highlighted how such factors impact the roles and effectiveness of educators. Anderson (2004) added that an educators' professional development is a complex process where even limitations encountered along their professional journeys might positively impact development. Similarly, the findings of Ibrahim & Yussof,'s (2009) qualitative case study exploring the perceptions of art educators in a tertiary education setting in Malaysia revealed that an educator's life experiences as a learner in school, in tertiary settings, and the community inform their teaching practices and influences their professional beliefs and values (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Most of the participants in Ibrahim & Yussof,'s (2009) study highlighted the association of their personal and professional profiles emphasizing that teaching involves both skills and experiences.

Although the mastery of the arts informs the dual identities of teaching-artists at the university level, in reference to Lansing (1976), Carillo & Baguley (2011) proposed that the mastery of a discipline might be insufficient in the process of preparing an instructor as accomplished artists might not necessarily make effective educators. Accordingly, the authors marked the importance of a teaching-artists' teaching experience (Carillo & Baguley, 2011). In

light of that, the following sections trace back the origins of and frame the professional development of teaching-artists leading to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge, presented by Stover & Veres (2013) as the effective pedagogy relevant to and exceeding the mastery of a particular discipline.

Professional Development in Education: A Historical Overview

In a study targeting the partnership between higher education institutions and art associations in implementing professional development, Charland (2006) has provided a historic review on the roots and the development of in-service professional development in the educational field. In reference to Dubey et al. (1982), Charland (2006) has discussed that professional development informally emerged early in the 19th century, at a time where the pedagogical skills of school educators were restricted to being picked up through practice. With the surge of public-concerns regarding the quality of teacher-training, specific subject courses were offered to address the gaps in teachers' knowledge (DuBey et al. 1982, as cited in Charland, 2006). In 1904, John Dewey argued in a publication addressing in-service professional development, the importance of integrating educational theory in professional development (Dewey, 1904 as cited in Charland, 2006). By the early twentieth century, a bachelor's degree became the minimum educational requirement for an entry into the teaching profession supported by remedial professional development oriented toward uplifting the educators' level of educational attainment (Charland, 2006). With time, the paradigm changes in the beliefs of educators based on understanding a classroom's diversity were transmitted into considerations for professional development, which lead to the emergence of a myriad of methods for delivering professional development (Charland, 2006).

However, the majority of the relevant conducted studies focus on primary and secondary school educators. Thus, their results marginally influence the practices of university instructors (Fraser, 2016) as universities constitute a different learning environment (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995). Perversely to primary and secondary school teachers' requirement to complete programs in educational theory, educators at university level have no such legal mandate (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012). After reviewing the literature, Honeyfield & Fraser (2012) have highlighted that institutions of higher education face quandaries, as they hire staff members based on their subject matter expertise yet expect them to perform as highly qualified educators.

Good teaching is elaborated in reference to Prebble et al. (2005) as associated with the students' outcomes and attainable through assisting teachers in the process of improving the quality of their teaching through different interventions (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012) namely professional development which extends the educators' knowledge and transforms their instructional practices (Borko,2004). In reference to Charland (2006) engaging teaching-artists in relevant pre-service and in-service professional development incentives sustains the quality of tertiary education institutions (Charland, 2006). However, many teaching-artists report not being sufficiently trained for their roles both before and after they were hired (Kim, 2015). The following sub-sections elaborate on professional development interventions targeting the specific professional development of teaching-artists in higher education described as crucial in supporting a career in education (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012).

Pre-service Professional Development for Teaching-Artist

Educators with a wealth of invaluable subject expertise but a dearth in pedagogical knowledge (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012) such as accomplished artists lacking teaching qualifications (Hall, 2010) might not necessarily make effective educators (Carillo & Baguley,

2011). In an article examining the essential factors for consideration in the development of a new master's program for theatre educators, Schuttler (2010) highlighted a worldwide scarcity in specialized training programs for theatre educators as many of the existing graduate programs emphasize artistic skills used outside the classroom. After highlighting the need for studying the emerging trends in the field of theatre education Schuttler (2010) has provided a clear solution to the problem of unfocused programs. In view of the growing need for diverse postgraduate training programs for theatre educators, arts and education departments were called to cooperate in developing programs that focus on pedagogy, research, and curriculum development (Schuttler, 2010). Similarly, the findings in Anderson & Risner's (2012) study, presenting the lack of preparation of teaching artists-and their workplace challenges, highlight the need for crafting programs that balance pedagogy with artistry. Similarly, Risner (2012), after conducting a hybrid study constituting of quantitative survey data and qualitative narratives from a range of teaching-artists committed to K-12 education whose work is rooted in performance disciplines in the United States, frames the importance of the development of specialized teaching curricula in diverse contexts and calls for the re-envisioning of senior projects in ways that encourage teaching artistry projects.

While it is common for graduate programs to generally develop the artistic skills of students, the findings of Risner's (2012) comprehensive examination of the participants' artistic and academic preparation has revealed that the majority of participants consider their graduate studies as a major influence on their training as teaching-artists. This might not be the case in our Lebanese context, as Bakhos (2012) identifies a crisis facing the state's university pre-service theatre programs. The author characterizes the local programs as influenced by the absence of academic and methodological work emerging from what was identified as academic,

professional, and cultural imbalances. Bakhos (2012) in her Ph.D. study characterizes the academic imbalance as emerging from the spread of fallacious curricula at the local institutes and faculties. Such curricula were described as non-scientific and arbitrary, confined to the listing of subjects and courses which neither adequately deal with academic objectives nor link the curricula with the needed skills (Bakhos, 2012). The author traces the crisis of the pre-service programs' curricula to the lack of specialist academic professors capable of setting and developing relevant curricula (Bakhos, 2012). Accordingly, she highlights the need for specialist lecturers in specific artistic fields such as directing, acting, scenography and dramaturgy (Bakhos, 2012). She also points out that assigning such courses to non-specialists negatively influences the quality of teaching (Bakhos, 2012). Furthermore, the academic imbalance has been associated with the professional imbalance, where the graduating artists constituting the national artistic scenery are failing in developing schools of thought and theatrical troops that might lead to the development of the theatrical culture (Bakhos, 2012).

Despite the international call for the development of specific pre-service programs that focus on pedagogy and teaching artistry (Schuttler, 2010; Anderson & Risner, 2012; Risner, 2012), the local programs are failing in graduating capable alumni as they remain constrained by the fallacious curricula and the lack of specialist academic professors (Bakhos, 2012). Consequently, to sustain the value of the arts in educational programs, educational institutions are advised to effectively support the ongoing professional development of their staff (Anderson, 2004) through the offering of a variety of in-service incentives that cater to their specific needs (McCaslin et al., 2004). The following section elaborates on different forms of in-service professional development.

In-service Professional Development for Teaching-artists

Despite the various calls that urge institutions of higher education to support their teaching staff (Carillo & Baguley, 2011; Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009), relevant professional development opportunities and induction opportunities remain in a formative stage (Charland,2006; Braund, 2015). In other words, teaching-artists are seeking supplementary professional training and support that is often none existing (Kim, 2015).

Educators lecturing at different levels and developing their instructional practices associated with their distinctive classroom contexts and different curricula, require job-embedded support to develop their teaching (Guskey & Yoon, 2009). Teachers in a specific domain have a variety of sources to develop their knowledge of teaching through their disciplinary background and their professional coursework (Grossman, 1990). In a more recent study on effective professional development incentives from the perspectives of educational leaders and trainers offering staff development for teaching artists in non-tertiary institutions of education, various forms of incentives have been mentioned including mentoring, in-house retreats, co-leading classrooms, self-evaluations, and group reflections (McCaslin et al., 2004). Moreover, two distinct stages of professional development were highlighted, the first targeting educators who have just started teaching and the second targeting experienced educators (McCaslin et al., 2004). For instance, induction programs, workshops, and certificate or degree programs offer newcomers into higher education the set of required knowledge and skills (Honeyfield & Fraser,2012). Induction and specific training constitute an effective platform enabling the professional development of novice educators lecturing at the university level (Carillo & Baguley, 2011) and are identified as the ground that cements pre-service training to professional development (Smith, 2013;2009;2008;). Unfortunately, induction opportunities

remain unavailable to many professionals at the level of tertiary education (Braund,2015). Such is the case for teaching-artists feeling inadequately prepared for their roles as many of them join the field by coincidence and develop their skills through practice highlighting the benefit of being introduced in advance to teaching artistry (Simpson Steele, 2018). Fortunately, in a collaborative environment that encourages professional learning, accomplished colleagues are found to contribute to the development of a learning community by supporting novice educators in building their teaching abilities and engage in collaboratively supporting the development of their capacities (Smith, 2013; 2009; 2008). The following sections elaborate on how educators might jointly develop professionally in a learning community and/or independently pave their own professional development journeys.

Commitment to Collaborative Professional Development in a Learning Community. Effective professional learning through collaboration among colleagues extending over long periods in the form of peer coaching and co-construction of practices impacts their continuous professional learning (Simpson Steele, 2018; Smith, 2013;2009;2008;). As professional learning communities provide teachers with opportunities to purposefully collaborate (Simpson Steele, 2008), this section elaborates on the professional learning of teachers within their social contexts. Collegiality in the form of purposeful collaboration among teachers that is associated with reflecting on practices, exchanging thoughts, and sharing approaches oriented towards improving the students' learning, promotes professional development (Guskey, 2003). Similarly, Braund (2015) associated professional development with workplace learning reporting that collaborative activity among colleagues impacts their performance and supports their integration within higher education settings (Braund, 2015). Furthermore, the professional relationships among teaching-artists are associated with the quality of the working environment as colleagues can assist the

19

professional development of one another through coaching, visiting, debriefing and mentoring (McCaslin et al., 2004). Such is the case for the teaching-artists participating in McCaslin's (2004) study. These participants highlight the importance of building the commitment of teaching-artists and their professional relationships among colleagues who can effectively and collaboratively support one another in their developmental journeys (McCaslin et al., 2004; Walmsley, 2013). While, Guskey (2003), Braund (2015) and McCaslin et al. (2004) illustrate collegiality ipso facto contributing to professional development Charland (2006) reported on a two way mutual influence where engaging in professional development also contributes to the development of a learning-community on the basis of mutual support among peers with diverse strengths and backgrounds.

Commitment to Self-Professional Development. Literature proposes several formats for the professional development of teaching-artists with distinct characteristics, including professional development programs, collaborative exchanges among colleagues and mentorship (Simpson Steele, 2018). However, it's the teachers' self-initiated reflection on the intersection of these incentives associated with their practices and beliefs that seem to be impacting their teaching (Steele, 2018). The review of literature highlights that few higher education institutions engage their teaching staff in specialized comprehensive programs that focus on pedagogy (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012) and such is the case for teaching-artists (Risner,2012) as the common professional development opportunities lack relevance, rigor, and venues for disseminating knowledge. Fortunately, educators in general are able to develop their knowledge of teaching by learning from their own experiences (Grossman, 1990). Similarly, the school theatre teaching-artists participating in McCaslin et al. 's (2004) study report self-coaching, self-evaluation, and reflection as alternative forms of professional development. These claims

receive further support in the conclusion of the paper documenting the experiences of arts educators, highlighting the positive impact of the implementation of individual professional development measures, such as reflection on the teaching practices of university educators (Carillo & Baguley, 2011). In fact, the drama educators, participating in Anderson's (2004) study have demonstrated an ability to pave their own professional development journeys in response to their unique needs. These drama educators reported operating within systems that provided them little assistance in their professional development journeys, poorly acknowledging their discipline as a subject and providing obstructive professional development (Anderson, 2004). Similarly, the participants in Risner's (2012) hybrid study, reported confronting along their professional journey's administrative bureaucracy, discouragement, and a lack of institutional support (Risner, 2012). Much like the drama educators in Anderson's (2004) study, the participants in Risner's (2012) study have reported becoming self-taught and engaging in research as a direct professional development training for their roles as educators. Furthermore, they reported the importance of upholding one's professional work as an artist as a form of in-service professional development (Risner, 2012; McCaslin et al., 2004).   Maintaining a teaching-artists' engagement in their respective art form in parallel with their teaching intensifies their credibility in the eyes of their students (Carillo & Baguley, 2011).

Reframing Professional Development

Scholars agree that to sustain the growing universal momentum for the recognition of the value of the arts in educational programs, educational institutions should effectively train novice-teachers and support the ongoing development of the experienced ones (Anderson, 2004) through the offering of a variety of differentiated professional development offerings that cater to their specific needs (McCaslin et al., 2004). Despite the cry for sustainable training programs for

teaching-artists (Kim, 2015) and the range of professional development incentives for both tertiary professors and school educators, the literature highlights a scarcity in specialized comprehensive programs for theatre teaching-artists.

Charland (2006) after reporting the existence of various yet distinct approaches to professional development, highlighted that specialized professional development programs on the teaching of arts remain in a formative state and concluded that teaching-artists are stranded with the deficiencies of the unspecialized professional development opportunities they are being exposed to. Such is the case for institutions of tertiary education that vary widely in the topics, the type, and amount of support they provide to educators (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012). Although professors are expected to continuously develop their knowledge and skills about teaching and learning, colleges and universities face difficulties in addressing the specific needs of teaching-artists (Charland, 2006) and seldom offer specialized workshops that focus on the development of Pedagogical content knowledge (Stover & Veres, 2013). Notwithstanding the emerging credential programs for educators, the teaching-artists are not thoroughly in favor of such programs (Simpson Steele, 2018). On one hand, some teaching-artists are concerned about developing their pedagogy, while on the other hand, their adversaries call for less standardization and more attention to their unique work as teaching-artists (Simpson Steele, 2018). These teaching-artists criticize being carried along deficient programs that target the needs of non-artist educators (Simpson Steele, 2018). Fortunately, unaided theatre teaching-artists are able to learn from their experiences and shape their own professional development journeys (Anderson, 2004).

Webster-Wright (2009) reached similar concluding thoughts regarding the professional development of professionals. In her study, she illustrated the workplace as an essential setting

for learning and research into learning enabling professionals to learn and develop their practice, from a range of activities including formal professional development programs, interaction with colleagues, and different on-course and exterior permutations of experiences (Webster-Wright, 2009). In view of that the author re-conceptualized professional development from an atomistic discourse separating the professionals from their contexts and perceiving them as deficient entities into self-directed professionals engaged in continuous professional learning (Webster-Wright, 2009). Simpson Steele's (2018) study on the professional learning journeys of teaching-artists also frames their continuous development as their continuous efforts to learn. The authors argued for this shift in terminology in the process of supporting the learning of professionals, associating professional development with professional knowledge and reframing it as continuous professional learning embodied and embedded in context specific practice (Webster-Wright, 2009). Rather than merely bounding professional development to training it was re-conceptualized as sociocultural emerging from different sorts of formal, contextual group-based experiences and informal, individual and context free transferable experiences (Webster-Wright, 2009). Similarly, Kim (2015) in reference to Booth (2012) frames good teaching as mindful of the balance between the individuals' experiences and their contexts calling for perceiving both as inseparable and mutually developing them. One way to inquire on authentic professional learning in light of the research review reported in Webster-Wright's (2009) article is to conceptualize it as embedded and constructed in the experiences of practicing professionals. Accordingly, practice won't be segregated from the professional, rather considered an integral part of being a professional practicing within a context (Webster-Wright, 2009). Moreover, the author has highlighted the importance of extracting holistic insights on the continuous learning

of professionals rather than focusing on the aggregate and well-defined factors associated with specific professional development incentives (Webster-Wright, 2009).

Reframing professional development as the active, situated and practice mediated professional learning within contexts calls for more situated, holistic research that inquires on the authentic experiences of continuing professional learning from the perspectives of professionals reflecting the assumptions that professional learning is contextually and socially situated or acknowledging these difficulties as research limitations (Webster-Wright, 2009). In light of the different rationales marking the importance of reframing or aligning professional development opportunities with the emerging theories and practices and as Charland (2006) has highlighted the need for educators to periodically reconsider their pedagogical approaches, the following section of this literature review elaborates on the continuous professional learning educators associated with the development of pedagogical content knowledge.

Pedagogical Content Knowledge

Ibrahim & Yussof, (2009), in a study not oriented towards providing generalizations but understanding the individuality and diversity of participants, highlighted that art educators have unique approaches to teaching, informed and influenced by the nature of their artistic discipline, beliefs and values. Most participants in the study acknowledge good art teaching in higher education as intellectual, cultural, and contextual requiring pedagogical content knowledge (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Nonetheless, research on teacher learning is relatively young (Borko,2004), specifically research on university professors where the concept of pedagogical content knowledge was described as left unexamined (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995). In more recent studies, authors highlighted that few researchers have addressed the pedagogical approaches associated with what constitutes good teaching at the level of tertiary education

(Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009) thus identifying a gap in literature (Fraser, 2016). Furthermore, the concept of pedagogical content knowledge, PCK, is found to marginally influence the practices of university instructors. Fraser (2016) described her study exploring the usefulness of PCK for science educators in higher education, as a milestone exploring the conceptual framework of PCK in the context of higher education. Though the concept of pedagogical content knowledge, proven useful for understanding teacher practice, has only been validated at the K-12 level the participants, in the study investigating the resonation of a school-based pedagogical content knowledge framework with university lecturers, supported the concept of pedagogical content knowledge in higher education and called for additional research in this field (Fraser, 2016).

In a preceding study on the pedagogical content knowledge strategies of university professors, Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl (1995), highlighted that despite lacking the formal preparation educators, higher education professors are subject experts able to learn on the job the skills and expertise of proficient educators. The authors concluded that the appropriate integration of pedagogical content knowledge, the ability to transform a subject matter from one's understanding into another's', may be central to a professor's success (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995). At a later stage of the development of the field of study, Stover & Veres (2013) conducted an action research study that encompasses the concept of pedagogical content knowledge in higher education. The literature review chapter clearly distinguishes between different kinds of knowledge in light of the work of Mishra & Koehler (2006) and Shulman (1987).

While a century preceding Shulman's (1986) study, pedagogical accomplishment was solely associated with content, the study differentiated the different sources of teacher's knowledge escorting the transformation of their content expertise into academic expertise

suggesting that teaches draw on different sources of knowledge including: content knowledge, pedagogical content knowledge, curricular knowledge and pedagogical knowledge. Later in 1987 the author, alongside Gudmundsdottir, revisited the concept of pedagogical content knowledge and elaborated it as neither content nor pedagogy but a form of understanding uniquely relevant to each teacher combining both (Gudmundsdottir & Shulman,1987). While content knowledge is the knowledge about a specific subject developed through an individual's postsecondary education and professional development, pedagogical knowledge is associated to the teaching processes, practices and methods shared across disciplines allowing individuals to develop their teaching strategies (Mishra & Koehler, 2006; Stover & Veres, 2013). Accordingly, educators' expertise and knowledge in specific disciplines might be considered as inadequate prerequisites for their roles as instructors (Stover & Veres, 2013).

In view of the above, pedagogical content knowledge was identified as the effective pedagogy in a discipline, elaborated in reference to Shulman (1987) as cited in Stover & Veres (2013). As a theoretical concept, pedagogical content knowledge was initially presented by Shulman (1986,1987) framing teachers as possessing a unique domain of knowledge crucial for quality teaching (Chan & Yung, 2018). Since then, the concept has been refined by many scholars and considered a paradigm shift to fill a gap in research on teaching (Depaepe et al., 2012). For instance, in their review, Depaepe et al. (2012) have identified that scholars agree with the association of PCK with content knowledge and pedagogical knowledge and Grossman's (1990) refinement of the conception and recommended the addition of two new components, central for the advancement of PCK: the knowledge of curriculum and that of their purposes for teaching.   Moreover, in an article investigating its characteristics considering the 21st-century research, Zepke (2013) presented a PCK framework based on threshold concepts

and student engagement. The framework as cited in Zepke's study (2013) adopts Shulman's (1987) views concerning the development of a specific practice at the intersection of pedagogy and content, accepts Mishra & Koehler's (2006) visualization of the relationship between content and learning and Entwistle's (2003) proposal that educators and students contribute together to quality learning. To rap the ribbon around the edge of the board, pedagogical content knowledge as a term refers to the transformation of content knowledge into a more practical form for teaching (Major & Palmer, 2006), is expandable in specific learning environments (Zepke,2013) and fundamental for a professor's success (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995).

In view of the complex process leading to the development of an educator's Pedagogical content knowledge (Pitfield, 2012) and as different types of teaching artists exist, some might be more likely to lack up-to-date pedagogical content knowledge. These include activists, professional artists, professional teachers, and accidental teaching-artist, elaborated as those who do not perceive themselves as teachers during their post-secondary education. (Anderson & Risner, 2012). Accordingly, the following sections elaborate on the development of pedagogical content of both teaching-artists and theatre teaching-artists.

Pedagogical Content Knowledge in the Arts

According to Ibrahim & Yussof (2009), although some teaching-artists consider the mastery of art skills and knowledge as good teaching others believe that it is rooted in pedagogical knowledge and skills. On one hand, findings revealed that good artists might not necessarily make good educators, on another, experience in teaching was perceived as important yet insufficient (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Accordingly, the participants highlighted the need for educators to continually engage in improving their subject matter knowledge and pedagogical content (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). In view of that, the study was concluded by suggesting that

good art teaching is attainable without a formal education in teaching through a commitment to ongoing professional development (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009).

Pedagogical Content Knowledge in Theatre

In a research exploring what British secondary school drama educators consider crucial for the teaching of drama, Kempe (2009) highlighted an ongoing debate between their practical and theoretical work. The author has framed drama educators as operating under tension rising from the interplay between institutional requirements and what they personally regard as useful and appropriate knowledge within the local context (Kempe, 2009). The findings highlighted that the drama educators build their identities within a matrix of imposed external professional values and practices, the local context, subject-specific knowledge and drama pedagogy (Kempe,2009). Pitfield (2012) who conducted a qualitative research study on how three cohorts of student-teachers of drama in a university in the UK construct their Pedagogical content knowledge reached a similar conclusion. The findings from written statements, questionnaires and interviews have interrelated the transformation of the participants' subject knowledge into pedagogical content knowledge to a complex interplay between their prior knowledge, prior professional experiences and on-course experiences related to the subject (Pitfield, 2012). Simultaneously, such an interplay among the educator's prior and on-course professional, artistic and pedagogical knowledge and experiences lead to the development of the professional identities of teaching-artists (Pitfield, 2012). Accordingly, the development of an educator's pedagogical content knowledge and professional identity emerge from undistinguishable characteristics. The following section elaborates on the professional identities of teaching-artists.

Educators' Professional Identities

The teaching of art is characterized by the teaching-artist's self-understanding and practice (Chemi, 2015). The perspectives of teaching-artists in Simpson Steele's (2018) study perceiving professional development as a continuous learning process rather than an occasional event, highlighted the significant importance of supporting teaching-artists in their own learning journeys as it impacts their professional identities and practices. In fact, the teaching-artists participating in Simpson Steele's (2018) did not articulate contradicting views associated with their dual identities, but reported complementary ones, as they highlighted integrating their skills into different contexts associated with their dichotomous roles.

In reference to Palmer (1997) teachers teach who they are. The author highlighted that educators seeking good teaching are required to understand the subjects and students they are dealing with in addition to their own self-knowledge. Accordingly, the inner landscape of an educator's life with its' three interwoven emotional, spiritual and intellectual paths in the human self and in education was proposed as a paradigm for good teaching (Palmer, 1997). While the intellectual path was described as the educators' conceptions about learning, students and the subject, the emotional one was elaborated as the feelings that affect the exchange between educators and students (Palmer, 1997). Finally, the spiritual path was represented as the educator's inoculation of passion and meaning into teaching (Palmer, 1997). Palmer (1997) concluded by reframing good teaching once perceived as mere technique, as emerging from the educators' identities, lying at the intersection of the diverse forces that make up one's life, and their integrity relating to those forces in ways that add meaning, wholeness and life to the educator.

The findings in Shagrir's (2015) study on working with higher education students has revealed that higher education staff differ based on their unique conceptions and approaches that guide their professional practice. Such conceptions were associated with their work stemming from various areas including personal motives, perceptions of their roles, amount of work experience, their teaching qualifications and seniority, their professional confidence, beliefs and experiences (Shagrir, 2015). In conclusion, while the inner landscape of an educator's identity were elaborated by Palmer (1997) as constituted of three interwoven emotional, spiritual and intellectual paths, the identities of teaching-artists develop through a complex matrix of external and local demands (Kempe,2009) interrelated with their passion for their respective arts discipline (Carillo & Baguley, 2011) and their prior and on-course professional, artistic and pedagogical knowledge and experiences (Pitfield, 2012).

Effectiveness in Teaching Arts in Higher Education

The teaching of art in tertiary education is constantly on the move as it is associated with innovative beliefs emerging from research on what constitutes good teaching in higher education (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Good teaching has been portrayed as the ability to respond to the ever-changing conditions while improving teaching and learning through committing to self-development and coping with change (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Such a theme in research has been elaborated to be gaining attention as a serious topic in the research agendas of universities (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). After analyzing different lists of characteristics of effective professional development leading to effective teaching, Guskey (2003) has identified that the most frequent dimensions include supporting educators in the process of advancing their content and pedagogical knowledge allowing them to understand the content they teach and the ways students learn (Guskey, 2003). Furthermore, Fernández-Balboa

& Stiehl (1995) have associated effective teaching with the integration of pedagogical content knowledge, the effective pedagogy relevant to a particular discipline (Stover & Veres, 2013).

Park and Oliver (2008) conducted a comprehensive literature review and have identified in light of the definitions of Shulman (1986) the different aspects of pedagogical content knowledge and have synthesized their own comprehensive pedagogical content knowledge definition for effective teaching elaborated as the teachers' understanding and performance supporting the students' learning of a specific subject within a learning environment bounded contextually, culturally, and socially (Park & Oliver, 2008). After defining pedagogical content knowledge, the authors have provided a model in the form of a conceptual tool constituted of a set of interconnected areas of teacher knowledge leading to the development of pedagogical content knowledge, yet recognized the model as not essentially a working one proposing teaching prescriptions, rather than a tool emerging from reflection in-action and reflection on-action (Park & Oliver, 2008). The model represents the concept of pedagogical content knowledge for teaching science as central to several components in a hexagon form. Such a representation, an evolutionary modification of the representation of Shulman's (1986) model, associated the possible development of PCK from any of the six components: the educators' orientations to teaching the subject area, their knowledge of the students' understanding in the subject area, their knowledge of the curriculum, their knowledge of instructional strategies for teaching the subject area, their knowledge of assessments of learning and their efficacy as teachers (Park & Oliver, 2008). The following section reviews Park & Oliver's (2008) conceptual framework and customizes it for the effective teaching of arts in higher education. By rationalizing creativity as an additional component, this section alters Park & Oliver's (2008)

hexagon model into a heptagon, fostering the development of teaching-artists' pedagogical content knowledge.

In a study focusing on the creative aspect of teaching in higher education Jarvis (2019) has discussed the prevailing tension in defining teaching in higher education as an art preserving educators' the space and resources to develop their creativity before considering it a science on the basis of binding educators by institutional constraints. The study explored the idea of teaching in institutions of higher education, as an art and highlighted the potential contribution such a portrayal provides by highlighting in reference to Eisner (2008) imagination as a source of innovation crucial for teaching (Jarvis,2019). Lupton (2013) reconfirms the conceptualization of teaching as an art, arguing based on her experience in higher education teacher training, that performativity led to the perception of teaching as a craft associating it with uniformity and efficacy. On the other hand, the author described teaching as an inherently risky art (Jarvis, 2019). Gibson (2010) reached a similar conclusion by associating teaching in higher education with taking risks and considering it as an art (Gibson, 2010). In her article she highlighted that institutions of higher education are being criticized for inhibiting creativity which was described in reference to Haring-Smith (2006) as having implications on pedagogy (Gibson, 2010). Accordingly, the author called higher education institutions to foster creativity by nurturing risk taking, independence and flexibility (Gibson, 2010). In reference to, Sternberg (2006) creativity was described as multi-faceted and hard to grasp as it requires self-assurance and risk taking leading to what has been elaborated in in reference to Koestler (1964) as the creation of meaningful new forms based on the already existing facts, ideas, faculties and skills (Gibson, 2010). While Gibson (2010) and Jarvis (2019) foster creativity as a crucial component for teaching in higher education, Bakhos (2012) highlights its impact on the work of an artist-

researchers through contributing to the advancement of the discipline of theatre by transcending the mere application of methodology as a solid path leading to innovation and binding it with artistic aesthetics and an intellectual vision. Accordingly, and as Miller (2016) in a study on the considerations for theatre and dance in higher education, calls teaching-artists to develop their roles into artist-scholar-teachers and to contribute to envisioning their pedagogical role in higher education, a teaching-artist lecturing in higher education needs to foster creativity as an artist, scholar and educator.

As the literature on the learning and understanding of creativity associates it with knowledge and is represented both as crucial for human development (Chemi, 2015), effective teaching in higher education might require a supplementary dimension, that of fostering creativity (Gibson, 2010). Accordingly, the following section develops Park and Oliver (2008), Kempe's (2009) and Pitfield's, (2012) PCK frameworks based on Shulman's models in light of the reviewed literature on teaching-artists and the relevant studies on the professional identities of teaching-artists, their effective teaching and the development of their pedagogical content knowledge.

Chapter Summary

Institutions of higher education expect their staff members hired based on their subject matter expertise to teach well (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012). Since good teaching is attainable through assisting teachers in the process of improving the quality of their practices (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012), institutions of higher education are urged to support the ongoing professional development of their staff (Anderson, 2004) through the offering of a variety of incentives that cater to their specific needs (McCaslin et al., 2004). Professional development is a complex process, characterized by the progression of potential in both the personal and professional lives

33

of educators (Anderson, 2004) leading to the transformation of their knowledge into practices that enable their students' growth (Avalos, 2011). The following section provides a detailed description of the conceptual understanding that the researcher has synthesized based on the literature reviewed as depicted in Figure 1 bellow:

Self-Initiated Learning

Learning from Institutional

Learning in a Learning Community

Prior Personal Knowledge and Experiences

Induction Programs

Pre-service Professional Learning

Workshops

On-course Professional Learning

In-house retreats

Comprehensive professional development programs

Self-initiated Reflection, evaluation &coaching

Certificate Programs

Collaborative Reflection

Visiting

Peer Coaching

Mentoring

Debriefing

...sing their:

Skills
Values
Knowledge
Practices
Beliefs
Dual-Professional Identity

Professional Learning of Teaching-artists

Creativity

Orientation to Teaching Theater (Prior Knowledge and experiences)

Reflection-in action

PCK

Drama pedagogy & Subject Specific Knowledge

Knowledge of the Theatre Curriculum Local Context

Reflection on Action

Knowledge of Assessment of Theatre Learning

Knowledge of the Students' Understanding in Theatre

Professional Values &Teacher Efficacy

Figure 1. A Conceptual understanding of the professional learning of teaching-artists leading to the development of their PCK

The first section, made up of the three arrows, reports the determinants of professional development reviewed in the literature. Various yet distinct approaches to professional development exist (Charland, 2006). These include institutional support in the form of induction programs, workshops, certificate programs (Honeyfield & Fraser, 2012) mentoring and in house-retreats (McCaslin et al., 2004). Though crucial in supporting a teaching-artist's career relevant professional development opportunities and induction opportunities for teaching-artists remain in a formative stage (Honeyfield & Fraser,2012, Charland,2006; Braund, 2015). As the most common professional development opportunities lack relevance, rigor, and venues for disseminating knowledge (Risner,2012) teaching-artists are found to seek supplementary professional training and support (Kim, 2015). Fortunately, the workplace supports the integration of professionals within higher education settings (Braund, 2015), enables their learning and impacts their practice through a range of activities, exceeding formal professional development programs, comprised of interaction with colleagues, on-course experiences and different exterior permutations of experiences (Webster-Wright, 2009). In addition to coaching, visiting, debriefing and mentoring where teaching-artists can effectively and collaboratively support one another in their developmental journeys (McCaslin et al., 2004; Walmsley, 2013) teaching-artists are professionally able to independently develop from their own experiences (Grossman, 1990). Such is the case for theatre educators capable of developing their dual-identities by taking control of their own professional development journeys (Anderson, 2004) while upholding their professional work as artists in parallel with their teaching as a form of an ongoing professional development (Risner, 2012; McCaslin et al., 2004; Carillo & Baguley, 2011). In summary, teaching-artists can professionally develop by learning through a variety of institutional incentives that cater to their specific needs (McCaslin et al., 2004), by effectively

and collaboratively supporting one another in their developmental journeys (McCaslin et al., 2004; Walmsley, 2013) and by professionally learning from their own experiences (Grossman, 1990).

In view of these interrelated determinants, professional development can be re-conceptualized from an atomistic discourse separating the professionals from their contexts into the continuous learning of self-directed teaching-artists (Webster-Wright, 2009; Simpson Steele, 2018), represented in Figure 1 in the circles constituting the professional leering of teaching-artists. Accordingly, the teaching-artist's continuous learning is contextually embedded, constructed and emerging from a range of formal and informal transferable experiences (Webster-Wright, 2009) that informs their teaching practices and influence their professional beliefs and values (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Such is the case for drama educators building their professional profiles within a matrix of imposed external professional values and practices, the local context, subject-specific and prior knowledge, drama pedagogy, prior professional experiences and on-course experiences related to the subject (Pitfield, 2012; Kempe,2009).This marks the complexity of the professional learning of teaching-artists (Kempe,2009) who develop their identities through a complex matrix of external and local demands interrelated with their prior and on-course professional, artistic and pedagogical knowledge and experiences (Pitfield, 2012).Given this and the fact that higher education professors are capable of learning through practice the skills, knowledge and expertise of proficient educators (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995), educators develop their Pedagogical content knowledge, the ability to transform content knowledge into a more practical form for teaching (Major & Palmer, 2006). Good teaching is rooted in pedagogical knowledge (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009), which is expandable in specific

learning environments (Zepke,2013) and fundamental for a professor's success (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995).

The third section of the framework, the heptagon, provides a zoomed in perspective into pedagogical content knowledge, a distinctive form of an applied knowledge developed as a skill through experience and emerging from reflection in-action and reflection on-action (Park & Oliver, 2008), associated with a teaching-artist's dual identity and advanced through their continuous professional learning. The framework provides a modification of the representation of Park &Oliver's (2008) model initially based on Shulman's (1986) model adding creativity as an additional paradigm for effective teaching in higher education (Gibson, 2010) as it is associated with knowledge and crucial for human development (Chemi, 2015). The heptagon reports the complexity of interaction among beliefs, values, knowledge and experiences contributing to the development of a teaching-artist's PCK. These include: a teaching-artist's orientation to teaching theater (prior knowledge and professional experiences), their knowledge of the theatre curriculum and the local context), knowledge of the students' understanding in theatre, professional values & teacher efficacy, knowledge of assessment of theatre learning, drama pedagogy & subject specific knowledge, and finally creativity.

Finally, in reference to Miller's (2016) study on the considerations for theatre and dance in higher education, teaching-artists are called to develop their roles into artist-scholar-teachers and to contribute to envisioning their pedagogical role in higher education, by continuously engaging in professional learning while fostering creativity as an artist, scholar and educator.

CHAPTER III

METHODOLOGY

This study explores the professional identities of theater teaching-artists at the second branch of the Lebanese University and inquires about the professional learning paths that theater teaching-artists follow to develop their pedagogical content knowledge, its nature and the personal, professional, organizational and societal factors that impact their professional learning. This chapter elaborates on the methodology chosen, its rationale, its data collection and analysis procedures and the quality criteria it followed.

Although continuing professional learning is renowned across different vocations, Webster-Wright (2009) highlights the importance of encouraging interdisciplinary research across various fields enabling the understanding and sharing of imperative findings that would enable professional learning. Accordingly, this study on teaching artistry is informed by Webster-Wright's (2009) conceptual framework that guides its methodology for exploring professional learning as rooted within the lives of dual-career teaching-artists.

Moreover, in line of Webster-Wright's (2009) call for rafting the focus away from atomistic professional development and into holistic professional learning permitting the analysis of the professionals' complex learning, this study follows the qualitative case study design, in the context of the Theatre Department at the second branch of the Faculty of Fine Arts at the Lebanese University in attempt to capture the contextually induced complexity of the experience. This study also examines the career paths and the professional learning of a group of diverse theatre teaching-artists as distinctive cases participating in this inquiry. The data collection tools and procedures

aimed at extracting relevant data about the incidents of professional learning of teaching-artists will be described, followed by the description of the qualitative data analysis measures used to reach an in depth understanding of the phenomenon of professional learning of theatre teaching-artists grounded in their perspectives and lived experiences.

Research Design

The interaction of unique instructors, students and institutional learning environments leads to the emergence of inimitable ways to conceptualize content within a single subject (Zepke, 2013). The aforementioned conclusion interrelates the teaching of any subject to its unique social reality. As there is no single social reality but a transforming one (Gall et al., 2010), this study inquired on how different teaching-artists develop their pedagogical content knowledge in relation to their unique social realities. Accordingly, this study adopts a qualitative design in the exploration of the research questions to understand the unique social realities of theatre teaching-artists with the Theatre Department as the case site. Qualitative research studies contribute to both research and practice by allowing researchers to understand the nature of the meanings associated with a specific social phenomenon (Gall et al., 2010) relevant to the experiences of participants within a context (Merriam, 2009). As described by Merriam (2009), a qualitative research methodology, oriented towards understanding the emic perspectives of participants, inquires on the ways they construct their worlds and provides thick descriptions on how they interpret their experiences. Furthermore, the need for qualitative research designs becomes adamant in the absence of adequate theories relevant to a phenomenon (Merriam, 2009). Accordingly, this study followed the recommendation of Risner (2012) to conduct basic qualitative studies in the absence of research on teaching-artists in higher education to unearth blind spots and conceptualize

experiences that emerge out of daily practice and Webster-Wright's (2009) call to seek insights on the complexity of professional learning within the professional contexts.

In sum, a qualitative case study design was adopted to provide an in-depth description and analysis of a single unit which can be characterized by contributing to the reader's understanding (Merriam, 2009). Subsequently, the Theatre Department was selected as the case site with the phenomenon under study being the experiences of diverse theater teaching-artists at the second branch of the Lebanese University's Faculty of Fine Arts as distinctive cases.

This study also extended Anderson's (2004) study on the professional development journey of drama educators in schools, within the relevant theories reviewed on the concept of pedagogical content knowledge in the process of exploring the professional learning journeys of theater educators in tertiary education. The reviewed literature resulted in an initial theoretical understanding that guided the preparation of the interview probes, yet these probes were held provisionally throughout the study allowing for the emergence of new themes and contextually grounded understandings. At an advanced stage of the data analysis, in light of Merriam's (2009) recommendation, the themes from the literature review were compared to the study findings and when deemed applicable guided the organization of the participants' narratives into themes that cut across the data and enabled its effective analysis to answer the raised research questions.

The Context of the Study

As the core of qualitative research lies in how participants experience and give meanings to incidents, any encompassing explanation of experience disregarding the context in which it is embedded would be incomplete (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). This section elaborates on the context of the study, the Theatre Department at the second branch of the Faculty of Fine Arts at the Lebanese University.

The foundation of the Lebanese University, the first and only public higher education institution, emerged out of popular demands in 1951 following the country's independence (الجامعة اللبنانية, 2017). The Lebanese authorities founded the institution with the intention of preserving and developing the nation's cultural and scientific heritage (الجامعة اللبنانية, 2017). Following its founding, the university started to successively expand by establishing additional faculties and institutes (الجامعة اللبنانية, 2017).

Up until 1975, the faculties of the University were located in the same city, the capital Beirut and its suburbs (الجامعة اللبنانية, 2017). The political tension in the country led to the outbreak of the civil war in 1975, reshaping the capital's geographic boundaries. As a result, the facilities of the Lebanese University were heavily destroyed (Bashshur, 1997). Moreover, frontlines hindered the commutation of students and educators between the opposing eastern and western sides of the capital (Bashshur,1997). In other words, the Lebanese people became physically separated based on their cultural and religious backgrounds as people belonging to different sects were demographically displaced. In brief, the intricate civil war splintered the hopes associated with establishing a unified national university (Bashshur, 1996), as the Christians in the eastern side of the capital demanded their share of the university with an independent administration and financing (Bashshur,1997). In view of these demands, the political system formalized the partitioning of the university on the 24th of August 1976 (Bashshur,1997). A decree was issued by the minister of education permitting one branch to operate away from the main campus (Bashshur,1997). With time, the edict triggered different sects to claim their share of the state's university (Bashshur, 1996). Consequently, several decrees were issued legalizing the establishment of different branches in different governorates (Bashshur, 1996).

Concurrently, the private higher education institutions in the country were compulsorily pressed into developing similar action plans to cope with the unfortunate consequences of the civil war (Bashshur, 1996). However, the private academic institutions developed different post-war scenarios. For instance, Saint Joseph University, which was already a decentralized institution, worked on strengthening the relationship between its different decentralized branches and fortifying their individual identities as part of one university while the American University of Beirut merged back its off-campus programs into its main campus (Bashshur, 1996). Thus, the decision of the partitioning of the Lebanese University and its associated decrees, initially considered as temporary emergency measures, ended up influencing the university's long-term plans as different governorates and different religious sects gradually claimed their shares of the university. Such claims made under the banner of balanced development, equity and democracy respectively led to an increase in the number of employees and resulted in what was described by Bashshur (1996) as inner institutional enclaves that developed into distinct institutions unified only by name.

In reference to a newspaper article published in March 2018, the central administration of the Lebanese University formed a political and sectarian committee to study the tenure of educators at the Lebanese University (Hajjar, 2018). The article revealed that the committee has excluded independent applicants that met the tenure criteria and favored ineligible ones on the basis of their political or sectarian affiliations (Hajjar, 2018). Accordingly, the institutional enclaves elaborated by Bashshur back in 1996 might still prevail. For instance, under the pretext of aiming for a sectarian balance, the committee listed applicants that do not meet the academic requirements, some of which do not even hold a Ph.D. (Hajjar, 2018). Consequently, the tenure contracts are being granted irrespective of the real needs of the university's faculties (Hajjar,

2018). The University's 16 faculties enroll about 80,874 students and assign the role of their education to a staff of 5,465 professors out of which about 2,000 are full-time Ph.D. holders across 64 branches (Hugo, 2019). The rising demands of the underprivileged portion of society might have led to the progressive expansion of the national university. Yet the outbreak of the civil war and the decision of partitioning the University and its associated decrees led to the development of inner institutional enclaves put through the influences of politics or sectarianism.

Two branches and thus two different Theater Departments are assigned the role of educating the young aspiring actors in our country. This study inquires about the Theater Department at the second branch of the Faculty of Fine Arts located in Furn el Chebbak, which was once located in the eastern side of the capital. The findings of an unpublished exploratory field inquiry with the director of the Theater Department, conducted in 2017 with the intention of writing a report on instructional supervision for one of the researcher's graduate courses, provide a concrete illustration of how the departments of the national university transformed into inner institutional enclaves. Furthermore, the director of the Theater Department highlighted that although the higher committees at the central administration design the program's curricula, the educators at the different branches independently develop their own syllabi and instructional plans (Achcar, personal communication, October 4, 2017). In addition, the head of the Theater Department at the time highlighted the lack of formal recruiting procedures, the influence of political nepotism on the selection process of instructors, and the lack of institutional professional development incentives (Achcar, personal communication, October 4, 2017). Moreover, the university's tenure process, detached from any form of instructors' evaluation, was transformed into a bargaining process influenced by sectarianism and political nepotism (Achcar, personal communication, October 4, 2017). To rub salt into the wound, tenure contracts are considered

permanent and difficult to terminate (Achcar, personal communication, October 4, 2017).

Luckily, and in spite of the limited institutional professional development incentives which were conveyed as constituting informal mentorship, the departments' teaching-artists were reported to engage in different forms of self-initiated professional development (Achcar, personal communication, October 4, 2017).

Study Participants

In qualitative research, researchers are often less interested in how representative their participants are of the population and are rather concerned about looking for incidents that illustrate distinct concepts (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). Accordingly, purposeful sampling was followed. Such form of sampling allowed the selection of relevant key informants, defined by Gall et al. (2010) as the individuals with specialized knowledge and the emic perspectives that are judged to provide data that inform the studied phenomenon.

To investigate the research questions, purposeful sampling of theater teaching-artists as information rich participants was followed. Accordingly, theater teaching-artists lecturing a range of core theatre courses, with distinctive professional experiences and different levels of seniority were contacted to participate in the research. The core theater related courses include practical and theoretical courses such as: acting, mime, dramaturgy, semiology and directing. In other words, different teaching-artists contributed to this study. Their differences lie in their profiles as artists and educators. For instance, both active artists and moderately practicing performers were contacted out of whom some hold doctoral degrees while others hold Master's degrees. Moreover, an additional difference lies in the level of courses these educators taught, as some taught both graduate and undergraduate courses, while others solely taught undergraduates.

45

In reference to Kelchtermans (1999), Carillo and Baguley (2011) highlighted the impact of the quality of the relationship between the researcher and the participant as essential to the quality and quantity of the data generated. Accordingly, Carillo and Baguley (2011) marked the importance of establishing a relationship between the researcher and participant, before conducting a study that accelerates and promotes understanding. In light of that, we highlight that the researcher personally knows the participants as he has attended their lectures as an educational administration and policy studies graduate student at the American University of Beirut and a Theatre undergraduate student at the Lebanese University. Accordingly, to increase the variability among the participants and to capture the wider possible range of different backgrounds and experiences, the participants in this study were contacted on the basis of their distinctive profiles. The number of participants was limited to 10 theater teaching-artists as a reduced number of participants allowed richer in-depth descriptions of their experiences. Table 3.1 provides an overview on the participant's profiles:

Table 3.1

Distribution of the Theatre Teaching-Artists Participants Based on their Degrees held, Artistic Status, Lecturing Level, Years Teaching in Higher Education, Type of Courses and Tenure Status.

Participant	Degree held	Artistic status	Lecturing level	Years teaching in higher education	Type of courses	Tenure status
1	MA	Active	UG	10-	Practical	Non
2	MA	Active	UG	10-	Practical	Non
3	MA	Active	UG	10+	Practical	Tenured
4	MA	Active	UG	10+	Practical	Tenured

5	Ph.D. Student	Moderately Practicing	UG	10+	Practical & Theoretical	Non
6	Ph.D. Student	Active	UG	10-	Practical	Non
7	Ph.D.	Moderately Practicing	UG	10+	Practical	Tenured
8	Ph.D.	Active	UG/G	10+	Practical & Theoretical	Tenured
9	Ph.D.	Active	UG/G	10+	Practical & Theoretical	Tenured
10	Ph.D.	Moderately Practicing	UG/G	10+	Practical& Theoretical	Tenured

Teaching-artists interviewed have been teaching at the Lebanese University for a range of 4 to more than 20 years and reflected different discipline-based professional identities. Four out of the ten educators already held a Ph.D., two were enrolled in Ph.D. programs and the remaining four had graduate degrees. All the Ph.D. holders had been lecturing at the institution for more than ten years and were tenured, three of them taught both graduate and undergraduate, practical and theoretical courses, while the remaining participant taught only practical courses to undergraduates. The participants enrolled in Ph.D. programs had distinct profiles, one of them has been teaching in higher education for more than ten years, while moderately practicing the art and lecturing both practical and theoretical courses. On the other hand, the other participant had been offering only practical courses for less than ten years yet is an active artist. While both of them weren't tenured, two of the four participants who have been teaching undergraduate courses for more than ten years without having a Ph.D., were. These two participants are active

artists. Similarly, the remaining two of the ten participants who were active actresses gaining

international recognition, have been teaching without a Ph.D. These two practitioners taught

solely practical courses without being tenured. Interestingly at the time of conducting the

interviews, one of these non-tenured, non-Ph.D. holders had resigned from teaching at the

Theatre Department yet continues to teach acting classes at the Department of Cinema.

Data Collection Tools

A pivotal concern in qualitative data is determining where to collect what data, at what

time, and in what way (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). Thus, after purposefully sampling and

contacting the participants to obtain their ethical consent, semi-structured phenomenological

interviews were scheduled and conducted. In reference to Corbin and Strauss (2008) semi-

structured interviews, based on probing and follow-up questions, enable the generation of more

data than interviews restrained by preset specific questions. Such interviews allowed what Gall et

al. (2010) elaborate as the adjustment of the level of language and the order of a set of specific

questions which provided the participants the freedom to answer on their own terms and

provided the interviewer the ability to clarify, add and remove probes (see appendix A for the list

of interview protocol questions, Appendix B for a sample of an alternate protocol with additional

probes). For instance, after few interviews, the researcher removed the probe related to

presenting oneself to students, as many of the participants struggled in answering it.   Moreover,

phenomenological interviews, considered as a qualitative research tool, assume that the data

extracted from the participants' experiences is associated with the ways in which they conduct

their work (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995). In other words, individual interviews that trigger

the participating educators to reflect, enable the extraction of their beliefs concerning their

teaching practices in higher education (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009) allowed the researcher to

contribute the development of empirical knowledge by stepping into what Corbin & Strauss (2008) highlight as the world of participants to be able to view the world from their perspectives.

Data Collection and Analysis Procedures

Qualitative methods of data collection and analysis allow researchers to initiate the data analysis while extracting and exploring concepts during its collection (Gall et al., 2010). Such a method allows participants to provide data that tells about concepts and thus fits for unexplored areas of research (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). Moreover, it provides field researchers with the ability to introduce new interview probes and further investigate topics brought up by participants that prove to be important in the evolution of concepts relevant to the phenomenon under study (Corbin & Strauss, 2008).

Data Collection Procedures

To facilitate the data collection, the teaching-artists were contacted to earn their consent before scheduling an interview. Later to familiarize the participants with the questions, they were provided with an interview protocol, conveying that additional probes would be added if the participants' reports stimulated issues. In the first stage of the data collection, an exploratory pilot interview with one of the participants was conducted to refine and insert alterations in the questions. In the second stage, semi-structured individual interviews along with open-ended questions were scheduled and conducted. The length of the interviews ranged from 45 minutes to two hours and 25-minute and involved discussing the teaching-artist's experiences. Later, the gathered data was transcribed and translated, and later on handed back to some of the participants for member checking and to inquire about some aspects for clarification.

Comparative Analysis

As for the data analysis, the final stage of this study, it involved the analysis of the data collected from the interviews, elaborated by Merriam (2009) as the process of providing answers to the raised research questions and defined by Corbin and Strauss (2008) as the coding process elevating raw data to a conceptual level. This section will include a thorough description of the thematic analysis procedures used by the researcher.

Coding the data. The interpretative procedures began after the first day of data gathering in a circular process that was cumulative and ongoing to identify themes and patterns till the researcher arrived to a point of saturation where concepts were well defined and explained. After adequately reading the transcribed interviews, the researcher generated codes instead of using predetermined one. In other words, open coding was adopted for conceptualizing and coding the data on the basis of its properties and dimensions to allow the reproduction of the participants' replies while preserving the minority's viewpoints (Corbin & Strauss, 2008).

Constant Comparisons. The coding of data was followed by comparative analysis, which allowed the transformation of the codes into a clearer representations of the studies phenomenon. Using the constant comparative method as outlined by Merriam (2009), the coded data were compared to conclude similarities and differences. To illustrate the process, codes from each interview were compared with codes arising from within the same interview and with codes emerging from other interviews. This technique enabled the grouping of codes of different levels of abstraction to constitute concepts and then into categories. Comparisons enable the densification of categories, revealing variations and patterns, and stimulating the reexamination of both the researcher's and the participants' perspectives and assumptions (Corbin, & Strauss, 2008). For instance, through the comparisons of incidents in the data based on similarities or

differences, constant comparisons enabled the generation of themes and the identification of

properties associated with incidents within a single code (see Appendix C). Accordingly, using

within-code comparisons, additional properties and dimensions of the code shed the light on

different aspects of the studied phenomenon (Corbin & Strauss, 2008).

Thematic Analysis. To develop themes and generate a theoretical understanding of the data,

thematic analysis, elaborate by Braun and Clarke (2006) as the grouping of the coded data into

themes was applied. The process of generating themes consisted of ensuring the alignment with

the research questions and that themes were mutually exclusive, and that the data was sensitized

by delicately bringing up underlying meanings and concurrently providing the same level of

conceptual abstraction to all themes (Meriam, 2009).

Theoretical Comparisons. After comparing the themes, the researcher hoped that through

what Meriam (2009) elaborated as reducing, refining and interrelating the themes in a

meaningful way, the analysis of the collected data would lay the foundation to the development

of a model or theory that responds to the peculiarities of the Lebanese context. However, the

main purpose of this qualitative data analysis was to provide an in depth understanding of the

phenomenon of professional learning of theatre teaching-artists in their natural setting.

Accordingly, some reports had to be reconsidered in light of the theoretical framework. The

application of theoretical comparisons, said to reduce the confusion associated with a range of

possible meanings related to the data (Corbin & Strauss, 2008), allowed the researcher to better

understand the participants' realities. This is often used in qualitative research designs, where the

literature and the theoretical frameworks tend to be used as initial guides to research

complementing, extending and verifying findings (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). Accordingly, by

examining the gathered data at the property and dimensional level through deriving comparisons

from experiences and drawing upon the theoretical framework, the analysis attempted to mark possible properties that might have been obscure to lead to a better understanding of the participants' interpretation of the phenomenon and how they formulated their views (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). The last step was the ongoing process of transforming these categories into written memos. The memos were written in a way to include quotes from the interviews and field notes along with the frequencies of responses that were often used as evidence.

Quality Criteria

This section reports on the measures that were taken to meet the quality criteria in this study. As this case study attempts to provide a thick description of a single unit, being the Theatre Department, reliability and validity were cautiously approached through the study's conceptualization, conduction and analysis. However, the terms "validity" and "reliability" of the findings have been elaborated by Corbin & Strauss (2008) as to carry quantitative implications. Accordingly, they favor substituting them with the terms "credibility" and "trustworthiness", achievable through providing insights on the study's phenomenon to contribute to the knowledge base and resonate with the life experiences of participants, researchers and readers (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). The following subsections present the quality criteria that the research study attempted to observe.

Credibility & Trustworthiness

During the analysis process, many possible interpretations emerged highlighting the complexity of developing a single judgment criterion. As qualitative research is based on different perceptions about the multifaceted, ever-changing and highly contextual reality which can't be holistically grasped, assessing the gathered data's credibility in a traditional sense through establishing a clear-cut benchmark is an unfitting farfetched goal (Merriam, 2009;

52

Corbin & Strauss, 2008). Yet, Merriam (2009) suggests several measures to ensure the findings' validity, which include triangulation, member checks, long-term observations and collaborative research. The measures that the researcher took in this study were performing member checks with participants, coding checks, clarifying the theoretical framework that grounds the study, keeping a journal and making oneself familiar with the culture of the institution. First, member checking was performed with some of the participants who consented to check whether the research report was accurate and comprehensive. Such a measure enables sharing the study's findings and initial analysis with participants to check whether the interpretations seem accurate (Merriam, 2009). Second, coding checks were performed by recoding the data after their initial coding and by repeatedly seeking peer coding through which another researcher reviewed the generated codes and themes. It is worth mentioning, that the researcher has spent four academic years at the institution and has attended the classes of nine of the participants. During that time the researcher kept a journal, made observations and got familiar with the culture of the Theatre Department and the institution, which facilitated his ability to report the results of the participants while honoring the meanings of the participants. Moreover, this allowed the researcher to give a thick description of the context of the Theatre Department. Finally, after coding the data and generating the themes, the researcher compared the analyzed data with the study's theoretical framework that guided the analysis. However, this framework remained provisional till the later stages of the analysis to secure the authenticity of the research findings.

Transferability

Even though transferability of research results is not a main goal of qualitative research, it was marked as attainable by Merriam (2009) through providing a thick description, of the case's setting, participants and findings. Similarly, Corbin and Strauss (2008) call researchers to

reflect on the fit of their findings in light of the experiences of professionals, by providing an in-depth description that captures their life's complexity in a contextual, logical, and creative manner which contributes to the knowledge base. In light of Merriam's (2009) recommendations to preserve consistency between the findings of the study and the gathered data, the researcher attempted to clarify their position in terms of what assumptions they had regarding the topic reported in literature review and perform an audit trail that consists of tracing in details how the data was collected, how decisions were made and how findings were generated. Accordingly, the researcher collected data from individual interviews, clarified and reflected on the conceptual framework and kept record of the data collection and analysis processes in a journal.

Study Limitations

An unexpected limitation has emerged in this study and could be addressed in future research. The participants' commitment to the institution frames this limitation. As the generalizability of the results is limited by the methodological choice of this study, it is worth mentioning that most of the participants turned out to have had graduated from the case site, the Lebanese University and marked their commitment to it. On one hand, this might explain their determination to support the teaching process, which could be interpreted as their alma mater enhancing their professional learning. On the other, such shared emotions towards their beloved institution led some of them to defend it, abstain from revealing some of their challenges or ask the researcher to stop recording when they felt their views might harm the institutional image.

CHAPTER IV

RESEARCH FINDINGS

This study aimed at exploring the perceptions of teaching-artists at the department of theatre at the Lebanese University Faculty of Arts, Branch II, on their professional learning journeys leading to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge. The below sections unfold the perceptions of ten different teaching-artists (A) on the nature and characteristics of their career, (B) the initiation of their career path and its constituents, followed by an elaborated section on (C) the factors that contributed to the development of a teaching-artist's pedagogical content knowledge. The chapter is concluded with the reported (D) challenges that teaching-artists encountered along their career journeys and their (E) suggestions for on-the-job learning incentives.

On Being a Teaching-Artist: Nature and Characteristics

This introductory section highlights the interpretations of the participants concerning their profiles as teaching-artists and their conceptualization of such a career path. This section emerged as the researcher allowed the generation of codes instead of using predetermined ones when coding the participants' replies concerning the development of their pedagogic content knowledge. In other words, when probed about the nature of their pedagogic content knowledge, the participants tended to characterize their profiles and career paths rather than providing downright answers to the raised probes. Although, such views weren't directly associated with the raised research questions, they are shared in this section because they provide a comprehensive understanding of how the participants characterize a teaching-artist and how they describe their professional career path in teaching-artistry. Our purpose here is not to evaluate,

judge or compare but rather understand their different perceptions, reported in Table 4.1, on how they characterized (1) a professional career path in teaching-artistry and (2) a successful teaching-artist. To begin with, the participating teaching-artists characterized their unclear career paths by the uniqueness of their dual identity rooted in artistry and teaching, with the latter being identified as an innate talent. Moreover, they elaborated on the characteristics of a successful teaching-artist.

Table 4.1

Frequency of Responses of Theatre Teaching-Artists on the Nature and Characteristics on Being Teaching-Artists

	N=10
Characteristics of the Career Path of Teaching-Artists.	
Uniqueness of a Teaching-artist's dual identity.	10
Artistry as a prerequisite for Teaching.	6
Teaching-Theatre as an Innate Ability.	7
An unclear career path.	5
Characteristics of a Successful Teaching-Artists	
Ongoing Learners.	9
Empathy.	9
Loving.	4
Understanding.	5
Sensitive.	5
Generosity.	3
Motivation.	10
Commitment.	10
Resilience.	3
Self-awareness.	9
Reflective.	6
Humble.	4

Characteristics of the Career Path of Teaching-Artists

This study prompted the teaching-artists to reflect on and describe the nature of their career choices. In light of their responses, this section reports on their career paths' complexity illustrated in a set of characteristics that capture the uniqueness of teaching theatre characterized by a teaching-artist's dual identity which is complex to manifest.

Uniqueness of a Teaching-Artist's Dual Identity. Before the researcher defined a "teaching-artist", all of the 10 participants pointed at the uniqueness of their career path and associated it with a teaching-artist's dual identity, based on their knowledge, beliefs and experiences. The narrative excerpts from participant A0002's interview illustrate this view of a teaching-artist' dual identity:

I don't separate my two roles who come hand in hand, teaching acting has to do with being a good actor... These two roles are tied to one another in my perception of what an actor is. Maybe others see it differently, but I find both to be related and I feel they are integrated.

The majority of the participants shared such views, as they have referred to a teaching-artist's unique identity and described it as simultaneously rooted in both areas of study. Out of these participants, Y0004 pointed at the role's complexity, stating: "I realized that teaching is a huge responsibility, as it has to do with the ability to transfer my beliefs and what I learned from my teachers and experiences." On the other hand, participant N0003 expressed this duality by highlighting the need for teaching-artists to find a sort of equilibrium between their teaching and their practical work as actors: "You need to find a sort of equilibrium between teaching and your practical work as an actor, both are important yet I'm against someone teaching without having practiced the art form." Accordingly, the next section targets the reported views concerning practicing artistry as a prerequisite to teaching theatre and teaching being more as an innate skill.

Artistry as a Prerequisite for Teaching. Successfully teaching theatre is associated with the educators' practical artistic experiences which reinforce their understanding of the field's prominent theoretical work. More than half of the participants, six of them, identified a practical career in acting as a prerequisite for a career in teaching-artistry. For instance, participant A0002 plainly reported "you can't teach acting if you were never a practitioner, an actor." Similarly, K0009 identified a teaching-artist's experience in acting as crucial for teaching this art form, highlighting that understanding the prominent theoretical work in the field is rooted in practice. This is also made clear in the following excerpts from participant N0003's interview: "institutions hiring artists should be convinced that recruited artists should have something to offer, a certain expertise worth sharing and this is not related to having a Ph.D." Together these findings frame theatre teaching to be rooted in practice and exceeding an educator's academic qualifications.

Teaching-Theatre as an Innate Ability. When probed about their pedagogical content knowledge, the teaching-artists were unable to provide definite answers and discussed the teaching of theater as a complex innate ability. Over half of the participants, seven out of ten, have associated teaching with an innate skill. Accordingly, they've illustrated teaching-theatre as encompassing innate abilities that exceed an educator's academic qualifications and artistic expertise. Take for example this field note passage describing the views of participant A0002 on being a successful teaching-artist*:* "I guess there is something way more beneficial than our academic studies and degrees. It's something innate. A lot of actors teach, and they do so really good, but you feel there is something missing." Furthermore, participant D0007 elaborated on the role's difficulty by reporting that some successful artists fail in transferring their knowledge or experience, while, some less successful artists succeed in teaching their students what they might

have failed at. This hints that merely practicing the art of acting doesn't guarantee a successful career in teaching it, what participant L0010 agreed on and elaborated as:

I don't believe that all artists can teach, maybe very few artists can. Let's say it requires a different talent, if one has a degree in literature, they might not be able to teach literature... I don't think all artists can teach and I don't think all good teachers are good artists.

The narratives of participant M0006 set apart a teaching-artist's dichotomous roles, the objectives of each and reveals that not all artists innately possess the competencies of pedagogues:

There is a big difference between a pedagogue and an artist, we had important teachers who weren't pedagogues. Artists set targets they desire whereas pedagogues set their students as their target and want them to attain the best they can.

Similarly, participant K0009 reported that teaching theatre is a difficult transfer between humans, a transfer which can't be learned in books. Moreover, she reported being influenced by a teaching-artist who hasn't graduated from high school and identified him as gifted in connecting with students:

I guess teaching arts, specifically theatre, has to do with communication, for instance one of my educators was a gifted artist that didn't talk much as a teacher. He didn't even have a baccalaureate and used to say that he doesn't even deserve enrolling in this faculty as a student. Yet, he had his ways to communicate with and transfer his energy to students. It might be that I haven't developed these skills yet. Some people might have such skills innately. Maybe the ability to transfer knowledge is an innate skill.

In addition, respondents agreed that transferring one's knowledge, experience and beliefs remains complex and requires an innate skill that leads to the development of the students' artistic

skills enabling them to creatively create. This was mirrored in participant's A0002 views, who elaborated on the need for teaching-artists to provide students with opportunities to engage in the creation process through arts. In conclusion, teaching theatre is viewed as rooted in understanding and practicing two different fields and thus encompasses the teaching-artist's knowledge, expertise and beliefs as well as an innate ability to teach.

An Unclear Career Path. Half of the participants who have illustrated the uniqueness of the teaching art process, reported the unavailability of a clear-cut formula that enables a career in teaching theatre. For instance, participant Y0004 highlights: "my knowledge and experience as an artist impact my teaching, but I don't know exactly how. It is not a matter of adding up ingredients." Such uncertainty in providing predefined steps leading towards a career in teaching theatre is apparent in the views of participant L0010, who highlighted:

> There is no one correct system ... Some artists have set methods, conducted research and put on performances but this isn't set in stone, art is very personal and depends on those practicing and receiving it.

Although practicing the art of acting was reported to naturally enable the grasping of knowledge related to the field, participants have reached conclusions asserting an uncertain career path that shapes a teaching-artist's dichotomous roles, different approaches, beliefs, knowledge and experiences. Moreover, participants agreed that teaching-theatre is a complex career as it encompasses a teaching-artist's self and is accordingly subjective and can't be set in stone.

Characteristics of Successful Teaching-Artists

The responses of the participants reflect a sort of a group awareness on the characteristics of a successful "teaching-artist". These participants agreed that teaching-artists

should be (a) ongoing learners who demonstrate high levels of (b) empathy, (c) motivation and (d) self-awareness.

Ongoing Learning. There was a remarkable agreement among teaching-artists, nine out of ten participants, on the importance of being ongoing learners committed to professional development. Two out of them highlighted that the key for a successful career as teaching-artists lies in continuously considering oneself as a learner, take for instance this field note excerpt from participant M0006: "dare to be a student and you'll be a great teacher." This participant added that with years of experience a teaching-artist realizes that his/her knowledge and experience might not be enough and requires advancement. Participant S0001 reported similar views: "I believe If I stay stagnant, I might rust. It is important to continuously experience new stuff." In light of the above, four teaching artists reflected in their narratives on their curious nature and their anticipated engagement in the discovery of the unknown. Participant's A0002 illuminates on the above stating: "curiosity is in my character: I'm in a constant state of searching." In brief the participants believe that effective teaching-artists are to be curious ongoing learners engaged in an endless process of self-discovery.

Empathy. There is wide agreement that a teaching-artists needs to demonstrate empathy. Nine out of ten participants reported forms of empathy, which include being (i) loving, (ii) understanding, (iii) sensitive and (iv) generous.

Loving. Four teaching artists reported the importance of loving one's students which supports the successful teaching-learning process. Such were the views of participant S0001: "A university student is just like any child who needs to know and feel that you love him/her and that you're not competing with them. I truly love my students." Similarly, participant M0006

highlighted that teaching-artists should be compassionate as they deal with the souls of their students.

Understanding. Half of the participants agreed on the importance of understanding students away from making judgments to be able to connect with them and support their learning paths. Such skills were reported to develop with time, as is clear in participant's C0008 narratives: "I'm now more of a pedagogue in how I'm able to understand the different students, their needs and their experiences. I'm more open and able to understand them ... This has developed with time."

Sensitivity. Half of the teaching-artists reported the importance of being sensitive and delicate while dealing with students. Participant K0009 reported views illustrate the matter: "I should always be sensitive; we're dealing with very precious crystals." Other participants highlighted that as actors/directors and educators deal with talented humans it requires them to be transparent and delicate. In light of that teaching-artists can either support or limit the development of their students.

Generosity. Three of the participants agreed on the importance of a teaching-artist's generosity in the sense of sharing their knowledge and experience. This is clearly reported by participant C0008 who called successful teaching-artists to be generous in transferring all what they have acquired to students without any restrictions. Similarly, participant N0003 reported as problematic the reality of having stingy teaching-artists who rather than broadening their students' abilities, they tend to limit them: "Unfortunately, some artists feel they're the best and tend to give their students their minimum, as they believe their students will not accomplish anything."

Motivation. There is a total agreement among the participating teaching-artists on the importance of being motivated, as the participants reported the need of a teaching-artist's (i) commitment to the teaching profession and to the institution and their (ii) resilience to teach.

Commitment. Most of the participants agreed on the importance of committing to the profession, 7 out of ten participants, while half of the participants reported on the importance of commitment to the institution. Interestingly, four of them illustrated an advanced form of commitment to both the profession and the institution as they agree on the importance of loving one's career and role. Take for example this excerpt from the participant M0006:

> I love what I do and feel very lucky to be here, I feel blessed having this job as it's my passion. You decide on a career in arts because you love arts, so in my case I'm able to practice my passion and enjoy my time while securing a living. I don't see myself doing anything else.

I do not want to give the impression that all the teaching-artists openly acknowledged commitment as an essential trait for a teaching-artist, however a majority of them, seven participants, reported facets of commitment which includes responsibly dealing with students and committing to the idea of teaching. This is clear in the following excerpts from participant's A0002 interview:

> It is your commitment to what you teach, to the idea of teaching, and its importance. I teach acting, which I consider sacred… as it touches the depth of the human…I tend to remind myself of why I'm here and respect my duties, I really don't know, I am committed to this and I just give it all my heart.

Moreover, half of the participants reported committing to the institution in a way or another. Three of them highlighted feeling gratitude towards what the institution has offered

them early on in their careers, out of which participant K0009 reported considering oneself

unified with the institution and feeling responsible towards it which as reported, dictates taking

initiatives that stimulate the university's development through one's self-initiated learning:

Our role isn't just lecturing in our classrooms. Not everything is related to financial

resources. Accordingly, I don't want to ask myself what the institution is offering me, but

what am I as an effective element in the institution giving it.

In light of the above statement and as two teaching-artists reported that non-tenured

educators get paid once every two years, these teaching-artists can be described as intrinsically

motivated. Even the only two out of the ten participants who haven't received their

undergraduate training at the premises of the Lebanese University, reported similar commitment

and motivation as one of them reported working on ameliorating the university's curriculum

while the second participant stated: "at private universities students make you feel purchased to

teach them, whereas over here the students come to learn, and I feel challenged to offer them

whatever they need as I believe it is our duty and their right."

Resilience. Three of the participants conveyed being resilient in their teaching and

demonstrating a willingness to do so. For instance, K0009 stated: "as long as we have the will in

this environment and the creativity everything can happen with or without financial resources."

Such views hint on the role of collegiality, which will be discussed in another section.

Self-awareness. Most of the participants, nine of them, agreed that teaching-artists

possess self-awareness skills such as being (i) reflective and monitoring one's ego through being

(ii) humble.

Reflective. More than half of the participants, six of them, reported on the importance of

reflecting on their beliefs, knowledge and experiences to reconsider what they might conceive as

true. Participant N0003 associated such a skill to being a pedagogue, stating: "I guess you can't become a pedagogue if you don't reflect back on how you learned and why you learned." Participant S0001 elaborates such views by stating that both actors and educators should be free and unrestricted to be able to experiment and later on reflect on their experiments.

Humble. Four out of the participants reported that a teaching-artist needs to regulate his/her ego, framing being "humble" as a key to unblock students, unleash their potential and enable transmission on a human level. Such were the views of participant C0008 who highlighted:

> I worked on erasing my ego as an actor and educator in the classroom to be able to better observe the students and offer them what they need… understanding the student is crucial for us to know what to offer them.

A Teaching-Artist's Professional Learning Path: Initiation and Constituents

This section addresses the second research question explicating the professional learning path (stages from being novice and beyond) that theater teaching-artists follow. Although a career in teaching-artistry is complex to manifest, this section elaborates the participants' perspectives on the (1) reasons that initiated such a career path and later on (2) the main constituents which pave the teaching-artists' career path. This section is concluded with the participants'' views concerning their (3) their ongoing professional learning.

On the Initiation of their Career Paths

Various factors influencing the initiation of a career in teaching theatre were reported by this study's participants. Table 4.2.1 provides an overview on these factors. Due to this profession's dichotomous nature, this section groups these factors under two main subtitles. While the first (a) discusses the reasons behind the participant's decision to major in the arts and

more specifically in acting or directing, the second elaborates on (b) the factors that influenced the artists' transition into academia at the national higher education institution.

Table 4.2.1

Frequency of Responses of Teaching-Artists on the Initiation of their Career Paths

	N=10
Reasons for studying theatre.	
Feeling an artistic urge.	6
Being previously exposed to an art.	8
Other factors.	5
Reasons for pursuing teaching at the University level	
Coincidently joining the higher education teaching profession.	6
Being contacted by the University.	8
A continuation of previous teaching experiences.	7
As an alternative to an uncertain path of a professional artistic career in the country.	3

Reasons for Studying Theatre. The teaching-artists emphasized in their responses (i) initially feeling an artistic urge and (ii) being previously exposed to theatre and other art forms which lead them into an artistic career. Moreover, (iii) a minority reported experiencing other factors that favored or hindered their career plans.

Feeling an Artistic Urge. While the participants in this study reported different reasons for studying theatre or aiming for a career in the field, more than half of them, six out of ten participants reported feeling an artistic urge to express oneself through the arts. For instance, participant N0003 reported enrolling as a student in the department of theatre aiming to share his/her beliefs with others, while three participants highlighted that their artistic urge emerged in their childhood, out of which participant C0008 stated: "I guess it's something you start feeling as a child and you'd want to pursue till the end." In view of that, an artistic urge or desire

initiates a teaching-artist's artistic career, the following section reports factors that are perceived to nourish these artistic tendencies.

Being Previously Exposed to an Art. The vast majority of the participants, eight out of ten, reported being previously exposed to an art form as a major influence for their career choice. For instance, participant L0010, who had the chance to participate in a student production before graduating from high school, highlighted:

> In my last year in high school, my neighbor who was studying communication arts … and needed an actress for her graduation play… I acted in her play and fell in love with the whole experience and knew that I wanted to study arts.

Three other participants highlighted similar narratives, associating previously being exposed to theatre as a major influence for their career choice. By way of contrast, the remaining four participants reported being previously exposed to other art forms such as puppetry, dance and cinema before enrolling for a degree in theatre. Take for example this passage, where participant N0003, reports:

> Back in the days the Lebanese University was the only institution offering artistic concentrations such as acting and painting. I wanted to study cinema, I had a camera and wanted to study cinema. I was told at the Lebanese University had such a major, when I went to check it out I figured that there was only a theatre program, so I applied.

Whether enrolling in a theatre program was an initial or an alternative career plan, teaching-artists appear to nourish their artistic impulses leading them into an artistic career by being exposed to various art forms.

Other Factors. In addition to feeling an artistic urge or being exposed to theatre and other art forms, Lebanese teaching-artists reported experiencing parental resistance or coincidently

initiating a career in the arts. Three participants highlighted that their parents didn't fully support their career choice, while few others described their decision to study theatre as a coincidence, two of which traced such a decision to the Lebanese Civil war. Finally, one participant highlighted a career in theatre as a broad and unrestrictive career choice fearing being stuck with one narrow field and interestingly stating: "I wanted to be everyone and couldn't imagine myself studying a single concentration, I wanted several concentrations and everything but not one single field." In sum, while the majority of the participants highlighted initiating a career in theater after being exposed to an art form or feeling an innate artistic urge to express oneself, a few reported forging their path through resistance and others reported coincidently landing on that choice.

Reasons for Pursuing Teaching Theatre. Many of the teaching-artists participating in this study, described their shift into teaching at higher education as (i) unplanned and as a(ii) response to being offered an opportunity to join a university teaching staff. Furthermore, these recruited artists reported pursuing a teaching career as a continuation of (iii) previous teaching experiences, while a minority reported (iv) shifting into academia after experiencing un-contentment in the artistic scene.

Coincidently Joining the Higher Education Teaching Profession. More than half of the participants, 6 to be exact, reported joining the higher education teaching profession by chance, 2 of which highlighted the importance of grasping the opportunity. The following narrative, from participant N0003 interview illuminates the matter:

> I never imagined teaching as a career... It happened by chance as I passed by the university
>
> to say hello to my teachers and ran into the head of department, who offered me the chance
>
> to join the university as a staff member to teach.

To conclude, while the university head hunts reputable artists, rarely do these theatre artists preplan a career in teaching-artistry.

Being Offered an Opportunity by the University. The majority of the participants, 8 out of 10, reported being contacted as reputable artists and offered a teaching position by acquaintances at the Lebanese University to teach at the institution. Take the case of participant L0010 who stated: "I was asked to apply, and I applied." The other participants reported similar narratives, out of which participant K0009 highlighted that the institution recruited trustworthy artists and later on stated:

> I was asked to teach at the University when my career as a stage and television actress was at its peak, so I didn't join the university as an educator because I wasn't finding work in the field, not at all.

A Continuation of Previous Teaching Experiences. More than half of the participants, seven of them to be exact, reported previously teaching in other academic institutions, four of which started teaching theatre at schools. Moreover, two of these six participants reported previously teaching theatre related courses at private higher education institutions. Three others had previously taught aspiring teaching-artists at their current institution in the department of education where the theatre program has been founded and later on paused. As an illustration, participant D0007 stated: "I started teaching in the Department of Education…, where I taught aspiring theatre-educators… back then the Department of Education had introduced a new program for teaching theatre". In view of that, only one of the ten participants reported graduating from the Faculty of Education with a specialized degree in teaching theater, and one other participant reported being trained for their role as a teaching-artist in his/her pre-service training received abroad. While the majority of the recruited teaching-artists had previous

teaching experiences, only a minority had a specialized training oriented towards a role in teaching-artistry.

As an Alternative to an Uncertain Path of a Professional Artistic Career in the Country. Few participants, three teaching-artists, reported reasons associated with the nature of the unstable artistic career scene in the country, where some joined the teaching profession for security reasons or after experiencing a sort of un-contentment. Such was the case for participant L0010 who reported:

> I knew when I was younger, that practicing theatre in Lebanon won't pay my bills. Having a graduate degree that will allow me to teach would pay my bills and allow me to fund my own plays. So that was the first practical reason… teaching would help me secure a living.

While participant B005 also reported joining the teaching profession for security reasons, they related that they pursued teaching after feeling un-contentment with the local artistic scene. Such views come in congruence with those of participant C0008, who viewed teaching as a natural career profession after earning a Ph.D.:

> It was natural after graduating with a Ph.D. to feel directed into academia. To be honest, I favored a career in Academia…after studying and living abroad for 7 years, I came back and found that the theatre scene in the country had changed a lot from what I had known it to be, so I decided to get away and shift into academia.

In sum, while the majority of the teaching-artists participating in this study reported joining the teaching profession after being contacted by the university, more than half of them had previous sporadic experiences with teaching, while just a minority reported being well prepared for their roles as educators in their pre-service training programs. It is worth mentioning that participants reported experiencing dissatisfaction with the local artistic scene and that the

latter has played a key role in their decision to join the teaching profession. Many considered such a career decision a move towards more job security, aiming to secure a living.

Constituents of the Teaching-artists' Career Paths

After discussing the reported factors urging these teaching-artists to initiate a career in the arts and in academia, this section elaborates on the milestones in their teaching-artists' career path, as reported in Table 4.2.2. Initially these teaching-artists received an (a) artistic pre-service training before (b) developing their experiences as actors or as educators and being recruited as theatre-teaching artists at the Lebanese University. Interestingly teaching-artists tended to report (c) paving their own professional learning journeys through engaging in what can be elaborated as various forms of self-initiated formal and informal learning opportunities.

Table 4.2.2

Frequency of Responses of Teaching-Artists on the Constituents of their Career Paths

	N=10
Pre-service training.	8
Prior Professional Experiences.	
Prior professional experiences in the arts	8
Prior experiences as educators.	8
On-Going Professional Learning	
Engaging in Formal Professional Learning.	5
Attending workshops.	3
Academic research/degree programs.	5
Informal Opportunities.	10
Reading.	8
Watching plays.	6
Actively engaging in one's professional artistic work.	6
Engaging in a community of artists.	3
Reflection as an alternative form of professional learning.	10

Pre-Service Training. A teaching-artist's preservice training impacts their careers. There was a wide agreement among the teaching-artists as eight of the ten participants referred to the importance of their pre-service training experiences, whether in the arts, or in education. When asked about the major constituents that influenced their careers, half of the participants referred to their training as theatre students. These teaching-artists conveyed benefiting from their artistic training, learning from their educators and the courses they were exposed to. Take for example this narrative excerpt from participant's M0006 interview, who reported being influenced as an educator by his/her teachers:

> I was very lucky to have had incredible instructors. I still share with my students what I was able to learn from X, Y and Z of my teachers… I believe nothing influenced me as a teacher more than my own teachers. I was very lucky to be their student.

On the other hand, others such as participant Y0004 highlighted the transferability of an artist's pre-service training through the transferability of unique skills, such as observation, between drama and education stating: "those who study drama, study characters, different characters. Accordingly, our observations as artist is a major skill that supports us into becoming artists, and later educators." On another note, only two of ten participants reported being trained as teaching-artists, either being exposed to educational theories or leading a classroom under the supervision of teaching-artists, as is clear in the following excerpt from participant D0007 interview:

> In our first year studying directing we were assigned as students a day to lead an hour of exercises... after leading a session we used to reflect and listen to the feedback of our teachers on what we were doing, discuss the purpose of every activity and the challenges we faced.

Moreover, three of the participants stressed on the impact of their pre-service trainings abroad, while two of them highlighted feeling well prepared for their role and at ease with what they identified as a well-developed knowledge base and skills, the third who had received his/her undergraduate studies at the Faculty of Fine Arts and later on his/her graduate studies abroad identified that the local programs focused more on the practical side of their preparation as artists and somehow overlooked the theoretical aspects of an actor. Accordingly, after reporting feeling theoretically underqualified, participant N0003 stated: "from a theoretical perspective, I discovered that we weren't exposed to a lot. For us, we were only exposed to Stanislavski, however abroad I was able to discover other big directors."

Prior Professional Experiences. In addition to their pre-service trainings, the teaching-artists participating in this study highlighted the impact of their prior professional experiences in the (i) arts as actors or stage directors and (ii) in academia as educators.

Prior Professional Experiences in the Arts. Most of the teaching-artists, eight out of ten, reported the importance of their practical experiences as actors or directors, developing what they identified as a cumulative "baggage" worth sharing with students. While three of them referred to their professional experiences on stage in artistic productions with their teachers or mentors, participant A0002 reported a totality of integrated artistic experiences stating: "my past experiences as an artist and as a human helped me grow and mature. So, it is the whole set of piled experiences." Such views hint again to the profession's integrated duality. Furthermore, the teaching-artist's practical experiences are perceived as favored over book knowledge, as is clear in the following excerpt from N0003's interview: *"what is more important than reading books is practicing what you've read"* as it enables better an understanding of the students, for instance participant M0006 stated:

Acting and living experiences as an actress allows me to better direct my students, as I've lived the challenges actors are exposed to... As a director I learned to set goals, deal with texts and find esthetics to stage these texts, this allows me to know how to set a target and helps me train and direct my students.

Prior Experiences as Educators. In addition to the teaching-artists' artistic experiences, more than half of the teaching-artists, eight of them, reported an agreement on the impact of their previous experiences as educators, whether in schools or in other higher education institutions. Half of the participants who reported having previous teaching experiences, four of them, reported teaching in schools. They related that they taught different age groups in schools, and three of them highlighted the differences between teaching adults and teaching kids. Take for example this field note passage from participant K0009: "Teaching at the university level was more serious than teaching at a school, as I had to deal with adults" and later identifying feeling more at ease while dealing with adults.

More than half of the participants reported prior experiences as educators in other higher education institutions. They explained that they had previously taught in a higher education institution, three of which had taught theatre related courses at the Department of Education, when it used to offer a specialized program for theatre educators, out of which participant D0007 highlighted: "Back in 1996, I started teaching in the Department of Education, I taught aspiring theatre-educators… back then the Department of Education had introduced a new program for "teaching theatre". There, I started experiencing my passion and skills in teaching". The other three participants had taught in private higher education institutions in the country.

Although a career path in teaching-artistry is hard to manifest, the participants reported that it emerges from one's artistic urges and is rooted in a teaching-artist's dual career in artistry

and academia, influenced by their pre-service training and prior professional experiences in the arts and as educators. Accordingly, such a career path heavily depends on the sum of learning opportunities and experiences that contribute to the learning of teaching-artists. The following section elaborates on the teaching-artists' professional learning journeys that contribute to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge.

On-Going Professional Learning

As teaching-artists can't separate any facet of their dual identity, their professional learning constitutes their advancement in the arts, in academia and as human beings. All the participants agreed on continuously learning, staying updated with the emerging advancements and reported handling their own professional learning journeys. Out of which, two participants reported benefiting from the lack of institutional supervision and daring to experiment. The following sections elaborate on the forms of (a) formal and (b) informal professional learning that teaching-artists experience on the job or willingly engage in.

Engaging in Formal In-Service Professional Learning. The participants agreed on the impact of formal training opportunities whether in (i) attending workshops or (ii) enrolling in academic programs to pursue higher degrees on their professional learning as teaching-artists.

Attending Workshops. Three of the participants, after reporting a lack of institutional training opportunities, reported taking the responsibility and engaging in workshops oriented towards the development of their artistic and/or pedagogical skills. All three participants discussed how these training opportunities impacted their careers, while participant M0006 elaborated on existent constraints:

The workshops we attend from time to time are very important... However, time and money might be a barrier for that, but even when some workshops are for free, I might not have the time to attend as I have a family.

Although the majority of the teaching-artists had previously elaborated on the need for reconsidering their beliefs and upraising their knowledge and skills, only a minority reported willingly engaging in training opportunities and identified time and financial limitations.

Academic Research/Degree Programs. Although half of the teaching-artists reported engaging in research as a form of professional development that impacts their teaching and allows them to better understand the courses they're teaching, only two of them elaborated on academic research. For instance, participant S0001 elaborated pursuing a Ph.D. on acting in the Lebanese context and attempting to train actors who can succeed in their career, participant D0007 highlighted publishing studies stating: "I always work on publishing, not locally though and without any supervision. I collaborate with universities abroad and publish". Furthermore, only three teaching-artists reported enrolling in graduate or postgraduate programs after being recruited as teaching-artists.

Engaging in Informal On-the-Job Professional Learning. The majority of the teaching-artists conveyed that the nature of their roles as teaching-artists contributes to their professional learning. In light of that the following section elaborates on how these teaching-artists learned on the job and engaged in various form of self-initiated informal professional learning opportunities that accompany the assignment of their responsibilities which include (i) reading, (ii) watching plays, (iii) upholding their professional work as artists, (iv) engaging in a community of artists and most importantly (v) engaging in self-evaluative reflections.

Reading. The participants conveyed a wide agreement on engaging in reading as a form of ongoing professional learning which broadens their knowledge and supports their dual career. Eight participants reported continuously engaging in reading what participant K0009 identified as his/her "daily bread" that enriches one's senses and imagination. While some highlighted the importance of reading theatrical repertoires, others highlighted their engagement in reading plays, psychology, literature, philosophy and the methods of renowned artists such as Stanislavski, Chekov and Meyerhold. Interestingly, participant K0009 highlighted the impact of rereading the contributions of renowned artists:

> I still read, and reread, for instance last year I reread Chekov and David Zinger. We have to go back to these big names just like we go back to the bible, the more we stack experience the more we understand these big practitioners the better. At the beginning of your career you can't understand them neither as an artist nor as a student, you only get these books when you start practicing, after all each book is the essence of their experiences. If you haven' experienced acting, you won't understand their work.

Watching Plays. The majority of the participants, six out of them, elaborated on the importance of watching plays. Attending all sorts of performances, whether directed by known artist or students, was framed as offering teaching-artists a cultural wealth, such is made clear in the following excerpt from participant L0010: "I think every play is a whole new world, it teaches you so much as you are delving into a different world, a different genre, a different creativity."

Actively Engaging in One's Professional Artistic Work. More than half of the participants identified upholding their careers as artists as a major factor contributing to their ongoing development. These practicing artists assigned to teach practical subjects are capable of

living and sharing practical experiences with their students. In other words, the more teaching-artists learn and transfer their artistic skills, beliefs and knowledge the more they can impact their students. Such is clearly illustrated in the views of participant L0010 who's engaged in the field as a director, this teaching-artist reported the benefit of dealing with different mentalities and capabilities on different artistic projects which developed her capabilities to spot and deal with rising problems. On the other hand, participant K0009 described being an actor as a 24/24 thing which requires ongoing physical activity and training, which she identified as artistic rituals that are locally lacking yet binding for practicing artists.

Engaging in a Community of Artists. Only three of the teaching-artists elaborated on the impact of collaborating with other artists. While participant M0006 highlighted the impact of the Department's positive energy among colleagues and reported engaging in a form of constructive collaboration with a colleague, the two others reported learning from engaging with other artists on artistic projects. Interestingly, participant D0007 reported joining a European organization for teaching-artists, allowing practitioners from different countries to cooperate in a form of residency enabling transmission and experimentation away from an academic system of assessment. This participant stated: "such an experience strengthens both of my roles as an artist and an educator. This helped me develop my teaching and creative skills."

Reflection as an Alternative form of Professional Learning. All of the participants reported the impact of reflection on their professional learning. While only four participants used the term "reflection" the others unintentionally described it. Take for example participant A0002 who reported: "I try to observe what is happening, I try to repeat it in my head and assess what went right or wrong". Similarly, other participants after highlighting that they're always plenty to be learned, reported engaging in what was identified as never ending questioning a sensation

illustrated by one of them as that of a "prehistoric man searching for a way to light up a fire".

Such questioning enables a deeper understanding of oneself, experiences and knowledge and was reported to include questions such as: "why is this technique not working with this actor? Why did I achieve a certain objective with a certain individual while others haven't? what blocked the students' learning experience".

On another note, three participants reported engaging in self-evaluative reflections at the end of an academic year or semester in an attempt to assess their performance, what participant N0003 identified as an opportunity to "learn for the coming years" adding that reflection is as mandatory for educators after a class as to artists after a performance. On a final note, participant B0005 identified that a teaching-artist's success lies in knowing one's field, reflecting on their knowledge base and being able to practically apply it.

In light of the above, reflection marks a teaching-artists' ability to incorporate the formal and informal learning opportunities that outline their professional journeys. Moreover, it points at the ability to purposefully fit in their knowledge base, readings, training, experiences, practices in the process enabling the development of their pedagogical content knowledge. Accordingly, the following section illuminates on the factors that develop a teaching-artist's pedagogical content knowledge.

The Factors Contributing to the Development of Pedagogical Content Knowledge

The teaching-artists participating in this study highlighted the complexity of teaching theatre as they associated the process leading to the development of their teaching practices to (1) their unique identities and (2) their students. Moreover, they associate the teaching of theatre to (3) planning the transmission process on the basis of integrating theory in practice and (4)

enabling joint experimentations with students, which marks the subject's uniqueness. Table 4.3

groups these different factors, along with the frequencies of the participants' responses.

Table 4.3

*Frequency of Responses of Teaching-artists on the f*actors developing their Pedagogical content

knowledge

	N=10
Embracing the Teaching-Artist.	
The Teaching-Artist's Integrated Self.	8
Teaching one's experience: protecting the students from the troubles the educators lived.	8
Transferring the skills of actors into academia.	7
Teaching impacts a teaching artist.	4
Embracing the Students.	
Catering for the Students.	10
Learning from students.	10
Embracing Planning the Teaching of Theatre.	
Setting Academic Objectives.	8
Integrating theoretical and practical work.	5
Enabling mutual experimentation.	7
Creativity.	4
Ongoing Learners	4
Embracing the Uniqueness of the Theatre's Pedagogical content knowledge.	5

Embracing the Teaching-Artist

    All the teaching-artists conveyed integrating one's self into their teaching, basing their

lessons on their identity which encompasses their knowledge, beliefs and experiences. The

participants agreed that teaching is holistic associated to (a) the teaching-artist's self, their (b)

experiences and (c) their artistic experiences. Simultaneously, (d) teaching reciprocally affects

and is affected by a teaching-artist's self.

The Teaching-Artist's Integrated Self. Eight of the teaching-artists reported integrating one's self into the teaching process, a transmission identified by K0009 as transference of the "essence" of a teaching-artist's experience and discoveries. Similarly, participant L0010 reported developing and transferring what has made sense to them from their experience and the different methods they have been exposed to. Furthermore, several participants agreed that the educator's self encompasses the artist, their personalities, who they are as parents and how they were raised as kids, or in other words their identity as humans. Accordingly, teaching necessitates the integration of a totality of their learning experiences, passion and ideas. The above is clearly illustrated in the following excerpt where participant A0002 reported:

> I do not separate the human in me from the actor and the teacher, everything that I have worked since my university projects up until now, they were all opportunities for me to learn, it is the piling of these experiences, since day one, how I searched for who I am as an artist and as a human in all of these opportunities, these things that I lived. I can't specify a single aspect as it is this integrated compilation. Acting is not just a career but a way of life, it's how you live, breathe and dream…I don't know how to put it into words.

While it has been reported in a previous section that the transmission occurring between teaching-artists and students necessitates the development of the educators' personal skills, it is closely associated with their artistic, pedagogic and human identities. Accordingly, the following section reports on how these teaching-artists integrate their experiences into their lessons to prevent their students from the challenges they have been previously exposed to.

Teaching One's Experience: Protecting Students from the Troubles They Lived.
Eight of the ten participants reported attempting to safeguard their students from the challenges

they were forced to live as learners or as practicing artists. These teaching artists aim on sharing with their students the easier paths they've discovered. For instance, participant L0010 reported:

I used whatever projects or methods that made sense to me and made me understand what my educators were saying, on the other hand I didn't use whatever didn't make sense to me and tried to improve it in a way to make it accessible for my students.

As is clear in seven of the narratives of the participants who graduated from the institution, the teaching-artists enthusiastically provide their students with more support and better learning experiences. This is clearly reflected in the following excerpt from participant K0007 who stated: "I want to give this place more than it has given me as a student." In fact, four participants agreed with participant B0005 who reported being able to formulate their own synthesis that would prevent their students the troubles they experienced:

I'm able to predict the challenging experiences the students might encounter. I'm someone who remembers the challenging experiences and the difficulties I had encountered as an actress without being able to formulate a clear call for help.

While such an excerpt illustrates the teaching-artists' determination to support the transmission process by remembering and integrating their experiences it illustrates their ability to professionally learn by engaging in reflection and developing their pedagogical content knowledge accordingly. More to the point, the following section suggests another effective outcome of a teaching-artist's reflection.

Transferring the Skills of Actors into Academia. More than half of the participants, seven of the teaching-artists, reported transferring skills they've acquired as theatre students and artists into academia. For instance, participant C0008 highlighted that "there's a certain discipline for actors and directors that applies on educators lecturing." Other participants agreed

on transferring various skills they've initially developed as artists into academia. These teaching-artists reported the following skills: understanding different characters in drama that affects how they approach their students, being able to work in a group, listening and communication skills, connecting with their audience, acting skills, skills of ongoing learners and finally their creative capacity what participant B0005 elaborated as: "the baggage" enabling an educator to be in control of their techniques and their interchangeable knowledge base:

> In theatre you are crafting your product on stage in front of your audience and this requires the integration of all of an artist's skills. Similarly, in academia, you should carry your knowledge and experiences with you all the time.

In light of that, teaching-artists holistically transfer their skills as artists, pedagogues and human, verifying that a teaching-artist integrates his/her unique and unified identity in the process contributing to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge.

Teaching Impacting a Teaching-Artist. While the majority of the participants previously conveyed that a teaching-artist's self and dual identity influences their teaching, half of them reported that teaching reciprocally impacted their characters or their artistic identities. For instance, three of them reported becoming more lenient, attentive and understanding while the remaining two highlighted how their interaction with students impacted their artistic careers. For example, participant D0007 who reported feeling an urge as a teaching-artist to stay updated as an artist. Similarly, participant M0006 reported developing his/her listening skills which helped him/her as a director, stating:

> My students taught me how to teach. In the end you're dealing with humans and the more you deal with humans the better you know. Just like a sculptor gains experience by sculpting, and becomes better and better with every new sculpture, similarly through

83

teaching theater we develop as theatre artists. Over here we're free as weren't being

evaluated so we dare to test, create and experiment. And we are able to invest these

experimentations in our professional careers as artists.

Accordingly, this teaching-artist has benefited from what others might perceive as lack of

supervision, to explore, experiment and professionally develop as an artist. Again, such an

excerpt demonstrates teaching-artists as ongoing learners who tend to take advantage of rising

circumstances to develop their professional learning journeys and their pedagogical content

knowledge.

Embracing the Students

As the teaching of theatre is an interactive transmission between humans, it doesn't

solely revolve around the teachers and requires bearing in mind the (a) students' input and their

needs, which simultaneously (b) contributes to the professional learning of teaching-artists.

Catering for the Students. The majority of the participants conveyed the importance of

connecting with students, understanding them and catering for their differences. Nine out of ten

teaching-artists reported developing their teaching in relation to their students' differences as

they are differently constituted coming from different backgrounds, have different abilities,

personalities, levels of maturity and perceptions of life. Furthermore, the participants reported a

wide agreement on the need of considering each student as a unique case and reconsidering their

teaching plans and approaches accordingly. For instance, participant K0009 highlighted that

teaching theatre is a challenging transfer between two humans, which can't be learned in books

but through practice by: "living the teaching experience in class with students and taking into

consideration each one of them as a case, at each moment."

The participant added that theatre students engage in an adventure of self-discovery, this entails wisely and cautiously planning lessons in a way that ensures the student's wellbeing. Three other participants agreed on the need for such differentiation, a skill described by participant N0003 as acquired with time after teaching-artists discover from their own experiences that there is no one single way applicable on everyone. Similarly, participant M0006 stated: "Your plans will have to cater for your students…I have to deal with each one of them in a different way", the participant added that teaching-artists have to find new ways to deal with students, while highlighting that some might show resistance or require different techniques contradicting with a teaching-artist's teaching plans, as is clear in the following excerpt: "As educators we set a target and plan a path but we sometimes find ourselves reconsidering this path as each student is different, with a different background and has lived a different life."

In conclusion, teaching-artists conveyed altering their teaching in relation to their students' input, which marks the flexibility of their pedagogical content knowledge based on their students' needs. Moreover, they agreed on the importance of understanding the students and connecting with them, what they conceived as the basis enabling creativity and the transfer of beliefs, artistic knowledge and skills, as is clear in the following excerpt from participant's A0002 interview:

> You need to learn to see and understand how each one of the students is made up, from where they are coming and how they are as humans, as a human entity, how they think, act, believe, what is the nature of their energy, what sort of baggage they've been carrying.

In light of that our next section discusses the reciprocity of the teaching process, highlighting how teaching-artists learn from their students.

Learning from Students. There was a wide agreement on a teaching-artist's job embedded learning emerging from their interaction with students. All the participants conveyed having learned from their students who were reported to boost their confidence, challenge them and urge them to reflect on and develop their beliefs, knowledge base and experiences. Three of the participants highlighted the importance of experimenting with students, out of which participant M0006 reported the different ways a student impact's a teaching artists' learning:

Maybe my students aren't aware of how they're teaching me but they do teach me. Sometimes they teach me in a direct and obvious manner: by asking me to read a book, but more uniquely in our field we tend to learn indirectly from each student... Trust me, sometimes you learn from their simplicity, and their spontaneous creativity as they courageously do things that you won't dare to do… I learn a lot from my students. They make me change and evolve... They're able to challenge you in a question that triggers your… where you'll be learning by attempting to answer them. In our field we don't teach "information" we rather meet in class and experience together...

Several other teaching artists reported on how student's challenge them and urge them to learn, as is clear in the following extract from D0007's interview:

There is always something new happening that my students might know about and I might be unaware of, I am obliged to know it for their sake. I guess I'm in a sort of a race for knowledge with my students, who are from a new generation and have more accessibility to knowledge… so I have to be up to the standards and always work on developing my knowledge.

Finally, participant K0009 reported regretting not keeping track of how his/her interaction with students impacted his/her professional learning stating:

86

The transfer is very important; I wish I had recorded all what I've been learning from my students... I took these for granted and considered them recorded in my head, I do record but maybe that wasn't enough, writing them would have preserved them.

This highlights that teaching-artists naturally learn by interacting and experimenting with students who challenge them to reflect on and appraise their artistic and pedagogical skills, beliefs and knowledge. Accordingly, the next section elaborates on the importance of planning this student-teacher interaction.

Embracing Planning the Teaching of Theatre

The teaching-artists agreed that the teaching of theater requires adequate planning. These participants agreed on the importance of (a) setting academic plans in a way that (b) enables the integration of theory into practice in a way that would allow students to acquire creative skills and the skills of ongoing learners through (c) experimentation.

Setting Academic Objectives. The teaching-artists valued planning their lessons and setting clear academic objectives aligned with the program's objectives and the students' class level. More than half of the participants, eight of them, conveyed the need for setting clear objectives, what participants L0010 described as drawing a finish line that simultaneously guides their teaching plans and the students' learning paths. The views of participant M0006 clearly illustrate the matter as they stated: "It is important for theater students to understand the laws before being able to creatively challenge them. Planning well helps me remain confident in class." Three other participants agreed on the importance of systematically and methodologically transferring such laws as is clear in the following narrative excerpt, where participant C0008 reported: "I'm too systematic and I favor discipline in life and in class. I can't see a work of art without it having disciplinary clear lines for creation."

Integrating Theoretical and Practical Work. The teaching artists agreed on the importance of integrating theoretical knowledge in their practical courses. Half of the participants agreed on the need of allowing students to practically apply theories giving them a chance to understand and practically apply and develop the concepts they're being taught. These teaching artists presented different ways for integrating theory in their practical courses, for instance one participant reported the need for assessing the students' practical courses in relation to theory, another reported setting both theoretical and practical objectives to cover his/her class' plan. While participant S0001 highlighted that a teaching-artists' practical experiences allow him/her to connect theory to practice, two others elaborated on the uniqueness of teaching theatre, which was identified as rooted in practice and accordingly requiring educators to artistically challenge their students and provide them with opportunities to create. Such uniqueness was made clear in the following narrative excerpt from participant's N0003 interview:

> You can't theoretically transfer your know-how to your students, doing that theoretically would get you and them lost. Theory allows you to strengthen your beliefs and frame your discoveries, but you can't theorize these beliefs and throw them on your students. You need to realize that your students are searching for something specific and you need to help them reach that specific thing.

Such reported views associate the integration of theory into practice with enabling the student's experimentation and is accordingly dependent on the distinctiveness of the student, which will be discussed in an upcoming section. On a final note we quote participant B0005 "If a theory doesn't amalgamate into practical work it remains an unexamined theory resembling an intellectual masturbation allowing us as educators to reveal our knowledge without serving any

purpose." Accordingly, the following section discusses the reported views highlighting the importance of mutual experimentation among students and teachers.

Enabling Mutual Experimentation. Seven out of ten participants reported on the impact of fostering experimentation in their classes to upraise the students' (i) creativity and their ability to (ii) learn on their own. For instance, participant N0003 reported the importance of providing students with opportunities to allow the formation of the students' independent realizations, reporting that the worst thing to be done while teaching an art form is "forcing your students to apply what you believe is true instead of giving them the keys and allowing them to decide".

Creativity. Even the teaching artists who reported setting clear objectives, being methodological or even systematic conveyed the importance of providing students with opportunities to launch their creativity. Four of the participants reported such views, while participant D0007 reported theatre as a form of pedagogy that has creative ends, the others reported the importance of bringing creativity out of their students by providing them with opportunities to reshuffle their knowledge, experiment and experience different emotions as is clear in the following excerpt from participant's M0006 interview, after identifying an artist's role as a creator of beauty, they stated:

I like to transfer this to my students so that they won't fear creating but enjoy its process. I want them to learn to do whatever they do properly, I believe they have to try and experiment but to do that properly and fully.

Ongoing Independent Learners. In addition to unleashing creativity, the teaching artists agreed on the need for transferring learning skills. Four of the participants agreed that through enabling experimentation by allowing students to experience probable complications, they apply what they're being taught to realize their weaknesses and accordingly shape their own

development. For instance, participant S0001, highlighted the need for teaching-artists to raft away from spoon feeding theatre students and rather: "allow them to experience things and discover how to act. Learning happens when they discover and retain what they have discovered."

Embracing the Uniqueness of the Theatre's Pedagogical Content Knowledge. As it is inarguable that planning for the students' and their theater teachers' transmission influences the development of a teaching-artist's pedagogical content knowledge, this section concludes with the uniqueness of this subject, its significance and specificity. Half of the teaching artists agreed on the uniqueness and complexity of teaching theatre. These teaching-artists reported developing their teaching in relation to the nature of the subject they're being assigned, elaborating that teaching theatre requires considering the essential artistic techniques and the academic path required for actors and artists while taking into consideration the uniqueness of each student and connecting with each individual in the group. For instance, participant N0003 highlighted that as teaching-artists deal with different students they are required to develop their approaches catering for each unique student. Moreover, the uniqueness of teaching-theatre was elaborated by participant A0002 as the transfer of knowledge to a human requiring the development of unique teaching skills enabling a teaching artist to:

Perceive things, to see and hear, and quickly respond. I don't know how to put it into words. Specifically, in acting… we need to link and implement our senses, energy and our knowledge, with facts while relating to the students supporting them and making them feel comfortable.

Challenges Faced During Professional Learning

Since the debut of their teaching career as educators, the participants reported encountering along their professional learning journeys (1) institutional and (2) personal enablers and challenges that influenced their careers and practices (see Table 4.4). The presence of these factors acted as enablers while their absence constituted challenges along the learning journey and career path.

Table 4.4

Frequency of Responses of Teaching-Artists on the Challenges They Encounter

	N=10
Institutional Challenges.	
Lack of institutional support.	8
Lack of qualified teaching-artists	8
Weakness in the program's curricula.	5
Unclear role objectives.	7
Unclear program objectives.	5
Limited accessibility to knowledge/resources.	3
Personal Challenges.	5
Professional challenges	9
The socio-political context	3

Institutional Challenges

The teaching-artists participating in this study highlighted as challenges the (a) lack of institutional support and (b) the absence of qualified or specialized teaching-artists, questioning the local program's curricula and the credibility of the offered degrees, while others referred to the (c) having limited accessibility to knowledge/resources.

Lack of Institutional Support. While the participants reported a wide agreement on the centrality of institutional support they pointed at the absence of this institutional support. For instance, eight out of ten stated that they weren't exposed to any form of formal induction while only a few of them conveyed benefiting from informal institutional incentives that are not

mandated. The following narrative excerpt from participant's N0003 interview illuminates on the matter:

It felt as if we were thrown in class to figure things out. It has been years since I left the country and I needed to know what my students had previously taken and what they will be taking later on. I took the initiative and asked my colleagues. No one answered, describing it as not important. This is a huge responsibility on the head of department who generally wash their hands from such a responsibility…

While participants D0007 who had received his/her preservice training abroad, compared both experiences by reporting feeling embraced abroad by being supported and supervised. Other participants agreed and reported not being offered any syllabi, which one of the participants used in his/her benefit, marking once again a teaching-artist's ability to pave their own professional learning: "Nobody asked me any question... everything was chaotic and I had the complete freedom to apply any method I wanted and decide on my own objectives... nagging won't change anything let's make the best out of it".

Moreover, five of these teaching-artists reported a prevailing lack of support described by a lack of cooperation, follow-up and professional development incentives. While participant D0007 reported a lack of supervision "I was never supervised ever since I started teaching, and if it were to happen it happened superficially." Participant N0003 reported that the institution rarely offered them training incentives and "puts sticks into their wheels", implying that the system hinders their development by restraining these educators from traveling on their own expenses to receive training or practice their art abroad during an academic year.

It is worth mentioning, that when asked about the available institutional incentives that support a career in teaching-artistry, only one participant, S0001, reported on professional

development incentives, highlighting that the university fosters research by providing an access to its library adding that in the lack of training opportunities the University has set policies permitting educators a sabbatical year, what was identified as "the 7th year" elaborated as:

When professors are fully compensated when they take a year off away from teaching classes to propose and then present a research topic. However, the policy is not obligatory and I'm not sure that professors actually commit to this.

In addition to the above, participant S0001 and three others reported the importance of job security factors as forms of intuitional support, framing the institution as indirectly providing them this security through offering them the job that is securing their living as artists, as is clear in the following extract from participant M0006's interview: "You decide on a career in arts because you love arts, so in my case I'm able to practice my passion and enjoy my time while securing a living."

In conclusion, the teaching-artists conveyed the centrality of institutional support while noting a predominant lack of this institutional support and few existing incentives which might be associated to the efficiency of teaching-artists. In light of that the following section elaborates on existent informal and unbinding support incentives. To illustrate, few of the teaching-artists hinted on the existence of informal incentives which include induction, forms of mentoring and collegiality. Only a minority, four participants, reported the existence of such self-initiated support incentives. Three of the four participants who have been recently recruited in the last five years, into the faculty, and the head of the department at that time highlight the above. For instance, the preceding head of the department stated:

I used to assign the right person to the right place… and follow up on them and on how they crafted their courses, making sure they were following the set guidelines. I used to ask them

about what and how they'll be teaching. I tried to give these novice teaching-artists the support they need to serve their students and this is very important. After recruiting a novice teacher with a good profile, you need to give them all your support.

The narratives of the remaining three participants support the above, as they affirmed the positive impact of the communication with the head of department. In addition, these participants reported reaching out to colleagues and having their full support, as is clear in the following narrative excerpt from participant M0006's interview:

I sought the advice of the head of the department, and my colleagues who taught these courses before me. A positive energy within a department is very important… Whatever I need I consult my colleagues. In the department we don't have a clear structure: we share a beautiful group dynamic, whenever I need advice, whether it is artistic, academic or pedagogical, I trust my colleagues and ask them. They always answer me and I was never let down.

Similarly, participant A0002 reported being supported by colleagues yet interestingly reported demanding a trial phase:

At first, I asked for a trial period, a period for them to test me and for myself to check whether I'll know how to teach and if I'd love such a responsibility. I wanted to check whether I was to be of a benefit to this place. So, I tried teaching and I loved it.

While these participants reported a positive learning experience as novices, others who were recruited earlier and participant L0010, who was recently admitted into the faculty contradicted the above and highlighted the prevalence of what participant N003 who had been recruited more than ten years ago, described as feeling thrown in a class to independently figure things out. More to the point, participant L0010, reported leaving the department after two

semesters of feeling unsupported in what was identified as an absence of follow-up. In light of that, the views of the participant who reported feeling supported categorize under personal voluntary endeavors that are unembraced institutionally.

Lack of Qualified Teaching-Artists. Three teaching-artists reported being taught as students by what they described as unqualified teaching-artists. For instance, participant N0003 stated:

My teachers used to tell us a lot about Stanislavski but for me the real concepts of Stanislavski were totally different from what they understood back then. Of course I didn't discover that early on in my first or second year but it took me years to realize that.

Half of the participants reported that the above still prevails, highlighting a shortage in specialized teaching-artists and a lack of a clear institutional vision where the recruited teaching-artists lack methodological teaching. Moreover, this situation was traced back to what was identified as easily accessible graduate degrees in the country. Accordingly, participant B0005 called higher education institutions to listen to field specialists stating:

We don't have a clear curriculum, criteria or a syllabus; each educator considers himself the best and everybody offers their opinions... For instance, when I'm advising a student in their senior year projects, I know that at the end my student would be facing a jury where only a few out of its members have the skills to truly assess the students' work.

Weakness in the Program's Curricula. Another prevailing challenge is that of the program's curricula. Half of the participants highlighted a deficiency in the program's curriculum, where the syllabi are not mandated, and the curricula were described as not methodological. Participant B0005 lamented that the central committees need to communicate

with the teaching-artists and called for assigning the right person in the right place highlighting the need for cooperation.

On another point, the majority of the teaching-artists reported experiencing uncertainty as they approached teaching, this includes feeling uncertain about their role as educators and/or the program/curriculum's objectives. These factors will be elaborated in the following section and could be legitimate reasons affecting the quality of teaching-artist's pedagogic performance.

Unclear Role Expectations. The majority of the teaching artists, seven of them, reported being unaware of their role expectations, being unaware of what needs to be done, feeling uncertain towards their capability as educators and their sufficiency of their expertise in the arts, fearing not being able to bring out the best in their students or teaching haphazardly, such is clear in the following excerpt from participant's B0005 interview: *"I feared becoming like some of my teachers that haphazardly taught only what they knew without differentiating their courses." S*imilarly, participant K0009 highlighted lacking a methodological training to guide his/her teaching, stating "we didn't take a methodological course on how to act for us to follow it."

Unclear Program Objectives. Half of the participants reported dealing with unclear program/curricula objectives, all of which reported having to elaborate on brief course descriptions set by the central committees. For instance, participant A0002 said: "we are assigned brief descriptions, more like a broad title. It is for each one of us to set their own path within this description." Meanwhile another participant described the curriculum as unbalanced and elaborated that it isn't well thought of.

Limited Accessibility to Knowledge/Resources. Three of the participants pointed at the limited accessibility of needed resources in their programs. They compared their accessibility to

resources and knowledge as students in relation to that of their students today. These teaching-artists reported that in the lack of internet accessibility, they had access to few books. Take for instance this narrative excerpt from participant D0007:

Today they have more access than I did, as they are being raised with more knowledge accessibility. We used to seek knowledge in books, movies and theater, while today they are being raised with the internet. So I have to be up to the standards and always work on developing my knowledge.

Personal Challenges

The teaching-artists reported various personal factors as challenges which, when present, influence their career paths. These include lack of confidence and self-efficacy. Half of the participants conveyed challenges associated with feeling unconfident. For instance, two of them participants reported feeling inferiority as students which influenced their careers as teachers as they tend to seek better learning experiences for their students, while the remaining three reported starting a career in academia at a young age and being younger than some of their students highlighting various challenges that will be discussed in the next section.

Professional Challenges

More than half of the participants reported finding it hard to transfer their ideas, beliefs, knowledge, experiences and passion while being in control of their knowledge base and classrooms. Nine out of the participants conveyed the above. Seven discussed the challenge of developing their teaching skills which includes: transforming their artistic skills into academic ones, connecting with students and transferring to them their passion, beliefs, knowledge and experiences. Out of these participants, participant Y0004 reported feeling challenged to transfer his/her ideas to the students specifically in the field of drama, highlighting the fields'

distinctiveness. Participant N0003 described theater and the arts as broad fields where "everything is so vast, connected and unrelated at the same time" reporting being lost while attempting to teach his/her students to "swim in this huge ocean so that they won't sink... not get lost nor too think that they have arrived" such statement frame the challenge of building an artist's teaching skills.

On another note, seven of the teaching-artists reported having a difficult time dealing with managing their classes and dealing with their students who tended to show resistance, as is clear in this extract from participant L0010 interview:

> Another challenge was dealing with the students, I felt so much resistance, which I felt in my first semester, I guess that was because they were trained differently, I was training them by giving them ways to think for themselves, I wasn't telling them how to do it but giving them tools to think and prepare and approach acting.

The Socio-Political Context

More than half of the participants highlighted that the university is affected by the country's instability and tough circumstances. These teaching artists identified operating under what was described by Y0004: "unique and harsh circumstances". Participant N0003 agreed, reporting that "we are in a continuous war with varying intensities… we haven't reached a total state of peace as we merely live in periods of peace." In addition, two of the participants highlighted the effect of going on strikes on the teaching process while two other highlighted that the government tends to settle the salaries of untenured lecturers once every two years and a third reported the government's inability to adequately fund and support their professional development.

Suggested On-the-job Learning Support for Teaching Artists

When probed about institutional incentives that would support a teaching-artist's professional learning, the participants delightedly proposed various incentives which will be reported in this section. Remarkably only one participant abstained from responding to the inquiry, highlighting that the Lebanese University operates under exceptional conditions and such incentives aren't in the hands of educators, nor students, but in those of universities who should be wise enough to know how to support their educators. Therefore, this section highlights a set of practical recommendations from the perspective of the participants that foster a teaching-artist's development some of which are accessible, context relevant and practice based (see Table 4.5). The teaching-artists participating in this study agreed on the impact of (1) enabling collegiality and (2) providing teaching-artists with professional development opportunities which encompass (a) funding theatrical productions, (b) offering training opportunities and (c) fostering research. Finally, the Lebanese teaching-artists elaborated on the need for revisiting the current recruitment strategies.

Table 4.5

*Frequency of Responses of Teaching-artists suggesting forms of o*n-*the-job Learning Incentives for Teaching Artists*

	N=10
Enabling Collegiality.	5
Professional Development Opportunities.	8
Funding Theatrical productions.	4
Training Opportunities.	6
Fostering Research.	2
Revisiting the recruitment strategies.	6

Enabling Collegiality

Teaching-artists highlighted the importance of enabling collegiality by facilitating the cooperation among teachers. Half of the participants highlighted the need for cooperation, sharing knowledge and experiences and building effective and unique strategies that support the students professional and personal advancement. In other words, these participants agreed on the importance of teams of teachers working hand in hand and complementing one another. While participant B0005 called for collaboration to secure the curricula's continuity, participant K0009 called colleagues to collaborate with one another to support the development of the institution.

Professional Development Opportunities

There was a wide agreement among colleagues on the importance of providing professional development opportunities that would impact a teaching-artist's career. Eight of the participants suggested several relevant incentives which include (a) providing teaching-artist with financial funding to produce shows alongside their students, (b) training opportunities and (c) fostering academic research,

Funding Theatrical Productions. Four of the participants highlighted the importance of providing funding for educators to produce performances together with their students. Such experiences were reported to provide teaching-artists with more time to join forces with their students to experiment and learn. Take for example the following narrative excerpt from participant's B0005 interview: "I'd like to have the chance to work with my students for a longer period of time" adding after highlighting that the current distribution of classes isn't sufficient:

I wish I had the chance to work with them outside of the classroom, to give them the chance to truly experience the field so that a year later we'll be able to continue our work in reference to real life examples.

100

Training Opportunities. More than half of the participants agreed on the importance of providing teaching-artists with appropriate training opportunities either locally or abroad. They all highlighted the importance of overcoming the financial difficulties to provide such training opportunities. These opportunities include attending or participating in international festivals, launching a local theatre festival and building cultural exchanges with embassies. Fortunately, one of the participants provided a solution for what was described as the hindering financial aspect, by recommending profiting from the institution's human capital. This teaching-artist called higher education institutions to facilitate the opportunity to have teaching-artists training one another as colleagues: "each time one of us would lead a training", furthermore she/he added: "we also need to be trained with our students, it is beneficial to participate in a class alongside our students under the direction of an external party. Accordingly, our students will feel comfortable having us by their side".

Fostering Research. Only two participants who had studied abroad in their lifetime, highlighted the importance of fostering research calling institutions of higher education to support teaching-artists in the process of conducting and publishing academic and methodological research, take for example this field note passage:

Abroad lecturers are forced to constantly write and publish articles, and this allows all types of educators to develop. As I have this mentality I always work on publishing, not locally though, I do so without any supervision by collaborating with external universities and publishing through them.

Furthermore, this participant, D0007 called teaching-artists to transform their work from merely teaching into an experimental lab and into research, stating: "rather than just teaching and offering subjects… educators should engage in research to transform their classes into real

experimental laboratories." Accordingly, such views support the previously reported calls on the need for experimenting with students.

Revisiting the Recruitment Strategies

The teaching-artists reported a need for revisiting the recruitment criteria and approaches. Half of the participants reported various induction incentives out of which four suggested a work trial phase before recruitment while the remaining two stressed on the importance of mentoring novices. For instance, participant M0006 called institutions to support novice teaching-artists by urging them to attend classes, give trial lectures and discuss their experiences afterwards. Similarly, participant N0003 stressed on the importance of a work trial phase, illustrating an example they experienced abroad: "They used to have a course labeled creative atelier where every semester they used to recruit different artists from different concentrations, this allowed them to offer students the secrets of their artistic careers." Moreover, the participants elaborated that such an atelier allowed artists to tryout teaching and figure out if they are fit for such a shift into academia or not, before accepting a teaching role. Participants C0008 agreed and L0010 elaborated on the need for such a trial period in the form of giving workshops or master classes before recruiting artists while two other participants stressed on the importance of reviewing and implementing quality standards while recruiting new teaching-artists.

On the other hand, three of the teaching-artists agreed on the importance of recruiting skilled artists in the first place, as is clear in the following extracts of participant A0002 who highlighted the need for ongoing communication with newly assigned teaching-artists on their theoretical and technical schools of and more precisely on their beliefs stating: "The most important thing is the teacher's beliefs concerning acting and their commitment to teaching this

form of art." Similarly, participants C0008 and N0003 called higher education institutions to seek and confidently recruit artists with experiences and artistic paths worth sharing.

Chapter Summary

This chapter reports the different perceptions of teaching-artists at the department of theatre at the Lebanese University Faculty of Arts, Branch II. After prompting them to reflect on and describe the nature of their unique careers through qualitative interviews, the participants elaborated their views of their professional identity as well as the professional learning journeys leading to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge. When probed to describe the nature of their pedagogical content knowledge, the Lebanese theatre educators participating in this study did not provide direct answers pertaining to their PCK. Rather, they highlighted the complexity of the teaching process and associated it with their dual identities as teaching-artists which encompasses their knowledge, beliefs, and experiences as both artists and educators.

While discussing the complexity of a teaching-artist's dual career, the participants illustrated teaching-theatre as an innate ability. Both learning an art, and practicing it through applying one's knowledge, were reported to impact a teaching-artist's career. More to the point, when probed about the nature of their pedagogical content knowledge, the participants did not clearly identify it and rather illustrated the transfer of their knowledge, experience, and beliefs as complexly requiring innate skills to connect with students and develop their artistic prowess enabling them to imaginatively create. The participants described the teaching of theatre as the planning of the transmission process on the basis of integrating theory in practice and enabling joint experimentations with students. Additionally, the teaching of theatre was described as a transfer between human beings, demanding commitment from both the teaching-artists and their students alike. While the teaching-artists conveyed integrating their unique identities, which

reciprocally affects their knowledge, beliefs and experiences in the process contributing to the development of their pedagogical content knowledge. The majority of the participants conveyed being mindful of the students' input and their needs, marking the importance of connecting with them, understanding them and catering to their differences. Furthermore, teaching-artists conveyed altering their teaching in relation to their students' input, which marks the dependability of their pedagogical content knowledge on the students' needs. Moreover, they agreed on the importance of understanding the students and connecting with them, what they conceived as the basis for enabling creativity and the transfer of beliefs, artistic knowledge and skills, requiring adequate planning.

Furthermore, a career in teaching of theatre was elaborated as exceeding an artist's academic qualifications and rooted in their experiences as theatre practitioners. A professional path in teaching-artistry is viewed as hard to manifest, and as emerging from one's artistic urges and rooted in a dual career in artistry and academia, influenced by the artist's pre-service training and prior professional experiences. Accordingly, such a career in teaching-artistry heavily depends on the collective opportunities and experiences that contribute to the learning of teaching-artists. As they can't separate any facet of their dual identity, their professional learning constitutes their advancement in the arts, in academia and as human beings. In light of this, the participants were able to report the characteristics of a successful "teaching-artist", agreeing that they should be ongoing learners who demonstrate high levels of empathy and self-awareness. Such traits, alongside the participants' passion and commitment to the teaching profession and to the Lebanese University, characterizes them as resilient and enthusiastic educators able to engage in self-initiated professional learning.

The second research question on their professional path was answered as follows. The teaching-artists' careers were initiated after experiencing an artistic urge as well as being previously exposed to theatre and other art forms, and later on being headhunted by the institution. Accordingly, the majority of the participants described their career shift into their teaching roles at higher education as unplanned, while some highlighted shifting into academia after experiencing discontent in the entertainment industry. In light of that it is not surprising that only a minority of the local teaching-artists reported being well prepared for their teaching roles in their artistic pre-service training.

This is made clear, as even within the lack of institutional professional learning incentives and limited financial resources, the participants agreed on the importance of continuous learning and paving their own professional development through engaging in what can be described as various forms of self-initiated learning opportunities to support their students and provide them with superior learning experiences.

Although the participants agreed on the pivotal impact of formal training opportunities, whether in attending workshops or enrolling in academic programs to pursue higher degrees on their professional learning as teaching-artists, such incentives were described as costly and absent. Interestingly, the majority of the teaching-artists conveyed that the nature of their roles as teaching-artists contributes to their informal professional learning on the job, such as reading, watching plays, upholding their professional work as artists, engaging in a community of artists, and most importantly engaging in self-evaluative reflections. The later was illustrated as the teaching-artists' ability to incorporate the formal and informal learning opportunities that outline their professional journeys, as it ascribes teaching-artists with the ability to purposefully fit in

their knowledge base, readings, trainings, experiences and practices in the process enabling the development of their pedagogical content knowledge.

Since the debut of their teaching career as educators, the participants reported encountering along their professional learning journeys institutional and personal enablers and challenges that influenced their careers and practices. For instance, the reported challenges include a lack of institutional support and the absence of qualified or specialized teaching-artists, and inadequate curricula. Therefore, the teaching-artists conveyed a predominant lack of institutional support and incentives, which might be associated to the efficiency of teaching-artists, who reported various personal and professional challenges, such as a lack of confidence and self-efficacy, as more than half of the participants reported finding it hard to transfer their ideas, beliefs, knowledge, experiences and passion to students.

Finally, the majority of the participants drew attention to the fact that the university, as a state institution, is inevitably affected by the country's economic and political instability and proposed various practical recommendations that foster a teaching-artist's development, some of which some are accessible, context relevant, and practice based. The teaching-artists agreed on the impact of enabling collegiality and providing them with professional development opportunities which encompass funding theatrical productions, offering training opportunities, fostering research and most importantly revisiting the prevalent recruitment strategies.

CHAPTER V

DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION, AND IMPLICATIONS

This chapter attempts to answer the research questions, examining the research findings through the lens of the initial theoretical understanding constructed based on the review of literature. Accordingly, this chapter attempts to interpret, discuss and synthesize key findings in relation to the initial conceptual understanding and presents the research claims, and recommendations in three main subsections. The first targets the interpretation of the results followed by a conclusion and last, the implications for practice and recommendations for further research.

This section elaborates on the teaching-artist's profiles, followed by a section discussing the participants' professional learning paths leading to acquiring their PCK. Their responses highlight that such a path is rooted in the two fields of education and theatre, enriched by personal experiences and advanced by self-initiated professional learning in the lack of institutional support incentives. Subsequently, a section describes the organizational conditions that affect the teaching-artists' pedagogic professional learning, followed by a section on its nature. We end this section by discussing the factors found to impact the professional learning of theatre teaching-artists. Under that title we elaborate on various influences which include maintaining the teaching-artists' professional artistic careers, enrolling in graduate studies, teaching in a climate of collegiality and actively interacting with and learning alongside students.

Discussion on the Teaching-Artist's Profile

Based on the findings, the teaching-artist's profile is conceived to consist of a hybrid identity rooted in two different fields and marked by a set of key characteristics enabling teaching-artists to develop their pedagogical content knowledge and effectively perform.

A Hybrid Identity

The participants' interpretations concerning their profiles as theater teaching-artist, highlight its complexity that encompasses the totality of their experiences rooted in artistry and in academia. All the participants qualify this profile as leading to a hybrid identity that is holistic. In their responses, the teaching-artists conveyed a very tight association between its two dimensions and also illustrated that their teaching and artistic experiences are reciprocally affecting and affected by a teaching-artist's self. This emerging understanding is echoed in Hargreaves and Fullan (1992) explication of the process of teacher development, as they characterize the later to incorporate aspects of the teachers' identities as individuals in addition to the teacher's skills, knowledge and the context in which they teach.

Furthermore, the teaching-artists reported basing their teaching on their holistic identity which encompasses their knowledge, beliefs and experiences as artists and teachers. Such claims support the findings of Anderson's (2004) study on the professional development journey of drama teachers where a career in teaching theatre is presented to be rooted in both the educators' personal and professional lives and thus associates their professional development with their dual identity. Accordingly, the study findings support the applicability of Anderson's (2004) conclusion in a Lebanese higher education context.

Key Characteristics of an Effective Teaching-Artist

The participants were all able to identify a set of characteristics that teaching-artists should possess to effectively perform their responsibilities suggesting a group awareness of the unique skills that they associate with a successful "teaching-artist". In fact, the participants agreed that teaching-artists should be ongoing reflective learners who demonstrate high levels of empathy, motivation and possess self-awareness skills. Careful examination of these characteristics suggests that the view of effectiveness of teaching-artists aligns with what Park and Oliver (2008) refer to as possessing key conceptual tools associated with the development of pedagogical content knowledge. Looking through the lens of Park and Oliver's (2008) PCK model, effective teaching-artists are the ones that construct their own pedagogical content knowledge through ongoing reflection in-action and reflection on-action. Such forms of conceptual tools allow teaching-artists to build their PCK from an amalgam of their teaching and artistic experiences.

In sum, the reported characteristics associated with an effective Lebanese teaching-artist, enable them to reflect on their practices as both teachers and artists as a means to develop their pedagogic skills to cater to their students' needs. Thus, setting a key building block to forming their dual identity.

Discussion on the Professional Learning Path of Teaching-Artists

The teaching-artists conveyed that the professional learning paths leading to acquiring the PCK of their hybrid dual identity starts first with acquiring mastery in a field of artistry. With time, this mastery becomes the foundation of their later interest in teaching. While the learning path is rooted in these two fields, it is also enriched by personal experiences and the peculiarities

of their personal identity. The following subsections elaborate on the contribution of each of the above pillars impacting the teaching-artists' career paths in light of the examined literature.

A Career Path Launched in Artistry

The teaching-artists launched their careers in teaching after they've academically and practically developed their artistic talents. They highlighted that what triggered their careers as teaching artists was a kind of an artistic urge, often since childhood, to express oneself through the arts and that turned into an impulse to develop a career in artistry. In fact, these teaching-artists have launched their teaching careers after they have earned a degree in theatre acting/directing and established a career as practitioners in the field. All the participants agree that starting their professional career with mastering an artistic talent has helped them develop a cumulative "baggage", a totality of integrated artistic experiences that they felt at some point worthy of being shared with students. Furthermore, they consider the mastery of their art as a prerequisite enabling them to apply this knowledge in a new form, that of transferring it to others. Accordingly, these findings mirror those of Carillo & Baguley (2011) who identify the mastery of the arts as constituting a foundation that informs the development of pedagogical skills hence, the dual identities of teaching-artists.

A Self-Driven Path Beyond Artistry Towards Building their PCK

The participants acknowledge that while artistic training and experiences are vital for a teaching career, they are insufficient if not followed by developing their pedagogical content knowledge needed to transfer their artistic knowledge and experiences to students. They all agree that the path to acquiring their teaching skills and building their PCK is self-driven, and often not facilitated by any outside guidance or support. Although the teaching-artists confirm that the totality of their pre-service training and experiences in the arts impacts their careers, these

recruited reputable artists report experiencing uncertainty as they approached teaching unprepared for their new roles as educators. Accordingly, these teaching-artists might be described like their international counterparts in reference to Honeyfield and Fraser (2012) as possessing a wealth of invaluable subject expertise yet a dearth in pedagogic knowledge. Similar to Honeyfield and Fraser's (2012) study participants, these teaching-artists seemed to be unaware of what needed to be done in class as they have conveyed experiencing uncertainty towards their capabilities as educators and feeling ill-equipped for their new roles. Accordingly, the lack of clear expectations appears to be the result of an institutional pattern mirroring what Honeyfield & Fraser (2012) and Hall (2010) describe as the lack of legal requirements for University professors to complete programs in educational theory to develop their teaching qualifications. As a result, fearing not being able to bring out the best in their students, the teaching-artists have seen the need for taking charge of developing their ability to "transfer knowledge and skills" to students. Thus, the last stage for Lebanese teaching-artists on their career-path towards becoming effective teaching artists consists of engaging independently in building their own pedagogical content knowledge, something that according to the reviewed literature does not seem to be unique to Lebanese teaching artists (Carillo & Baguley, 2011; Stover & Veres, 2013).

A Career Path Pledged in the Teaching-Artist's Self

Analysis of the study findings highlighted that a career path in teaching theatre, is subjectively associated with personal characteristics of those practicing it whether in shaping the mastery of their artistry or in developing their pedagogical content knowledge that enables them to transfer their artistic know-how to their students. In fact, teaching-artists view that "personal" and "human" characteristics are critical to amalgamate those two aspects into a sum greater than the sum of the skills the two dimensions bring to their dual identity. This includes their

111

personalities, personal experiences and the dimension of their identities that makes them unique human beings. According to the respondents, this "personal" dimension reflects the totality of their life experiences and intersects with their PCK and teaching as well as with their practice of artistry. In fact, the literature supports the centrality of the personal dimension in shaping both the artist and the educator. Researchers agree that the arts engage an artist's personal identity in a creative process which is unbound by specialization and rather open for exploring possibilities, and that the artistry that develops is closely connected to the artist's self (Brandt & Eagleman, 2017). Similarly, Palmer's (1997) conclusion recognizes good teaching as emerging from the educators' identities and lying at the intersection of the diverse forces that make up their lives and adds meaning to their roles as educators. Put differently, our results fit with Palmer's theory (1997) who states that educators seeking good teaching are required to understand in addition to the subjects and students they are dealing with, their own selves and teach who they are.

Additionally, another aspect of the self that many of this study participants highlighted was their urge to protect their students from the challenges they were forced to live as learners or as practicing artists. These teaching artists explained that they aim to help their students forge an easier career path than the one they struggled to travel and spare their students the troubles they experienced. These results echo   Ibrahim and Yussof 's (2009) conclusion stating that a successful career path culminates in the combination of both facets of a teaching-artist's dual identity shaped by their life experiences as learners in school, in tertiary settings, and the community which informs the complexity of their practices as teaching-artists and influences their professional beliefs and values. By agreeing that the educator's self encompasses the teaching-artist's identity as humans, artists, parents, colleagues, students, and kids, we infer that the totality of a teaching-artist's experiences in life influences their careers.

112

A Career Path Pledged in Self-Initiated Learning

Lebanese teaching-artists participating in this study explained that they have received limited support along their learning journeys. These participants elaborated that forming their complex identity and gaining the characteristics of effective teaching-artists is a journey they manage to initiate and travel on their own without much systemic support. As such, these reflective ongoing learners reported developing their expertise through reflecting on their practical experiences with students and willingly paving their own professional learning journeys by significantly learning alongside them. On one hand the participants saw that their reflective practices impact their careers as they became more lenient and attentive teaching-artists, aligning with what Charland (2006) highlights as the need for educators in higher education to periodically reflect on their pedagogical approaches. On the other hand, the local teaching-artists have highlighted the impact of reflection on their artistic identities and their personalities as they demonstrated becoming more understanding human beings.

In addition to learning on the job alongside students and engaging in self-evaluative reflections the majority of the teaching-artists reported that they engage in various forms of self-initiated informal professional learning opportunities which include reading, watching plays, upholding their professional work as artists and engaging in a community of artists. As previously stated in the literature review, the teaching of arts in tertiary education is constantly on the move as it is associated with innovative beliefs, portrayed as the ability to respond to the ever-changing conditions while improving teaching and learning through committing to self-development and coping with change (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Accordingly, what has been identified as relevant to the teaching of arts in a Malaysian higher education setting is locally

applicable as the majority of the participants conveyed the importance of being ongoing learners, committed to professional development.

Finally, in the absence of any systemic support to induct them into their newly assumed responsibilities or support their ongoing professional learning, the local teaching-artists reported benefiting from the space of freedom emerging from the lack of institutional supervision to experiment and interact with their students who tend to challenge them and urge them to learn, reflect on and appraise their skills, beliefs and knowledge. This extends the applicability into the context of the Lebanese Higher Education of Anderson's findings (2004), highlighting that an educators' professional development is a complex process that is rooted in the ability of the educator to transform limitations into learning opportunities.

Discussion on the Organizational Conditions that Affect the Pedagogical Professional Learning of Teaching-Artists

The participants' perceptions concerning the organizational conditions that affect their pedagogic professional learning as teaching-artist, highlight the absence of institutional support incentives that would purposefully develop their professional identity or shape their career paths as theatre educators. When contacted by and recruited into the national higher-education institution, the Lebanese theatre teaching-artists felt ill-equipped and uncertain about their new roles. Although researchers recommend that lecturers at institutions of higher education receive job-embedded support to develop their teaching (Guskey & Yoon, 2009) the Lebanese public University is illustrated as neither supporting the induction of its newly recruited teaching-artists nor the ongoing professional learning of its experienced teaching staff. All participants agreed that the university doesn't induct nor supervise its' teaching staff, doesn't bind the publishing of research and abstains from providing its' teaching staff with professional development

114

opportunities. Even though some newly recruited teaching-artists reported benefiting from the existence of informal incentives which include some forms of mentoring and collegiality, these support opportunities are sporadic and non-formalized and thus could be classified under personal voluntary endeavors.

However, this lack of institutional support fronting the Lebanese participants isn't unique to higher education teaching-artists in our context as Braund's (2015) study identifies that induction opportunities remain unavailable to many professionals at the level of tertiary education and Risner (2012) highlighted that the common professional development opportunities offered to teaching-artists lack relevance, rigor, and venues for disseminating knowledge. On a final note, despite the alignment between the Lebanese context and what is reported in the international literature, the extreme lack of any institutionally mandated professional development in the Lebanese context leaves teacher-artists lagging behind as they aren't being institutionally supported and rather left to develop their profiles through practice.

Discussion on the Nature of the Pedagogical Content Knowledge that Theatre Teaching-Artists Develop

Although the participants did not clearly identify the nature of their pedagogic content knowledge their responses reflect aspects of this knowledge reflected in their need to adequately connect with students, inspire them and transfer to them complex skills. For instance, they predominantly show a lack of awareness of what constitutes their PCK and how it can purposefully be developed. While their description of their career path helped the researcher to infer their characterization of their PCK as encompassing a set of acquired skills that aligns with the literature on developing a pedagogical content knowledge, their views remain dominated with beliefs that attribute the know-how of being or becoming an effective teaching artist to

115

possessing an "innate talent". Accordingly, in what follows we discuss the participants'

responses framing the nature of theatre teaching as an "innate talent" and later as an "acquired

skill".

PCK as an Innate Talent

The majority of the Lebanese teaching-artists couldn't articulate what constitutes their

pedagogical content knowledge nor the process that leads to its formation. Most framed the

transfer of their knowledge, experiences and beliefs to ensure the development of their students'

learning skills and creativity as rather an innate talent and an art by itself. While they

overemphasized the fact that merely practicing the art of acting doesn't guarantee a successful

career in teaching it, they identified the ability to teach as a unique talent that only few can

possess. Among the group that viewed possessing the innate talent as the only venue to

becoming an effective teacher-artists, some teaching-artists asserted that teaching theatre is a

challenging transfer between two humans, which can't be learnt in books, and reported being

influenced by a teaching-artist who hasn't even graduated from high school, yet was gifted in

connecting with students and transferring to them his energy. Although the literature accepts the

fact that not all accomplished artists can teach (Carillo & Baguley 2011), it refutes the

participants' beliefs as it presents the transformation of content knowledge into a more practical

form for teaching essential to effectiveness (Major & Palmer, 2006). Moreover, it portrays this

PCK as expandable in learning environments (Zepke, 2013), impacted by the educators'

experiences (Grossman, 1990) yet constantly developed through their commitment to ongoing

professional development (Anderson, 2004; Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009).

PCK as an Acquired Skill

According to Fernandez-Balboa & Stiehl (1995), the appropriate integration of pedagogical content knowledge, the ability to transform a subject matter from the educators' understanding into their students' understanding, is central to a professor's success. Despite their emphasis on the importance of talent, many teachers alluded in their responses to competencies that can be associated with pedagogical content knowledge leading them to be effective teaching-artists. Though mostly incapable of articulating it as PCK, their responses are filled with evidence that points at it and enlist some of its characteristics. In fact, the participants reported the need for being reflective, empathetic and motivated ongoing learners, taking control of advancing their teaching skills as essential characteristics for being an effective teaching-artist. The literature confirms these characteristics as it framed the educator's ability to develop their pedagogical content knowledge through reflecting on their experiences (Grossman, 1990) and committing to ongoing professional development (Anderson, 2004; Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Accordingly, this grounds the responses of the Lebanese teaching-artists who seem to believe that through a commitment to professional learning, and a skill to build empathetic relationships with their students they are able to acquire and advance what is needed to build their ability to transfer knowledge and skills to students.

Commitment to On-Going Professional Learning through Reflective Practice. Teaching-Artists believe that effectiveness is manifested in being motivated and curious ongoing learners eager and able to take control of paving their professional learning journeys. The teaching-artists reported developing their teaching skills, practices and their drama pedagogy through reflecting on their dual practice and amalgamating their professional practical knowledge and experiences rooted in both teaching and theatre. This resonates with what the

literature reports as effective teaching of arts in tertiary education. The latter is often associated

with innovative beliefs and portrayed as the ability to respond to the ever-changing conditions

while improving teaching and learning through committing to self-development and coping with

change (Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). Despite the fact that the majority of the participants reported

operating in uniquely harsh circumstances marked by a scarcity in institutional incentives, the

Lebanese teaching-artists critiqued the stagnation of educators and conveyed committing to the

discovery of the unknown. These teaching-artists reported managing to engage in ongoing

professional learning on the job through reconsidering their professional beliefs and practices.

Accordingly, what has been identified as relevant to the teaching of theatre in schools in

Anderson's (2004) study seems to be equally relevant in the Lebanese higher education setting.

Moreover, the views of participants seem to capitalize on the set of skills that many agree to

characterize university professors. Namely, Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl (1995), highlighted that

higher education professors are subject experts able to learn on the job the skills and expertise of

proficient teachers. Accordingly, the professional learning that the participants in this study

reported is achieved through what Charland (2006) identifies as actively engaging in self-

evaluation and reflection on pedagogical approaches, beliefs, knowledge and teaching

experiences.

Moreover, the teaching-artists seem to agree that the purpose of their reflection is to

integrate theoretical knowledge in their practical courses to provide students with challenging

opportunities to practically apply and develop the concepts they're being taught. In this regard, a

number of participants saw their reflective practice as an opportunity to transfer their

professional experiences, subject specific knowledge, and artistic values into teaching. These

results are supported by Risner's (2012) findings on performance/dance teaching-artists, who

framed the teaching-artists' ability to transfer and transform their artistic skills into their teaching. For instance, the participants reported reflecting on and transferring their ability to understand a theatrical character as an actor into better understanding different students in an academic setting. Similarly, other participants reported transferring their listening and communication skills as actors into academia, their creative skills and ability to connect to an audience in a theatre into an ability to connect to students in a classroom.

Being Caring and Empathetic Educators. All the theater teaching-artists agreed that their ability to teach art entails empathetically connecting with students, understanding their needs, loving them and embracing their differences. According to Guskey (2003) the most frequently reported factor that supports students' learning is teachers understanding the ways their students learn in relation to the content they teach. Likewise, half of the participants agreed on the importance of understanding their students' needs and sensitively connecting with them to support their learning journey. Additionally, by highlighting the need to responsibly deal with students, the majority of the participants have conveyed facets of commitment to the profession which align with what Palmer (1997) elaborates as the spiritual path illustrated in the educator's inoculation of passion and meaning into their teaching.

Discussion on the Factors that Shape the Teaching-Artist's Professional Learning

As teaching-artists can't separate any facet of their dual identity, their professional learning is influenced by many factors which encompass their practices and feelings as professionals and human beings. This section elaborates on these various factors which include maintaining the teaching-artists' professional artistic careers, enrolling in graduate studies, teaching in a climate of collegiality and actively interacting with and learning alongside students.

Maintaining One's Professional Artistic Career

Through upholding their artistic careers, teaching-artists reported being capable of concurrent professional learning to advance their teaching practices. More than half of the participants identified upholding their careers as artists as a major factor contributing to their ongoing development. These practicing artists are capable while teaching practical theatre courses, of living and sharing practical experiences with their students which in reference to Carillo & Baguley (2011) intensifies the educators' credibility in the eyes of their students. In other words, the more teaching-artists refine their artistic skills, beliefs and knowledge the more they can successfully transfer their experiences and knowledge to students. Similar to these Lebanese participants, there is broad agreement in the literature that upholding one's professional work as artists in parallel with their teaching functions is an added value and can be considered a form of ongoing in-service professional development (Risner, 2012; McCaslin et al., 2004).

Enrolling in Graduate Programs

The Lebanese teaching-artists conveyed the benefit of engaging in graduate studies and/or conducting research that is relevant to their work as teaching-artists. The participants agreed on the positive impact of enrolling in academic programs to pursue higher degrees on their professional learning as teaching-artists and considered it as a form of in -service "formal" training that enhances their professional learning. However, none of the participants reported being trained in their graduate studies on the skills of educators. This is confirmed in the findings reported in Risner's study (2012) which highlights the inability of graduate programs to influence a teaching-artist's pedagogic development, as most of the available programs tend to develop the artistic skills of students. Thus, although all of the participants identified graduate

studies as a factor that enhances their PCK, there seems to be a confusion about the nature of the learning they can acquire through their participation in these graduate programs. While none of the existing graduate programs seem to target developing pedagogical skills, one is left to wonder whether the extended period of gaining mastery in an artistic subject matter allows teaching-artists to develop their pedagogical skills on their own.

On another note, half of the teaching-artists reported that engaging in research as a factor that supports their professional learning, builds their PCK and allows them to transfer their skills to their students. However, only few of them identified formally engaging in academic research or provided any further explanation on how this can constitute a source of support. While on the job professional learning is highly recommended in the literature (Webster-Wright, 2009), the only connection found in this literature is linked to engaging in contextualized action research that purposefully capitalize on problems of practice while situating the learning into the job context and connecting it to the tasks needed to be completed.

A Climate of Collegiality and a Sense of Belonging to the Institution

The majority of the teaching-artists participating in the study reported that establishing professional relationships with their colleagues within a positive climate is a factor that supports their professional learning. In fact, Guskey (2003) highlights collegiality in the form of purposeful collaboration among teachers as a means to enhance professional learning. He explains that professional learning can be promoted through professional dialogue that reflects on practice (Guskey, 20003). Furthermore, Guksey (2003) highlights the importance of exchanging thoughts, and sharing approaches oriented towards improving the students' learning. Thus, despite the lack of targeted institutional support for their professional development, the teaching-artists see professional collaboration as triggering opportunities for learning and as a

means to increase their sense of ownership and responsibility to give back to the institution. Hargreaves & Fullan (2013), explain that a positive climate that enhances professional collaboration builds the social capital of an institution which in turn will increase the formal and informal interactions among colleagues which in turn will sustain the development of a learning community. The collegial interactions that the participants linked to their learning might very well be a manifestation of this social capital that ultimately becomes an enhancer to their on-going professional learning.

Actively Interacting with and Learning Alongside Students

The teaching-artists reported their experiences with students as a key contributor to their success in the teaching-learning process and a source of their own learning as they pointed at the impact of their interaction with students and illustrated it as a factor impacting their continuous professional learning. Webster-Wright (2009) advances that authentic professional learning is one that is embedded and constructed based on the experiences of practicing professionals. Zepke's (2013) also confirms that the educators' learning is tightly connected to their interaction with students. Accordingly, much like the drama educators in Anderson's (2004) study, the theatre teaching-artists participating in this study are advocates for engaging in self-initiated professional learning triggered by their interaction with students. These teaching-artists believe that they are benefiting from the lack of institutional supervision to experiment and interact with their students who tend to challenge them and urge them to learn, reflect on and appraise their skills, beliefs and knowledge.

Conclusion

After reconsidering the literature and the reported findings we conclude that although the participants still believe that good theater teaching is an innate talent, their responses framing it

as an intuitive drive to serve the students creates a positive tension between the two components of their hybrid identity. This tension seems to intrinsically motivate them to develop their PCK on their own. Accordingly, the following sections present their nonlinear professional learning paths as a form of survival-professionalism and highlight the major institutional impediments to professional learning facing teaching-artists in their institutional context and later re-envisions their professional learning paths. Finally, to ground the research recommendations, a section will reconsider the centrality of artistic creativity in the development of the teaching-artists' PCK and another section presents a successful teaching-artist's characteristic.

A Challenging Institutional Context

Based on the study findings, teaching-artists in the case of the Lebanese University are operating under major institutional impediments to professional learning. Despite the growing awareness among international scholars of the centrality and importance of a teaching-artist's pedagogical knowledge, there are no formal training programs to support the ongoing professional development of teaching-artists (Anderson, 2004) nor the offering of a variety of in-service incentives that cater to their specific needs (McCaslin et al., 2004). Although relevant professional development and induction opportunities are still globally in a formative stage (Charland,2006; Braund, 2015) they remain completely unavailable at the local institution. To illustrate, the Lebanese University fails in supporting the professional learning of its teaching staff as there is neither awareness nor availability of high selection criteria, induction programs and ongoing professional learning incentives.

On one hand, there is an absence of requirement for expertise or pre-service training for teaching artists as the majority of the participants reported feeling ill-equipped for the role they were coincidently assigned to by acquaintances at the University. Accordingly, if we were to

123

accept the participants' claims that teaching theatre is an innate talent by itself, we can't but question how is the university assessing its staff before recruiting them and how are they considering the artists' readiness for a teaching career? Especially since some of the participants reported initiating their teaching careers at a young age, being somehow their students' age. In addition, the Lebanese University abstains from supporting its staff through on the job institutional support incentives. Even though professional development oriented towards the development of the teaching-artist's dual identities and skills, might be essential for educators (Hall,2010), the Lebanese teaching-artists reported being left to learn on the job without any institutional intervention and conveyed craving institutional support in the form of mandated pre-service or in service professional development to transform their artistic experience and knowledge into teaching skills. In light of the above, to sustain the quality of education at higher education institutions, Theatre Departments shouldn't take it for granted that all recruited artists innately possess the competencies of teaching-artists or have the ability to pave their own professional learning journeys. In sum, faculties of arts have to restructure their institutional recruitment strategies in light of the recent advancements in the field of human resources which include a range of emerging research-based guidelines to minimize unprofessional recruitment, strategies to induct professionals and policies to support the professional development of their staff.

Survival-Professionalism as a Career Path

The perspectives of teaching-artists reflect their understanding of the complexity and inner tension of their hybrid identity and the responsibilities accompanying it. Their responses highlighted that not all teaching-artists tend to develop what it takes to effectively teach in the lack of institutional support. In light of that, we can't generalize that all teaching-artists are able

to independently develop the required competencies and accordingly question whether all recruited educators are capable to learn on the job and develop their pedagogical content knowledge in the lack of institutionalized professional learning opportunities. On one hand such a hypothesis challenges Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl's (1995) theory stating that higher education professors are able to learn on the job the skills and expertise of proficient teachers. On the other, it emphasizes that it is contingent on universities' abilities to provide their staff with adequate professional learning opportunities for supporting the professional learning paths of teaching-artists to sustain the level of higher education at the national public higher education institution which echoes the study's initial aim to have every teaching-artist deliver the best teaching experience to their students.

On another note just like the school theatre teaching-artists participating in McCaslin et al.'s (2004), Anderson's (2004) and Risner's (2012) studies, the Lebanese theatre teaching-artists portray an example of survival-professionalism that seems to defy their limited awareness of pedagogical content knowledge and the means to acquire it. They all shared accounts of heroic self-directed attempts at engaging in self-initiated learning towards advancing their pedagogical content knowledge through alternative forms of professional development. Despite the fact that the majority of the participants framed the teaching of theatre as an innate talent and a substantial group of them highlighted its scarcity, these teaching-artists reported that they engage in purposeful reflective practice to advance and integrate their knowledge base and practices. This included readings, training and experiences oriented towards developing their competencies through trial and error rather than through formal institutional support. In other words, the participants' accounts reflect that they have managed to set their own professional learning goal of mastering the skills that allow them to transform their artistic experiences into academic ones,

connect with students and transfer to them their passion, beliefs, knowledge and experiences. Moreover, they advanced that their independent learning journeys have led them to acquire the pedagogical competencies of reflective practice and the skills of empathetic and caring educators that motivate their students to continue on learning as they incorporate the formal and informal learning opportunities that outline their professional journeys.

While the above conclusion emerged from an analysis of the views of the interviewed teacher-artists, a more critical look at the emerging narrative points to an exaggerated "hero" self-image. Such an image seems to be detached from its context as the participants strived to convey the efforts they have put to form their pedagogical content knowledge they need to be effective teaching-artists while overcoming the dire institutional conditions they are forced to operate under. Although, the participants highlighted that their self-directed learning path heavily depends on their lived experiences, they tended to shy away from communicating the harshness of the conditions in their work context. Whether it is related to available limited financial and academic resources, the influence of political nepotism or the lack of institutional support incentives and incompetence of leadership, the narratives that emerged from the interviews seem to reflect the participants' idealistic views of their practices within what seems to be "normal" conditions, or at best what seems to portray their aspirations to the kind of teaching-artists they wish they can become. In light of this, a more critical interpretation of the findings requires that the collected data is examined further as symptomatic of an evasive stance that those teacher artists have elected to assume vis a vis the research and the researcher. Rather than seeing the interview questions as an invitation to exercise the reflections they all claim to engage in, some of these participants opted to project the classic view of the self-made hero, that can survive "any" systemic conditions. This kind of analysis is beyond the scope of this study.

Yet, the researcher acknowledges this study's findings its complex reality and as a result frames the need to expedite additional qualitative inquiries to dig deeper into the practices of these participants and allow the surfacing of the multilayers of their complex professional path and identity grounded in their organizational and sociopolitical context.

Centrality of Artistic Creativity to the Development of PCK

The participants saw that the indicator of their success as teaching-artists is in their ability to unleash their students' creativity and enable their engagement in an adventure of self-discovery as independent learners within a caring and supportive learning environment. Driven by their deep care for their students, the teaching-artists take responsibility of developing the PCK of their hybrid dual identity which starts, in their view, with acquiring mastery in a field of artistry. Their responses lead to the understanding that their artistic talent, knowledge of the artistic field as well as career as artists are prerequisites on which teaching-artists build their teaching expertise and develop their teaching knowledge. However, they saw that merely mastering the art of acting doesn't guarantee a successful career as teaching-artists. While their explicit awareness of the PCK and their ability to develop it was limited, they were actually aware of the complexity of their dual professional field, and the interconnectedness of its components. These participants highlighted that a successful career in teaching-artistry surpasses a teaching-artist's artistic and academic expertise and qualifications as it requires experimentation and the integration of one's identity encompassing the totality of their learning experiences in life to unleash their students' talents and creativity. Such views mirror Gibson's (2010) conclusion which considers teaching in higher education as a multi-faceted, hard to grasp art associated with taking risks and creativity. From the latter's description of creativity as the creation of meaningful new forms based on the already existing facts, ideas and skills (Gibson,

2010), we can infer that what the participants identified as a "complex innate ability" is indeed a reference to the centrality of creativity in the process of developing their PCK. In fact, what was described by the participants as an innate talent to transform and transfer experiences and skills to students, was referred to in literature as PCK: the complex hard to grasp skill interwoven with the teaching-artists' contextual beliefs, practices and knowledge which exceeds the mastery of a particular discipline and lies in the transfer of personal and professional experiences to students. Accordingly, we hypothesize that what was elaborated as an innate talent might be nothing else than creativity, the transformative tool that could characterize good art teaching. Given the definition of creativity as the unique mental process enabling individuals to push boundaries and explore new possibilities through amalgamating inputs (Brandt & Eagleman, 2017), we note its correspondence with how Park & Oliver (2008) characterize PCK as the transformation of acquired subject matter knowledge per se into a new form of knowledge for teaching. In light of the above it seems that we can infer that the definitions of creativity and PCK intersect with the participants' responses concerning "good teaching" being innate. Accordingly, what the participants may have referred to as a teaching-artist's innate ability to transfer experiences and skills to students might be simply interpreted as an ability to embed their creativity into the teaching process.

The Characteristics of a Successful Teacher-Artist Process

We point out that this study aims on shedding the light on the characteristics of teaching-artists, who amalgamate both facets of their dual identity. By considering the case of the faculty members at the Lebanese University withstanding the country's exceptionally tough circumstances and the lack of institutional support, the results lead to a characterization of the successful local teaching-artists by the ability to be self-directed learners committed to upholding

effective teaching approaches. Such a conclusion aligns with the international studies manifesting effective teaching-artists as motivated and curious ongoing learners eager and able to take control of paving their professional learning journeys (Anderson, 2004; Ibrahim & Yussof, 2009). The latter is paved through the teaching-artists' informal and self-initiated professional learning on the job from and alongside students and colleagues and through engaging in self-evaluative reflections. In fact, being ongoing reflective practitioners enables teaching-artists to understand their students' needs, embrace their differences and empathetically connect with them. This marks another trait of effective teaching artists as it contributes to the development of the teaching-artist's self-awareness skills associated with the development of pedagogical content knowledge (Grossman, 1990).

In addition to the need to understand the ways students learn in relation to the content being taught (Guskey, 2003), teaching an art entails understanding one's subject and oneself which encompasses one's identity as a human (Palmer, 1997). To be able to understand one's artistic subject matter, teaching-artists should develop strong artistic portfolios and experiences before their recruitment. Although Honeyfield and Fraser (2012) agree on the need for educators to have a wealth of invaluable subject expertise, they highlight the need for their pedagogical knowledge. Scholars agree that the later accentuates the impact of the teaching-artist's self in the subjective process leading to the transmission of their acquired theoretical knowledge, life and professional experiences and artistic talents to students (Pitfield, 2012; Major & Palmer, 2006). As such a transmission is seen fundamental for a professor's success (Fernández-Balboa & Stiehl, 1995), teaching-artists are required to have some pedagogical training, previous teaching experiences or at least a willingness and a passion to transfer their artistic talents to students and impact their lives. Finally, in addition to the teaching-artist's passion for their respective artistic

discipline (Carillo & Baguley, 2011) and the teaching profession, effective teaching in higher education requires educators to foster creativity (Gibson, 2010). In light of Miller's study (2016) and our findings, this can happen by re-envisioning one's role from merely a "lecturer" into a truly "creative teaching-artist". This entails simultaneously being an artist, a scholar and a teacher determined to unleash the students' creativity and engage in ongoing cycles of reconsidering one's pedagogical content knowledge centered on their own creativity.

Recommendations for Practice

This section presents the study's recommendations for practice. In what follows, the recommendations are built on the inferences drawn from the study results as well as the analysis of the recommendations conveyed by the participants throughout the study and the review of the existing literature. In what follows we recommend establishing and developing a hybrid field of study that fosters bi-disciplinary research collaboration between departments of theater and education, re-envisioning the preservice training oriented towards developing teaching-artists PCK and revisiting the content knowledge of theatre programs. Furthermore, we recommend implementing institutional support for continuous professional learning through initiating induction programs, implementing differentiated specialized in-service professional development trainings and enhancing collegiality. Finally, we recommend revisiting the pedagogic recruitment criteria for teaching-artists in light of our previous discussion on the profile of teaching-artists.

Establishing and Developing a Hybrid Field of Study

In light of the study's findings, the majority of the participants reported previously teaching in schools or other higher education institutions, which frames a local demand for theatre teaching-artists. Consequently, we recommend that Higher Education institutions coordinate the establishment of a bi-disciplinary program of study between faculties of education

and faculties of art to lay the foundations for a field of study that responds to the hybrid nature of the teacher-artist profession. Such programs should include a research component to build a bi-disciplinary knowledge base, preservice pedagogic training, and re-envision the existing arts programs to strengthen their content and effectiveness.

Bi-Disciplinary Research Collaboration. The need to develop a knowledge base that encompasses the expertise needed for becoming a successful teacher-artists is strongly needed. As such, universities should support initiatives that promote collaborative qualitative research projects among faculties of education and faculties of arts to develop a local body of theoretical knowledge with the professional learning of teaching-artists as its focal point. Successively, such a collaboration might bring forth the development of specialized teaching courses for theatre students and a reexamination of the current degree offerings.

Moreover, this study adopts the call of some of the Lebanese teaching-artists for fostering research in Higher Education. Accordingly, we call these institutions to engage their teaching staffs in action research as a form of professional development, having the teaching-artists at its core. Action research might take the form of collaborative inquiries in the classroom or on stage joint artistic experimentations with students. Such a call aligns with Webster-Wright's (2009) conclusion regarding reframing professional development from merely training professionals into a rather sociocultural experience, emerging from interactive and informal group-based experiences.

Preservice Training Oriented Towards Developing Teaching-artists PCK. Years ago, our national higher educational institutional closed the program of theatre at the department of education, a program which prepared school theatre teaching-artists. Thereby, the University is currently offering degrees which solely focus on the artistic skills of students, away from any

131

pedagogic training. In light of the participants' calls that urge higher education institutions to support them in the process enrolling in advanced degrees that would impact their teaching, we call the university to provide specialized teaching diplomas for higher education teaching-artists or new master's program that focus on theatre pedagogy, research, and curriculum development. In fact, the initiation of collaboration between the faculty of art and that of education could take the form of proposing for theatre students a specialized elective course that targets their pedagogic skills. Such initiative allows the national higher education institution to graduate theatre artists possessing the basics of pedagogic knowledge to launch a teaching career.

Revisiting the Content Knowledge of Theatre Programs. The participants agreed that the better they are as artists, the better they are as teachers, and those who received their pre-service training abroad conveyed feeling better equipped for their teaching roles. Accordingly, the national institution is urged to initiate collaborative research projects between teaching-artists, curriculum experts and pedagogues oriented towards reconsidering the current curricula in light of the international advancements in theatre education and the emerging trends in tertiary education.

Implementing Institutional Support for Continuous Professional Learning. In comparison with teaching-artists abroad being exposed to some professional development opportunities (Risner,2012), the local teaching-artists at the Lebanese University aren't exposed to any form of professional development. As our findings support those of Kim (2015) highlighting that teaching-artists are not being sufficiently trained for their roles both before and after they are being hired (Kim, 2015), the following section recommends diverse in-service training opportunities. Such opportunities include specialized induction, in-service professional development incentives addressing the development of the pedagogical content knowledge of

132

teaching-artists, what was said to sustain the quality of tertiary education institutions (Charland, 2006).

Induction Programs. Since, induction programs constitute an effective platform enabling the professional development of novice educators lecturing at the university level (Carillo & Baguley, 2011) and are considered as the ground that cements the skills of pre-service training which connects it to in service ongoing professional learning (Smith, 2013;2009;2008), the local university is advised to initiate such programs. The latter could be based on what Simpson Steele (2018) elaborate as mentorship enabling a collaborative exchange among colleagues by assigning novices to experienced mentors. It could also take variable forms in light of the participant's recommendation such as giving novices the chance to lead a "master class" before recruitment or engage them in apprenticeship programs as assistants to current teaching-artists before they are left to handle their own courses.

Differentiated Specialized In-Service Professional Development Trainings Based on Emerging Needs. Scholars agree on the need to effectively train novice teachers and support the ongoing development of the experienced ones (Anderson, 2004) through the offering of a variety of differentiated professional development incentives that cater to their specific needs (McCaslin et al., 2004). Since professional development was reported as essential for those lacking teaching qualifications (Hall, 2010), specialized in-service professional development programs would aid the Lebanese teaching-artists. We highly recommend differentiated institutional support oriented towards the development of teaching-artists' pedagogical content knowledge, while catering for their dissimilar needs, talents and skills.

Enhancing Collegiality

In light of the participants' positive experiences in collaborating with one another and how Hargreaves & Fullan (2013) identified professional collaboration as central to building a social capital in an institution, we call faculty leaders to enable collegiality through arranging for reflective dialogues, forming support groups and providing their staffs with opportunities to train one another. Such recommendations align with the research review reported in Webster-Wright's (2009) article elaborating that learning is embedded and constructed in the experiences of professionals as they socially interact in the workplace, an essential setting for continuing learning. In other words, we recommend that institutions of higher education should profit from their available human capital, and allow them to support one another on their cognitive, and emotional learning journey (Avalos; 2011). One way would be implementing peer mentoring programs that pair teaching-artists together and allows them to accompany one another in their learning journeys.

Pedagogic Recruitment Criteria

The current recruitment practices based on referrals might be inadequate for the selection of the University's teaching-artists staff. Accordingly, we recommend that the national higher education reconsiders its' recruitment practices and its criteria to ensure recruiting highly skillful creative teaching-artists determined to unleash their students' talents, as identified in our conclusion. In other words, recruiters should call on passionate and experienced teaching-artists who would have developed in addition to their artistic career paths worth sharing with students, pedagogic skills through training or teaching experiences. Furthermore, art faculties should headhunt self-directed ongoing learners, who are highly empathic, self-aware and reflective

practitioners able to engage in ongoing cycles of developing and reconsidering their pedagogical content knowledge and role in higher education.

Recommendations for Further Research

Since there is a lack of studies about the professional learning of teaching-artists (Abrams et al., 2012) our rationale mostly relied on the works of scholars on the development of PCK of theatre school educators or University lecturers in fields other than theatre. The such identifies gaps in the global literature and presents the need for further development of this hybrid field of study. Given this global scarcity of research on teaching-artists, we call local and Arab researchers to embark on collaborative research studies which could set a regional milestone towards a much needed research agenda on understanding the professional learning of University Educators and the nature of the PCK they need to reach effectiveness. Moreover, additional in-depth studies that inquire on the teaching of theatre and other art forms in various higher education contexts are still needed to allow researchers to capture success stories of those teaching-artists who self-direct their learning and the development of their PCK.

While this study frames the importance of supporting teaching-artists in their learning journeys from its inception and proposes some guidelines for those interested in enhancing their learning, it falls short on offering research-based guidelines to design professional learning programs. Accordingly, we urge researchers and educational leaders in higher education to engage in action research studies aimed at identifying the design component of pre-service, induction and in-service programs that enable institutions of higher education to take control of their teaching staff's professional advancement.

The findings of this study must be seen in light of its research methodology. Accordingly, the chosen case study design sheds the light on the experiences of theatre teaching-artists at one of

the two branches of the Faculty of Fine Arts that offer a theatre degree. For a more representative nationwide study and a better understanding on the phenomenon of the professional learning of local theatre teaching-artists, we suggest expanding on this study and replicating it for generalizability by considering the theatre teaching-artists at the other branch and at private higher education institutions. Therefore, to dig deeper into the realities of teaching-artists, further research in the Lebanese context could envision comparing and contrasting the teaching-artists' hybrid identities and their professional learning paths in both public and private institutions. Also, this study accounts for the responses of teaching-artists on their hybrid identity and the development of their PCK without taking into consideration their actual practices in class or the perceptions of students concerning "good teaching of an art". Accordingly, other qualitative studies are urged to further investigate on the matter by hearing the voices of theatre students and inquiring on their perceptions concerning effective arts and theatre educators. Finally, we attempted in our literature review to rationalize creativity, crucial for teaching in higher education (Gibson, 2010; Jarvis, 2019), as an additional component in Park & Oliver's (2008) PCK model. However, in light of the shared characteristics of creativity and PCK which intersect with the participants' responses concerning "good teaching" as the transfer of experiences and skills to students, we hypothesize that the teaching-artists' PCK might actually be an outlet for their creativity. Since the scope of this study can't confirm such a hypothesis, we call future researchers to inquire on the extent to which PCK and creativity correspond, as both mental processes tend to explore new possibilities by embedding skills, combining knowledge and transforming experiences.

APPENDIX A

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL

1. **A Teaching-artist's professional learning path**

   - Kindly elaborate on your career path as an artist

     o What were the factors that lead your career path into artistry?

   - Kindly elaborate on your career path as an educator

     o Initiation into becoming an educator. I want to take you back to the first two years of you assuming your teaching responsibility at the university level:

        ▪ What were the factors that lead your career path into academia?

        ▪ Describe how you got the job.

        ▪ How did you, as an artist, prepare to become a teaching-artist?

   Defining a teaching-artist: *The term "teaching-artists" is a hybrid terminology indicative of the complexity and shifting characteristics of the dual career-professional artists working as educators (Kim, 2015). These, teaching-artists, alongside mastering their artistic disciplines, develop pedagogical approaches for effectively supporting their students as they perform, produce, and respond to art (Simpson Steele, 2018).*

        ▪ What aspects of your training as an artist contributed to your career as an educator?

     o What were the challenges you faced during your first year(s) as a teaching-artist?

- ▪ Please share the three key challenges and give examples on how they impacted your professional development.

- ▪ What measures did you take to overcome these challenges?

- o What were the factors that supported your career as a teaching-artist?

- ▪ State the three key factors and elaborate with examples on how they impacted your development

- ▪ What on-the job experiences lead to the development of knowledge as a teaching-artist?

2. **The professional learning of teaching-artists**

- What are the factors (personal, professional, societal) that shapes your professional learning as an artist?

   - o How do you continue to develop your skills as an artist?

- What are the factors (personal, professional, societal) that shapes your professional learning as a teaching-artist?

   - o How do you continue to develop your skills as a teaching-artist?

   - o What on-the job experiences continue to lead to the development of your knowledge as a teaching-artist?

   - o What aspects of your professional career and experiences as an artist, contribute towards your professional development as a teaching-artist?

   - o What are the personal factors that contribute to the advancement of your role as a teaching-artist?

   - o What aspects of your personal life support your professional learning?

- What social conditions within the context of the Lebanese society, if any, contribute to your teaching? How does it shape your professional learning?

- Compare your first years of teaching to your current state?

  - In what ways did your knowledge, skills and experiences as an artist impact your identity as an educator?

  - How did you transform your artistic skills into teaching skills?

  - In what ways did your knowledge, skills and experience as an educator impact your identity as an artist?

  - What beliefs as an artist did you carry with you into academia?

3. **Nature of Pedagogical content knowledge that theatre teaching-artists develop.**

   - What characteristics do you see to be critical for a successful teaching-artist? '

   - What are the common aspects of artistry and pedagogy?

   - How do you develop your pedagogical content knowledge?

     - How do you develop your instructional strategies?

     - How do you teach?

   - Please describe to me your profile as an artist-teacher.

     - How do you describe yourself as an artist?

     - How do you describe yourself as an educator?

     - How do you describe yourself as a teaching-artist?

       - What is your teaching philosophy?

       - How would you present yourself to your student?

4. **Organizational conditions that impact a teaching-artist's pedagogical professional learning.**

- What forms of institutional support have you been exposed to as a novice teaching-artist?

- What are the institutional incentives that would have facilitated your transition into teaching?

- How can an academic institution support an artist's shift into academia?

- What forms of institutional support are you currently exposed to as a teaching-artist?

- What forms of institutional support would support your professional development and support the quality of your teaching as a teaching-artists?

APPENDIX B

SAMPLE OF AN ALTERNATED INTERVIEW PROTOCOL

1. **A Teaching-artist's professional learning path**

   - Kindly elaborate on your career path as an artist

     o What were the factors that lead your career path into artistry?

   - Kindly elaborate on your career path as an educator

     o Initiation into becoming an educator. I want to take you back to the first two years of you assuming your teaching responsibility at the university level:

       ▪ What were the factors that lead your career path into academia?

       ▪ Describe how you got the job.

       ▪ How did you, as an artist, prepare to become a teaching-artist?

   Defining a teaching-artist: *The term "teaching-artists" is a hybrid terminology indicative of the complexity and shifting characteristics of the dual career-professional artists working as educators (Kim, 2015). These, teaching-artists, alongside mastering their artistic disciplines, develop pedagogical approaches for effectively supporting their students as they perform, produce, and respond to art (Simpson Steele, 2018).*

       ▪ What aspects of your training as an artist contributed to your career as an educator?

     o What were the challenges you faced during your first year(s) as a teaching-artist?

       ▪ Please share the three key challenges and give examples on how they impacted your professional development.

141

▪ What measures did you take to overcome these challenges?

● *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW WERE YOU ABLE TO TRANSFER YOUR BELIEFS?*

○ What were the factors that supported your career as a teaching-artist?

▪ State the three key factors and elaborate with examples on how they impacted your development *(ANSWERED IN A PREVIOUS PROBE)*

▪ What on-the job experiences lead to the development of knowledge as a teaching-artist? *(ANSWERED IN A PREVIOUS PROBE)*

2. **The professional learning of teaching-artists**

● What are the factors (personal, professional, societal) that shapes your professional learning as an artist?

○ How do you continue to develop your skills as an artist? *(ANSWERED IN A PREVIOUS PROBE)*

● What are the factors (personal, professional, societal) that shapes your professional learning as a teaching-artist?

○ How do you continue to develop your skills as a teaching-artist?

○ What on-the job experiences continue to lead to the development of your knowledge as a teaching-artist?

○ What aspects of your professional career and experiences as an artist, contribute towards your professional development as a teaching-artist?

○ What are the personal factors that contribute to the advancement of your role as a teaching-artist?

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW DO YOU TRANSFER THESE SKILLS TO YOUR STUDENTS?*

  o What aspects of your personal life support your professional learning?

  o What social conditions within the context of the Lebanese society, if any, contribute to your teaching? How does it shape your professional learning?

- Compare your first years of teaching to your current state?

  o In what ways did your knowledge, skills and experiences as an artist impact your identity as an educator?

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: WHY IS IT IMPORTANT FOR YOU AS AN EDUCATOR TO PRACTICE ACTING?*

  o How did you transform your artistic skills into teaching skills?

  o In what ways did your knowledge, skills and experience as an educator impact your identity as an artist?

  o What beliefs as an artist did you carry with you into academia?

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW DO YOU TRANSLATE THESE BELIEFS IN CLASS?*

3. **Nature of Pedagogical content knowledge that theatre teaching-artists develop.**

   - What characteristics do you see to be critical for a successful teaching-artist? '

   - What are the common aspects of artistry and pedagogy? *(REPHRASED: WHERE DO ARTISTRY AND PEDAGOGY INTERSECT? HOW ARE THEY ALIKE?*

   - How do you develop your pedagogical content knowledge?

     ▪ How do you develop your instructional strategies?

     ▪ How do you teach?

143

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW HAVE YOU DISCOVERED THIS PATH?*

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW DO YOU TRANSLATE THIS GOAL THAT YOU'RE SET FOR YOUR STUDENTS IN CLASS?*

- Please describe to me your profile as an artist-teacher.

  - How do you describe yourself as an artist?

  - How do you describe yourself as an educator?

  - How do you describe yourself as a teaching-artist?

    - What is your teaching philosophy? (BASED ON THE PREVIOUS INTERVIEWS, AS THE PARTICIPANTS FOUND IT CHALLENGING TO ANSWER THIS PROBE, IT WAS MOVED INTO A CLOSING PROBE)

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW ARE YOU DEVELOPING THIS (WHAT THE PARTICIPANT IDENTIFIED AS THE STUDENTS' CULTURE)? HOW DO YOU PROVIDE TO THEM THESE NEW OPPORTUNITIES?*

    - ~~How would you present yourself to your student?~~ *(PROBE REMOVED; PARTICIPANTS WEREN'T COMFORTABLE ANSWERING THIS QUESTION)*

4. **Organizational conditions that impact a teaching-artist's pedagogical professional learning.**

- What forms of institutional support have you been exposed to as a novice teaching-artist?

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: YOU'VE STATED THAT YOUR COLLEAGUES WHO HAVE TAUGHT YOU AS A STUDENT SUPPORTED YOU AS A NOVICE TEACHER,*

WHAT FORMS OF INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT WOULD ANOTHER TEACHER WHO WASN'T THEIR STUDENT RECEIVE?

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW DID THE Administration FOLLOW UP ON YOU?*

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: HOW DO YOU KNOW YOU'RE TEACHING WELL?*

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: WHEN YOU ARE ASSIGNED A CLASS, HOW DO DEVELOP YOUR LESSON BASED ON WHAT HAS BEEN ASSIGNED BY THE CENTRAL COMMITTEE?*

- What are the institutional incentives that would have facilitated your transition into teaching?

- How can an academic institution support an artist's shift into academia?

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: IF YOU WERE ASSIGNED THE ROLE OF THE HEAD OF DEPARTMENT, HOW WOULD YOU SUPPORT NEWLY RECRUITED TEACHERS?*

- What forms of institutional support are you currently exposed to as a teaching-artist?

- What forms of institutional support would support your professional development and support the quality of your teaching as a teaching-artists?

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: IF YOU WERE IN CHARGE OF THE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF THIS FACULTY'S STAFF, WHAT FORM OF INTUITIONAL SUPPORT WOULD YOU IMPLEMENT TO SUPPORT THEIR PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT?*

- *ADDITIONAL PROBE: IF YOU HAD AN OPEN BUDGET, MEANING IF THE REPORTED FINANCIAL RESOURCES WERE NOT A CONSTRAINT. WHAT WOULD YOU LIKE TO IMPLEMENT?*

APPENDIX C

SAMPLE OF CATEGORIZING DATA UNDER THEME

Code	Participants' responses
Teaching one's experience: protecting students from the troubles the educators lived.	Y0004: If I had a negative experience worth highlighting for my students, I make sure to share it with them so that when they start working in the field they'll be aware of it, I want to prevent them the hustle I had to live. C0008: I transfer to the students everything that I've lived or consider as a problem for artists. I share with my students these very personal experiences. K0008: I wanted to give this place more than it has given me as a student M0006: All the fears and challenges I have lived as an actress give me an awareness of my students' fears, and accordingly I'm able to help them overcome their fears N0003: When you face as a student certain challenges, as some educator's tend to overcomplicated things, and you discover the easier path you have to share this path with your students. L0010: I used whatever projects or methods that made sense to me and made me understand what my educators were saying, on the other hand I didn't use whatever didn't

make sense to me and tried to improve it in a way to make it accessible for my students

S0001: When I approached the theatre field, I always felt I was inferior to my colleagues as they had graduated from the Faculty I wasn't admitted into. I feel they looked at me in a degrading way... This is why I intend in my classes to have my students open up to one another, support one another and accept one another.

B0005: I have created new synthesis that I haven't read elsewhere, this helped me to save my students the troubles I had experienced

B0005: I'm able to predict the challenging experiences the students might encounter. I'm someone who remembers the challenging experiences and the difficulties I had encountered as an actress without being able to formulate a clear call for help.

147

REFERENCES

Abrams, J., Alker, G., Solomon, A., Dolan, J., Shaw, P., Weaver, L., Zapata, M. R. (2012).

    Reflecting on ATHE's silver: Archiving conference curation and the state of the field in

    theatre and performance studies. Theatre Topics, 22(1), 1-22

Anderson, M. (2004). The professional development journeys of drama educators. Youth Theatre

    Journal, 18(1), 1-16. doi:10.1080/08929092.2004.10012560

Anderson, M. E., & Risner, D. (2012). A survey of teaching artists in dance and theater:

    Implications for preparation, curriculum, and professional degree programs. Arts

    Education Policy Review, 113(1), 1-16. doi:10.1080/10632913.2012.626383

Avalos, B. (2011). Teacher professional development in teaching and teacher education over ten

    years. Teaching and Teacher Education, 27(1), 10-20. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2010.08.007

Bakhos, M. (2016). دراسة في الاخراج المسرحي 1 طلال درجاني جدلية ستانيسلافسكس و مايرخولد (1 st ed., Vol.

    1). Beirut: Dar-Alfarabi.

    Bashshur M. (1996). مجلة دراسات لبنانية

    Bashshur M. (1997). التعليم العالي في لبنان (ط. ed.). 1. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية

    Borko, H. (2004). Professional development and teacher learning: Mapping the terrain.

    Educational Researcher, 33(8), 3-15. doi:10.3102/0013189X033008003

Brandt, A. K., & Eagleman, D. (2017). The runaway species: How human creativity remakes the

    world.

    Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research

    in Psychology, 3(2), 77-101. doi:10.1191/1478088706qp063oa

Braund, M. (2015). Drama and learning science: An empty space? British Educational

Research Journal, 41(1), 102-121. doi:10.1002/berj.3130

Carillo, C., & Baguley, M. (2011). From schoolteacher to university lecturer: Illuminating

the journey from the classroom to the university for two arts educators. Teaching and

Teacher Education, 27, 62-72. doi:10.1016/j. tate.2010.07.003

Chan, K. K. H., & Yung, B. H. W. (2018). Developing pedagogical content knowledge for

teaching a new topic: More than teaching experience and subject matter knowledge.

Research in Science Education, 48(2), 233-265. doi:10.1007/s11165-016-9567-1

Charland, W. (2006). The art Association/Higher education partnership: Implementing

residential professional development. Arts Education Policy Review, 107(6), 31-39.

doi:10.3200/AEPR.107.6.31-39

Chemi, T. (2015). The teaching artist as cultural learning entrepreneur: An introductory

conceptualization. Teaching Artist Journal, 13(2), 84-94.

doi:10.1080/15411796.2015.997114

Corbin, J. M., & Strauss, A. L. (2008). Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and

procedures for developing grounded theory (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage

Publications.

Daniels, J. (2017). Professional learning in higher education: Making good practice relevant.

International Journal for Academic Development, 22(2), 170-181.

doi:10.1080/1360144X.2016.1261352

Depaepe, F., Verschaffel, L., & Kelchtermans, G. (2013). Pedagogical content knowledge: A

systematic review of the way in which the concept has pervaded mathematics educational

research. Teaching and Teacher Education, 34, 12-25. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.03.001

Fernández-Balboa, J., & Stiehl, J. (1995). The generic nature of pedagogical content knowledge among college professors. Teaching and Teacher Education, 11(3), 293-306. doi:10.1016/0742-051X(94)00030-A

Fraser, S. P. (2016). Pedagogical content knowledge (PCK): Exploring its usefulness for science lecturers in higher education. Research in Science Education, 46(1), 141-161. doi:10.1007/s11165-014-9459-1

Gall, M. D., Gall, J. P., & Borg, W. R. (2010). Applying educational research: How to read, do, and use research to solve problems of practice (sixth ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson

Gibson, R. (2010). The 'art' of creative teaching: Implications for higher education. Teaching in Higher Education, 15(5), 607-613. doi:10.1080/13562517.2010.493349

Grossman, P. L. (1990). The making of a teacher: Teacher knowledge and teacher education. New York: Teachers College Press.

Gudmundsdottir, S., & Shulman, L. (1987). Pedagogical content knowledge in social studies. Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research, 31(2), 59-70. doi:10.1080/0031383870310201

Guskey, T. R. (2003). What makes professional development effective? The Phi Delta Kappan, 84(10), 748-750. doi:10.1177/003172170308401007

Guskey, T. R., & Yoon, K. S. (2009). What works in professional development? A research synthesis confirms the difficulty of translating professional development into student achievement gains despite the intuitive and logical connection. those responsible for planning and implementing professional development must learn how to critically assess and evaluate the effectiveness of what they do. Phi Delta Kappan, 90(7), 495.

Hajjar, G. (2018, March 03). الجامعة اللبنانية: مزيد من الخلل الطئفي و التنفيعات لأحة تفرغ ب700 اسم. An-Nahar. ترضي الأحزاب بالمحاصصةز

Hall, J. (2010). Making art, teaching art, learning art: Exploring the concept of the artist teacher. International Journal of Art & Design Education, 29(2), 103-110. doi:10.1111/j.1476-8070.2010.01636.x

Hargreaves, A., & Fullan, M. (1992). Understanding teacher development. New York: Teachers College Press.

Hargreaves, A., & Fullan, M. (2013). THE POWER of PROFESSIONAL CAPITAL. Journal of Staff Development, 34(3), 36.

Honeyfield, J. & Fraser C. (2012). Resource Development for Novice Educators: The Story of a New Zealand Interinstitutional Collaboration. International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education, 24 (2), 264-271

Hugo, T. (2019, April 02). L'Université libanaise, un établissement public peu connu des jeunes et des parents. L'orient Le Jour. Retrieved June 5, 2019, from https://www.lorientlejour.com/article/1164124/luniversite-libanaise-un-etablissement-public-peu-connu-des-jeunes-et-des parents.html?fbclid=IwAR1FJ8dFIit0JZ5bpV_ae8c3Q3S7HBPmAl9tw277HkJmwcYtUr4 kDxXc5Ag

Ibrahim, M. N., & Syed Yusoff, S. O. (2009). What does good visual art teaching look like in a Malaysian higher education setting? The International Journal of Learning: Annual Review, 16(6), 129-144. doi:10.18848/1447-9494/CGP/v16i06/46345

Jarvis, C. (2019). The art of freedom in HE teacher development. Teaching in Higher Education, 24(1), 17-31. doi:10.1080/13562517.2018.1456422

Kempe, A. (2009). Resilience or resistance? the value of subject knowledge for drama

    teachers. Research in Drama Education: The Journal of Applied Theatre and Performance,

    14(3), 411-428. doi:10.1080/13569780903072224

Kim, B. J. (2015). Balancing the apollonian and Dionysian dualism: A look at the

    drama/theatre teaching artist. Research in Drama Education: The Journal of Applied

    Theatre and Performance, 20(3), 302-305. doi:10.1080/13569783.2015.1059264

Leadbeater, C. (2005). Britain's Creativity Challenge. London: Creative and Cultural Skills

    Sector Council.

Lee, B., Cawthon, S., & Dawson, K. (2013). Elementary and secondary teacher self-efficacy

    for teaching and pedagogical conceptual change in a drama-based professional

    development program. Teaching and Teacher Education, 30, 84-98.

    doi:10.1016/j.tate.2012.10.010

Lupton, M. (2013). Reclaiming the art of teaching. Teaching in Higher Education, 18(2),

    156-166. doi:10.1080/13562517.2012.694098

Major, C. H., & Palmer, B. (2006). Reshaping teaching and learning: The transformation of

    faculty pedagogical content knowledge. Higher Education, 51(4), 619-647.

McCaslin, G., Rhodes, A., & Lind, T. (2004). Professional development for teaching artists:

    A sampling. Teaching Artist Journal, 2(3), 140-152. doi:10.1207/s1541180xtaj0203_2

Merriam, S. (2009). Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation.

Miller, R. (2016). The Courage to Teach and the Courage to Lead: Considerations for

    Theatre and Dance in Higher Education. Theatre Topics 26(1), E-1-E-7. The Johns

    Hopkins University Press. Retrieved December 9, 2017, from Project MUSE database.

Mishra, P., & Koehler, M. J. (2006). Technological pedagogical content knowledge: A

framework for teacher knowledge. Teachers College Record, 108(6), 1017-1054.

doi:10.1111/j.1467-9620.2006.00684.x

Palmer, P. J. (1997). The heart of a teacher identity and integrity in teaching. Change: The

Magazine of Higher Learning, 29(6), 14-21. doi:10.1080/00091389709602343

Park, S., & Oliver, J. S. (2008). Revisiting the conceptualisation of pedagogical content

knowledge (PCK): PCK as a conceptual tool to understand teachers as professionals.

Research in Science Education, 38(3), 261-284. doi:10.1007/s11165-007-9049-6

Pitfield, M. (2012). Transforming subject knowledge: Drama student-teachers and the pursuit

of pedagogical content knowledge. Research in Drama Education: The Journal of Applied

Theatre and Performance, 17(3), 425-442. doi:10.1080/13569783.2012.694038

Risner, D. (2012). Hybrid lives of teaching and artistry: A study of teaching artists in dance

in the USA. Research in Dance Education, 13(2), 175-193.

doi:10.1080/14647893.2012.677426

Schuttler, M. (2010). Developing A master's program for theater educators. Arts Education

Policy Review, 111(1), 1.

Shagrir, L. (2015). Working with students in higher education - professional conceptions of

teacher educators. Teaching in Higher Education, 20(8), 783-794.

doi:10.1080/13562517.2015.1085854

Shulman, L. S. (1987). Assessment for teaching: An initiative for the profession. The Phi

Delta Kappan, 69(1), 38-44.

Shulman, L. S. (1986). Those who understand: Knowledge growth in teaching. Educational

Researcher, 15(2), 4-14. doi:10.3102/0013189X015002004

Simpson Steele, J. (2018). The teaching artist's journey: Professional learning in a hybrid

    field. Youth Theatre Journal, 32(1), 60. doi:10.1080/08929092.2017.1422167

Smith, R. E. (2013;2009;2008;). Human resources administration: A school-based

    perspective (4th ed.). London; New York: Routledge. doi:10.4324/978131585553

Stover, S., & Veres, M. (2013). TPACK in higher education: Using the TPACK framework

    for professional development. Global Education Journal, 2013(1), 93-110. Retrieved from

    http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=ehh&AN=89332416&site=ehost-

    live

Walmsley, B. (2013). A reflective perspective on the challenges facing research-led teaching

    in the performing and creative arts. Arts and Humanities in Higher Education, 12(2-3),

    222-233. doi:10.1177/1474022212473944

Webster-Wright, A. (2009). Reframing professional development through understanding

    authentic professional learning. Review of Educational Research, 79(2), 702-739.

    doi:10.3102/0034654308330970

Weltsek, J., Duffy, P., & Carney C. (2014) The local and global state of theater education

    research and policy. Arts Education Policy Review, 115(3), 63-71.

    doi:10.1080/10632913.2014.913968

Zepke, N. (2013). Threshold concepts and student engagement: Revisiting pedagogical

    content knowledge. Active Learning in Higher Education, 14(2), 97-107.

    doi:10.1177/1469787413481127

الجامعة اللبنانية (2017). Lebanese University Mission Statement. Retrieved March 11, 2018,

    from https://www.ul.edu.lb/lu/mission.aspx