

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY OF BEIRUT

EXPLORING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE  
INTERNATIONAL BACCALAUREATE DIPLOMA  
PROGRAMME IN THE LEBANESE CONTEXT

by  
SARA CHADI REFAI

A thesis  
submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of Master of Arts  
to the Department of Education  
of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences  
at the American University of Beirut

Beirut, Lebanon  
January 2020

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY OF BEIRUT

EXPLORING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE  
INTERNATIONAL BACCALAUREATE DIPLOMA  
PROGRAMME IN THE LEBANESE CONTEXT

by  
SARA CHADI REFAI

Approved by:

Dr. Rima Karami-Akkary, Associate Professor  
Department of Education

  
Advisor

Dr Saouma BouJaoude, Associate Dean & Professor  
Department of Education

  
Member of Committee

Dr Anies Al-Hroub, Associate Professor  
Department of Education

  
Member of Committee

Date of thesis defense: January 20, 2020

# AMERICAN UNIVERSITY OF BEIRUT


## THESIS, DISSERTATION, PROJECT RELEASE FORM

Student Name: Refai Sara Chadi  
Last First Middle

☒ Master's Thesis ☐ Master's Project ☐ Doctoral Dissertation

☒ I authorize the American University of Beirut to: (a) reproduce hard or electronic copies of my thesis, dissertation, or project; (b) include such copies in the archives and digital repositories of the University; and (c) make freely available such copies to third parties for research or educational purposes.

☐ I authorize the American University of Beirut, to: (a) reproduce hard or electronic copies of it; (b) include such copies in the archives and digital repositories of the University; and (c) make freely available such copies to third parties for research or educational purposes after : **One --- year from the date of submission of my thesis, dissertation, or project.**  
**Two --- years from the date of submission of my thesis, dissertation, or project.**  
**Three -- years from the date of submission of my thesis, dissertation, or project.**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature Date  
January 22, 2020

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

With the greatest of gratitude to Dr Rima Karami-Akkary whose endless patience, engagement and enthusiasm were both an inspiration and an ever-present reminder that doing research in the Middle East should never be seen as just an assignment.

Many thanks to Drs. BouJaoude and Al-Hroub whose thoughtful and insightful comments remained with me as I developed my proposal and conducted my research. The guidance provided to me by my committee was integral to my development as a researcher. I aspire to be as impactful in the education of my own students.

To my participants who opened their hearts and practices to me. They shared not only their work and pedagogies, but also their hopes and frustrations as passionate educators and invested members of the teaching community in Lebanon.

To my friends and family for their support. Lastly, to my husband Phil Wendel who is everything and without whom this would be nothing.

# AN ABSTRACT OF THE THESIS OF

Sara Chadi Refai for Master of Arts

Major: Educational Administration and Policy Studies

Title: Exploring the Implementation of the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme in the Lebanese Context

This study sought to answer the following research questions: a) what are the practices and core values expected of DP teachers based on their understanding of the IB's mission statement, Learner Profile, pedagogical approaches and DP assessment requirements, b) what, if any, challenges do DP teachers face in meeting the IB's expectations in the Lebanese context in terms of their understanding of its pedagogical approaches, its requirements when it comes to values-based teaching and preparing students for the DP assessments and c) in what ways are teachers' challenges due to incongruences between the core values of the IB and those commonly used in the Lebanese context?

The study was built on a body of literature that suggests that both students and teachers face challenges when transitioning to the DP. Data from focus groups and interviews that included 62 DP teachers were analyzed using thematic analysis. Key findings show that teachers have a strong understanding of the IB's expectations of them as DP teachers in terms of how and what they teach and the dual purpose of the DP as a skills and values-based framework.

Challenges faced by teachers fall under two categories, one that is the result of incongruences between the value systems of the IB and that of the Lebanese context and another category which is the result of an incongruence between the value system of the IB and the realities of the DP itself.

Recommendations resulting from this study include strategies to support teacher training with a focus on low-cost, context specific opportunities for professional development. In terms of research, there is a clear need for more cross-cultural studies on the implementation of the DP which can draw parallels between the challenges of implementation in different types of contexts.

## CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....	v
ABSTRACT.....	vi
LIST OF TABLES.....	xii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	xiii

### Chapter

I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
A. Background.....	2
B. Problem Statement.....	4
C. Rationale.....	9
D. Research Questions.....	11
E. Significance.....	12
II. LITERATURE REVIEW.....	14
A. The International Baccalaureate and its Diploma Programme.....	16
1. The Founding of the IB and DP: Practicality, Ideology and Pedagogy.....	16
2. The IB in 2019: A Story of Growth.....	18
B. Expectations of Teachers: The How and the What of DP Teaching....	19
1. Academic Expectations of Teachers.....	20
2. Values-Based Expectations of Teachers: The Learner Profile and International Mindedness.....	23
C. Challenges Faced by Teachers in Meeting the IB's Expectations.....	25
1. Keeping Up with the Workload of the DP.....	25
2. Aligning the DP Curriculum with Local Requirements and Practices.....	27
3. Transitioning to New Pedagogical Practices and Values.....	29
4. Teaching International-Mindedness in Settings Which Lack Diversity.....	30
5. Opportunities for Teacher Support.....	31
D. Concerns Around the Implementation of the DP in non-Western Contexts..	32
1. Global Representation Within the Spread and Leadership of the IB.....	33
2. Preserving Cultural Values and Local Knowledge Systems When Implementing the DP in non-Western Contexts.....	35
3. Contribution to Academic and Socioeconomic Segregation.....	39

E. The Lebanese Educational Landscape.....	43
1. Context and History.....	43
2. The Lebanese Baccalaureate: Framework and Pedagogy.....	45
3. Education and Socio-economic Division in Lebanon.....	47
4. Studies on the Implementation of the DP in Lebanon.....	48
F. Theoretical Framework.....	51
G. Summary.....	53
<b>III. METHODOLOGY.....</b>	<b>55</b>
A. Research Questions.....	55
B. Research Design.....	55
C. Data Collection Tools.....	56
D. Study Sites and Participants.....	57
E. Data Analysis.....	58
1. Thematic Analysis.....	59
2. Coding Using Microsoft Excel.....	62
F. Strategies for Ensuring Quality.....	63
1. Usefulness.....	64
2. Coding Checks.....	65
3. Member Checks.....	66
4. Chain of Evidence.....	66
5. Reflexivity.....	66
G. Positionality of Researcher.....	67
H. Limitations.....	68
<b>IV RESEARCH FINDINGS.....</b>	<b>70</b>
A. DP Teachers' Understandings of the Expected Core Values and Practices.....	74
1. Espousing and Incorporating the Values of the Learner Profile into Teaching.....	74
2. Using the DP Syllabi to Teach the LP Attributes.....	75
3. Explicitly Teaching the LP.....	76
4. Developing Open Relationships with Students.....	77
5. Modeling the LP Traits and Values.....	78
6. Incorporating International-Mindedness into Teaching.....	80
7. Using the IB Approaches to Teaching.....	84
8. Pursuing PD and Remaining Open to Continuous Learning.....	93
B. Challenges Faced by DP Teachers When Implementing the DP.....	95
1. The Rigorous Nature of the DP.....	96
2. Students Struggle with the Size and Rigor of the Program.....	103
3. Context Specific Challenges of Teaching International-Mindedness and the Values of the Learner Profile.....	112
C. Perceived Differences in the Cultural and Academic Value Systems of the IB and the Lebanese Context.....	122
1. Incongruences Between the Societal Value System of the Lebanese Context and that of the IB.....	123
2. Incongruences Between the Academic Values of the DP and Those of the Lebanese Baccalaureate.....	128

D. Summary of the Results.....	136
V. DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	141
A. Discussion.....	142
1. Teachers' Understandings of the IB's Expectations.....	143
2. Challenges Faced by Teachers and the Incongruences They Attribute them to.....	145
B. Conclusion.....	158
C. Recommendations for Practice.....	161
D. Recommendations for Research.....	164
E. Reflections on the Research.....	165

## Appendix

A. THE IB LEARNER PROFILE.....	166
B. LIST OF DP SCHOOLS IN LEBANON.....	167
C. STRUCTURAL/CULTURAL FINDINGS USING SOCIAL SYSTEMS THEORY.....	168
D. FOCUS GROUP QUESTIONS.....	170
E. PHASES OF THEMATIC ANALYSIS.....	173
F. EXAMPLE OF EXCEL SHEET CODES.....	176

REFERENCES.....	178
-----------------	-----

## TABLES

Table	Page
1. Breakdown of IB World Schools (August 2018).....	33
2. A Merging of Quality Control Measures Used in this Study.....	64
3. Frequency of Responses of the Research Participants in the Focus Groups....	72

## ABBREVIATIONS

IB: International Baccalaureate

IBDP or DP: International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme

LP: Learner Profile

IM: International-mindedness

IA: Internal assessment (internally graded IB assessment)

TOK: Theory of Knowledge (DP course)

CAS: Creativity, Service, Action (DP compulsory course component)

EE: Extended Essay (DP compulsory course component)

LB: Lebanese Baccalaureate

# CHAPTER I

## INTRODUCTION

The International Baccalaureate (IB), previously known as the International Baccalaureate Organization, describes itself as a “not for profit foundation, motivated by its mission to create a better world through education” (IB, 2015b, p.3). As of September 2019, 5,175 schools across the world had been certified to adopt one or more of its programs (IB, n.d.-b) and the IB has stated that over 1 million students were enrolled in an IB program (IB, 2018a).

In 2017, the IB’s Diploma Programme (IBDP or DP) counted for 52% of implemented programs worldwide, more than double the number of either its primary (PYP) or middle school (MYP) programs (Kidson, Odhiambo & Wilson, 2018). It has become, as described by Doherty and Shield (2012), “an iconic alternative to local curricula” (p. 415).

Studies looking at the experiences of teachers and students as they transition to the program have uncovered that they face certain challenges. These challenges tend to be very common across the different contexts with a subsection of challenges appearing to be unique to non-Western contexts. Challenges that are shared across all contexts include keeping up with the workload of the DP, covering course content within the allocated time and teaching international-mindedness to a homogenous student body (Barnett, 2013; Cook, 2017; Dulfer, 2019; Halicioglu, 2008; Taylor, 2019). Challenges that are specific to non-Western contexts focus on the adoption of new educational paradigms and practices and adopting the IB’s standards around educational concepts such as academic honesty, critical thinking or assessment styles (Barnett, 2013; Gan, 2009; Halicioglu, 2008).

Additionally, while it continues to grow in popularity, the DP has also come under some scrutiny. Firstly for its claims of offering an international education, the very definition

of which is a contested concept (Bunnell, 2008; Bunnell, 2011; Hahn, 2003), secondly for selling itself as a curriculum that can be implemented across, and easily integrated into, educational structures in different contexts (Hughes, 2009; Paris, 2003; Poonoosamy, 2010; Van Oord, 2007), and thirdly, for encouraging the streaming of students along academic and socioeconomic lines (Doherty, 2009; Doherty & Shield, 2012; Gardner-McTaggart, 2016).

The goal of this study is to explore challenges around the implementation of the DP in Lebanon through the lens of DP teachers' understandings of the IB's expectations of them in terms of pedagogical approaches, assessment styles and core values. The study will additionally explore the ways in which these challenges are due to a lack of alignment between the core values of the IB and those of the Lebanese context. The purpose of the study is to provide school leaders and policy makers with an understanding of how to support teachers effectively in their implementation of the program by understanding their needs and the challenges of teaching the DP in the Lebanese context.

### **Background**

The IB offers four curricular frameworks: the Primary Years (PYP), Middle Years (MYP), and Careers (CP) Programmes as well as the DP which was its original offering in the late 1960's (Hayden, 2006). The initial motivation for the DP was to fill a gap in the market that had been carved out by the need of transnational families for an academically rigorous, widely recognized leaving certificate that their children could use to apply to universities in their countries of origin (Bunnell, 2008; Hayden, 2006; Hill & Saxton, 2014; Peterson, 1972).

The founders of the IB aligned the pedagogical goals of the DP with the nurturing of critical thought through an inquiry-based, hands-on approach to teaching and learning (Hayden, 2006; Hill, 2006; IB, n.d.-a; Peterson, 1972; Van Oord, 2007). Their ideas were

based on a constructivist approach to pedagogy (Hill & Saxton, 2014) and heavily influenced by Dewey, Piaget and Bruner (IB, n.d.-a).

Academically, the DP framework was based on Alec Peterson's, the first Director General of the IB and a key architect of its programming, dissatisfaction with the British A levels system. He had been advocating for less subject-specific specialization in high school so students could take more courses from across the disciplines (Hill & Saxton, 2014; Pound, 2006). Peterson's idea of a broad-based curriculum formed the backbone of the DP, which married "the range of subjects taught in the French baccalaureate...with the depth of knowledge and specialism found in the British A-level system" (Balzani, 2010, p. 61).

Although its beginnings were economically opportunistic and academically oriented, post-World War II idealism also motivated the birth of the DP and its founders were passionate about building an internationalized curriculum that would transcend national boundaries and produce socially responsible global citizens who were tolerant, knowledgeable about the world, and accepting of its wide range of cultures and perspectives (Balzani, 2010; Hayden, 2006; Hill & Saxton, 2014; IB, 2015a; Peterson, 1972).

Despite the lack of agreement on how to define international education (Bunnell, 2008; Hayden & Wong, 1997; Kidson et al., 2018; Lineham, 2013; Poonosamy, 2016), the IB stakes its claim to providing one on what it has termed 'international-mindedness'. While the IB has supplied no clear definition of what international-mindedness (IM) is (Lineham, 2013; Poonosamy, 2016), former IB Director General, Ian Hill (2006), has explained that IM is predicated on the notion that, as stated in the IB's mission statement, others "with their differences, can also be right" (Hill, 2006, p. 101). He has also stated that since the IB curricula are aligned with UNESCO's aims of an international education and have no allegiance to any specific national narratives or cultures, they are free of the politics and cultural molding of other curricula (Hill & Saxton, 2014).

## **Problem Statement**

To complete the DP, students are required to take six courses (IB, 2015a) and pass a variety of internal and external assessments for each course assessing their ability to think critically and analytically (IB, 2018b). Teachers are expected to prepare students effectively for the assessments (IB, 2015a) as well as support students through three additional elements known as the core components. These are a service-oriented component (CAS), a theory of knowledge course (TOK) and a 4,000-word research paper on a topic of their choice called the Extended Essay (Austin, 2006).

In addition to supporting students through the course and preparing them for their final exams, teachers are expected to use a specific set of pedagogical principles set by the IB, known as the Approaches to Teaching (ATT). The ATT are using inquiry-based teaching, teaching for conceptual understanding, using local and global connections, teaching collaboration, differentiation, and using assessment data to guide teaching (Bergeron & Dean, 2013; IB, 2015a).

While the DP is, essentially, a very rigorous university prep program (Hayden, 2006; Hill & Saxton, 2014; Peterson, 1972) it is also a program that strongly endorses values-based teaching around international-mindedness and a set of character traits known as the Learner Profile (Lepine, 2013). The Learner Profile asks students to be inquirers, knowledgeable, thinkers, communicators, principled, open-minded, caring, risk-takers, balanced and reflective (IB, n.d.-f). Teachers and schools are expected to both model, nurture and endorse these values through their teaching, choice of content, how they use the flexibility of the framework to incorporate a wide range of resources and even their behavior (Bergeron, 2013; IB, 2014b; IB, 2015a; Lepine, 2003).

Analysis of IB documentation has shown that teachers are expected to deliver on teaching both the IB's core values and the skills that will help student succeed in the rigorous

DP examinations while using the ATT's to do so (Bergeron & Dean, 2013). However, studies conducted across the world show that teachers are struggling with implementing certain elements of the program, with a specific subset of challenges appearing only in non-Western contexts.

For example, when it comes to the DP, part and parcel of the claim to international-mindedness comes from its built-in flexibility which allows for teaching intercultural understanding while also accommodating for the transfer of the curriculum across different contexts by allocating space within the curriculum for local content and national education requirements (Hill, 2006; Lepine, 2006). So, its courses are designed to allow teachers to incorporate a broad variety of cultural content, histories and perspectives to promote internationally minded teaching while avoiding the nationalism that can come from curricula shaped by their geographic boundaries (Peterson, 1972). As a result, the onus of filling the DP curriculum with content falls on the teacher (Lepine, 2006). At the same time, teachers also have rigorous and immense syllabi to complete in two years while using student-centered teaching strategies.

Studies conducted in Australia, Hong Kong, Macao, Malaysia, Qatar, Turkey, the US, Costa Rica and Ecuador have all found that teachers are struggling with the workload of the DP and are finding it difficult to meet all the IB's expectations of them (Barnett, 2013; Cook, 2017; Halicioglu, 2008; Mukherjee, 2018; Taylor, 2019). Having said this, there was also almost unanimously positive feedback from teachers across the studies about the growth they were experiencing as educators as a result of teaching in the program.

Additionally, although the IB claims easy transitioning of the DP from context to context, studies in Australia, China, Turkey and South America have found that students and teachers face challenges in attempting to align the requirements of the DP with that of the national curriculum (Barnett, 2013; Doherty & Shield, 2012; Gan, 2009; Halicioglu, 2008;

Resnik, 2016). These findings may play a role in explaining why very few countries, almost none in the non-Western world, host the DP program within the state schooling infrastructure (Hill, 2006), although its prohibitive costs are another consideration.

There are also questions around the notion that international-mindedness can be taught through curriculum alone (Belal, 2017; Hayden & Wong, 1997; Kanan & Baker, 2006; Lineham, 2013) which means that teachers in school with more homogenous student bodies will have to work harder to instill IB values of open-mindedness and tolerance.

In terms of non-Western cultures, many teachers have faced difficulties when it comes to the extent to which they must change their practice to match that of the DP. For example, Barnett (2013) found that teachers in Ecuador needed IB workshops specifically geared to help them pivot to reach an understanding of the IB's definition of academic honesty and cross-disciplinary teaching. While teachers found this exciting, it was also seen as an additional burden. Similarly, Halicioglu (2008) found that 50% of the teachers in her study, which was conducted in Turkey, felt overwhelmed when they began teaching in the DP. Additionally, Gan (2009) found that students in China had difficulty adopting to the critical thinking style required of the DP which would suggest added pressure on their teachers in supporting them.

Drake (2004) makes the point that an understanding of the IB's expectations of DP teachers and an awareness of teachers' needs in terms of their context are necessary in order for school leaders to support teachers and their implementation of the DP effectively. Researcher recommendations for supporting teachers in the implementation of the DP include funding and allocating time for professional development (Halicioglu, 2008), sustained training, mentorship and collaboration with other DP teachers (Taylor, 2019).

There are also concerns that the DP is a highly Westernized pedagogical framework so its implementation in non-Western contexts needs additional thought and consideration.

There are several reasons for which the IB and its DP program have been described as Western-centric. The first is that those who study the pedagogy and design of the DP have found it to be firmly rooted in a Western European educational paradigm (Paris, 2003; Van Oord, 2007). The second is that a sizeable number of schools that implement one or more IB programs (called IB World schools) are situated in the West (Bunnell, 2015). The third is that a study of the structural layers of the IB have found it to be heavily Western in terms of the IB's leadership team, students and the spread of IB World schools (Bunnell, 2008; Hahn, 2003).

Furthermore, despite the IB's selling international-mindedness as a key offering of the DP, studies of why students choose the DP show that the key factors in their decision making are rooted in getting access to the global job market and Western universities as opposed to learning about other cultures and traditions (Doherty et al., 2009; Hayden & Wong 1997; Lineham, 2013; Paris, 2003).

Others have argued that simply to succeed in the DP, students and teachers must adopt Western educational traditions, assessment practices and cultural values, often at the expense of their own (Hughes, 2009; Paris, 2003; Poonoosamy, 2010; Van Oord, 2007). A study conducted in Qatar, for example, found differences in how local Qatari students in IB World and British IGCSE (International General Certificate of Secondary Education) schools self-identified as compared to their peers in local schools suggesting that being educated in these curricula had resulted in their adoption of a higher degree of individualism in a generally collectivist culture (Kanan & Baker, 2006).

Hill (2006) disagrees with the notion that implementing the DP necessitates the replacement of local cultural values and knowledge systems, calling it a misrepresentation of how the DP works. He says that, although the DP has Western roots, the framework itself “explores and legitimizes non-western modes of expression and thought” (p. 107) and insists

that families who choose the DP are already hooked into a global mindset and would, with or without the DP, gravitate away from a singularly ‘local’ perspective. The IB has also advocated for its program through a reminder that adaptability is a fundamental component of the DP, meaning that the built-in flexibility of the framework allows it to be shaped to fit the needs of different local educational systems, their content, cultural values and traditional educational practices (Hill, 2006; Peterson, 1972).

Nevertheless, Paris (2003) bemoans the inevitable homogenization of ideas resulting from teachers from around the world being trained on, and given access to, a wide range of IB support materials, publications, workshops, conferences and ‘best practices’ which shape their approach to teaching, choice of content and assessment. He also notes the need for schools in some countries to adopt foreign languages (English, Spanish or French) as their primary language of instruction as well as relinquishing their traditional approaches to curriculum building and grading styles when transitioning to the DP.

This is supported by commentators who underscore the inherent differences in assessment and grading styles between cultures and the challenge that poses for teachers and students (Drake, 2004; Peterson, 1972). It is also supported by studies that show DP teachers are transposing their DP style teaching into their non-DP classes (Barnett, 2013; Cook, 2017; Mukherjee, 2018).

As a result, there are concerns that transitioning to the Western pedagogical approaches of the DP disadvantages students and teachers from non-Western pedagogical traditions (Drake, 2004; Paris, 2003). Drake (2004), for example, comments on the sense of dissonance produced in students and teachers in countries such as China, Africa and Japan who must engage in teacher/student relationships that run counter to their cultural norms.

Consequently, the problem to be addressed here is a matter of fit, or congruence, which is the term used in Hoy and Miskel’s (2011) social systems theory to describe the

alignment between institutional and individual expectations. According to social systems theory, the bureaucratic component of a social system (in this case the IB) establishes an institution's goals which it breaks down into roles that individuals (in this case DP teachers) fit into in order to fulfil the institution's goals (Getzels & Guba, 1957). Should there be a difference between an institution's expectations and an individual's ability to meet those expectations, there is a resulting incongruence which can lead to employee dissatisfaction, low morale or an inability for the institution to achieve its goals (Hoy & Miskel, 2011). It is this space between the reality on the ground for DP teachers, and their perceptions of the IB's institutional expectations that this study seeks to explore.

### **Rationale**

In the case of the DP's academic framework and the IB's pedagogical expectations of DP teachers, the literature lays out a persuasive case that it is a challenging program for teachers to implement. Amidst concerns that it is culturally and pedagogically Western, there is a clear distinction between the challenges that are shared across contexts and those that are specific to non-Western contexts. Considering the continuing growth and popularity of the program, there is scope, opportunity and even need for more context-specific studies that may lead to a greater understanding of how its implementation plays out in different contexts.

Lebanon is not a newcomer to the game of external influence on domestic educational infrastructures. It has, over the centuries, reflected the languages, interests and intellectual heritages of a lengthy series of ruling powers (Daher, 2012; Frayha, 2003). The nationally mandated Lebanese Baccalaureate Certificate of Secondary Education (Shahaadat Al-Bakaalouriya al Lubnaaniya l'il-ta'liim al-Thaanawi) exams, also known as the LB, is itself modeled on the French Baccalaureate (Frayha, 2003).

Currently, non-national curricula being implemented across the Lebanese educational landscape include "the U.S. High School (HS) Diploma, General Certificate of

Secondary Education (GCSE), International Baccalaureate (IB), Deutsches Sprachdiplom (DSD) and French Baccalaureate” (Akar & Albrecht, 2017, p. 557) and are taught primarily in English, French and German.

The popularity of the DP, however, continues to grow in Lebanon, and there are currently 13 schools that offer the DP (IB, n.d.-c) with more accreditations in the works. An equivalency between the LB and DP has also been agreed upon and ratified in the government. In her work on school reform in the Middle East, Karami-Akkary (2014) makes it a point to challenge the tradition of parachuting in non-national educational trends and curricula without critically assessing them for fit and not considering the cultural and contextual implications of their implementation. Additionally, Karami-Akkary and Rizk (2011) make the recommendation that successful reform must include teacher input and the training of teachers to build their capacity in the target skills and competencies. As opposed to being “mere executors of those top-down directives” (p. 19). This study is framed by both these pieces of advice.

Studies already conducted around the implementation of the DP in Lebanon, such as Hilal (2018), Jbara (2008) and Azzi (2018), provide excellent insight into specific aspects of the implementation of the DP in this context and show a marked difference in the pedagogical approaches of the DP and the Lebanese Baccalaureate (LB). These studies have revealed differences in the use of critical thinking in the teaching of the DP versus the Lebanese Baccalaureate (Hilal, 2018) and differences in assessment styles (Jbara, 2008). Additionally, Azzi (2018) found that teachers in Lebanon struggled to incorporate local content in the DP curriculum.

This study aims to go deeper into the teacher experience by exploring DP teachers’ understandings of the IB’s expectations in terms of pedagogical approaches, assessment practices and core values, while exploring the challenges they face in trying to meet these

expectations when implementing the DP in the Lebanese context. To quote Getzels, Lipham and Campbell: to understand a social system “it is necessary to understand its articulation with the culture in which it is embedded” (1968, p. 93), and this study aims to ask questions to capture this articulation

From a policy perspective, Drake (2004) makes the point that the culture of schools seeps into society, and that it is the responsibility of school and national education leaders to think carefully and thoughtfully about how, and to what extent, implementation of the DP needs to be adapted to the local context, its cultural values and knowledge systems. It is, therefore, important that those who lead schools and shape policy in this context have access to a range of studies that can inform their decision making.

Ultimately this study does not seek to discredit or glorify either system nor make unjustifiable statements about which is ‘better’. Rather, it seeks to ask questions about the challenges of the implementation of the DP, a non-national curriculum, in this context. Its results can give school leaders and policy makers the opportunity to make informed decisions on how to implement it in a non-western context, or how to support teachers in its implementation, so that we can benefit from its strengths without compromising our own.

As someone with experience of teaching the DP in Lebanon, I was interested to see what parallels I would find in both the literature and in the discussions of teachers in this context. As the DP has been consistently implemented in this context for over 20 years (IB, n.d.-c), there is immense experience of it within the walls of our schools, waiting only for interested parties to excavate and share it.

## **Research Questions**

From the perspective of DP teachers in Lebanon:

1. what are the practices and core values expected of DP teachers based on their understanding of the IB's mission statement, Learner Profile, pedagogical approaches and DP assessment requirements?
2. what, if any, challenges do DP teachers face in meeting the IB's expectations in the Lebanese context in terms of their understanding of its pedagogical approaches, its requirements when it comes to values-based teaching and preparing students for the DP assessments?
3. in what ways are teachers' challenges due to incongruences between the core values of the IB and those commonly used in the Lebanese context?

## **Significance**

Despite the heated debates, there is a dearth of empirical studies that look at the implementation of the DP, especially from the perspective of teachers. Additionally, of those studies that have explored the implementation of the DP, few have used an organizational framework that looks specifically at the alignment between the expectations of the program and the realities of the context it is being implemented in. This is useful because it allows for the productive examination of the challenges of implementing the DP across different contexts by pinpointing areas where there is a mismatch between what the program expects of its teachers and what they are feasibly able to do in the context they are operating in.

This study aims to fill this gap in the literature by exploring DP teachers' perceptions of the IB's expectations of them and the challenges they face when implementing the DP in Lebanon through the lens of social systems theory. This helps to identify areas of incongruence, opportunities for teacher development or areas where the DP framework itself may need to be modified or customized to better fit the local context. It also contributes to the

existing literature on the implementation of the DP in a non-Western context, providing practitioners and researchers with a more nuanced view of the DP's applicability across contexts.

Qualitative research is often difficult to replicate or generalize (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018); however, whether the results suggest parallel experiences between teachers in the Lebanese context and their peers in other countries or not, they inform our understanding of the experience of teaching the DP in the Lebanese context. This, while not directly generalizable, can be a steppingstone for other studies on the implementation of the DP in Lebanon, as well as other contexts.

In terms of practice, Drake (2004) advises schools, school leaders and educators to be “fully aware of the challenges posed to their current paradigms from any attempt to simply clone IB programmes and methodologies and apply them to different cultural contexts” (p. 194). The results of this study will help school leaders predict and mediate the incongruences resulting from a cultural gap between the expectations put in place by the IB, and the teachers trying to satisfy them. It will also help them fulfil what Getzels and Guba called the “unique task of administration, at least with respect to staff relations, (which) is to integrate the demands of the institution and the demands of the staff member in a way that is at once organizationally productive and individually fulfilling” (1957, p. 430).

The results can also guide school leaders who are considering the professional development needs of DP teachers to pre-empt potential issues. For schools planning on implementing the DP, the results of this study can help in making for a smoother transition or more informed alignment between the DP and LB programs.

## CHAPTER II

### LITERATURE REVIEW

Since its first, teetering steps in the 1960's, the IBDP (International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme – also called the DP or Diploma Programme) has been implemented across the globe. A review of the literature on the implementation of the DP in different contexts reveals that, although it has a significant presence across the world, the research on its implementation is concentrated in very few countries, and is mostly in the form of small studies, anecdotal commentary and case studies.

The lack of prevalence of these studies does not preclude the magnitude of the debate taking place around the DP's implementation in different contexts, especially non-Western ones. The following paragraphs present the key issues uncovered in the literature.

Firstly, students and teachers in both Western and non-Western contexts can face difficulty when transitioning to and implementing the DP according to the IB's requirements. Studies have shown that these include adapting to new educational paradigms and pedagogies, struggling with the workload of the DP and teaching to the IB's value system while preparing students for the rigor of the DP assessments (Barnett, 2013; Cook, 2017; Dulfer, 2019; Gan, 2009; Halicioglu, 2008; Taylor, 2019).

Secondly, the spread of International Baccalaureate (IB) schools around the world and its organizational structure are disproportionately Western, stoking concerns of a Eurocentric or North American bias in the DP curriculum, content and assessment criteria (Bunnell, 2008; Bunnell, 2011; Hahn, 2003).

Thirdly, the DP's pedagogy and design cater to, and are based on, Western educational constructs, core values and the entry requirements of higher education institutions. This has led to concerns that its application in non-Western contexts encourages

the replacement of traditional educational practices, knowledge systems and cultural values with Western ones (Hughes, 2009; Paris, 2003; Poonoosamy, 2010; Van Oord, 2007). These concerns throw doubt on the notion that the DP is a curriculum that necessarily transfers easily across contexts which is a key selling point for the IB.

Lastly, there are also concerns that, in spite of the IB's values of social responsibility and inclusivity, the adoption of the DP in both Western and non-Western contexts can contribute to academic and socioeconomic segregation because of its prohibitive cost structures and academic streaming (Doherty, 2009; Doherty & Shield, 2012; Gardner-McTaggart, 2016; Resnik, 2009).

The goal of this study is to explore DP teachers' understandings of the IB's expectations of them in terms of pedagogical approaches and core values, the challenges they face in trying to meet these expectations when implementing the DP in the Lebanese context; the study also aims to understand the ways in which these challenges are due to a lack of congruence between the value system of the IB and those of the Lebanese context. This literature review will collect, synthesize and analyze the literature around the practice and implementation of the DP in contexts around the world, especially non-Western ones.

The review will begin by introducing the IB and DP by describing the context and pedagogical influences behind their formation. This will be followed by a description of the DP itself in terms of the IB's pedagogical approach and core values, the style of DP assessments, its curricular framework and how all these translate into expectations around the practice of DP teachers.

Next, the review will present studies conducted in both Western and non-Western contexts that examine student and teacher experiences of transitioning to the DP, the challenges they face and the recommendations of the researchers for how to pre-empt or ease these challenges. After the presentation of the challenges, a further subset of research focused

on concerns around the implementation of the DP in non-Western contexts will be presented as it forms the foundation from which we must consider the DP's implementation in Lebanon. As we are reminded by Karami-Akkary (2014), it is crucial to consider the implementation of non-national curricula with a critical eye to understanding how they can and should fit into our cultural contexts.

Finally, the review will describe the Lebanese educational landscape, its national curriculum and present the studies that have explored aspects of the DP's implementation in Lebanon as well as the theoretical framework of the study.

### **The International Baccalaureate and its Diploma Programme**

The IB describes itself as a “not for profit foundation, motivated by its mission to create a better world through education” (IB, 2015b, pg. 3). Its mission statement reads:

The International Baccalaureate aims to develop inquiring, knowledgeable and caring young people who help to create a better and more peaceful world through intercultural understanding and respect.

To this end the organization works with schools, governments and international organizations to develop challenging programmes of international education and rigorous assessment.

These programs encourage students across the world to become active, compassionate and lifelong learners who understand that other people, with their differences, can also be right (IB, 2017, slide 2).

The following sections outline its beginnings and growths to bring us to the present.

### **The Founding of the IB and DP: Practicality, Ideology and Pedagogy**

In the late 1950's and early 1960's, international schools began popping up around the world in response to a post-World War 2 employment boom of diplomatic staff, employees of multinational corporations and NGO workers who needed schools for their children (Bunnell, 2008). Problematically, because schools implemented the national curricula of their host countries, students were graduating with transcripts that had no easy equivalence mechanisms for universities in their countries of origin (Peterson, 1972). This primed the market for the introduction of an 'International Baccalaureate' diploma: a widely accepted and academically

rigorous certificate recognized by universities around the world (Bunnell, 2008; Hayden, 2006; Hill & Saxton, 2014; Peterson, 1972).

Around the same time, social studies teachers at the International School of Geneva had begun a discussion about the need for an internationalized approach to teaching (Bunnell, 2008; Hill & Saxton, 2014). With World War II looming large in the rear-view mirror, the notion of using education to rise above the friction of competing national narratives and promote peace began to pick up pace. These ideas resonated strongly with those working to build the DP and played a large role in defining its core value system and brand of internationalism (Balzani, 2010; Hayden, 2006; Hill & Saxton, 2014; Peterson, 1972).

In addition to imbuing the Diploma Program with values of interculturalism and peacebuilding, the architects of the curriculum sought a move away from the hermetic, rote learning pedagogical traditions of 1960's Europe. Instead, they envisioned a more transdisciplinary framework; one infused with critical analysis and an inquiry-based approach to learning (Hayden, 2006; Hill, 2006; IB, n.d.-a; Van Oord, 2007) working in tandem with student reflection and hands-on experimentation (Peterson, 1983).

Based on Alec Peterson's, the first Director General of the IB and a key figure in its programming (IB, n.d.-a), research and advocacy, the DP was built on a framework which married "the range of subjects taught in the French baccalaureate...with the depth of knowledge and specialism found in the British A-level system" (Balzani, 2010, p. 61). With the additional influence of Dewey, Piaget and Bruner (IB, n.d.-a), the DP embodied a much more constructivist approach to pedagogy than was being practiced in Western Europe at that time (Hill & Saxton, 2014).

This coming together of pragmatism, pedagogy and idealism set the stage for the establishment of the DP (Hill & Saxton, 2014) as a viable, alternative curricular option to be implemented in local markets across the world: a baccalaureate program promising an

international education built on an explicit value system. With the birth of the DP came the founding of its parent organization (the IB) and eventually, the Middle Years (MYP), Primary Years (PYP) and Careers (CP) Programmes were also introduced (Hayden, 2006).

### **The IB in 2019: A Story of Growth**

When the founders of the IB launched their pilot DP project in 1966, they had recruited seven schools across the world and registered 349 students for a trial examination session (Bunnell, 2008). Since that time, the IB has successfully positioned and sold itself as the only international curriculum holding no allegiance to a specific national narrative, culture or geographic area (Hill & Saxton, 2014).

Because of an ever-growing conviction among the ranks of the wealthy that an international education ensures economic success for their children and an increasing number of transnational families needing international schooling for their children, the IB's curricular offerings have been in high demand (Resnik, 2009). Over time, the IB has quite literally blossomed into a multi-faceted organization that has grown in terms of numbers of participating schools, but also in the development and growth of the organization itself and the array of products and services it provides to support its work (Bunnell, 2015).

From seven schools in the 1960's, there were, as of September 2019, 5,175 schools across the world implementing one or more of the IB programs (IB, n.d.-b), and over 1 million students enrolled in an IB program (IB, 2018a). It has become, as described by Doherty and Shield (2012), "an iconic alternative to local curricula" (p. 415). Lebanon itself is host to 17 schools that implement at least one of the IB programs. 13 of the 17 have adopted the DP, and one school offers the entire continuum: PYP, MYP and DP (IB, n.d.-c).

This growth is despite the arduous authorization process schools go through to be authorized by the IB which is time-consuming, costly, rigorous, and requires the realignment of, among other structural and pedagogical elements, the school's mission statement and

philosophy to match that of the IB's. On top of all this, the authorization is subject to a five-year review process (IB, 2016) and, once authorized, schools pay a yearly fee. Despite the costs, seven out of Lebanon's 13 DP schools have been authorized since 2016 (IB, n.d.-c) attesting to its growing popularity in the country.

Now that the foundation for the IB has been presented, the remainder of this thesis will refer to the DP, and other international franchises, as 'non-national' curricula, and the schools that implement them as non-national schools. This is done for the sake of precision and follows the example of Azzi (2018) who describes the IB as "an alternative to national curricula designed and monitored by national bodies. It is therefore intentionally international in ethos and non-national as an educational program" (p. 52).

The following sections will break down the DP framework and IB ethos around pedagogy and values-based education. These will be presented through the lens of what they mean in terms of how teachers are expected to teach.

### **Expectations of Teachers: The How and the What of DP Teaching**

The IBDP curriculum provides schools with an educational framework aimed at teaching an explicit set of skills and values based on the IB's ethos and pedagogical leanings. The following sections will elaborate on the DP framework and how its values, pedagogical underpinnings and assessment practices translate into expectations of how and what DP teachers are meant to be teaching. It will begin with presenting the academic expectations of DP teachers in terms of the DP's academic demands and the IB's preferred pedagogical approach. This is followed by a discussion of how teachers are expected to fulfil the IB's promise of a values-based education.

The claims made in this section are based on the IB documentation for the DP which provides clear guidelines on what teachers are expected to teach and how they are expected to

teach it. This section will also include findings from the literature on the IB's documentation, ideology and development.

### **Academic Expectations of Teachers**

The DP is, at its core, a university prep program (Hayden, 2006) aimed at helping young people thrive in the knowledge economy and deal with the fluidity of the future job market (Hill & Saxton, 2014). The official DP exams are end-of-program assessments and, coupled with several internal (school-graded) assessments, make up students' final grades.

The DP offers six different subject groups: Language A (Studies in Language & Literature), Language B (Language Acquisition), Individuals and Societies (I & S), Sciences, Mathematics, and Arts. Students are required to take one course from each subject group in categories one through five, and either one arts subject, or an additional course from I & S, languages or sciences (IB, 2015a). Three or four of the six courses must be taken at higher level (HL) with the rest at standard level (SL). Students also have the option of a bilingual diploma should they decide to study two languages at the Language A level and no Language B course (IB, n.d.-e).

In addition to the number of courses taken by students, the curriculum relies on many different forms of assessment which teachers must prepare students for. These include exams, presentations, portfolios and hands-on activities such as field work and projects. The assessments themselves are focused on promoting critical thinking skills such as interpretation, analysis and evaluation of data (IB, 2018b). Student results are calculated based on a combination of internal (school evaluated and IB moderated) and external (IB evaluated) assessments set by the DP subject curricula and graded using IB mandated grading criteria (IB, n.d.-e).

Assessments are taken throughout the two-year course and culminate in a set of final exams. For each course, the grades of all the assessments are calculated to produce a single

final grade out of seven. The DP's approach to grading follows a compensation model meaning students' aggregate grade must be a pass, instead of requiring a passing grade for each assessment component of the course (IB, 2018b).

Teachers are expected to be well-versed in the assessment requirements and be familiar with what is expected of students in their assessments. It is expected that teachers are planning and delivering their content with an eye to preparing students for their DP exams. According to DP documentation, the "assessments are based on the course aims and objectives and, therefore, effective teaching to the course requirements also ensures effective teaching to the formal assessment requirements" (IB, 2015a, p. 78).

In addition to the academic courses, all students are required to take the compulsory TOK (Theory of Knowledge), CAS (Creativity, Activity, Service) and EE (Extended Essay) components of the program which aim to encourage students to be well-rounded, critical thinkers with a sense of responsibility to others (Austin, 2006). This means that teachers are expected to provide and guide students through these additional components of the program. The TOK course, for example, requires that teachers draw from across the disciplines to teach students to think critically about and question the very nature of their knowledge; it culminates in an externally graded 1600-word essay and an internally graded presentation about a debatable topic (Austin, 2006).

CAS, meanwhile, consists of an ungraded but obligatory combination of community service and/or the pursuit of personal or artistic endeavors throughout the program. This is aimed at encouraging students to be well-rounded and develop a sense of social responsibility. The last core component, the Extended Essay, is a 4,000-word research paper anchored in a specific discipline and mentored by a teacher from that academic area. These components are considered central to a DP education and completing them is necessary to

receive the DP diploma (Austin, 2006). Both teachers and schools are expected to provide students with opportunities for CAS, mentorship and guidance in their Extended Essays.

At the same time as preparing students for a wide range of courses, academic expectations and assessments, teachers are expected to teach according to the IB's Approaches to Teaching (ATT). The ATT are six principles that outline the IB's preferred pedagogical approach and are as follows:

Teaching in IB programmes is:

1. based on inquiry
2. focused on conceptual understanding
3. developed in local and global contexts
4. focused on effective teamwork and collaboration
5. differentiated to meet the needs of all learners
6. informed by assessment (formative and summative) (IB, 2015a, p. 66)

Content analysis of IB documentation (Bergeron & Dean, 2013) revealed that these expectations are woven throughout the IB guides and literature and explicitly request that IB teachers adopt inquiry-based learning which develops students' conceptual understanding while encouraging independent learning.

To support teachers in meeting the academic expectations of the program, schools are provided with a range of resources including detailed guides for each course which outline assessment, grading criteria and objectives, as well as conceptual and skills-based objectives. Teachers have access to an online resource called MyIB featuring examples of student work, previous exam papers, discussion forums and additional resources. The IB also sells access to online and face to face workshops, of which participating schools are required to offer a minimum number to their teachers (IB, n.d.-e; Lepine, 2006).

The trainings are aimed at helping teachers balance the expectation to use inquiry-based teaching while also preparing students for the assessments. According to the IB,

one of the most important considerations for DP teachers is therefore how to design teaching practice to produce effective inquiry-based learning. This can be challenging given the quantity of important information in each subject area that needs to be

addressed and the pressure of ongoing formative assessment and the culminating measure of a student's academic performance being an examination-based summative assessment (IB, 2015a, p. 68).

However, expectations of teachers go beyond preparing students to succeed in an academically rigorous program while using specific pedagogical practices. The IB also has a strong values-based framework which, as the next section explains, teachers are also expected to integrate into their classes.

### **Values-Based Expectations of Teachers: The Learner Profile and International-Mindedness**

While the DP is academically very rigorous (Hayden, 2006; Hill & Saxton, 2014; Peterson, 1972), the framework does also focus on developing in its students the values of intercultural respect, compassion, tolerance and social responsibility put forward in the IB mission statement (Lineham, 2013). These values are deconstructed in the form of the Learner Profile (see Appendix A) and defined by the IB as “a broad range of human capacities and responsibilities that go beyond academic success” (IB, n.d.-f, p.1). The Learner Profile is meant to “help individuals and groups become responsible members of local, national and global communities” (IB, 2015b, p. 12). This student profile is shared across the IB programs and asks students to be inquirers, knowledgeable, thinkers, communicators, principled, open-minded, caring, risk-takers, balanced and reflective (IB, n.d.-f).

Coupled with the Learner Profile, another core value of the IB is international-mindedness (IM). While defining internationalism in schools is in the midst of a heated debate (Bunnell, 2008; Hayden & Wong, 1997; Kidson, Odhiambo & Wilson, 2018; Lineham, 2013; Poonosamy, 2016), the IB characterizes its brand of non-national education as teaching ‘international-mindedness’. Although IB has not published a set definition of ‘international-mindedness’ (Lineham, 2013; Poonosamy, 2016), the IB’s Principles into Practices document refers to it as “an attitude of openness to, and curiosity about, the world

and different cultures” (IB, 2015a, p. 6) and teachers are expected to foster it through their teaching.

International-mindedness is also predicated on the value of open-mindedness and that, as stated in the mission statement, others “with their differences, can also be right” (Hill, 2006, p. 101). As a result, the DP courses themselves are intentionally designed to make room for the introduction of multiple perspectives, even if they are in conflict, and teachers are meant to use these opportunities to educate students about the world beyond (IB, 2015a).

This is also part of a strategy that is meant to allow for adaptability across different contexts and teachers are expected to differentiate the curriculum content to meet local needs and incorporate local knowledge. This is to be balanced with breeding intercultural understanding and avoiding the promotion of specific national narratives (Lepine, 2006; Peterson, 1972). While this built-in flexibility is meant to ensure that the curriculum can be easily customized to fit the needs of different contexts, it puts the onus on teachers and schools to make decisions around curriculum content.

The design of the history curriculum, for example, gives teachers options from a broad range of modules which represent different cultures as well a compulsory world history unit (Lepine, 2006). Additionally, a ‘Prescribed Reading List’ in the languages courses ensures that teachers incorporate translated works and promote discussions about different cultural contexts while the math curriculum encourages the teaching of the contributions to math of different cultures and civilizations (IB, 2015a).

Each IB school must aim to nurture and develop in students “all attributes of the IB learner profile across the school community (IB, 2014b, p. 21) and “model the values and behaviours associated with education for intercultural understanding.” (IB, 2015a, p. 7) In terms of teachers, the IB expects them to model and endorse the values of both the Learner

Profile and IM both through their teaching, course content and how they frame their teaching, but also through their behavior (Bergeron & Dean, 2013).

The following section will present studies around the implementation of the DP in different contexts and the kinds of challenges faced by students and teaches as they transition to the DP.

### **Challenges Faced by Teachers in Meeting the IB's Expectations**

Although there have not been many studies exploring the teacher's experience of implementing the DP, it is an important way of understanding the teething issues of implementing a new or unfamiliar pedagogical framework. The following sections will present results of studies that looked at how teachers, and their students, have responded to transitioning to the DP program.

Many of these studies took place in non-Western contexts and are aimed at understanding the impact of adopting a non-national program on students and teachers. However, this section will also present results of studies that were conducted in Western contexts in an attempt to provide a broad look at the implementation of the DP as well as bring to the fore common and disparate threads between the Western and non-Western experiences.

### **Keeping Up with the Workload of the DP**

The flexible, open framework of the program, while aiming for adaptability, means that most DP courses do not come with textbooks or a set list of resources; this puts increased pressure on teachers to construct their syllabus, source materials and find resources (Lepine, 2006) as well as to complete their syllabi in time for assessments.

In Halicioglu's (2008) study surveying over 100 DP practitioners in Turkey, 50% felt overwhelmed and undertrained when they began teaching in the DP and over 60% stated that, because of the increased workload, teaching within the DP was more stressful than

teaching the national curriculum. Mukherjee's (2018) mixed methods study of private and public-school DP teachers in Costa Rica also found teachers to be very critical of what they saw as the increased workload of working within the DP and its assessment-heavy approach to education. Similarly, studies such as Barnett's (2013) revealed that teachers were concerned that the DP was more work for the same pay.

Interviews with non-local teachers in Macao, Malaysia, Qatar and Turkey revealed that teachers had reservations not only about the amount of work they had to do, but also what they felt was the limited time they had to cover their course content. Participants explained that the DP was both difficult to teach and prepare for because the course was extremely rigorous with some content at university level. They also felt there was not enough time to implement the program. Because of the complexity and rigor of the program, participants declared they needed at least two years of experience before they began to feel confident teaching the program (Taylor, 2019).

Another study conducted in Australia and Hong Kong also found that teachers felt they had to rush through the course content in order to finish in time, which could be resulting in less student-centered teaching although that is a core pedagogical expectation of the IB (Dulfer, 2019).

However, it is not only teachers who transition to the DP in non-Western contexts who face challenges. A study done in California also revealed that teachers found the increased workload resulting from the depth and breadth of the program as well as the number of assessments to be immense and stressful (Cook, 2017).

Having said this, teachers in all the studies mentioned in this section were extremely positive about the growth they experienced through teaching in the DP and felt that their practice had improved. Teachers also spoke with enthusiasm about their development as educators as a result of teaching the program both in terms of their knowledge and their

pedagogical practice. Many of the studies align with what Cook (2017) terms the “paradox of the IBDP” which she explains is simultaneous feelings of “stress and love for the program” (p. 120).

### **Aligning the DP Curriculum with Local Requirements and Practices**

One of the key claims of the IB is that the DP can be implemented across contexts because it is flexible enough for teachers to manipulate the content to meet local needs and practices. In some cases, this takes the shape of teachers preparing students for the DP assessments as well as the national leaving certification exams even though sometimes the DP and local frameworks operate on very different ideological and pedagogical foundations.

Moving between different educational frameworks can be challenging for students as well. Surveys and interviews conducted with 11 Chinese students who had moved to Australia to complete the DP revealed their areas of struggle. In transitioning from a Chinese educational environment to one that espouses the pedagogical expectations of the DP, difficulties showed up particularly in “active class participation, critical thinking, adopting multiple perspectives, independent research and referencing” (Gan, 2009, p. 289), which are fundamental tenets of DP teaching and assessment across the disciplines.

Barnett’s (2013) study of the impact of the incorporation of the DP in Ecuador’s public schools found that students were finding the transition to the DP very difficult with many additional hours being put in to studying. In order to ease the transition, schools were using various preparatory strategies such as including more critical and creative thinking into lower grades, a formal pre-DP curriculum in 10<sup>th</sup> grade designed and delivered by DP trained teachers and presentations.

In other contexts, students must contend with the burden of studying additional subjects on top of their DP courses to meet national requirements set by their ministries of education. DP students in Chile, Ecuador, Argentina and Spain who want to attend public

universities, for example, end up sitting for the summative examinations of both the DP and their local curriculum. This is extraordinarily stressful, not only during exam time, but also during the year when these students attend school on weekends and have an extended school day in order to fulfil the requirements of both curricula (Resnik, 2016).

In a similar case, local students in Turkey are also required to obtain the national certification to attend a Turkish university. Turkish DP students take Language A, history, military science, geography and philosophy in Turkish to satisfy the national requirements of the Turkish Ministry of Education. These courses are fundamentally pedagogically different from the DP in that they operate on a system of rote learning and traditional teaching styles, meaning students have to learn two different test taking approaches and swing between different modes of thought in order to navigate the demands of the two programs (Halicioglu, 2008).

As the students struggle to meet the requirements of the DP combined with added components from their local curriculum, teachers struggle right alongside with them in an effort to align the DP curriculum with local requirements and prepare students for both.

Although all the studies quoted so far were conducted in non-Western contexts, a study surveying 225 teachers across Australia shows that even Western contexts are not immune to the difficulties of aligning local and DP curricula. Australia's decentralized approach to education allows provinces to set their own policies so teachers from the various provinces have different levels of flexibility in weaving the DP in with the local curricula. Teachers in the more flexible provinces found it easier to adapt their teaching to satisfy the goals of both curricula in a single classroom. However, in provinces with more rigid policies, teachers struggled with what they described as aligning what were essentially "two different courses, full stop" (Doherty & Shield, 2012, p. 428). One teacher even resigned because she

found the school's offering of the DP, in this case, to constitute an unethical, unfulfillable promise to students and their families.

In these cases, students and their teachers are not only moving from one incongruous framework to another, but actively juggling them, often working desperately to keep all these different balls in the air. For teachers who are operating within two examination frameworks that are not aligned, the pressure of catering to both can be immense, and the logistics sometimes almost impossible. Because culminating exams are so fundamental to determining students' futures, teachers often shape how and what they teach to ensure student success (Lineham, 2013).

### **Transitioning to New Pedagogical Practices and Values**

A mixed-methods study of the Ecuadorian government's decision to work with the IB on incorporating the DP into the public-school system, revealed that the IB had to provide subject specific workshops for teachers based on differences in interpreting key terms and concepts. These workshops focused on training teachers on the use of laboratories and calculators for relevant subjects, and broad, cross-disciplinary training in areas such as the value-based notion of academic honesty and how to reference material. For teachers, this was exciting yet overwhelming, and coordinators reported that, over time, it became increasingly difficult to find teachers who wanted to teach within the DP (Barnett, 2013).

Another example is the questioning, critical approach to all subjects embodied by the TOK course. This style of open-ended, open-minded teaching can make teachers from many contexts "feel somewhat uncomfortable about challenging the status quo in the approach to their subject discipline" and relinquishing their cultural role as the foremost reservoir of knowledge in their classroom (Austin, 2006, p. 152); it can also require an entire shift in mindset in terms of the values of teachers and students, their relationship in the

classroom, the need to learn new strategies of approaching material and the facilitation of classroom discussions.

Changing assessment styles can also be challenging for teachers versed in the educational practices of more collectivist cultures who must guide students through individual assessments that are ability based, rather than collaborative and effort based (Drake, 2004). Although the IB does not see this as insurmountable or highly problematic, it is not something that is ignored. In the IB's documentation on assessment it is stated that its approach "can create cultural bias as the idea of individualism is traditionally a western European ideology" (IB, 2018b, p. 97).

Adding on to this, not only is the style of the assessment likely to differ from local practices but, in Peterson's words, "teachers in different national traditions have very different ideas about the use of grading scales" (1983, p. 17) adding yet another layer of potential confusion in the translation of academic expectations, assessments and grading.

### **Teaching International-Mindedness in Settings which Lack Diversity**

Former IB Director General Ian Hill believes that it is "the attitude of mind reflected in both the teaching and administration of the school, rather than the cultural composition or location" of the school itself that matters when it comes to instilling values of international-mindedness (2006, p. 98). However, this is not supported by studies done in non-national schools in Switzerland, Qatar, Cairo and the United Kingdom which suggest that the school's environment and the diversity of its student body is perceived by teachers and students to be as, if not more, important than the curriculum in producing students with an international mindset (Belal, 2017; Hayden & Wong, 1997; Kanan & Baker, 2006; Lineham, 2013).

This suggests that schools with broadly heterogenous student and staff bodies are, by virtue of design, providers of an inherently international experience because they expose students to a broad range of cultures, languages and experiences. Based on studies such as

these, there are concerns that international-mindedness is harder to achieve in schools with largely homogenous student bodies who all speak the same language (Halicioglu, 2008; Hayden & Wong, 1997) and are perhaps from the same socioeconomic class (Doherty, 2009),

### **Opportunities for Teacher Support**

When considering all the expectations and challenges presented in this part of the review, it is important to note that there is a recognition on the part of the IB that the DP is a challenging program. The IB requires all DP teachers participate in at least one subject specific PD workshop to support their growth and transition. Having said this, the cost of these workshops can be, in addition to the cost of the program itself, quite a sizeable barrier to schools hoping to implement the DP (Bunnell, 2008) and can result in limited training opportunities for teachers.

Additionally, workshops are currently only provided in eight languages (English, French, Spanish, Arabic, Turkish, Chinese, Bahasa, and Japanese) and not all languages are treated equally. At the time of writing (December 2019) there were 111 English language DP workshops on offer through the official IB resource website (MyIB) and no Arabic language DP workshops currently on offer (IB, n.d.-h). This is not unique to Arabic and does suggest that non-English or second language English speaking teachers are at a disadvantage when it comes receiving the professional development provided by the IB.

However, there are other ways that schools can offer support to their teachers. Halicioglu (2008) suggests that funding and making time for professional development be a serious priority for schools wanting to implement the DP. She also comments that a poorly attended annual national IB Day, which is a one-day conference for IB teachers in Turkey, be more intentional in considering the needs of the teachers as it could be an effective piece of the DP teachers' "professional development jigsaw" (p. 177). The conference is also, she noted, an important opportunity for professional support as teachers can network and

exchange ideas as well as problem solve issues. Meanwhile, Taylor's (2019) participants also felt that regular training, time, collaboration with other DP teachers and mentorship were integral to their success as DP teachers.

In conclusion, based on the studies in this section there are clear commonalities in the challenges faced by teachers as they transition to the DP. There are large overlaps between the experiences of teachers in Western and non-Western contexts such as the increased workload, what is perceived to be a lack of time to complete the program and teaching international-mindedness in a homogenous environment. Non-Western specific challenges come in the form of a lack of shared understandings about things like the shape and role of academic honesty in education and having to pivot further away from traditional teaching practices when adopting the DP.

As the studies in this section of the literature review suggest and as highlighted by Drake (2004), school leaders must be thoughtful in their conversations about learning and teaching policies, teacher appraisals and professional development. They must have an awareness of what is being asked of their teachers in terms of fulfilling the expectations of the DP, adopting its core values and adapting to educational paradigms that may not be their own and be prepared to support them effectively using both the IB's own training resources but also their own initiatives.

### **Concerns Around the Implementation of the DP in non-Western Contexts**

Despite the IB's claims of providing a curriculum that belongs to no one cultural context but can be used for any, those who examine its origins and the spread of IB World schools are concerned that it and its curricula remain Western centric (Bunnell, 2015; Drake, 2004; Hahn, 2003; Paris, 2003; Poonosamy, 2016). The following sections will present the rationale behind the concerns and how those concerns are seen as manifesting in non-Western contexts.

## Global Representation Within the Spread and Leadership of the IB

Although the IB does have a global presence, it is worth looking a little more closely at the numbers to understand the balance of that presence. Table 1 provides a breakdown of IB

World schools around the world by region as of August 2018 (IB, n.d.-c):

Table 1			
<i>Breakdown of IB World Schools (August 2018)</i>			
IB Regional Categories	Number of Countries in Category	Number of Schools in Category	Percentage of Global Total
Africa, Europe & Middle East	90	1181	22.7%*
Asia Pacific	29	879	16.9%**
Americas	33	3072	58.9%***
* 70% of schools in the “Africa, Europe & Middle East” category are on the European continent, 9% on the African Continent, and 20% on the Asian continent and in the Arabian Gulf region. Schools in Spain, the UK and Germany account for almost a third of the schools in this category.			
**Schools in China, India & Australia make up 54.8% of the “Asia Pacific” total.			
*** Schools in Canada and the USA make up 76.3% of the “Americas” total.			

As can be seen in Table 1, schools in the Americas make up almost two thirds of all IB World schools globally; three quarters of those schools are found in Canada and the USA. Meanwhile, most of the schools in the ‘Africa, Europe & Middle East’ category are on the European continent. Of all the schools in this category, Spain, the UK and Germany are home to a third. This means that Spain, the UK and Germany by themselves represent a greater proportion of schools in this category than either the Middle East or Africa.

These numbers support Bunnell’s (2008) findings that the spread of IB schools over time has been unbalanced, not only in terms of East and West, but also in that the Northern hemisphere accounts for many more students than the Southern hemisphere. This, cautions

Bunnell (2008), results in “a certain degree of bias in terms of syllabus content and assessment criteria” (p. 428) and puts a question mark on the claim that it has no cultural affiliations or is truly global in its influences and make up.

Bunnell’s concerns are supported by results from Hahn’s (2003) study which includes an analysis of the IB’s institutional structure and governing board as well as the spread of IB World schools and DP students throughout the world. Her results led her to conclude that the IB is “an international organization governed primarily by Western European nations and the United States” (p. 131). Her study also suggests that this imbalance of Western influence is reflected in the structural frameworks of the IB curricula.

Although the DP courses are subject to a seven-year curriculum review cycle which invites the feedback of teachers and academics from around the world (Balzani, 2010; Lepine, 2006), critics point out that the uneven spread of schools compromises the integrity of this feedback in terms of global feedback and may disproportionately reflect Western thought (Bunnell, 2008). There is also an awareness that the DP was designed to fit the needs and entry requirements of Western universities (Hill, 2006; Paris, 2003; Peterson, 1983) which has reinforced concerns that the program is derived from, and for, a Western educational construct (Paris, 2003). It has also not escaped the eyes of critics that the DP’s early influencers were all white, male and Western (Azzi, 2018).

While the IB does recognize that the DP has Western roots, Hill (2006) says the framework “explores and legitimises non-western modes of expression and thought” (p. 107). The IB also states quite firmly that adaptability is an essential component of the DP’s curricular framework, allowing it to be shaped to fit the needs of different local educational systems, their content and their traditional educational practices (Hill, 2006; Peterson, 1972).

Critics have responded by labeling this argument as overly simplistic saying that students and teachers must assimilate the Western values, pedagogies and knowledge

benchmarks simply to succeed within the DP (Hughes, 2009; Paris, 2003; Poonoosamy, 2010; Van Oord, 2007).

In summary, critics of the DP point to the roots of its pedagogy, its organizational structure and the very shape of its presence around the world as they question the extent to which it is international and transferable, or simply an artifact of the West with a strong, if misleading, internationalist branding. The next section will present concerns around the DP's implementation in non-Western contexts.

### **Preserving Cultural Values and Local Knowledge Systems when Implementing the DP in non-Western Contexts**

In non-Western contexts, schools implementing non-national curricula often host student, and teacher, bodies which are predominantly national. Paris (2003) believes that, in these schools, the DP acts as a globalizing force that threatens to replace local values and indigenous knowledge systems. He goes so far as to state that, "fundamentally, each culture that chooses to run with the IB-DP potentially relinquishes its values and practices of education in exchange for those of the western world" (p. 235).

Hill (2006) counters this, saying it is a misrepresentation of how the DP works. Instead, he says, the DP is chosen by a select number of schools catering to populations already hooked into and seeking a more internationalized worldview. Hill (2006) cites another former Director General of the IB, Robert Peel (1988), as saying that the IB prioritizes the teaching and learning of native languages, histories, values and customs before shifting to educating for internationally mindedness.

However, the research suggests it is not the promise of promoting local cultures while educating for international-mindedness that makes the DP attractive in non-Western contexts. Rather, it is its inherent Westernness that draws students and their families to it. Doherty et al. (2009) point out that the availability of non-national education franchises gives

affluent, internationally mobile families access to a transnational market when it comes to the schooling of their children. Studies of why students choose the DP over their local curricula or other non-national franchises, such as the British and American curricula, have found that access to the global market and Western universities are key factors in their decision making (Doherty et al., 2009; Hayden & Wong, 1997; Lineham, 2013; Paris, 2003).

Hill's (2006) has stated that students in such schools are strongly anchored in their local cultures while simultaneously, through the curriculum's focus on international-mindedness, developing an increased ability to accept and understand others. The research would support the former of his conclusions, but not necessarily the latter. Regarding whether students in non-national schools with largely local populations remain ensconced in their local culture, the research presents a more nuanced view. Kanan and Baker's (2006) study of the representations of identity and career aspirations of 270 local students in Qatari public, private and magnet schools revealed that students attending public schools identified more strongly with collective and religious elements of Qatari culture than their counterparts in IB World and IGCSE schools, who demonstrated a higher degree of individualism in how they self-identified.

There were also differences in the universities each group of students aspired to and their career goals. Despite this, the students themselves did not perceive a threat to their cultural identity resulting from their enrollment in a non-national school, because they felt embedded in their local culture. Nonetheless, the researchers warn specifically of the potential for the dilution of religious identity in Islamic contexts saying it could have "social and political reverberations in the host country" (Kanan & Baker, 2006, p. 265).

It is important to note that the researchers also caution against generalizing these results because of the difficulty in controlling for social factors in and outside of the school

walls. It does, nevertheless, add intrigue to the murky division between Paris (2003) and Hill's (2006) perspectives on the DP's impact on cultural values in non-Western contexts.

***The challenge of maintaining native languages.*** For some, the teaching of local languages is also considered at risk within the DP. Apart from the language courses, DP subjects are, with rare exceptions, taught and examined only in English, French or Spanish (IB, 2014a). After surveying a small number of DP graduates and teachers at the University of Bath, Hayden and Wong (1997) found that students felt learning their own language in Language A was key to preserving their sense of cultural identity.

Currently the course offerings within the Language A component are 'Literature', 'Language & Literature' and 'Literature & Performance'. The Literature course is currently offered in 55 languages, Language & Literature in 17 (both include Arabic) and, lastly, Language & Performance which is only offered in English, Spanish or French (IB, n.d.-g).

For schools catering to a diverse student body, there may not always be the funds or teachers available to offer Language A in each student's mother tongue; having said that, there is an option for students to complete the course via an independent study format.

***The replacement of traditional educational practices with Western ones.*** There are concerns that adopting the DP can involve the relinquishing of traditional educational practices in favor of the DP's pedagogical approach and, with them, a history of organic, educational development. Gan (2009), for example, describes the deeply cultural and historically revered Chinese practice of memorization, and its role in attaining in-depth understanding of concepts. Memorization, he explains, has also been historically linked to the logistical realities that teachers in China face such as large classroom sizes, limited resources and a cultural focus on exam results. In the DP however, these approaches are actively discouraged in favor of more student led, inquiry-based pedagogies. Another example is contexts such as China, Africa and Japan where teachers and students must forego traditional

adult/child relationships in favor of the critical, questioning approach expected of students in the DP.

Drake (2004) cautions against importing of the DP into non-Western contexts without consideration of how it will fit into the local context. He describes, for example, the philosophical conflict facing fatalistic cultures when dealing with the individualistic goal setting of the DP. He also points out the incongruity of individual assessment in collectivist cultures that value the product of the group; this, he says, can be “to the detriment of those whose educational experience has been shaped by different cultural norms” (Drake, 2004, p. 196).

Studies conducted in both Western and non-Western contexts suggest that teachers believe so strongly in the IB’s pedagogical approach that they are using it in both their DP and non-DP classes. For example, Barnett (2013) found that 90% of the teachers who participated in her study in Ecuador felt that teaching in the DP had changed their practice and given them more modern teaching methods and strategies that they were implementing as part of their normal teaching practice.

Mukherjee (2018) also found that teachers in Costa Rica were eschewing their former practices in favor of DP style teaching in all their classes, DP and non-DP. This finding echoes Cook’s (2017) study which also found the teachers in California were also using the IB’s pedagogical strategies in their non-DP classes.

While these studies could be seen as examples of local practices being replaced, the teachers in all these studies felt that this development in their practice was a sign of their growth as practitioners and were positive about the change. Additionally, because of similar themes in Western contexts, these studies add a question mark to the notion that the IB’s strategies are necessarily ‘Westernizing’ non-Western contexts. However, it is not clear how

each context compares in terms of the amount of change that is required in order for teachers to adopt the IB's pedagogical principles in place of their traditional ones.

Van Oord's (2007) own summary wraps up this section, while introducing the next one, very succinctly:

Claiming that the IBO contributes to cultural imperialism is a bold accusation, yet the analysis... suggests that the organization might contribute to the transformation and westernization of non-western kinds of knowledge. If this is the case, then the IBO could indeed play a modest role in the perpetuation of western domination by westernizing the youth of non-western traditions (p. 387)

### **Contribution to Academic and Socioeconomic Segregation**

As mentioned previously, the DP is an expensive program for schools to implement, and this cost is generally passed on to the parents in the form of fees. That, coupled with its rigorous academic slant, has led some to caution that it encourages both academic and socioeconomic segregation especially in non-Western contexts where it is being implemented in mostly private schools.

*The DP's contribution to socioeconomic segregation.* Doherty (2009) points out that "the IB has its origins and vision in facilitating routes for transnational mobility of a cosmopolitan middle class" (p. 77). Because of the prohibitive fees associated with enrolling in the DP, and apart from some countries like America (White, 2012), Costa Rica (Mukherjee, 2018) and Ecuador (Resnik, 2016) where the DP has been used as a tool for reforming public education, schools that offer it tend to be expensive private schools, inaccessible to those who fall outside of the higher income brackets (Bunnell, 2008; Bunnell, 2016; Gardner-McTaggart, 2016; Kidson et al., 2018). Bunnell's (2011) analysis of the spread of IB World schools across the world suggests that attending an IB school is, in many countries, a visible sign of social status, "such as the Middle East, where the programme has a largely private and elitist education following" (Bunnell, 2009, p. 63). Poonoosamy says the same of Mauritius where "the IB is reserved for the economic elite" (2010, p. 16), and in

Argentina and Chile where almost all DP schools are private and cater mostly to upper and middle-class families (Resnik, 2016).

In line with this, studies have found that schools are capitalizing on this elitism as part of their marketing material. Whitehead's (2005) analysis of the text and images in IB World schools' advertising in a daily Australian newspaper revealed that, despite the IB's desire to create an inclusive curriculum producing thoughtful and contributing citizens of the world, adverts used language and imagery featuring the socially advantaged in traditional family structures and conventional gender roles; in this context the IB was being sold as a product providing, as she phrased it, "social advantage rather than social justice" (p. 2).

Echoing these findings, in his discussion of the DP's growth in the global south, Gardner-McTaggart (2016) states that, "a brief 'surf' over international schools websites in the South reveals a glossy world of advantage, replete with jostling visions, missions, curricula: the unique selling point" (Gardner-McTaggart, 2016, p. 12). He cautions that this segregation risks creating a cycle of social reproduction based on the social, economic and cultural capital provided within the 'exclusive' environment of such a socioeconomically segregated schooling system.

In the same vein, in her comparison of corporate multiculturalism with the aims, courses, and structures of the MYP and DP curricula, Resnik (2009) found that there is a remarkable alignment between the characteristics of a successful global manager as laid out in organizational literature, and the competencies students learn through the IB curricula. She concludes that the IB is molding students to fit the profile of a global manager, in line with the evolving global job market, which has two main dangers. The first is a growing divide between the national and non-national school systems where "students from elite schools acquire cognitive, emotional and communicative skills that open the doors to high status jobs whereas students from state schools lack essential predispositions, undermining their chances

to access these coveted jobs.” (p. 236). Secondly, students attending public schools that have weak multiculturalism programs and do not promote the job-ready competencies taught through the IB curricula are further disadvantaged compared to their wealthier counterparts.

The problem with this finds its roots in a statement by Peterson (1972) regarding the purpose of non-national schools in bringing students together rather than separating them based on their chosen curriculum. After discussing the importance of including a sizeable number of local students in non-national schools, he says, using Lebanon as an example, "if this group from the host country is, alone of all pupils, debarred from following the common International Baccalaureate curriculum and from taking the common examination, the old evils of segregation into separate teaching groups appear again in a very acute form" (Peterson, 1972, p. 25).

In the case of non-national schools catering to local families, the streaming of children into educational haves and have-nots most certainly contributes to the evils of socioeconomic segregation and there is no question that this happens in schools that implement the DP in non-Western contexts. In Lebanon, where 1% of Lebanon’s population holds a quarter of its wealth and a third of the population is living below the poverty line (Fadel, 2018), the cost of implementing an IB program makes the cost of attending an IB World school a barrier to a significant chunk of the population (Azzi, 2018).

***Academic elitism in the DP.*** Meanwhile, the DP has also been criticized for its academic elitism. After analyzing the language used to describe the DP in Australian newspapers, Doherty (2009) found that the narrative around it is very much aimed at students destined for university. She says the DP “is clearly portrayed as an alternative for a particular type of student, so not everybody gets this choice. The students do not just choose the curriculum the curriculum chooses the students” (p. 86). In their extensive, mixed methods study of teachers in public and private schools offering both the DP and national curriculum

across Australia, Doherty and Shield (2012) found concerns that the separating of students into DP and local programs, while beneficial to participating DP students and teachers, has a detrimental knock-on effect on those in the local programs. This manifests in the intellectual streaming of DP students into smaller classes and leaving local program students in larger classes with lower average academic ability, more behavioral issues and fewer academic role models in the classroom.

Additionally, more qualified and experienced teachers tended to be pulled into, or volunteer for, DP teaching roles which impacted the quality of education given in the local program. One teacher complained of an unequal distribution of resources allocated to DP students. Similarly, Paris's (2003) study of 10<sup>th</sup> graders at an IB World school in Switzerland who were about to embark on the DP revealed that students themselves believed enrollment in the DP results in smaller classes, being grouped with the 'smart' kids and access to better qualified, more effective teachers.

Interestingly, despite the marketing of the DP as a 'superior' curriculum, Fitzgerald's (2015) study of perceptions of the DP in admissions offices of Canadian universities found that, while the admissions officers rated the DP higher than the US and Canadian curricula as a university prep course for students, they were unable to provide any measurable evidence for their opinions and, secondly, rated the DP largely on par with the A 'level and other non-national curricula.

These findings were consistent with IB commissioned studies conducted in the UK and Australia, which Fitzgerald used as the basis for her own. She posits that the high regard displayed by admissions officers is largely down to the IB's own branding and marketing efforts with universities and "numerous publications, brochures, conference presentations, and workshops to help university personnel understand the IBDP curriculum" (p. 4). This,

over time, she asserts, has created a construct that informs opinions on the DP resulting in its being “institutionalized as a superior curriculum” (p. 6).

The next section will look at the history and state of education in Lebanon.

### **The Lebanese Educational Landscape**

Lebanon’s education system is not new to the influence of Western curricula. Currently, the non-national curricula being implemented across the Lebanese educational landscape include “the U.S. High School (HS) Diploma, Graduate Certificate of Secondary Education (GCSE), International Baccalaureate (IB), Deutsches Sprachdiplom (DSD) and French Baccalaureate” (Akar & Albrecht, 2017, p. 557) which are taught primarily in English, French and German.

Interestingly, Lebanon’s relationship with the DP is almost as old as the DP itself. International College (IC) put forward 48 students to take part in the DP’s pilot examination session in 1966 (Peterson, 1972). However, IC’s DP accreditation lapsed during the Civil War (1975 – 1990) and was not reactivated until 2001, by which time both Sagesse High School and the American Community School (ACS) had received their DP accreditations which they received in 1995 (IB, n.d.-c) (see Appendix B for a full list of DP schools in Lebanon).

The DP, however, was not the Lebanon’s first foray into non-national education. The following sections will present a brief overview of education in Lebanon and relevant research done around the implementation of the DP in this context.

### **Context and History**

Lebanon’s nascent post-colonial political sovereignty stands in the long-fingered shadow of empire, itself manifested through the history of Lebanon’s educational system which, over the centuries, has reflected the languages, interests and intellectual heritages of a lengthy series of ruling powers (Daher, 2012; Frayha, 2003). After the post-World War 1 crumbling

of the Ottoman Empire, the French gained a foothold in Lebanon in the form of a political mandate (1920 – 1943), and, with the responsibility of rejuvenating the education sector, the French quickly made the French Baccalaureate system the model on which Lebanon's new national curriculum was based (Frayha, 2003).

The resulting national Lebanese Baccalaureate Certificate of Secondary Education (Shahaadat Al-Bakaalouriya al Lubnaaniya l'il-ta 'liim al-Thaanawi) exams, also known as the Lebanese Baccalaureate or LB, are school leaving exams which are mandatory for all Lebanese citizens and cover the last three years of high school. Like the DP, completing the Baccalaureate course serves as an equivalent year to the first, or freshman, year at American style universities (Jbara, 2008).

Students can also complete the French Baccalaureate which the LB is based on and is considered as an equivalent diploma by the government (Azzi, 2018). As a result, although private schools are allowed to and do implement their own curricula, the broad sketch lines remain largely similar across schools as teachers prepare students for their leaving examinations.

Since Lebanese independence in 1943, successive governments have sought to create a standardized, national curriculum promoting citizenship, national identity and peace building with Arabic as a first language and English or French as a second (Akar, 2007; Frayha, 2003; Jabbour, 2014; Jbara, 2008). However, educational reform in Lebanon, especially with regards to the history and civics curricula, has been slow; its goals hijacked by a 15-year civil war, a series of internal conflicts, political bickering and the impossibility of navigating a still-fraught, sectarian landscape where everyone wants to be right (Daher, 2012; Frayha, 2012; van Ommering, 2015). The history curriculum, for example, was last reviewed in 1968 (Akar, 2017). In addition, as Shuayb's (2019) study of recent educational

reform in Lebanon found, a key barrier to successful reform was, among other things, the inconsistent relationship between producers of research and policy makers.

### **The Lebanese Baccalaureate: Framework and Pedagogy**

The objectives of the LB curriculum itself, as well as the individual syllabi are, in theory, geared towards student centered teaching, the use of projects and linking course work to the real world. The LB exams, however, are designed in such a way to reward rote learning, and teacher-centric approaches to teaching such as the use of lecturing and drilling students on past papers (Hilal, 2018; Jbara, 2008). As a result, teaching in the LB tends to lean heavily on what is seen as more traditional teaching strategies.

There have been several studies which examine the incongruity between the aims of the Lebanese national curriculum and the way it is assessed and taught. For example, Hashwe's (2016) study on the curriculum development of the Lebanese program's grade 1 Arabic curriculum found that there was a lack of coherence in the alignment of the learning objectives, content, methodology, and assessment of the curriculum in terms of the development of a particular type of learner. She also found that the curriculum did not provide opportunities for students to learn critical or creative thinking and was more focused on the production of skills rather than the process of learning them. Hashwe expressed concern that the CERD curriculum developers were not using systematic, well thought out protocols in curriculum development. For example, the needs assessment carried out by the developers was based on "a semi-informal rather than a systematic and participative process of data collection that solicit the opinions of all stakeholders" (p. 124). Although her study focused on the grade 1 Arabic curriculum, it is not unlikely that the rest of the curricula were built using similar protocols (or lack thereof).

Additionally, an analysis of the physics and chemistry LB exams using Blooms Taxonomy found that the assessments test for basic knowledge recall and focus very little on

critical and analytical thinking. Also, there is very little attempt to integrate discussions of relevant social or ethical issues in the examinations and, therefore, in the teaching (Kraidy & Fares, 1984). While this study is quite dated, there is little to suggest that much has changed.

Another example demonstrating the difference between the written and taught curricula in Lebanon are the civics and history subjects which teachers and students agree prioritize memorization over understanding (Akar, 2017). Studies done on the teaching of the civics course, which explicitly espouses democratic participation and civic engagement, was found by students to be uninspiring, unengaging and reliant on traditional techniques like rote learning with the use of critical thought or debates not encouraged, and sometimes actively shut down (Akar, 2007; Jabbour, 2014; Shuayb, 2011; van Ommering, 2015). This is partly due to teachers teaching to the test, and partly due to sensitivities which discourage open discussions about the Lebanese Civil War, and the difficulties of navigating the competing sectarian narratives of Lebanon's history after 1943, which marks the end of recorded Lebanese history in the government mandated national history books (van Ommering, 2015).

A Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD) analysis of Lebanese students' 2015 performance on the international PISA tests highlighted certain skills gaps in the competencies students demonstrated, especially when it came to higher order thinking skills. The report linked the results of the PISA tests, which assess students' ability to extrapolate on their knowledge and use skills of evaluation and analysis, with the approach to assessment in Lebanon which focuses on the reproduction of knowledge and considered this a contributing factor to student performance. This same analysis found that 50.7% of students performed below proficiency in all three exams: math, science and reading literacy and that 21<sup>st</sup> century skills were not necessarily being addressed in the curriculum (2018).

The report's suggestions for improving Lebanon's performance included providing teacher professional development in questioning techniques, integrating more real-life,

problem-solving and conceptual exercises, and using student-centered instructional strategies to encourage higher level thinking skills in the students (CERD, 2018).

### **Education and Socio-economic Division in Lebanon**

Lebanon's social and political fabric features divisions etched deeply into its collective memory and, because of the lack of a unifying narrative or school curriculum around Lebanon's modern history, it is a country "where young people inherit their historical knowledge of the war and its grievances" (Shuayb, 2011, p. 434).

Additionally, a weak civics curriculum coupled with teacher-centered pedagogical practices that do not inspire or engage students is not helping students to navigate nor understand the fractures surrounding them. A study by Akar on the effectiveness of citizenship education in Lebanon found that students struggled to align the concepts they were learning in class with the lack of 'proper' civic behavior being demonstrated outside of their school walls (2007). Akar (2012) also found that teachers used "didactic pedagogies for the purpose of students passing exams and degrees of resistance towards classroom discussions so as to avoid conflicts with and among students" (as cited in Akar, 2017, p. 555).

Meanwhile, Baytiyeh (2017) makes the point that the pushing of religious agendas through the contentious reform process has also contributed to the challenge of channeling social unity through the school system. Lebanon's divisions therefore are reflected, and as Baytiyeh (2017) argues, perpetuated through a school system that "facilitates the segregation of communities and marginalizes the role of schools as preparatory institution for social development and progress" (p. 548). This claim is supported by a CERD report which shows a lack of equity in education (2018) suggesting that the educational landscape is not providing opportunities for social mobility and segregates students along socioeconomic lines.

Because of a lack of development in the public education sector dating back to the Ottoman Empire, a cultural preference for private schooling, and a long-standing tradition of private, faith-based schooling; by the end of the French mandate over 50% students were enrolled in private education (Frayha, 2003). This trend has by no means abated and an average of five public schools have shut down each year since the 2011 – 2012 academic year leaving the private to public school ratio at 54% in favor of private schools (Daou & Mikhael, 2018). According to a CERD report, in 2017, 68% of Lebanese pupils were registered in private schools. This means that most students are outside of the government mandated curriculum and, importantly, the framing of controversial issues which are left to the discretion of individual schools and teachers. Because of their affiliation to a particular religion or area, there are concerns that these schools are reinforcing social divisions (Baytiyeh, 2017).

In addition, the 10<sup>th</sup> amendment of the Lebanese Constitution protects the rights of communities to have religious schools “provided they follow the general rules issued by the state regulating public instruction” and their teaching is “not contrary to public order and morals and does not affect the dignity of any of the religions or sects” (Lebanese Republic, 1995). This vague wording leaves much open to interpretation and enshrines the rights of schools to teach narratives that suit their beliefs; however, it also makes for an anxious battleground for teachers or school who wish to question or critique the predominant narratives of their constituents.

### **Studies on the Implementation of the DP in Lebanon**

Only students holding a non-Lebanese passport or students who have spent three or more years of their schooling outside of Lebanon can apply for an exemption from taking the LB exams (Azzi, 2018) and participate in the non-national curriculum of their school. Having

said this, since the equivalency, students no longer need a second nationality nor to apply for an equivalency in order to enroll in the DP.

Interest in the IB has grown in Lebanon, and more schools have been adopting it. Although studies around its implementation are few, they show a marked difference between the pedagogies, expectations and content taught in the LB and DP. For example, BouJaoude, Dagher and Refai's analysis of representations of the nature of science in Lebanese ninth grade science textbooks suggests that they do not "adequately support students' development of scientific literacy in its broader sense" (2017, p. 94). Meanwhile, El-Mehtar and Alameh (2017) highlight the explicit focus on nature of science in the DP science curricula and its connection to teaching international-mindedness and the epistemological questioning embodied by the compulsory Theory of Knowledge course.

Another example is the DP history course which, like other DP courses, makes room for the incorporation of local knowledge, but it also requires teachers to give equal weight to different, even conflicting, perspectives, and teach students to approach them all with an open-minded but critical and analytical eye (IB, 2015a; Lepine, 2006). This would be a clear difficulty for teachers in Lebanon where, as van Ommering (2015) bemoans, there is a lack of teacher training or support in dealing with, or facilitating, such sensitive discussions.

***Studies comparing the LB and the DP.*** Hilal's (2018) mixed methods comparative study of teachers' use of critical thinking in a DP school versus an LB school found that teaching strategies promoting critical thinking were deployed substantially more in the DP than the LB. Teachers described how the LB afforded them few opportunities to integrate critical thinking into their pedagogy or assessment, especially in civics, geography, history and sociology courses.

Meanwhile, Jbara's (2008) surveys of 200 students and teachers revealed that 64% of DP teachers tended to use a wide variety of assessment tools which included oral and

written assessments, project work, performances and the use of portfolios. However, only 19% of LB teachers saw themselves (or were seen) as making use of diverse tools of assessment.

*The difficulty of incorporating national focused content into the DP.* Poonoosamy (2010; 2016) contends that the physical end of colonization does not always signify the end of its influence; especially in areas such as trade and education. Meanwhile, Hughes (2009) argues that, without careful consideration of the implicit power dynamics that exist between cultures, non-national curricula like the DP can fall into the trap of centering the Western gaze, which reduces the ideas and knowledge systems of ‘others’ to only what can be seen or understood through a Western lens (Hughes, 2009).

In his interviews with two DP students in Mauritius, one local and one international, Poonoosamy (2016) found that the students perceived Western knowledge systems and culture as being given greater weight in the TOK courses. Similarly, Azzi’s (2018) case study of a DP school in Lebanon uncovered students’ feelings that America was vastly over-represented in class discussions while Lebanon barely featured. They also showed a cynical awareness that it was unlikely that students in America were learning as much about Lebanon as they were about the US. While Azzi’s (2018) case study showed an awareness of this on the part of teachers, it also identified their concerns about the difficulty of incorporating more Lebanese content in their lessons because of time constraints and being overwhelmed by the program.

To conclude this literature review, based on the results of studies conducted in Lebanon as well as both Western and non-Western contexts, and as the DP continues to grow in popularity around the world and in Lebanon, there is certainly the need to look deeper into its implementation in the Lebanese context

This study aims to add to existing studies in Lebanon and around the world in order to better understand the challenges to implementing the DP. In terms of practice, is it important for school leaders to understand teachers' experiences of the DP, their challenges and the ways in which these challenges come down to a lack of congruence in the value systems of the IB and Lebanese context. This will allow school leaders to be forward thinking and thoughtful about how these challenges can be pre-empted or dealt with to ensure effective implementation that is supportive of teachers and considerate of the needs of the context.

### **Theoretical Framework**

In order to explore the perceptions of DP teachers through the lens of the DP's expectations of them, a theoretical framework was needed that could support the analysis of the geographic and cultural distance between the expectations of the IB and the experiences of the teachers implementing the DP. In the case of the DP schools chosen for this study, their educational and organizational goals and the expectations of how those goals should be met are largely set by the IB, not the schools themselves. So, the IB can be seen as the governing institution of its member schools.

In accordance, teachers' roles, or what is expected of the teachers, are also set by the IB through the DP's curricular frameworks, the IB's chosen pedagogies, assessment styles, mission statement, Learner Profile and the values underpinning the core components of the DP. As this study aims to delve into the space between the expectations of the DP, as adopted by DP schools in Lebanon, and the perceptions of the teachers who are trying to deliver it, Getzels and Guba's model of schools as social systems (1957), overlaid with Hoy and Miskel's (2011) refinement of it, are used as a basis to organize, describe and foreground teacher experiences of teaching the DP within this context.

Getzels and Guba's (1957) model of schools as social systems describes two enfolding arms that border and shape the school environment. One arm is the structural (or nomothetic) dimension whose purpose and expectations provide the overarching goals and structure of the institution; these are then broken down into roles and expected behaviors. Individuals are ultimately drafted into these roles to deliver the institutional goals; however, these goals are "empty if the subordinate does not implement" (Getzels et al., 1968, p. 53).

It is these individuals, or subordinates, that make up the second (idiographic) arm of the model and, even though all members in the social system may gather around the same set of expectations and goals, how these roles are perceived or enacted by the different individuals within the system can vary because of the unique interpretive lenses of the different members (Getzels et al., 1968).

Additionally, expectations on members of an institution "derive from the requirements of the social system of which the institution is a part but also are related to the values of the culture which is the context for the particular social system" (Getzels et al., 1968, p. 92). This is a key notion for this study as the literature has uncovered challenges, or gaps, linked to the difficulties of aligning the pedagogical expectations and value systems of the DP with those of teachers in Western and non-Western contexts who are trying to meet them.

Getzels and Guba (1957) posit that conflicts can happen when individuals are, "required to conform simultaneously to a number of expectations which are mutually exclusive, contradictory, or inconsistent" (p. 432). These conflict between the structural expectations laid out by institutions and their members' perceived ability to meet those expectations can cause dissatisfaction or ineffectiveness at work (Getzels & Guba, 1957). Hoy and Miskel (2011) call them structural/cultural incongruences and it is these

incongruences that this study seeks to uncover in the experiences of DP teachers in the Lebanese context.

According to Hoy and Miskel (2011), the four main elements of a school are structure, culture, individuals and politics. This study will focus on the structural and cultural elements to understand what structural/cultural incongruences can be identified in the Lebanese context as experienced by DP teachers. For the purpose of this study, the structural component of the framework will be comprised of the IB and DP-set expectations around teacher behavior including pedagogies, educational approaches and values. These have been taken from the IB's documentation and analysis done by other researchers.

Culture is defined by Hoy and Miskel as “shared orientations” (2011, p. 29) around values and belief systems between the members of an organization and can be as influential as the structural component in shaping behavior. Values are tied more closely to the roles and expectations set by the institution and reflect what it considers to be desirable behavior. For the purpose of this study, the realities of the teachers on the ground will comprise the cultural component of the framework. The findings of the literature in terms of the IB's expectations and challenges faced by teachers in meeting them are laid out in Appendix C and create out a framework for initial coding and analysis which will be done using Thematic Analysis (TA).

The research design is a multiple case study format and is underpinned by an interpretivist epistemology which considers the experience of reality to be constructed by the perceptions of those living it (Gall, Gall & Borg, 2014) and an interpretivist/constructivist approach. Focus groups were conducted in selected DP schools in Lebanon in order to capture the experiences of the teachers.

### **Summary**

To summarize, although its popularity continues to grow, the DP has come under scrutiny for its claims of offering an international education (Bunnell, 2008; Bunnell, 2011;

Hahn, 2003), and for selling itself as a curriculum that can be implemented across different contexts (Hughes, 2009; Paris, 2003; Poonoosamy, 2010; Van Oord, 2007).

Studies conducted in both Western and non-Western contexts reveal that transitioning to the program can be difficult for both teachers and students. Teachers who face challenges in meeting the expectations required of them when transitioning to, or working within, the DP in terms of keeping up with the workload, completing their syllabi in the allocated time and, especially in non-Western context, adopting new pedagogical approaches and aligning the framework to their local context (Barnett, 2013; Cook, 2017; Dulfer, 2019; Gan, 2009; Halicioglu, 2008; Taylor, 2019).

Building on the challenges presented in the literature from other contexts, this study aims to explore DP teachers' understandings of the IB's expectations of them in terms of pedagogical approaches, and core values, while exploring the challenges they face in trying to meet these expectations when implementing the DP in the Lebanese context. The research will focus on developing an understanding of the ways in which these challenges come down to a lack of alignment between the IB's value system and that of the Lebanese context.

In order to frame the nature of the alignment (or lack thereof) between the IB and the Lebanese context, the language of Hoy and Miskel's (2011) treatment of Getzels and Guba's (1957) social systems framework is used. Hoy and Miskel use the term structural/cultural incongruence to describe a situation where the governing component of an ecosystem (in this case the IB) has expectations that its implementers (in this case DP teachers) are unable to fulfil. This study aims to find those areas of structural/cultural incongruence between the IB's expectations and the every-day realities of DP teachers in order to help school leaders support their DP teachers in transitioning to and implementing the program.

The next chapter will elaborate on the methodology used in this study.

## CHAPTER III

### METHODOLOGY

This study explored DP teachers' perceptions of the IB's expectations in terms of pedagogical approaches and core values, while attempting to uncover the challenges they face in trying to meet these expectations when implementing the DP in the Lebanese context and whether any of these challenges are due to a lack of congruence between the value system of the IB and that of the Lebanese context.

This section of the thesis will specify the research questions, outline the methodological approach to be used, means of data collection and analysis, and the strategies that will be taken to ensure quality of research.

#### **Research Questions**

From the perspective of DP teachers in Lebanon:

1. what are the practices and core values expected of DP teachers based on their understanding of the IB's mission statement, Learner Profile, pedagogical approaches and DP assessment requirements?
2. what, if any, challenges do DP teachers face in meeting the IB's expectations in the Lebanese context in terms of their understanding of its pedagogical approaches, its requirements when it comes to values-based teaching and preparing students for the DP assessments?
3. in what ways are teachers' challenges due to incongruences between the core values of the IB and those commonly used in the Lebanese context?

#### **Research Design**

In order to reach a genuine understanding of DP teachers' experiences and the challenges they face, this study had to be built on a foundation that brings to the fore and

distils the perceptions of its participants which is a strength and key purpose of the qualitative approach to research (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018; Vaismoradi, Turunen & Bondas, 2013).

The study adopted a constructivist perspective, which helps to identify the lived experience and allows for meaning to be derived through interpretation (Tice, 1995). As the constructivist perspective supports an exploration of the perceived experiences constructed by its participants, this perspective aligns naturally with an interpretivist epistemology.

Therefore, a constructivist/interpretivist paradigm was used.

A multiple case study design was used to collect data from a number of different school locations; this design allows for gaining a deeper understanding of the constructed realities of participants teachers in different locations schools and uncovering the common threads of experience across the different locations (Stake, 2006).

### **Data Collection Tools**

Focus groups were chosen as the data collection tool for this study as bringing teachers together to discuss, or negotiate, their shared experiences would allow for a deeper, more dynamic exploration of the topic. As Robinson (2012) says, the discussions between participants will act “as a catalyst on the topic as people contribute in new and unexpected ways (even to themselves)” (p. 402).

Kitzinger (1995) makes a distinction between the group interview, where questions are posed to each participant, and the focus group where even the interaction between participants can become part of the data collection, or at the very least, be a tool for navigating ever deeper into the topics at hand. She makes particular note of the advantages of this method for the open-ended exploration of people’s ideas and experiences.

The structure of the focus group and interview questions followed Spradley’s (1979) suggestion of a broad “grand tour” question based on the research question which is then supported by sub-questions the prompt participants if and when needed (as cited in Kawulich,

2012, p.10). The discussions were open-ended and reactive to the participants' ideas, while remaining within the realm of the research questions (see Appendix D for focus group questions). As Vaismoradi et al. (2013) describe it, "the result should be the identification of a story, which the researcher tells about the data in relation to the research question" (p. 403).

In addition to focus groups, two interviews were conducted to include two teachers who had not been able to attend their school focus groups. The interviews followed the same format and question structure of the focus groups. Although it was not the original intention, the interviews did end up being valuable, although unplanned, member checking tools. Away from the conforming influence of peers, the interviews ultimately helped to validate the focus groups findings and reflected many of the same themes as the focus groups.

### **Study Sites and Participants**

Participants for this study were drawn from six of the 11 schools in Lebanon that were implementing the DP at the time of research (the number of DP schools in Lebanon is now 13). The sampling procedure for this study was a purposive one based on naturally occurring groups. Selected schools were contacted for permission to conduct research with their teachers on site.

The parameters for inclusion in this study were that teachers be current DP teachers, and that their school have completed at least one full cycle of the DP. The reasons for this are twofold; on the one hand, the two-year minimum ensures that participating teachers (foreign or local) have had enough time to build up an understanding of teaching the DP in this context. Additionally, opening up the focus groups to both local and foreign teachers, and those who have taught in both national and non-national schools supports the study's objective of looking at the spectrum of experience across the Lebanese context, and remains inclusive of a cross section of teachers.

While there were initial thoughts about limiting participation to those teachers who had at least four years of experience with the DP, this significantly reduced the pool of potential participants and schools. As a result, the experience restriction was loosened to ensure there were enough teachers to make up a large enough sample to research.

While the researcher attempted to include a broad enough variety of schools to provide a cross section of schools in the Lebanese context, not all the original selection of schools responded or agreed to participate in the study. As a result, some additional schools were contacted; however, the sample did not cover some key areas of Lebanon such as the South where there is a DP school. It does however provide a broad cross section of schools in terms of years since DP accreditation, size of teaching staff and student body, school culture and some variation in physical location.

Based on the above and Stake's (2006) recommendation that multiple case study studies involve between four and 15 cases, six schools were ultimately included in this study (For a full list of DP accredited schools in Lebanon see Appendix B). In line with interpretive research, the focus groups were conducted in the teachers' natural settings (their schools) (Kawulich, 2012) and were made up of teachers from the same school. Between one and three focus groups were conducted with each school depending on the size and availability of the teaching staff.

By the end of the study, 10 focus groups and two interviews were held which included 62 teachers from six different schools. Focus groups were between 4 and 8 people to ensure there were enough voices to stimulate discussion while remaining a comfortable, manageable group size (Kitzinger, 1995; Robinson, 2012). Keeping focus groups small encourages participation from shyer participants who may feel drowned out in a larger group, while saving them from the experience of a one to one interview, the pressure of which could curb the length and depth of their responses (Kitzinger, 1995). Three participants participated

in member checking to ensure that the coding resulting from the analysis reflected their experiences.

### **Data Analysis**

The analysis for this study was both inductive and deductive, using both pre-figured codes based on the literature review and emergent codes. The data was organized and studied for emerging patterns then mapped and compared to the issues uncovered in the literature review (see Appendix C for the organizational structure using Hoy and Miskel's (2011) take on schools as social systems theory).

In order to remain open to the context-specific challenges of DP educators in Lebanon, an inductive approach to coding was also used which caters for and assimilates emerging and unexpected patterns so that a complete picture could be provided (Terry et al., 2017). The purpose of the combination of inductive and deductive analysis was to begin from a position informed by research while allowing the richness of the participants' experience to unfold through the analysis, rather than trap it within an overly prescribed analytic structure.

Such an approach requires a method like thematic analysis which provides an organic and flexible framework for coding and organizing data (Clarke & Braun, 2017). The recursive method of coding and recoding data, creating thematic groupings and mapping out relationships eventually leads to a broad, conceptual understanding of the data (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018), which can be subject to constant comparison (Gall et al., 2014) until theoretical saturation is reached and conclusions can be drawn.

Qualitative studies are supported by the provision of rich, detailed descriptions of the process of analysis and in the reporting of results (Kawulich, 2012) so this section will present the steps taken during the process of conducting Thematic Analysis.

## **Thematic Analysis**

The data were analyzed using an experiential approach to thematic analysis (TA) where language is seen as reflecting the realities, or perceived realities, of participants. The experiential approach to TA relies on the researcher using semantic coding to reflect the explicit meanings of participants (Terry, Hayfield, Clarke, & Braun, 2017). This is opposed to a critical approach which uses latent coding reflecting participants' "implicit meaning, such as ideas, meanings, concepts, assumptions which are not explicitly stated" (Terry, Hayfield, Clarke, & Braun, 2017, p. 8). The experiential approach was chosen in order to create a coding structure that could capture teachers' experiences of implementing the DP, in their words, based on their realities.

It has been suggested that TA is particularly useful for qualitative analysis dealing with large sets of data as it entails a flexible yet methodical process of deriving meaning from data (Nowell, Norris, White, & Moules, 2017). However, TA has been described by its critics as lacking a formalized structure which weakens its position as a rigorous process of analysis (Nowell et al., 2017). As a result, this study will use, as recommended by Maguire and Delahunt (2017), Braun and Clarke's (2006) method for conducting thematic analysis. This method is aimed at adding rigor to TA by providing a transparent and flexible structure which increases its functionality and reliability. How the steps were used in the analysis of the data is presented below (see Appendix E for further detail on Braun and Clarke's (2006) steps for thematic analysis):

1. Familiarization: the focus group discussions and interviews were transcribed and exported to an Excel sheet to allow for line by line analysis and grouped, when needed, into meaningful chunks of data such as short conversations between teachers. They were then studied in order to achieve the familiarity

which forms the bedrock of thematic analysis (Terry et al., 2017; Vaismoradi et al., 2013).

2. Generating initial codes: the transcripts were coded using labels that reflected the data's relationship to the research questions and broke down the data into "small chunks of meaning" (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017, p. 3355). Although certain codes and themes used for research question 1 were informed by the expectations of teachers set out in IB documentation, open coding was used for research questions 2 and 3 meaning that codes were developed during the process of analysis.
3. Searching for themes: after this, the data and codes were systematically studied in order to identify and develop, categories informed by, but not limited to, the key issues discussed in the literature review. In accordance with multiple case study design, the goal was to find patterns that held constant across the different school settings in order to make generalizations about the experiences of implementing the DP in the Lebanese context (Stake, 2006).
4. Reviewing themes: using themes that analyze as opposed to simply summarizing the data is key to conducting effective TA (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017), so the themes and coding were revised and reviewed until they told a story that both reflected the data, and provided a springboard from which further analysis could be made. This was done through a lengthy and recursive process of cross-checking, rethinking, reorganizing and rewording until a satisfactory catalogue of themes and codes was produced.
5. Defining and naming themes: finalizing names of themes and their connections to the research questions involved understanding how each theme reflected participants' understandings of the DP and its implementation and ensuring that

the wording of each theme reflected the data it represented. The final codes were checked by another researcher as well as three volunteers from the original participants who member checked the codes and themes.

6. Producing the report: this involved reporting the results according to themes and codes produced in step 5 (see chapter IV). Because TA is a recursive process, the lines between steps 4, 5 and 6 blurred as the process of reporting the data uncovered discrepancies in theme or code organization that needed to be addressed. The circular nature of the process allowed for the themes to be subjected to additional scrutiny and review which culminated in a more cohesive thematic story and more thoughtful analysis. The reporting was emic meaning the “words of the participants themselves to illustrate their perspective” (Kawulich, 2012, p. 16) in order to reflect the constructed understandings of participants.

### **Coding Using Microsoft Excel**

This study used Bree and Gallagher’s (2016) technique of using Microsoft Excel to increase the rigor and transparency of TA. This approach is aimed at a) increasing the transparency of the process by documenting each iteration of the analysis in an easy to follow, easy to compile file which becomes a key component of a study’s chain of evidence, b) increasing the rigor of the process by facilitating triangulation, peer review and assessing reliability through its transparency and c) providing researchers with a cost-effective mechanism for compiling and organizing data analysis.

After the data were collected and transcribed, they were exported into an Excel worksheet which divided the transcripts into small chunks of language based on the punctuation of the original transcript. After the familiarization with the data, during the second phrase of TA, each chunk of data was assigned key words to reflect the developing

codes. Once these transcripts were coded, Excel's 'sort' function was used to group data according to their assigned codes.

Once the coding had settled, data were grouped into larger thematic groupings based on their codes. At this point, each theme was assigned a color and the cells of data that represented that theme were color coded accordingly. Now the 'sort' function could be used to manipulate data by cell color (theme) or by codes which allowed for ease of review by both the researcher and principal researcher. Data could also be sorted by focus group which made consulting the original transcripts and original context of each comment quick and easy.

Once the data were grouped thematically, each grouping could be copy/pasted into a new worksheet within the Excel workbook. With each grouping on its own page, and easy access to the original transcripts, the review process was accessible and transparent. As reviews were conducted and changes were made, new worksheets were created to reflect the changes. As the analysis progressed through its different phases, the Excel workbook became a digital map which preserved each iteration and laid out the progression of the analysis process (see Appendix F for examples of sorted data).

### **Strategies for Ensuring Quality**

A criticism of TA is that its flexibility, on the one hand a great strength, makes the analysis vulnerability to inconsistency and unreliability during the coding and theme creation process (Nowell et al., 2017). Therefore, this study used a combination of Gall et al.'s (2014) quality assurance strategies in conjunction with Bree and Gallagher's (2016) highly structured and transparent method of using Microsoft Excel for coding.

The following section will elaborate on how they were used to ensure that this qualitative study was transparent in its process, well designed, assessable for generalizability

and composed of a rich set of data. Table 2 shows how each step of Braun and Clarke's (2006) phases of TA corresponds with Gall and Gall's (2014) quality measures.

Table 2	
<i>A Merging of Quality Control Measures Used in this Study</i>	
<u>Gall &amp; Gall Strategies for Qualitative Research (2014)</u>	<u>Braun &amp; Clarke's Steps for Thematic Analysis (2006)</u>
Usefulness	3, 6
Coding and member checks	4, 5
Chain of evidence	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6
Reflexivity	4, 5

## **Usefulness**

Drake (2004) advises schools, school leaders and educators to be “fully aware of the challenges posed to their current paradigms from any attempt to simply clone IB programmes and methodologies and apply them to different cultural contexts” (p. 194). Usefulness as a measure of evaluating the quality of qualitative research is defined by Gall et al. (2014) as a study “being relevant to problems of practice” (p. 288).

As outlined previously, the results of this study will provide helpful information for the planning of professional development, and mediating implementation issues related to practice by identifying the incongruences resulting from a cultural gap between the expectations put in place by the IB, and the teachers trying to satisfy them. For schools planning on implementing the DP, the results of this study can make for a smoother transition or more informed alignment between the DP and LB programs.

By foregrounding and being led by teachers' experiences and providing in-depth descriptions of their experiences and the Lebanese educational context, this study will

identify their concerns as perceived by the participants themselves. Including member checks and providing all interested parties with copies of the completed study will ensure that the study retains the potential of changing the practice of implementing the DP in this context. This will increase the study's usefulness to practitioners and its rigor as an example of qualitative research.

### **Coding Checks**

For qualitative studies conducted by a single researcher, aiming for inter-coder reliability can be difficult. Some researchers have suggested that inter-coder reliability is actually a hindrance to qualitative research and undermines it (Terry et al., 2017). They argue that, "within a qualitative paradigm, there is no one right way to analyse data, because there is no single truth" (Terry et al., 2017, p. 4), so having two people analyze code in the same way may simply imply that they have similar opinions or have been trained to 'see' similar results.

Instead, it is recommended that the researcher use intra-coder reliability coupled with members checks or participant validation to ensure reliability (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018). Therefore, an analysis of an early portion of data was revisited with the intention of comparing the initial results. The more similar the coding and analysis, the more reliable the categories and interpretation could be assumed to be. Because of the iterative nature of the thematic analysis, coding was revisited often to ensure that each theme and code accurately reflected the data set.

Additionally, member checking was done and care was taken to discuss the coding process with other researchers and make time for reflection and self-interrogation throughout the process.

## **Member Checks**

There are, of course, concerns that the group dynamic may cause some participants to not disclose issues that make them feel vulnerable, or that risk making them lose face in front of their colleagues. In order to make up for this, and ensure reliability, member checks were conducted to ensure that reporting and interpretation of the data was consistent with teachers' experiences (Stake, 2006). Three teachers were consulted in member checking all of whom felt that the themes reflected their experiences and none had any concerns or felt that changes to the coding should be made.

## **Chain of Evidence**

In line with Gall et al.'s (2014) suggestions, this study made use of an 'audit' trail which compiled and diligently recorded how the data were collected and procedures for their analysis. This was done both through careful record keeping but also maintaining a Microsoft Excel workbook that preserved a systematic, easy to follow record of each iteration of coding and analysis (see Appendix F). This serves to contribute to the study's generalizability by providing other researchers with detailed information about its methodology.

## **Reflexivity**

Gall et al. (2014) define reflexivity as a process used to help researchers "identify their biases, attempt to take these biases into account in their interpretations, and seek to minimize their effects on data collection and interpretation" (p. 281).

Being a DP teacher myself, it was important to separate my own opinions from those of the participants and, most importantly, not to let them sway the direction of the focus group discussions. A reflection journal was kept during the study and care was taken to ensure that any biases were considered and included in a discussion of the study's limitations.

## **Positionality of Researcher**

Kawulich (2012) recommends that researchers conducting qualitative studies disclose their relationship to the topic of study through a description of their values, relationship to participants and ideological biases. My interest in pursuing this research stems from questions that I had when implementing the DP in a school in Lebanon. I found myself questioning whether the IB's values were aligned with those of the context; and if they weren't, which value system was I consciously or unconsciously endorsing? What was ethical or right in this situation? I found that I was having many conversations with teachers who were also feeling a sense of being pulled in different directions. It seemed very much like we needed to think more carefully and deeply about what we wanted from the DP and how it should fit into our school.

When I began the research, I assumed that I would hear many opinions like mine, especially when it came to adopting a very critical perspective on the role that the DP could play in a non-Western context. My experiences had led me to believe that teachers would be facing challenges when it came to, for example, preserving local values and incorporating resources and discussions that encouraged students to get to know and feel a sense of belonging to their culture. However, that was not the case. It was intriguing to learn that very few other teachers felt that this was a concern. In many ways, that was very motivational for me as a researcher – to learn more about what I didn't know. As I came to this realization very early on in the data collection process, it was also an important reminder to step back from focus groups discussions and try to be as aware as possible of any moments where I could be trying to lead the conversation or encourage answers that would align with my perspectives.

This was especially critical for the research because, although I was teaching in the Lebanese context, I grew up in different places and came up through non-national schooling.

Therefore, it was especially important for me to step back and really listen to teachers who were born in and of this context and had much more insight into it than I.

### **Limitations**

This study is being conducted as part of the requirements of master's program and is therefore limited in its scope. Of the 13 schools currently implementing the DP (see Appendix B for full list), only 11 were implementing the program at the time of research. Of these 11, six participated in the study. Although these schools were chosen with the aim of providing a suitable cross section of schools in terms of location and time since initial accreditation, this study will not be able to provide the completeness of analysis that would be achieved by including all 13 schools.

Additionally, this study did not parse the teacher populations based on nationality, subject area or previous teaching experience, only length of time teaching the DP in the Lebanese context. This lack of ability to ensure equal representation across these categories may have skewed the results. For example, the humanities had greater representation than the math and sciences subjects.

Secondly, some non-national schools in Lebanon employ foreign teachers whose experiences and approaches to pedagogy may differ significantly from local teachers, which could color their experiences of implementation. Additionally, having taught internationally and been exposed to a greater variety of student populations in terms of culture (if not socio-economic background), their perspective on what is context specific adolescent behavior versus what is typical for teenagers around the world may be different.

Qualitative research is often difficult to replicate or generalize (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018), and, like many other studies exploring the implementation of the DP, this study will be small in size and scope and its results will live within the confines of the suspended

perspectives of its participants at a particular moment in time, as understood by the researcher.

## CHAPTER IV

### RESEARCH FINDINGS

This study sought to explore how teachers of the IBDP in Lebanon navigate the differences, or incongruences, between what they understand to be the expectations of the DP program and the realities of teaching in the Lebanese context and what these challenges are due to in terms of the congruence, or lack thereof, between the value system of the IB and that of the Lebanese context. In order to do this, the study explored the following research questions:

From the perspective of DP teachers in Lebanon

1. what are the practices and core values expected of DP teachers based on their understanding of the IB's mission statement, Learner Profile, pedagogical approaches, and DP assessment requirements?
2. what, if any, challenges do DP teachers face in meeting the IB's expectations in the Lebanese context in terms of their understanding of its pedagogical approaches, its requirements when it comes to values-based teaching and preparing students for the DP assessments?
3. in what ways are teachers' challenges due to incongruences between the core values of the IB and those commonly used in the Lebanese context?

The rationale for this study was based on a review of the literature on the IB, the DP in particular, and its implementation around the world. Based on the results of studies conducted in both Western and non-Western contexts, the review provided a compelling case for studying teachers' experiences of implementing the DP in Lebanon.

In 2019, the Lebanese government formalized an equivalency between the Lebanese Baccalaureate Certificate of Secondary Education (LB) and the International Baccalaureate's

Diploma Programme (DP). In order to find a balance between capitalizing on the benefits of the DP while remaining cognizant of the local context, it is important for school leaders and policy makers to think carefully about how to implement it effectively while supporting teachers and students. This study aims to provide at least some direction on this by exploring the experiences of the DP teachers whose job it is to bridge the gap between the expectations of the DP and the needs and demands of the Lebanese context.

The responses of 62 DP teachers were solicited through 10 focus groups and two individual interviews. The data were then aggregated and analyzed using Braun and Clarke's (2006) phases for conducting thematic analysis (see Appendix E), resulting in 11 core themes (see Table 3). This chapter is organized by research question with each question's themes described and presented accordingly. In addition to presenting the themes and subthemes, Table 3 also indicates the number of focus groups or interviews that discussed them.

In accordance with Gall and Gall's (2014) suggestions, resulting themes were member checked by three participants. Additionally, the research process relied on their strategies of ensuring usefulness, keeping a transparent and accessible chain of evidence and reflexivity to ensure that the study was subject to checks for rigor and accuracy along the way.

Table 3

*Frequency of Responses of the Research Participants in the Focus Groups*

	Frequency of responses of the Research Participants in the Individual Interviews N=2	Frequency of responses of the Research Participants in the Focus Group N=10
<b>DP Teachers' Understandings of the Expected Core Values and Practices</b>	2	10
<b>Espousing and Incorporating the Values of the Learner Profile into Their Teaching.</b>	2	9
Using the DP syllabi to teach the LP attributes	1	8
Explicitly teaching the LP	0	8
Developing open relationships with students	1	5
Modeling the LP traits and values	2	7
<b>Incorporating International-Mindedness into Teaching</b>	2	10
<b>Using the IB Approaches to Teaching (ATT) in Teaching</b>	2	10
Using inquiry-based teaching	2	9
Focusing on conceptual understanding.	0	6
Linking learning to local and global contexts and issues	0	3
Fostering teamwork and collaboration between students, between teachers and in student/teacher interactions	1	8
Differentiating to meet the needs of all learners	0	1
Using formative and summative assessment to inform teaching	0	1
<b>Pursuing PD and Remaining Open to Continuous Learning</b>	1	5
<b>Challenges Teachers Face When Implementing the DP</b>	2	10
<b>The Rigorous Nature of the Program</b>	2	9

Conflict between the DP's framework and the IB's philosophy	0	5
The limited time allocated to complete the program compromises teachers' abilities to deliver the program according to the ATT	2	9
A societal focus on grades hinders teachers' attempts to meet the IB's expectations in terms of the ATT	1	4
A heavy teaching workload	0	5
<b>Students Struggle with the Size and Rigor of the Program</b>	2	9
The large number of DP assessments	0	8
Students have limited time and self-management skills	2	7
Students lack the ability to think critically or independently	1	9
<b>Context Specific Challenges of Teaching IM and Values of the LP in Lebanon</b>	2	10
Lack of diversity in the student body and divisions within Lebanese society	1	7
Navigating local sensitivities	2	5
The practice of business and politics conflicts with the values of IM and the LP	0	5
<b>Perceived Differences in the Cultural and Academic Value Systems of the IB and the Lebanese Context</b>	2	10
<b>Incongruences Between the Societal Value System of the Lebanese Context and That of the IB</b>	2	10
<b>Incongruences Between the Academic Values of the DP and Those of the Lebanese Baccalaureate</b>	1	10
Despite similarities in their written curricula, the LB and DP are implemented very differently	1	5
The DP promotes creative and critical thinking while the LB relies on rote learning	0	9
In the Lebanese Baccalaureate, grades are seen as a measure of success	1	6
Sciences are valued over the arts	0	7
<b>Despite its Values of Inclusion, Teachers Recognize that the IB is Academically and Financially Elitist</b>	2	7

### **DP Teachers' Understandings of the Expected Core Values and Practices**

The data around this research question were produced inductively and deductively based on teachers' answers to the first research question as well as expectations pulled from IB documentation and the literature review. Teachers were given open-ended prompts guiding them to consider their understandings of the IB mission statement, the Learner Profile (LP), international mindedness (IM), and assessment in the DP.

The following section presents teachers' understandings of the core values of the IB and DP, and what they feel the IB and DP expect of them in terms of their teaching practices. The section begins by addressing teachers' understanding of the IB Learner Profile and how they are expected to incorporate it into their teaching. After this, a summary of teachers' discussions of international-mindedness and how they are expected to weave it into the teaching of their specific disciplines is presented followed by participants' thoughts on what teaching practices the IB expects of them is presented. Lastly, this section will present the expectations teachers feel the IB places on them in terms of professional development and what impact they believe teaching in the DP has had on the development of their professional practice.

#### **Espousing and incorporating the values of the Learner Profile into teaching.**

The Learner Profile (LP) was a prominent feature in the responses of teachers in nine out of ten focus groups and both interviews. Teachers overwhelmingly agreed that engaging with the LP was central to the IB's expectations of them as teachers, and that it should shape how and what they teach, their relationships with students and even their personal value systems. As one teacher phrased it, "it is our job, eventually, to incorporate all the parts of the Learner Profile" into their teaching practice.

One teacher described it as being “at the heart of the IB program” while another argued that it is a “basic” element of the IB as it is “in all guides and it's across all the IB.” She continued to explain that it is “an expectation to live it with the students and practice it and encourage students to really fulfill those criteria of the profile.” Another teacher defined it as a framework which “outlines what a good student should be.”

Teachers pointed to the attributes of the LP and how the LP provided teachers with a roadmap to developing the kinds of students IB schools are meant to be nurturing; as one noted, “we expect students to graduate with those qualities.” Teachers felt responsible for nurturing in students Learner Profile values of open-mindedness and caring, but also the other characteristics of being principled and critical thinkers. One teacher commented that the LP encouraged students to be, “capable of taking risks and not being afraid of the results. This is what IB engrains in the students, and this is what we've been trying to do.”

Teachers discussed different ways in which they felt the IB expected them to teach LP attributes to students. These fell into four broad categories: a) using the DP syllabi to teach LP values such as critical thinking and the ability to see more than one side of an issue, b) explicitly teaching the LP, c) eschewing the traditional student/teacher relationship in favor of one based on dialogue and mutual respect, and d) making modeling of the LP by teachers central to their teaching strategies.

### **Using the DP Syllabi to Teach the LP Attributes**

Teachers in eight focus groups and one interview felt that, in order to teach the LP, it was expected that their pedagogical strategies should focus on teaching critical thinking, research skills and the ability to see different sides of a story through their specific disciplines. One teacher recounted asking students in her class to use the research process to better understand the political history of Lebanon. This was a way to encourage students to “realize there is

another way to look at things” and help students become more “discerning when it comes to looking at everything in the world.”

A science teacher described having students debate the ethical implications of using embryonic stem cells as a way of incorporating open-mindedness, an LP trait, into her class. Students were asked to research different perspectives, craft arguments and defend them, even if they didn’t agree with them. This way, she argued, “they’re going to be exposed to what arguments we have; how different groups of people think.”

Other subject area examples included critically exploring ethical issues through visual arts, exposing students to a wide range of different perspectives and issues in literature, and framing the development of math and scientific thought through the lens of collaboration and critical thought. At a school level, examples were given of initiatives such as recycling and fundraising for causes which were seen to nurture Learner Profile traits such as caring and being principled.

Teachers also referenced the IB mandated internal assessments (IA’s), CAS projects and Extended Essays (EEs) as process-based learning experiences that encourage the development of LP traits by focusing on academic honesty (the LP trait of being principled), research skills (the LP trait of being an inquirer) and experimentation (the LP trait of risk-taking). One teacher’s description of the alignment between the LP and the DP curriculum sums up the general feeling of how the teachers see the symbiotic relationship between the Learner Profile and the DP’s academic curriculum. She explained, “in the end, I think all the IB learner profile characteristics are embedded somehow, somewhere, in something, within the IB diploma.”

### **Explicitly Teaching the LP**

In addition to implicitly weaving the LP into their teaching, teachers across eight focus groups felt they were responsible for explicitly teaching the LP values alongside content. One

teacher claimed, “that's the number one rule for me: to promote the Learner Profile, and I always have it posted in my classes. I point at it, so my students, from now and then, they joke like, "we have to be this," or "we have to be that." So, it's more of a language that is being used.” This explicit and intentional teaching of the LP was seen as an important way of contextualizing the LP values and converting them from abstract definitions to demonstrable behavior that the students could recognize and emulate.

In one group, a teacher described teaching the LP values as:

Everything has a name now; we just need to show what it's like. What does it look like? What does ‘principled’ look like? What does ‘caring’ look like? And caring isn't being nice to your friend. Caring is looking at your work and saying, "is this the best that I can do?" Translating it into not just young ideas, but into adult ideas.

An exchange between two teachers in another group culminated in one teacher highlighting, “I keep hearing myself in class, labeling things like saying, "Wow, you're really a risk taker with that." But I know it sounds ridiculous when I'm saying it in class, but they are so not aware of it that they have to hear it.”

### **Developing Open Relationships with Students**

Moreover, teachers in five focus groups and one interview spoke of their relationships with students and the expectation to eschew the traditionally formal relationship between teacher and student in favor of that of a facilitator and mentor. According to one teacher, the expectation is for teachers to guide students

through the miasma of what's right and what's wrong. And the black and the white, and what are the shades of gray. This is what we're guiding them through. So even if you're talking business, you're talking in biology, you're talking in anything, you're talking about what's right. What's ethical. What's moral. What are the values? What are the morals that are involved? And I think this is what a teacher is. A guide. You're basically setting them on the path to thinking. I'm teaching them how to think.

According to teachers, this style of teaching necessitates a more open relationship with students based on dialogue and giving students opportunities to express themselves. For

example, one teacher gave the example of negotiating deadlines with students and showing empathy for them by taking their needs into consideration.

Another teacher revealed that she asks her students to hold her accountable to the same principles of academic honesty that she expects from them. She tells them, "if you find me sometimes using material, especially in the lab, if I use pictures that I'm not quoting where I'm getting it, I don't cite, you have to tell me because I'm holding you accountable. So, you have also to hold me accountable."

Yet another teacher described speaking of what she sees as her weaknesses openly with students because she believes that "embracing the fact that you're not perfect opens up all this dialogue between you and the students, that you are like them and they are like you." Teachers agreed that this openness lays the groundwork for the teaching of LP values and is necessary to fulfilling the expectation of teaching the LP. However, one teacher pointed out, the purpose is not to impose the values on the students but to eventually "have a positive influence on them by the way I'm respecting their ideas and they're respecting my ideas."

### **Modeling the LP Traits and Values**

Finally, teachers felt the IB expects them to model and espouse the LP values. This was one of the most widely shared understandings teachers exhibited with teachers in seven focus groups and both interviews mentioning it. One teacher phrased it as, "a big one - role modeling for all of the attributes of the profile," and, she continued, "to live the profile and be a model for the students."

Teachers felt strongly that they were just as accountable to demonstrate the Learner Profile values as the students. One group bemoaned the poor example set by teachers who do not respect deadlines or appointments with one elaborating, "when we talk about deadlines, or respecting time, and when we have-- I hate to say it, I hate to say it guys, when we have teachers, they come late to their class. This is a very bad model."

One of the groups discussed the importance of teachers modeling open-mindedness by remaining neutral during political discussions. Ultimately, the teachers felt a responsibility to, in the words of one teacher, “mirror” the LP in order to teach it to the students. “It has to be a two-way thing” warned another teacher, “you can’t expect that from them but not model it (the LP).”

Some went so far as to say DP teachers should themselves adopt the values of the LP or have come to the DP with a similar set of values already. For example, one argued, “if you're not open-minded, you can't have your students be open-minded. Because it's not a thing that you teach, it's an example that you behave with.” Another asserted, “we as teachers have to also live that culture and exemplify it to our students.” Some even felt that those who did not share the value system of the LP couldn’t, or shouldn’t, become DP teachers, such as the teacher who argued, “if you're not all of this, you can't be an IB teacher.” Another stated simply, “that's what IB requires us to be.”

Teachers from three different schools mentioned that they felt their school culture and values aligned naturally with those of the IB and several teachers showed a genuine sense of passion and belief in the values of the Learner Profile. During a discussion about the LP, for example, one teacher exclaimed, “personally, I'm in love with the IB learner profile! I use it every day and in every opportunity I have in class I mention it,” to which the other teachers laughed good naturedly.

Only one teacher in her group disagreed saying, “to be completely frank, it's not a part of my instruction intentionally, at least, in any way. I don't even know what they are. I know they exist, but I can tell you three of them. And I don't have them posted. I don't refer to them at all.”

While it is likely that a spectrum of idealism versus skepticism about the LP exists among teachers, none disagreed that, as a concept, it aligns with the rest of the program and

plays a central role in clarifying the IB's expectations of teachers as well as helping them align how and what they teach with the IB's value system. The shared understandings about its importance to successfully implementing the program are summed up in one teacher's statement that, "the more there is harmony in your program, in your curriculum, teachers doing what they are saying: it works."

### **Incorporating International-Mindedness into Teaching**

International-mindedness (IM) was also widely understood to be a core expectation of the IB when it comes to DP teachers. As the IB has yet to clearly define what it means by 'international mindedness,' there were some nuanced differences in how teachers described IM. Teachers generally conflated IM with being open-minded, learning about people and issues outside of Lebanon and being tolerant of other perspectives.

While describing international-mindedness, some teachers also referenced being aware of how their academic disciplines relate to local and global issues while others talked about respecting the perspectives of others regardless of race, ethnicity or religion. Nonetheless, there was a common thread in the teachers' understanding of IM which was the notion of human connection and understanding across countries and cultures.

Despite the variance in defining IM, it was expressed as a fundamental expectation of the IB and was discussed in every focus group and both interviews. This section will present how teachers describe fulfilling the expectation of incorporating IM into their teaching, firstly through their various subject areas but also by modeling how to value diversity through their behavior in their own classrooms.

The most widely discussed subject area around IM was the teaching of languages. Language A teachers pointed to their use of a wide variety of novels and texts to expose students to different cultures, contexts and perspectives. One teacher explained, "every single novel has its own culture, its own context and exposure to these cultures and contexts."

Another spoke of using comparisons between Lebanon and other cultures in order to encourage students to make links between themselves and other communities. He elaborated, “we do compare the values of every single play or novel or whatever to our Lebanese culture, from a different perspective.”

Additionally, the DP’s Prescribed Reading List for the language and literature subjects was seen as supporting teachers in fulfilling the IB’s expectations around incorporating IM into their teaching. As one teacher explained, it mandated that teachers “take different authors from different times, from different places.” She continued to say that, “a lot of the concepts that come up through that discussion and debate, I think, underpin the ethos of the IB: promoting peace in the world.”

Language B teachers also talked about the structure of the syllabus as a helpful tool in incorporating IM in teaching. The Language B curriculum is organized around themes which aim to teach students about other cultures and societies; one noted, “you’re talking about a language, but in another culture. This is the core. This is the objective of language B, to know other cultures, so it’s built in.”

Similarly, one teacher who teaches literature and theater felt, “the guidelines and principles of both those subjects reinforce the IB mandate.” Other teachers who teach visual arts and theater discussed looking at work produced from around the world as examples of how they incorporate IM into their disciplines. One visual arts teacher related her approach of helping students become “aware of how people are working around the globe: different art forms, different artists, different art movements. But also looking at local arts, so trying to see local arts in the context of international art.” According to the theater teacher, this results in students learning “not to be fully engulfed” in their own perspectives. He concluded that this approach helped students to put themselves “in the shoes of other characters, other personalities” which builds empathy and understanding of other cultures.

Meanwhile, science teachers discussed incorporating lessons about “the implications of different laws on different countries” as a way to bring issues from other countries into the classroom. An environmental sciences teacher talked about building lessons around the environment that linked local and global issues. One physics teacher summed up her work as “allowing the students to see the world through this program.”

Others used examples of highlighting to their students how the evolution of scientific thought and progress depended on cross border collaboration. One built lessons about the human genome project which involved learning about the contributions of “many scientists from all over the world” as a way to emphasize the international nature of scientific collaboration. Focusing on this emphasizes, as one put it, that “science is not a solo endeavor” and fulfils the IM expectation by showing how different cultures “contributed to the science today.”

Math teachers also used multicultural contributions to math to highlight international-mindedness. One math teacher shared that, “if you go back to the origins of the math and theorems that you're learning in class, I would tend to-- working with the students in class, you will notice that it is not a one-man show. It was a matter of several cultures.” Other teachers used statistical studies to investigate and explain phenomena in other countries. One teacher explained that this helps students be “exposed to other cultures” and gain a deeper understanding of them.

Similarly, economics teachers used current events and economic concepts like inequality around the world to expose students to other countries, cultures and the issues they face. One teacher related that he taught modules on international and developmental economics to add “some empathy building in class. What do these people across the world feel like?”

International trips and CAS, a core component of the DP, were seen as valuable opportunities to build international-mindedness in students. One group of teachers talked about a trip to Bosnia where students made connections between Sarajevo and Beirut, “a city that was conquered by hatred, by sectarianism, and Sarajevo went through the same experiences.”

Teachers in this group felt that this nurtured students’ “ability to see perspectives” and remarked that “to see that the same thing happens all over the globe is international-mindedness.” Others talked about CAS projects involving Syrian refugees in Lebanon which helped students better understand the perspectives of vulnerable groups in their community. One teacher suggested that “content is important. However, the experience is much more important than content here.” She continued to say, “this is also something that encourages international-mindedness.”

In addition to incorporating international-mindedness into their various disciplines, teachers also described the importance of using the diversity in their own classrooms to model it. Several discussed mining the experiences of Lebanese students who, if they are enrolled in the DP (at the time of writing and prior to the equivalency), would need to hold a second passport and are likely to have done some international traveling. One explained, “most of our students now travel. They have other nationalities; they learned in other schools.” This, teachers said, was an asset in a classroom geared towards the teaching of IM as students could be encouraged to share their experiences and the perspectives they had gained through travel.

Some spoke about the importance of setting a tone of acceptance in a classroom of mixed local and international students. One expressed, “I mean, when you have different students in the classroom with different nationalities and they come from different

backgrounds, first of all, you as a teacher have to accept them in order for them to accept each other.”

Another used the diversity in his classroom to give students opportunities to teach others about their local culture or language. He argued, “whenever you dive into different cultures and allow the students to realize that they come from various backgrounds, they would accept each other more, and you'd have a healthier learning environment with them, and they will be more prone to be caring about each other.” Another said being intentional about approaching the diversity of the students meant, “they learn from each other, and we learn from them also.”

Ultimately, as one teacher pointed out, teachers feel that it is expected of them to ensure that students know that “the planet is one world for all of us and it's not about borders, and it is important to make it happen in the classroom.”

### **Using the IB Approaches to Teaching (ATT) in Teaching**

The IB identifies six principles that teachers are expected to adopt as part of their teaching practice. These principles are called the Approaches to Teaching (ATT) and were used deductively to establish the extent of teachers’ awareness of these expectations. The ATT ask teachers to shape their practice around a) inquiry-based teaching, b) focusing on conceptual understanding, c) linking learning to local and global contexts and issues, d) fostering teamwork and collaboration, e) differentiating instruction and f) using formative and summative assessment to inform teaching.

Although only one focus group used the term ‘Approaches to Teaching’, all 10 focus groups and both interviewees gave examples of pedagogical strategies that DP teachers are expected to adopt. All the strategies they referred to fell neatly in with the principles outlined by the ATT. The sections that follow describe teachers’ discussions around each of the six principles and what they feel the IB expects of them in terms of practice.

***Using inquiry-based teaching.*** Teachers in nine out of the 10 focus groups and both interviews discussed this expectation. Teachers felt that it was expected of them to create learning experiences using inquiry-based learning strategies such as experiential learning, using real-world connections, encouraging independent learning and acting as facilitators rather than instructors.

***Experiential Learning.*** One teacher described what she understood to be the purpose of this expectation as follows: “we are expected to engage these students in learning experiences, but the difference being is that this engagement needs to be more inquiry-based for us to be able to develop thinkers and reflective students, rather than just students who can sit for an exam and achieve a good grade.”

Incorporating experiential learning in their subjects was seen as a core expectation in order to create inquiry-based learning experiences. Science teachers in particular found this expectation to be clearly communicated by the IB as it is built into the DP sciences syllabi and fits into the nature of the subject. As one teacher stated regarding the hands-on work the students do in her class, “physics is an experimental science. So, everything should be experimental eventually.”

One of the science teachers explained that in his subject area, 20 periods are explicitly set aside for hands-on learning. In addition, the sciences assessment criteria itself requires students to demonstrate their ability to conduct their own experiments. Adding on, another science teacher talked about the trial and error process of the science internal assessment explaining, “I make it a point not to give them for example the proper concentrations to be used... We don't do their job.” This ensures that students are given the opportunity to learn the relevant skills through the actual process of doing them, rather than simply being taught theory.

A theater teacher described what she saw as her responsibility to expose students to what her discipline looked like in the real world. She explained that DP theater teachers must “try and find experiences that students can relate to in terms of different international theater companies; and that onus rests on the teacher to make those opportunities available.”

*Connecting to real-world situations.* Another strategy that teachers feel they are expected to use as part of inquiry-based teaching is connecting their teaching to the real world. One teacher argued that linking his teaching to contemporary issues and developments made the learning experience more meaningful for students. He remarked, “I think that's one aspect of what it means to link it to real life, that they (students) are studying things for a purpose.”

Another described it as “transferring what they learn into real life. This is why the context that is provided during instruction has to be authentic in a way that students can connect with and make sense of it.” As an example of this, one of the economics teachers described a field trip to a factory to learn about the principles of supply and demand.

Science teachers talked about the areas of study identified in the DP syllabus and how they naturally encourage real world links. One teacher explained the extent of this by saying, “all the topics in IB are related somehow to real world.” While describing the Extended Essay process in science, one of the teachers highlighted how it reflected the real world because students were encouraged to use trial and error in their experimentation and, according to the IB,

you're supposed to write your problems, you're supposed to conclude, you're supposed to write the procedure and explain what happened, why, what went wrong and it's fine. And IB is not going to regard that as a failure. It's actually going to regard that as proper critical thinking, that this is scientific experimentation.

Using math to encourage students to understand and solve real world problems instead of practicing skills within the framework of made up word problems was also given

as an example of linking learning to real life. Meanwhile, language teachers talked about using topical issues such as eating disorders as discussion points. One said these lessons are popular with students “because they (the students) can relate” to these types of issues.

Another stated that she makes it a point to “choose very up to date topics that are related to their daily life,” because “we cannot really separate what's happening inside the classroom with what's happening around us in the world.”

Teachers identified other strategies for connecting their teaching to the real world, such as field trips, inviting guest speakers into the classroom or organizing activities related to current events and issues. International field trips were also credited with being opportunities for students to make strong links between their learning and the world outside the classroom.

*Encouraging independent learning.* This was seen as another expectation of incorporating inquiry-based teaching into the classroom. Teachers talked positively about this strategy with one praising the fostering of independence in learning as “a beautiful idea because even the quality of learning that happens when learning is done in an independent manner is that the students make connection more, they make sense and make more meaning of things they learn.”

Another explained that, with the advent of the internet, learning had to go beyond “learning from books alone.” Instead, she suggested, it is more effective to give students the question and have them come to the answers themselves. Another teacher talked about how the internal assessments and science investigations encourage independent learning. She explained, “I can see the inquiry part in the individual investigation that students have to do, but also lab work in general, when they have to design their own labs and all the lab work in itself.”

Similar strategies to encourage independent learning were mentioned by language teachers, one of whom said “even language arts, they're trying to do their own projects and research. So, for example, they created a French newsletter for the class. So, it wasn't really asked from them to do, but they did it on their own.”

Additionally, a math teacher described the process of the math internal assessment which may involve a student studying a topic that had not been covered in class. “So,” he asserted, “they have to do research on their own, and understand the material on their own, and to be independent to be able to reach a conclusion at the end.” Another teacher described giving students rubrics and building peer and self-assessment into her classes to encourage independent learning.

Allowing for student choice was also seen as an important way of encouraging independent learning. An arts teacher described encouraging students to choose their own lines of inquiry so “each one of them takes her own track. Even the research, the comparative study, and the process portfolio is all about them. Not what I want them to learn. It's about what they discover and the road they take.”

For some teachers, having students work independently was a critical part of completing their course on time. One teacher spoke about this in terms of the math syllabus and noted that “as much as we cover in class, still, there is material that students have to be responsible for by themselves. They have to work a lot. They have to search for a lot, for new problems, for new ideas, we cannot cover everything.”

*Teachers as Facilitators.* The principle of teacher-as-facilitator was also widely understood as being an expectation of the IB when creating inquiry-based learning experiences. One teacher explained, “I find that, as IB teachers, the teachers facilitate (*others agree*). We do not - I don't teach. I facilitate information and facilitate the discussion and the class.” Another spoke of how the IB expects “the whole classroom to be based on

interaction.” Another noted, “because the idea is that we're not really teachers in the old-fashioned way but we're like facilitators. It goes back to the idea of it being student-centered, student-led.”

One teacher described her approach as discovering and learning alongside the students and being seen as their “coach” rather than a fount of knowledge in the classroom. Another linked the approach of student discovery to ensuring a more student-led classroom; “discuss and learn, if you want,” she said, “but not teach students, definitely. I mean, the students, they have to be at the center of the learning. They have to come up with the explanation.”

***Focusing on conceptual understanding.*** This expectation was mentioned in six different focus groups. Teachers talked about what they saw as developments in the DP syllabi and how these developments implied a move towards the use of broad, organizing concepts (often provided by the DP) to frame learning of knowledge and skills.

Several of the math teachers talked about this in terms of a recent overhauling of the DP math syllabus. One said, “I looked at the math papers this year, and I noticed that there were many reasoning questions. So, the focus is shifting from the correct answer to conceptual understanding and to interpretation. It's not just about the right answer.”

One of the science teachers also spoke about the DP science exams and their focus on conceptual understanding. She directs the students to focus on the concepts, telling them, “it's always something new, but it's the concept that you covered. So, the skill is to apply what you already learned in a new context.”

***Linking learning to local and global contexts and issues.*** This expectation was only mentioned in three focus groups. Those teachers that mentioned it spoke specifically of trying to incorporate examples linked to their discipline from around the world. For example, the theater teacher said,

when we study different cultures, different traditions, different theorists, this gives you the-- it makes the artist well rounded in the sense that they will understand other cultures and they will try to see how can they actually implement that in the work that they're doing and even how it is compared to the work that's done in their own country.

The art teacher also talked about using artists from around the globe as examples in her classes. An environmental sciences teacher described comparing environmental issues and policy in Lebanon with other countries. This, she felt, gave the students a broader understanding of how discussions about the environment took place in different contexts. A biology teacher talked about bringing in discussions around abortion to her classrooms to demonstrate how different contexts frame the issue.

***Fostering teamwork and collaboration between students, between teachers and in student/teacher interactions.*** Teachers in eight focus groups and one interview discussed this expectation. Teachers saw this playing out in their classes in two ways; firstly, by providing opportunities for group work and secondly by establishing collaborative, dialogue-based relationships with students. Teachers also described collaboration between themselves as colleagues which improved their practice and better served the students.

Teachers felt that the DP syllabus provided some opportunities for group work such as the Group 4 (sciences) project where students work in groups to come up with a solution to a real-world problem. Similarly, the theater teacher talked about the Collaborative Project where students mentor and lead each other as part of one of their cumulative projects. He described it as an opportunity for students to “work together” and “assume the responsibility of being teachers” which makes them accountable to each other and fosters collaboration skills.

Another teacher talked about communicating an explicit expectation of teamwork to students which “teaches them solidarity.” She shared an example of her class where she tells them, “we are not competing with each other, we're competing with other schools”. She

explained that this encourages students to “form a group” where they “help each other. They share information. They go and do peer tutoring. So, this will increase the relationship, the interpersonal relationship among the group.” Another teacher said that at her school, teachers insisted on students collaborating because they had a diverse group of students “coming from different parts of the world and we are making things happen as a group, as a team.”

In addition to nurturing collaboration between students, fostering collaborative relationships between students and teachers was also recognized as being in line with the ATTs. The TOK teacher, for example, talked about the importance of students’ input for teaching the course effectively. She said, “the students provide me with the examples, and they start thinking. They start asking questions in class.” This allowed her to create student-centered lessons based on their progress in the course.

Meanwhile, an English teacher described using a contract with her students that outlined expectations including how quickly she would give them feedback on their work. She introduced an element of fun to the contract by allowing them to pick consequences for her should she not fulfil her part of the agreement. She also talked about a “get out of jail free” card which each student could use once a year for missed assignments.

Teachers also talked about the importance of not appearing infallible to their students as a means of building relationships with them. One said, “sometimes they ask me things that I don't know, and I tell them I really don't know. Let's go look it up together and come next class and discuss it. It's really nice to admit that we don't know everything.” The other teachers in her group agreed with this statement.

This relationship building was seen as laying the groundwork for establishing the collaborative student/teacher relationship the IB expected. One teacher explained,

I think when you have this empathy with them and they see you as a human being, it actually makes things a lot easier. I mean, I often have to ask them for help with IT and they know that and it's just like, "oh, okay (*laughter*)," and in a way it's kind of

nice because they come to see that we're human, we make mistakes and so on and so forth (*others agree*).

Some teachers also mentioned the value of collaboration between teachers and how it helped their practice. One of the TOK teachers related examples of consulting with different subject teachers to help deepen her knowledge of that discipline's connection with TOK. This helped her serve her students better. Other teachers brought up the importance of collaborating when trying to navigate the logistics of the DP's very full and busy schedule. One explained, "we're taking measures in school to try to balance things as much as possible for the students in terms of academic calendars and try not to step on each other's feet in other subject matters." Another spoke of her appreciation of this collaborative approach saying, "it's about the teamwork; you can't do it alone."

***Differentiating instruction to meet the needs of all learners.*** Although differentiation is mentioned across the IB guides and documentation, and is explicitly listed in the ATT's, only one teacher mentioned it across all the focus groups and interviews. She happened to be a Language B teacher who often taught classes with students who had different levels of exposure to the target language. She said this impacted how she taught her lesson as "you can't do the same class for different levels. You have to see what kind of students you have, what resources you have in class."

***Using formative and summative assessment to inform teaching.*** The expectation to use formative and summative assessment was discussed in only one focus group. The group's understanding of this expectation had to do with the style in which they approached giving feedback on formative and summative assessment. One of the teachers pointed to a DP training where teachers were taught the IB style of grading which was aimed at assessing students based on what they got right by actively looking for opportunities to reward them, rather than penalizing them for what they got wrong. She explained that this contrasted with

her experience of teaching in the LB saying, “they were teaching us to mark what's good. And we weren't used to that. We used to mark what was not good.”

Teachers’ understandings of the Approaches to Teaching were, for the most part, widely shared. This was especially evidenced in their understanding of the IB’s expectations around inquiry-based learning and fostering collaboration. However, conversation around differentiation and assessment were sparse.

Valuing remarks about the ATT were unanimously positive. Several teachers talked about adopting the IB’s pedagogies in their non-IB classes. For example, one teacher shared, that when she is teaching the IGCSE or LB programs, “indirectly we are teaching the same way as we are teaching IB. It's affected us.” Another said of her non-DP classroom teaching, “because I love the IB program, I have incorporated the IB ideas.”

### **Pursuing PD and Remaining Open to Continuous Learning**

Teachers in five of the focus groups and one of the interviews talked about the expectation to continuously pursue professional development (PD). This could take the form of DP specific training in the form of workshops provided by the IB, school organized PD or pursuing their own development and learning through personal research. Teachers talked about the importance of this for keeping up to date on the latest developments in teaching practices and becoming more effective educators within the DP framework.

In terms of staying up to date with the profession, one teacher argued that continuous PD kept DP teachers current in terms of trends in teaching practices which helped them avoid getting stuck in a rut of traditional practice. One teacher highlighted that evolving with educational best practices was important because, “the needs of the student are now different than the needs” they had when she was a student. A visual arts teacher talked about pursuing her own learning as a way to keep abreast of student interests: “I mean, I take it on

myself to really find out about artists that my students are interested in because we don't always share the same interests.”

Teachers felt strongly that the expectation to pursue PD, especially IB specific PD, helped them understand the IB curriculum more deeply. One said, “I think that it helps the teachers to feel that they are program teachers.” Another teacher emphasized the importance of PD for DP teachers saying, “you have to be trained so that you're well-rounded with the requirements of the curriculum because if you don't know them, you will not be able to deliver the curriculum as it should be done.”

This was mirrored in the comment of another teacher who stated, “before teaching our students or training our students, we need to train ourselves. And that's why it's very important to participate in face to face or online workshops”. While talking about IB themed conferences or events that offer simultaneous student and teacher development, one of the theater teachers remarked that DP teachers should “be aware of those pathways and ask for support to do professional development.”

Many teachers felt that they had developed as teachers through the very practice of teaching within the DP framework. Teachers in seven focus groups and both interviews about this with one teaching saying, for example, that the learning that came hand in hand with teaching the DP “keeps me up-to-date, it keeps me reading. And I have to do that. And what's nice about it is when you have debates with students in class, it's very challenging. And I love that.”

One of the art teachers talked about having to learn about the critical methodologies her syllabus required her to teach to students. She said, “I have gotten a great education just trying to understand what are these things I'm going to teach them or try and facilitate their understanding of because I have to first facilitate my own understanding which is about being engaged and the whole process of learning.” In the language courses, a participant described

the benefits of planning lessons involving teaching IM because she herself had to become “open-minded and tolerant about other cultures and races” in order to teach these values to her students.

The way the ATT shaped teachers’ classroom practices was also seen as highly beneficial with one teacher commenting that it had made her teaching “richer.” One teacher described the change to her teaching when she moved from teaching the LB to the DP; she said, “I taught the Lebanese curriculum for 12 years before I actually became an IB teacher. So, when I took into consideration the IB learner profile, the whole spirit of the DP, it was like I’m a complete new teacher in a completely different perspective; a different scope.”

### **Challenges Faced by DP Teachers When Implementing the DP**

For the second research question, teachers were asked to describe challenges they faced while trying to implement the DP in the Lebanese context. As with the first question, teachers were asked broad questions that used the phrasing of the research question followed by additional prompts when necessary.

The first section will present teachers’ feelings about the size and rigor of the DP program and challenges that poses for them. These challenges fall into two distinct categories; the first is about teachers’ perceptions about the difficulties in implementing the program. The second category focuses on the challenges faced by students, and the challenges that creates for teachers who feel they have to compensate for students’ lack of readiness to complete the program.

The section after that presents the challenges teachers face while trying to fulfil the expectation of teaching the values of international-mindedness and the Learner Profile in the Lebanese context.

## **The Rigorous Nature of the DP**

Teachers in nine focus groups and two interviews felt that the size and rigor of the program impacted their ability to deliver on the IB's expectations of the ATT. Teachers described their challenges as manifesting in a) a sense that the IB's ideology was not well aligned with the assessment-heavy framework of the DP, b) a feeling of being squeezed for time in trying to deliver the DP curriculum, c) the focus on grades they experienced in the Lebanese context and lastly d) the heavy workload of the DP.

This section will present findings around each of these topics in turn.

***Conflict between the DP's framework and the IB philosophy.*** Teachers in five focus groups were disappointed by what they felt was an incompatibility between the IB's expectations and the structure of the DP. This was very much connected to the trade-offs they found themselves having to make between practicing inquiry and values-based teaching in accordance with the IB's ideology, while also preparing students for the exams. One teacher declared, "at times I feel the highly prescribed curriculum and the assessments do not really lend themselves to this philosophy. I think in the diploma, there is some conflict between the philosophy and the practice."

Key to the teacher's unease was the DP's focus on assessment and how they felt it cast a long, dark shadow over the more idealistic aspects of the program like the Learner Profile (LP) and international-mindedness (IM). One teacher described the conflict between telling the students, "I would like you to be this wonderful global citizen but now, we're going to assess you for the last two years on what you learned in physics." One of the math teachers spoke specifically about the higher-level course saying, "because it's very, very, very demanding and then there's a lot of focus on the content, I feel that the syllabus itself does not match the mission statement, and the subject guide itself does not leave room for any of the other aspects that the mission statement discusses."

One participant commented, “the Approaches to Teaching, and IB learner profile promote really beautiful things.” However, because of the continued and even increasing focus on assessment, she doesn’t believe the DP “is aligned with the educational philosophy the IB have in their mind.” This was echoed by a teacher who said, “I’ve always considered it a bit of contradiction within the IB about we’re supposed to be doing all of these things, having CAS, and all of these things. And yet we have a huge curriculum to get through.”

An economics teacher suggested that teachers and students end up not prioritizing values-based learning over teaching to the test because, ultimately, content knowledge is what is assessed by the DP. Therefore, he posited, the IB was expecting one thing, but incentivizing another and, he argued, “any rational person is going to work on the thing that has a grade.”

Another teacher expressed concern about the ability to create impactful learning experiences around social responsibility. She explained, “we try to do this thing in class as teachers, and the schools have some programs doing social awareness activities, but what about in the assessment? In the final end product, which is what our kids focus 95% of their energy on.”

The notion of the focus on assessment actively working against the teaching of the softer skills of the LP and mission statement was expanded on as teachers talked about their separate disciplines. One teacher spoke of being demoralized by this and noted,

I became a literature teacher, an English teacher because the idea in my head was, this would be amazing to actually inspire the passion of writing. So, we have the next generation of great Shakespeare’s and Hemingway’s and all these wonderful authors in the world. And what am I producing? All they can do is write you analysis. They can’t write you a poem, they can’t write you a short story, they can’t write you a play. There’s no creativity at all in the curriculum. I’m going to start crying (*laughing*). It’s like, Ahh. So, holistically because we don’t assess them on it.... there’s no way to assess them on it.

When speaking about how the pressure on assessment impacted her ability to teach according to the IB's expectations of academic and creative risk-taking, a visual arts teacher commented that the deadlines placed on students negated the process-driven, exploratory nature of her subject. She explained that in order to pass the course, her students have to create a certain number of pieces. Because of the time crunch, instead of having time to experiment with their ideas, students ending up having to be "really focused on final work, which really sort of contradicts the whole idea about exploration and taking risks."

Teachers also felt that the way assessments were graded in the DP also flew in the face of authentic learning and, if anything, served as a very poor model for the students. One teacher commented that the DP examiners, "just follow a certain term and if it's not there in the student's test then it's wrong." Voicing a similar concern about the nature of the DP assessment and rubrics suppressing students' exploration, an economics teacher gave the example of an assessment where students analyze a newspaper article from an economic perspective. When students chose articles that inspired them but did not involve economic models outlined by the syllabus, they would not score well on the assessment. When guiding students in their article choices, he noted that having to curb students' interests is "the saddest conversation" because he felt that he was steering them away from learning and towards the extrinsic reward of grades.

This also, teachers felt, pushed students and teachers to rely on rote memorization rather than critical thinking. For example, one teacher noted that because of the assessment demands teachers end up teaching to the test: "I mean no matter how many aspects you try to put into the process, we do teach for a test." She noted that, because of the nature of the rubrics, "even if students' answers are correct, they might not be counted because they're not in the format or what the IB requires."

Another teacher argued students “can be passionate about literature, but they don’t know the particular element names for it” in which case they would be penalized in the assessment. The teacher continued to say that “knowing those specific things comes down to just rote memorization, which kind of goes against what IB is trying to get us to do.” Teachers noted the contradiction with the Learner Profile saying, “We want them to be thinkers. We don’t want them to have just a bunch of information crammed in our heads that we regurgitate.”

A math teacher in another group pointed out that there was a simple reality that led to the deprioritizing learning experiences in favor of the assessment: “at the end,” he said, students “have to be ready for the official exams.” Another went so far as to say that, because of its focus on assessment, “I feel sometimes that the IB is moving towards the LB now.”

***The limited time allocated to complete the program compromises teachers’ abilities to deliver the program according to the ATT.*** While teachers showed an awareness of the IB’s expectations in terms of teaching practices, teachers in nine focus groups and both interviews felt their ability to fulfill these expectations was restricted by the time available to them for actually teaching the curriculum. Teachers widely agreed that they were having to sacrifice Approaches to Teaching expectations such as inquiry-based learning in order to make their deadlines and cover the content in time.

One teacher stated, “we all know that inquiry-based teaching is a time-consuming process. ... I think it's a beautiful idea.” However, she continued, “with the length of the curriculum and the amount of time that you have, sometimes you feel, I can't do this anymore, because you want to move on.” One physics teacher emphasized the difficulty of this in the sciences and described his thinking around lesson planning: “do I do inquiry when it takes three-quarters of the block, or do I move on? Because I really need to meet my

timeline for this year.” Another teacher felt that he never had enough time, “to try and figure out how to be more creative.”

Likewise, a history teacher spoke about how teachers are, on the one hand, expected to “nurture the inquirer and risk-taker.” She gave the example of not being able to indulge the tangential interests of the students during class time because teachers are “limited in our ability to do that because of the very demanding content.” The arts, with their process-based approach to the creation of work, was also seen as a challenging discipline in terms of fulfilling the requirements of the program. One art teacher felt that the number of works the students are required to make were unreasonable considering how long it takes to create art. “We can't get there,” she stated about the number of pieces, “it's just physically impossible because art is just too lengthy a process.”

Two literature teachers spoke of having to sacrifice creative work for exam preparation. One said

the challenge might be, perhaps, that we have such an emphasis that, I think, we put on ourselves on that final assessment; like it's coming, right? We've got to prepare them for those assessments, so at all costs, we have to teach them, just drill them on those certain skills they'll need, which might mean that we throw out other things. I know after my first year of teaching Language and Literature, I thought do I really have time to have them write to music for 5 or 10 minutes at the beginning of class for the opening free write?

The other responded,

I've stopped doing all the kind of fun, creative process writing just to get the kids to experience language and have fun with it and play with it. And it's pretty much just been, "We're going to do IOC practice. We're going to do Paper 1 practice." That's pretty much been it. And it is so depressing to me because why would I teach something that I am myself passionate about: literature, creative writing, thinking and sharing if all I'm going to ask them to do is write analytically and that's it. Severely depressing.

When it came to taking teaching beyond the walls of the classroom, one of the math teachers questioned how feasible that was. He asked, “doing an extracurricular activity or something outside the classroom? In math, honestly, I never did it with them in DP.” An

economics teacher in another group described positive experiences of student learning on field trips; however, he realized that “the cost is that it impacts other teachers...And if everybody's doing that, then it becomes hard.”

One exchange between teachers in another group highlighted this tension between incorporating valuable, but time-consuming, learning experiences into the curriculum while also being considerate of other teachers’ time. The exchange began with a visual arts teacher expressing enthusiasm about the arts scene in Lebanon and excitement about how her DP students had attended five exhibitions over the course of that year. Her colleagues smiled and responded good-naturedly and almost in unison: “Yes! We know!” to which she replied laughingly, “I’m sorry! Sometimes they have to leave regular classes, but because it is so available in our culture. But I'm sorry. I promise, I promise, I promise, never again.” One of the CAS coordinators also experienced difficulty in using school time for off-campus experiential learning. She complained that, “the Lebanese mentality, even if it's a DP program, is they can't skip school. They have to have a CAS activity within the school premises.”

One teacher brought up the increased pressure he felt because of a lack of contact hours with his students. He explained that in Lebanon, “we have so many vacations. And sometimes they fall during the days when we teach. And if they fall during that day and you teach three hours per day, three consecutive – then you will be losing.”

Teachers did notice some improvements with changes to both the DP English and math syllabi. One math teacher noted that the IB’s latest revision of the math syllabus showed positive change with the addition of 30 hours to the syllabus which would allow for more time spent on inquiry-based teaching and learning.

***A societal focus on grades hinders teachers’ attempts to meet the IB’s expectations in terms of ATT.*** Teachers in four focus groups and one interview stated that there was an

overwhelming focus on grades in the Lebanese context. They felt this put additional pressure on teachers to teach to the test and ensure students achieve high grades while sacrificing the practices expected of them through the IB's Approaches to Teaching. In the words of one teacher, "even though we're not supposed to, we teach to the test. We have to, because, especially here, it's all about grades." Another noted that both "the reaction of the parents and even the school - our own approach - is we want them to get high grades, so this puts more pressure on the teachers."

Some teachers felt the pressure of being held responsible for their students' grades. For example, one said to the agreement of her group, "we are sometimes judged on the performance of our students, so this also is an issue." Another argued, "we have to assume this role. We start teaching to the test because it reflects on us."

Teachers also spoke of receiving mixed messaging; on the one hand they were being expected to push students to perform, while on the other, teachers were also accused of expecting too much. One talked about being accused of being "harsh" with her students. However, she said, if "the results in the exams or in the assessments aren't at the level everybody expects them to be" teachers are held responsible.

One teacher argued that the impact of this was that, instead of being innovative, teachers ended up using more explicit ways of teaching "even if it's still like the old chalk and talk way." Meanwhile, another teacher expressed guilt that she was unable to show compassion for her students because "I think there's such a pressure on the teachers to produce the grades, the grades, the grades, that at times, you just can't stop to think about what other pressures the kids are under."

***A heavy teaching workload.*** Teachers in five focus groups talked about the pressure that working in the DP placed on them as teachers. One participant stated that the DP is "the most challenging programs I have ever taught."

One demand of the program came in the form of the time required to maintain the collaborative nature of professional practice expected by the IB. “It’s the amount of meetings,” one teacher explained, “it’s the amount of meetings we have and to consult and to-- group meetings and so on-- that is very time-consuming.” Paperwork was also seen as an issue as it ate into planning time. As one teacher put it, “you have little time and you have a lot of paperwork.”

Experienced teachers also felt the pressure of keeping up with the curriculum reviews which happen every seven years for each subject. One Language B teacher described herself as having to join her students in learning “to be able to succeed” as she taught the newest iteration of her syllabus. Teachers felt there was a constant demand for additional work to be done on non-reviewed syllabi as well as teachers are expected to reflect on and adjust their practice based on annual post-assessment reports from the IB. As one teacher explained, “there are always new things to talk about, even though the program is still the same. You’re never in a relaxed mode.”

### **Students Struggle with the Size and Rigor of the Program**

Teachers in nine focus groups and both interviews made a connection between students struggling with the size of the program and how that created additional challenges for them. As one teacher described it, “one of our greatest challenges is to push everybody up to IB standards when they are coming in from grade 10 not fully prepared, or not fully mentally prepared to take on the IB program.”

This section will present the teachers’ perspective on students’ struggles with the DP. It will first present teachers’ ideas on how students deal with the sheer amount of DP assignments and assessments. This will be followed by teachers’ thoughts on students lack of self and time management and, lastly, issues with students’ ability to think critically and

independently which adds to teachers' workload and makes it more difficult to prepare students adequately for the DP assessments.

***The large number of DP assessments.*** Teachers in eight focus groups noted that the DP's many assessments posed a challenge for the students. When talking about the sheer number of assessments students have over the course of the program one stated, "from a student's perspective, the number of papers that they have to sit for is frightening." Another teacher voiced the concern that "it's really, really hard. And students have a lot of things going on. You have so many IAs (internal assessments), so many submission days."

Another catalogued the requirements of the students to highlight his point:

you've got a TOK program, you've got individual investigations, you've got extended essays, you've got community service CAS program, you've got to do a lot of writing, a lot of testing, a lot of papers to sit for eventually. Very rigorous in that sense. Experimental work is a phenomenal number of hours that you need to do. If somebody ventures into two sciences, for example, in its own right, that is totally exhausting.

Similarly, in another group, a teacher argued that students, "need to know everything. You need to be good in everything. You need to be good in arts. You need to be good in sciences. you have to be well rounded in everything. Do researches. Do your IA's, your EE's." All the while, a teacher in her group noted, students have to "survive emotionally."

One of the language teachers explained that it is not just the number of the required assessments but also the broad range of skills that students needed to demonstrate in these assessments, "it's not only the oral, it's the writing, it's the literature, it's the interactive oral, it's the written assignment up to now, a lot of components that makes it rigorous."

A theater teacher emphasized that his course, on its own, constituted a heavy workload. Students were required to produce reports, present performances, give

presentations and, “at the same time, they need to write a 15-page portfolio... So this is how rigorous it is.”

The production of work in the arts subjects provides a particularly visual example of the amount of work students must complete. The theater teacher explained the pressure students face: “it is really time-consuming. In a sense, the work of art doesn't happen in an exam. Or that you study a chapter and actually implement it. It needs time. It's a work in progress the whole time.”

One math teacher half-jokingly related a conversation she had with students after visiting their DP Arts end of program exhibition. She told her students, "I'm sorry for every homework I gave you. I did not know you spend this much time doing the artwork and I was so busy with my math homework, so I should've been more considerate". She explained that as she walked around the exhibition, she found herself wondering, "when did they find the time to do it?"

When discussing the students' workload, teachers described it as “stressful” for the students. Another replied, “you can know that they are always stressed.” Another teacher talked about the fear and responsibility she felt when confronted with the avalanche of requirements her students would have to complete. She confessed, “my major concern is how I'm going to prepare them. You're always worried.”

***Students have limited time and self-management skills.*** In two interviews and seven focus groups teachers pointed out that, because of the academic rigor and logistics of the program, it is difficult for teachers to prepare students effectively for the DP assessments because students do not have effective self and time management skills. Students “struggle with deadlines” asserted one teacher to the agreement of the rest. The teachers agreed that the students “weren't trained to work on their own... To know what it is expected from them.” One teacher gave the example of a student who, as a result of his inability to manage

deadlines, “started failing exams; he wasn't able to prepare for the exams and all of that, and he ended up not taking the full DP.”

While explaining why it is so crucial that students be responsible for their own time and self-management a teacher described the way students’ schedules are created in the DP. She noted students choose their choices so “it's not as if you're going to a regular class where students have a regular schedule.” This, she said, makes it easy for teachers to stay abreast of the work students had in other classes or what exams they had. However, since each student’s schedule could be different, teachers were unable to guide the students in self-management meaning that students had to be responsible for their own work.

*Students lack the ability to think critically or independently.* Teachers in nine of the focus groups and one interview discussed the difficulty of teaching the DP as students are not able to think critically or independently. This could result in teachers facing an uphill battle when trying to deliver their syllabi in accordance with IB expectations.

Teachers stated that many students were either unable or unwilling to think either independently or critically. Rather, teachers felt students expected teachers to simply give them the right answer. One explained, that students often do not engage in inquiry, they just want the final answer. He elaborated: “sometimes the student wants, "Just give me the answers, sir. Let me get on with my life." And this is I think the greatest challenge is... sometimes I refuse to.”

This was echoed by several other teachers who said things like, “they don't think outside the box,” students are “not inquirers,” they are “used to spoon-feeding,” and “it's a matter of getting them out of their spoon-feeding cocoon and making them responsible for their own actions, which is actually the greatest challenge.”

In addition to the challenge of developing independent and critical thinking skills in their students, it was widely agreed that, as one teacher put it, students “expect a lot of

closed-ended questions. They're not used to the open-ended discussions.” According to the teachers, students are not used to open ended questions that offer them multiple options to choose from, rather “they want a hint. They want the starting point. They want you to help them out. They want pointers. They want clues.”

Teachers in another group talked about this being such a major challenge that it had become a school improvement goal. She explained, “for us as a school, we are still addressing the issue of critical thinking ourselves. We're still trying to improve that.”

This challenge was evident across a number of different subjects where teachers reported that their students were not used to having to come up with their own ideas. In literature, one teacher spoke of the students as

always looking for, is this correct? Is it correct? Whereas I have to coach them through: “it's your argument, you need to be able to support the evidence from your literature. Prove to me that you are correct.” But there is a constant, “no, no, no. What is the answer? What is the theme of this text? What is this character's development?” there is no, like, thinking through it, no matter what because - they just... There must only be one answer.

Another literature teacher from a different group pointed to the difficulties students have in being independent learners who “challenge themselves.” Another explained that although failure was part of the learning process, she had to encourage her students to take risks in their work because “they’re so afraid of being wrong and not being perfect every time.” One of the theater teachers viewed the inability to function independently and the fear of making mistakes as especially challenging while teaching in her field. He noted that he struggles to get students to take risks and be open-minded: “my dilemma is that they want to approach my class like it's a math class...There's one answer; one fit. You can't look at it that way.”

Even the math and science teachers found it a struggle to nudge students along the path of independent and critical thought. In one group teachers spoke of the evolution of the

math and sciences assessments which have been showing an increased focus on critical thought. One said, “the questions, they are more holistic and they incorporate many, many concepts.” This, he continued, was a great step; however, “getting the students there is a challenge; is a big challenge, because the students always try to think segmented.”

TOK, a subject with a heavy focus on nurturing critical and independent thought, was seen to be particularly challenging to students. In one TOK teacher’s experience, she described students as not knowing “how to think. They haven’t been exposed enough. They don’t read widely enough. They’re not curious enough.” Another said that for new DP students, beginning the TOK course was like “culture shock.”

In another group, TOK presentations (an assessment asking students to present a debatable issue) were discussed as an area of challenge and one teacher explained,

right now, we are going through TOK presentations with our juniors and they want us to tell them exactly what they need to do. Right? And part of IB is that, no, we’re not going to teach you how to do it. They give you the framework, you do the steps, right? You work through it. And then they’re frustrated.

Similarly, a TOK teacher from another group said simply, that the challenge the students face is connected to the fact that “Lebanese students do not reflect.” Another teacher agreed using an example from her own classroom: “it happens in math, sometimes they get answers that are insane; I ask them, “why didn’t you look at your answer and think if this answer makes sense?” They do not reflect at all. Not at all.”

***Students not ready for the demands of the DP.*** Amidst the concerns was also a genuine feeling of concern for students and questions around whether or not the demands of the DP program were realistic. Teachers felt that the lack of student readiness could be attributed to the developmental capabilities of their age group, parenting styles and inadequate pre-DP training.

*Developmental capabilities of the age group.* Several teachers described the DP as being a college-level course and often had expectations that went beyond those of normal high school classes. One made the point that the DP, “is a program that is reviewed every seven years and is informed by university requirements.” Another noted that the higher-level DP courses were essentially university courses so, “many students who actually take the higher-level courses, when they go to college, they say, “Oh. I've done all of that in school.” In addition to the courses, she continued “they also have to write a research paper that is quite extensive. In my time, I've not even done that in college.” Similar sentiments were voiced across four other focus groups. One teacher revealed, “I sometimes feel so unfair to ask them to do all this analysis and critical thinking...I didn't do that before I was like way into college. So, in that sense, it feels like this disconnect.”

In addition, some teachers put students' difficulties with time and self-management down to immaturity. One teacher argued, “getting a 17-year-old to cope with deadlines is already something rigorous. It demands responsibility from the students that maybe not all of them are able to do.” In the same vein, another participant said, “our students are quite young. They don't know how to organize themselves. They don't know how to use their time...Are we really expecting them to have the maturity to be able to cope with all of this?”

Regarding the additional support that students often needed, one teacher wondered if, “17-year-olds can get through that without this help that we're offering them.” Another noted, “it's only in American style international schools that the DP is done in grade 11 and 12” as opposed a British-style 13th grade. “In my opinion,” she continued, the students are “too immature for this program.”

Another expressed a sense that the IB had gone overboard with exams and program requirements; she said, “coming back to the brain of the students at this age, as with students 17, 18. Meeting the requirements and the critical thinking sometimes that is required. It's too

much. It's becoming too much.” A literature teacher expressed a similar feeling saying that the official exams in her subject were “much too demanding and kind of out of touch with what students were really able to produce.”

The general feeling across the groups was that teachers should keep pushing the students. One explained, “I feel like it’s my job to keep pushing,” even though it “comes down to the cognitive level of being a teenager: I don’t know how to come up with my own thinking. And that’s hard and it’s challenging. so, I don’t want to do that.”

Another revealed that for students who are not yet ready, “I think we do a disfavor to some if we encourage them to pursue that program. And it's not that they're not-- they're good or bad, they're not ready yet.”

*Parenting styles.* Others linked the lack of readiness to the parenting approach in the Lebanese context that tend to be too nurturing and protective, hence not allowing for the teenagers to develop their own stances. One suggested,

the thing about the differences in the parenting aspect, ..., we in the Middle East, we hover over our kids and we do everything for them. And we're making sure that they do it. The problem is, is that by the time they hit their teenage years, we have expectations of them to be able to do things alone, yet we have, all we've ever done is train them to rely on us. So they hit that teenage year, and they have no skills, they don't have the baggage to be able to make the right choices and to be independent, and then we blame them for it.

*Inadequate pre-DP training.* Another aspect that the teachers linked to the students lack of readiness for the problem was that the majority of the students lacked adequate pre-DP training. Teachers found it especially challenging to work with students who had not had specific pre-DP training and were not exposed to teaching strategies using inquiry, critical or independent thought. During his interview, a math teacher remarked, “if students have encountered inquiry experiences before, they'll be more comfortable with it in grade 11. If not, then it will be tough. So, coming from a traditional way of teaching, it will be tough.”

One particular school implemented two programs in their pre-DP schooling: the Lebanese Brevet curriculum and an American style curriculum. Teachers from this school noted that students from the American style program adapted to the DP faster and with less struggle than the Brevet students. One teacher explained, that the challenge with the Lebanese Brevet students –is their learning styles. While they have skills to function under stress, they are not ready for the independent thinking demands of the DP program. He said,

they need it ready-made. “Give it to me. I will study it. I will reproduce it.” So the challenge is to make them think out of the box. I find it easier to try to reshape the thinking of the high school program more than the Lebanese. Lebanese, they're very systematic. "You do this, you do this, and that's it. Okay?"

During one discussion, a biology teacher noted that these students “are moving between a curriculum that has a different dimension and moving to another curriculum that has another dimension.” Similar to other teachers, she felt that integrating more DP skills at a younger age would have helped students with the transition. It was also suggested by a number of teachers that schools should adopt the Learner Profile into younger grade levels so students “have at least a minimum idea about what it is.”

Despite the challenges, however, teachers in eight focus groups specifically discussed the growth they saw in their students over the two years. Teachers gave examples around the sense of achievements students felt after completing the DP and how much more open-minded they grew throughout the course. One teacher gave the example of an assignment where students had to research the Lebanese Civil War and delve into difficult and controversial topics. Another teacher talked about her children’s experience in the theater course saying, “as a parent that I did see my own kids' personalities changing at the beginning and at the end due that course of drama. It really changed their confidence.”

## **Context Specific Challenges of Teaching International-Mindedness and the Values of the Learner Profile**

This section presents the challenges teachers face when teaching international-mindedness and the values of the Learner Profile in Lebanon. The challenges presented are a) the homogenous nature of the student body coupled with socio-economic and cultural divisions in Lebanese society, b) navigating local sensitivities such as political and religious topics while incorporating LP and IM related content, and lastly, c) conflicts between the values of the Learner Profile and the ways in which business and politics are practiced in Lebanon.

### ***Lack of diversity in the student body and divisions within Lebanese society.***

Because of the pre-equivalency rules, most of the DP students in Lebanon are Lebanese citizens with a second nationality, which implies that the majority students enrolled in DP schools come from a wealthier class of Lebanese society. In seven of the focus groups, teachers voiced concerns over how the cultural homogeneity and lack of socioeconomic diversity in the student body as well as socio-economic and cultural divisions in Lebanese society impacted their ability to effectively teach IM and the values of the LP.

### ***The cultural homogeneity of the student body hinders teaching of IM and the LP.***

During a discussion on international-mindedness, one teacher made the point that the student body at her school was “not international per se. We do not have that mix of different nationalities here on campus.” This is similar for all the DP schools in Lebanon and teachers felt this lack of diversity made teaching the LP and IM a challenge because students were not exposed to, nor learning from, people from other cultures. One teacher stated “it is tougher to deal with and talk about international-mindedness in a homogeneous class.”

Another teacher described this challenge using her economics class as an example, she complained that,

it's very difficult to make it really meaningful because we can choose texts - I can choose articles from different countries, we can choose papers from different countries but really what we're trying to do is to try to get the kids to develop a sense of empathy for the other. And I actually feel that that's a very difficult thing to do. We can tick the boxes. Yes, I've read an article from India or yes, I've read an article about poverty in Southeast Asia, but how do we know if it's really making a difference to how they see themselves in the global context? For me, I feel that they don't really get it. It's very superficial.

Another teacher was concerned about how little teachers could do to instill the values of the LP and IM when students are so isolated from others who are different from them. Students “live in a bubble,” she stated, “there's very little we can do except for offering them, and keep reminding them, that we live in this world and they have to accept others.” Another teacher in the same group added on, “they won't know it unless they experience” mingling with other cultures and learning how to get along with those that are different. The others in the group nodded in agreement. The demographics of Lebanon were seen as contributing to the insular upbringing of the children because Lebanon, as one teacher described it, is “a very closed community and society, where foreigners are not in a big number. So it's a challenge for us to open students' minds to accept differences.”

In terms of how this lack of exposure plays out in the classroom, one of the teachers described how students entered the program with very clear biases. She commented on the time that it took to instill values of tolerance and open-mindedness saying, “they start off by making these kinds of assumptions based on their own preconceived ideas. And it literally takes, I would say, maybe more than six months, from three to six months to start peeling off the layers.” A teacher in another group talked about the impact of this on the few foreign students she had in class noting, “the majority tend to be from the Lebanese culture, and there tends to be a situation where, if there's one or two coming from abroad, they're picked upon.”

*The lack of socioeconomic diversity within the student body makes teaching IM and the LP a challenge.* In addition to the cultural homogeneity of the students, teachers pointed

out that the students were also largely socio-economically homogeneous; this was seen as another challenge as students remained functionally ignorant of the lives of those less fortunate than themselves.

One teacher related the students' wealth with difficulties in encouraging student engagement in local and global issues. She wondered whether teachers were succeeding, "in creating passion, interest, or engagement in social issues and environmental issues. We try. But I think in general that the sort of engagement, political awareness, social awareness is at a pretty low level in our community."

The metaphor of students living in a bubble was used in several focus groups as teachers described how unaware students were about both local and global issues. One teacher explained, "there are cases - but it's rare - where students expose themselves and read the newspaper every day and really know what's going on." "But," another asked, "how aware are they? When they're striking every Friday in Europe (the school children all over Europe). I mentioned it in my class and they've not even heard about them. They had no idea what I was talking about." A colleague joked in reply, "or they would strike just to get out of school, but not necessarily for the cause."

One of the economics teachers, for example, described sharing an article about inequality in Ivory Coast and trying to elicit an 'insider' perspective from a student who had lived there. The student was unable to answer because, the teacher explained,

she'd never gone out. She'd just spent her life in her air-conditioned car, air-conditioned apartment, air-conditioned school. And she really wasn't aware of the world which she came from, and the world which actually gave her family the wealth to be able to enjoy the life she has now.

In the same vein, a global politics teacher talked about a DP assessment where students are asked to learn about a political issue and be involved in instigating change. She explained that although students completed activities like holding fundraisers for

underprivileged communities, they demonstrated a “very shallow understanding of what makes poverty” and the reasons for inequality in society. She was surprised, she said, “how very little they know about this; how very protected they live.”

In contrast, one teacher felt that some students who had traveled were more exposed. This came down to the attitude of the parents she stated as, “in some cases, with some students, that privilege is a positive element. Their parents have tried to travel with them extensively or expose them to community service. It depends on the family.”

The home environment and the extent to which it reflected the values of the IB was widely seen to be an important factor in helping or hindering the work of teachers in trying to instill the values of the LP and IM in students. One teacher remarked, “there’s a lot you can do as a school, but it really comes from home. This is the main issue.” Similarly, a teacher in another group observed, “at this point, and throughout high school, students’ views often represent those of their parents.”

*Cultural and socio-economic divisions in the Lebanese context can impede the teaching of IM and the LP.* The socio-economic divisions of Lebanon were also seen as contributing to what was seen as the overly sheltered lives of the students. One teacher explained, “the two halves of society aren’t exposed to each other enough. For example, in other countries, if you go to London or New York or wherever, you see people sleeping on the streets or living on the streets, and we are exposed to that. Whereas in Lebanon, you’re very much sheltered from that other half.” The rest of her group agreed.

Teachers did highlight that there were always students who were by nature socially and politically engaged and who volunteered for social projects; but, one commented, “there are students who, with or without us, they are going to shine with these projects because they simply are like that. We need to pull in more the students who are peripheral.” Another gave the example of setting projects around environmental issues in the hope of engaging students.

She described their lackluster response, explaining that “one or two will say, “wow, my God, is that true? Is this a reality?” But the rest will just do it to finish it and they really just don't care.”

A third shared challenge concerns students' stamina in terms of sustained engagement in social issues. One teacher found that “sustaining their interest in something that is outside themselves and their own self for a long time, like big humanitarian issues” to be challenging. She speculated that this could be a reflection of Lebanese society at large as she described that students would “be interested, and they will contribute, and donate, and do like relief campaigns and this stuff. But then, with time, like maybe even the Lebanese society, it fades a little bit.”

*Navigating local sensitivities.* Balancing teaching challenging topics and materials which encourage international and open-mindedness while not offending local beliefs or traditions was seen as challenging and was discussed by teachers in three focus groups and on interview. One teacher described how careful she had to be in choosing the topics and resources she chose to tackle in class, “so that you will not jump into problems with students and their parents.”

Certain topics, another teacher stated, were simply off the table. He recounted coming back to Lebanon after living abroad for almost 20 years and being told at the orientation of his new school, “there are taboo topics or conversations” that could not be broached in class. These topics included religion and politics; two subject areas that were widely seen among the teachers as being sensitive and difficult to navigate at time.

While some teachers talked about the difficulty of discussing international politics, Even more difficult was the notion of discussing local politics. One teacher talked about a truth and reconciliation unit she taught where students did a research project on Lebanese politics. She confided to the group, “it's scary for me. It's very scary.”

On the other hand, another argued for the importance of incorporating controversial content because that was how students could be challenged in a way that nurtured open-mindedness. She stated, “I like to bring up very sensitive issues to the table because this is challenging for the student, and this is part of the international-mindedness for the IB profile.” She did have one important caveat to this however, which was, “I don’t think that we have to say no unless it’s Lebanese. Lebanese politics, I don’t go into it.”

She was not the only one who felt that local politics constituted a complex red line that couldn’t, or shouldn’t, be brought into the classroom. Another teacher, for example, begins the year by telling her students that there would be no discussion about Lebanese politics. She explained that it was the only topic that was off-limits to her “because it’s related to their religion, and then it’s so personal. So I’d rather not.”

For some schools, the manifestation of local politics in the form of religious division or strife played a large role in curating the experiences of students for CAS, a key component for the teaching of IM and LP values. One particular school is situated in an area largely inhabited by adherents of a particular religion. This put certain constraints on the range and type of experiences the CAS coordinator could arrange for her students as mixing with, or helping, other communities was not encouraged. She explained in other countries, students in IB schools were free to be involved in a wide range of CAS projects. However, in her school, “working with ethnic groups, Christians, Muslims. that’s another challenge for me.”

Regional politics was also a touchy subject and one teacher spoke about her experience teaching history and shared, “it’s not easy to give topics such as the existence of Israel, the problem with Palestine.” Like other teachers, she keenly felt the responsibility of teaching open-mindedness and the need to model it by discussing difficult issues without “backing up a certain idea against the other.” However, she continued, this was especially challenging when it came to local or regional politics because students “live in families where

they speak about politics. They speak their hatred for this and that. So, it's not easy to deal with."

On the topic of Israel and Palestine, another teacher explained, "initially, you're told, "well, you really shouldn't have those conversations." I teach them Romeo and Juliet, "don't suggest that they do Capulet, Montague, a video adaptation based on Israel, Palestine. You can't suggest that."

There was among the teachers a genuine desire to not offend while still fulfilling the expectations of the IB. During a conversation about open-mindedness an art teacher reflected on whether it was possible to be open-minded while also steering clear of certain topics. She explained,

I do not allow my students to-- I advise them not to go into anything that has to do with religion, anything that has to do with politics, anything that would-- even if it's done in a very tasteful way. Anything that might in some way insult someone else. So I'm not open-minded. Being really open-minded, I would allow them to do anything.

This sparked a debate between the teachers about what open-mindedness even meant and what constituted open-mindedness versus offensiveness.

Another group of teachers talked about their experiences battling with their administration about certain sensitive topics like sexuality which could conflict with certain religious beliefs. One teacher explained, "we've had lots of other examples dealing with religion and homosexuality in the school where we treated the subject opposite to what the IB mission statement dictates." In another group, one teacher posited, "open-minded and religion, they cannot work. They cannot."

Generally, topics that went against the current of local beliefs were considered to be tricky. One teacher talked about a discussion on abortion that came up in her class, describing it as her most difficult teaching experience. "I wasn't able to control the class," she explained,

“it was very, very aggressive. Some people with, some people against. It was very, very personal.”

One teacher concluded that not all cultures were equal in the ease of instilling international-mindedness and the values of the Learner Profile. It is, he posited, very challenging “to take the students from certain backgrounds and shift their way of thinking to fit the IB learner profile and to fit this internationally wide way of thinking.”

Ultimately, another teacher remarked, the responsibility of the DP teacher lies in pushing the boundaries of students’ thinking, even if it means skirting controversy. She emphasized that DP teachers must

have courage because introducing international concepts sometimes clash with local traditions or cultures. You need to be mindful of those things, but at the same time, to help your students to grow you have to make them question their culture, their values, their relationships - not only between one another and their families, but also with the wider world. And that can be very challenging, and you can clash with authorities and whoever is in the school.

Teachers in four focus groups briefly discussed the challenge of keeping the balance between teaching international-mindedness, and breeding a sense of belonging to Lebanon in the students and preserving the local culture within the DP framework.

The teachers who discussed this point generally felt that the DP’s structure allowed for sufficient time to be spent on teaching students about their own culture and history. For example, one teacher compared the DP favorably in this aspect in comparison with the French Baccalaureate. She said the “DP, they care about your local, your values” because the syllabus encouraged the inclusion of local resources. Teachers talked, for example, about incorporating news or documentaries about Lebanon while another teacher brought up the point that the students’ CAS activities developed their bond with their country as the activities all took place within the local community.

One teacher noted, “promoting international-mindedness doesn't mean losing your culture and losing your values. You can have your own values.” But still, she admitted, there was a challenge in finding the right balance between being “open-minded to other perspectives in life” and remaining “grounded” in one’s own beliefs. One of the visual arts teachers said “because they have to do research on three different artists, different eras, different everything. I influence them very strongly for one of the artists to be a primary source which would be an Arab artist that they can actually meet and talk to. So I've solved this problem by doing it that way.”

Having said that, there was one group that voiced their concerns about the difficulty of instilling the students with a sense of connection or loyalty to Lebanon. This was not IB-specific, but rather a situation that the teachers felt transcended schools and education. One teacher explained that this was difficult because children have “given up, just like their parents have. They've given up on this country.” Another said that so many students were leaving the country that the school had become “almost like a travel agency with 50% of our kids going out.”

Out of the 62 teachers involved in the study, only two thought the curriculum was geared towards the West; both were English language A teachers. One referred to a bias in exam content and gave the example of a test which used excerpts from British newspapers. She felt that this bias can disadvantage students coming from Lebanon who are often second language speakers of English and may lack exposure to manifestations of Western culture such as its media landscape. Another spoke of his choices of classroom literature and resources and how, in his course, teachers “wind up being led to look at things in the States and in Britain.”

***The practice of business and politics conflicts with IM and the values of the LP.***

Teachers in five focus groups, meanwhile, found that the manner in which business and

politics are practiced poses obstacles to the teaching of international-mindedness and the Learner Profile. One of the business teachers gave the example of an assignment where students are asked to write a paper analyzing a local business; the assignment requires students to have access to that company's financial information and "this is the struggle in Lebanon because most businesses don't have well-kept records or papers or financial statements." In addition, she continued, those that did wouldn't necessarily be transparent in their record keeping. So, she concluded, "there's this privacy and confidentiality issue that we're facing."

Teachers also talked about the difficulties of promoting values in the IB that are not reinforced in the wider political and legislative landscape. One teacher stated, for example, that "trying to educate the students about academic honesty, and trying to be ethical while others are not is hard for them. They say, "but Miss, this and this, do that. This and this, do that." So this is challenging." Several other teachers made similar points.

Not only did teachers feel that the LP values are not reinforced within the wider Lebanese context, but the systemic corruption which rewards the wealthy and politically connected at the expense of the rest sometimes seeped into student behavior. One teacher disclosed, "I feel that, specifically, academic integrity has become more and more challenging. If I want to link it to the Lebanese context, the concept of ethics, it's very, let's say, very ...." the teacher trailed off, at a loss for how to explain her point diplomatically. "Volatile?" another teacher suggested helpfully and the others laughed and nodded.

"Exactly. In the Lebanese context," continued the initial speaker. "So the expectations, they're not reinforced at all in the society; in a society that we all complain all the time about corruption." She continued to describe how the corruption outside the school walls were reflected in students' approach to their studies. Academic honesty, for example,

was seen as a particular challenge because the students' families "have enough money to even hire people to do their work. This has become more and more prominent."

CAS coordinators, in particular, felt that this lack of modeling in the wider context was a hindrance to their work. One said, to the agreement of others in his group,

in terms of the other ethical issues, yes, sometimes we have a huge problem because they do projects in CAS and there is a goal behind the project, but what is being applied nationwide has nothing to do with what they're doing.

Another example around CAS had to do with the impact of the fluidity of the political environment. As one coordinator explained that the unpredictability of security situation made traveling around the country difficult.

A biology teacher discussed the government's approach to environmental issues and how it interfered with her linking her teaching to real-world, context-based problem-solving. She explained that encouraging her students to consider solutions to environmental problems in Lebanon was,

the most challenging part in my course because students link it to all the politics. It's a huge problem and challenging to have those discussions in class. Because kids, just like us, they see what is happening around us, and especially when it comes to the pollution problem, garbage issues and how the politicians are handling it.

### **Perceived Differences in the Cultural and Academic Value Systems of the IB and the Lebanese Context**

It is important at this juncture to mention that the value system of the IB is, by its nature, a highly idealized and aspirational framework while the on-the-ground reality of the Lebanese context is subject to the natural compromises of being lived out on a day to day basis. The very nature of the two entities suggests that there will be incompatibilities; what this section is concerned with is the areas considered by teachers to not be aligned.

When speaking of incongruences between the perceived value systems of the Lebanese context and the IB, teachers felt strongly that there were certain areas where the

gaps between the two were glaring. One teacher suggested that the IB and the Lebanese context housed “two different mentalities and spirits.” Another explained, “we all feel that we're living a double life. I personally feel I have a double personality. When I am in school and this is my world, everything is fine and it's nice,” however, she continued, “the moment you step outside and you're driving (*laughter*), you feel misplaced, and I'm sure our students, they have the same thing as what we feel.”

This section will present teachers' perceptions of points of misalignment between the IB's value system and that of the Lebanese context. It will first present teachers' perceptions of the incongruences between the societal value system of Lebanon and the IB, followed by a description of teachers' perceptions of the academic incongruences that they feel exist between the DP and the LB. This section will end with an overview of teachers' feelings about the elitism of the IB itself which is displayed as an incongruency with its own values of inclusion.

### **Incongruences Between the Societal Value System of the Lebanese Context and That of the IB**

When discussing social incongruences, teachers in ten focus groups and two interviews discussed specific points of misalignment when comparing the realities of the Lebanese context to the value system promoted by the IB. These points focused on a) differences in the degree of open-mindedness endorsed by each value system, b) the practice of politics and workplace behavior in the Lebanese context operate on a more flexible ethical framework than that endorsed by the IB.

*The IB value system expects a greater degree of open-mindedness than the value system of the Lebanese context.* The perpetuation of sectarian divisions in Lebanese society through the political and educational infrastructures of the country were seen as taking precedence over the practice of tolerance and understanding. One teacher commented that,

despite almost 30 years having passed since the end of the Lebanese Civil War, “we are still living in a country where politically, president, prime minister, all of this stuff is elected by religion,” this, she stated is “against the IB Learners Profile” and in direct contrast with the teachings of the IB.

A global politics teacher gave an example of how the IB nurtures open-mindedness and tolerance while the education infrastructure of the Lebanese context tends to crystallize divisions. “Lebanon is very divided society,” she stated, “we teach Lebanese history, and we talk about this.” She compared this inclusive approach to discussing about Lebanon’s communities in her classroom with her children’s friends’ school in their village where, she says, “they’re not exposed to the point of view of other people in their own country.”

One teacher spoke about the prevalence of racism in Lebanese society, specifically “racism towards other cultures who we perceive, or we as a society perceive, that they are lower than us.” Another participant stated that when students first enter the program, “their bias comes through; the stereotypes come through, the judgment comes through.” She stated that it often took up to six months for students to start thinking beyond their preconceived ideas and notions. She continued to say that after students return from summer break, “I have to start again, to refresh-- because these are learnt-- they’re embedded in us as a society. The way we look at things, the way we judge.”

***Professional norms in the political and professional arenas in Lebanon do not operate on the same standards as the IB.*** Teachers saw students’ inability to manage time as one of their foremost challenges; however, one group also noted that the adults “also have time management issues.” “Here in Lebanon,” she confided, “we don’t appreciate time - it’s not part of our agenda,” and the members of the group agreed and examples of laxity in doctor’s appointments were shared and laughed about.

The approach of the government to education was also seen as incongruent to the professional norms and values espoused by IB. Teachers complained that educational policy, for example, was more informed by politics than educational ideology. One conversation centered around the lack of a modern history textbook for Lebanon with one teacher pointing out that politicians were, “still arguing about which word to use in the history books: ‘Rab’ or ‘Allah’.”

Another talked of serving on a committee to come up with a Learner Profile for the Lebanese curriculum. She said, “we spent three days in a committee trying to come up with a Learner Profile! Three days! They couldn’t decide between ‘innovative’ or ‘creative’ in the Arabic language.” She went on to point out that committee members were chosen based on sect and political alliance and weren’t necessarily “qualified to be around the table.”

Another participant from a different group also described her time on a committee, this one aimed at reviewing the English syllabus. She said, “we thought we’d made some kind of progress and then this guy from the back of beyond in the north of Bekaa came and started arguing about the name of the character in the story. I just thought, okay.” Another participant spoke of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education’s (MEHE) failure to comply with its own curriculum review policies saying, “the Lebanese curriculum was designed to be reviewed every five years but that was never done due to political reasons.”

The lack of political interference in the IB was seen as a plus by one of the teachers who explained, “the IB doesn’t have to answer to any one government’s political issues. And that, I think, is one of the strengths of the IB, that it can be above it.”

Although teachers were clearly frustrated by the state of affairs in Lebanon, some showed great optimism about the role the IB could play in paving the path to improvement. Several teachers felt the growth of the DP in the country would serve as an incentive for the government to make reforms to the LB. Others suggested the DP could serve as a model for

the reforms. One mused that maybe one day “an IB student who graduated some time ago will be a minister of education that will put his effort to implement the IB in all of Lebanon; because it would help.”

The more striking comments were those that demonstrated the hope that teachers had in the future of Lebanon and role they could play in it through the teaching of the DP. A biology teacher talked about scientific literacy and how, for her, “it is not only knowing about the content and doing well for the IB official. It's how they would tackle this content eventually to put them in our Lebanese context...be able to make a change in our society.” Another stated, “I never lose hope. At least we are implementing in students how things should be.”

One teacher joked that maybe the IB had been “created for Lebanon... I think it's the solution. If the parliament members, rather than shouting and screaming at each other, listen and communicate and try to be less dramatic. We will have better decisions.”

***Expectations of adolescent independence are much greater in the DP than the Lebanese context.*** Teachers felt there was an incongruence in the expectations around the degree of independence students should have. One explained that Lebanon had a “collectivist culture; it's the ‘we’ mentality. Our kids, or our students, they're highly supported by their parents, if not by the parents they have the means to go for, let's say, private tutors or any other help.”

Another compared Lebanese parents with her experience of a foreign parent who, when she called him about his son's behavior asked her in exasperation, “Why are you calling me? You can talk with my child, he's at school. Why are you relying on me?” This was contrasted with teachers' experiences of dealing with Lebanese parents who expected to be kept informed of their children's behavior and academics.

Meanwhile, another teacher in her group said of Lebanese families,

it's our cultural thing, we follow up on our kids ever since they're young, and we tell them what to do. We buy them their stationery; we buy them the bag and the books and we laminate them. We label, we follow up, we check their agendas. We sit with them for hours. We leave our work. I'm speaking from personal experience.

One of the college counselors spoke of the conflict some students face when deciding whether to leave and pursue an international education or remain with their families. She gave the example of a hard-working student who had been accepted into a prestigious university in Canada. Although the student desperately wanted to go, “she may not be able to go because her family wants her stay here.”

***Parents do not value the IB’s non-academic offerings.*** In nine focus groups and one interview, teachers reflected on parental priorities and their alignment to those of the IB value system. One stated, “there is a disconnect between how the parents view the learning. A lot of them don't really understand the child's learning; they just look at the benchmark.” Another thought that perhaps since, “the IB in general is a new idea in Lebanon. Not all the parents can understand the requirements of the IB.”

One said, “from my experience, I've noticed that some parents maybe put their children into an IB school perhaps because it's prestigious because this is what's in fashion.” Or, said another, “we have students whose parents want them to IB because they get a year off college, for example. Which is a financial reality, I don't blame them.”

In another conversation about the reason parents chose the DP for their children, one teacher mused, “I think a lot of parents want better for their children than what they had in some way. If that's through going through the IB program, through going to a better college.” One of her peers replied, “but it's not necessarily to be more socially engaged, or to be more critically thinking,” to which the initial speaker agreed.

Others however felt that most parents were intentional in their choice of the DP because of its focus on IM and the LP. One teacher expressed that most parents are “aware

that IB is different than the Lebanese program,” and that “a lot of them have researched it, and I do have some parents who are really appreciative of the IB curriculum, definitely.”

**Incongruences between the academic values of the DP and those of the Lebanese Baccalaureate.** Teachers in 10 focus groups and one interview noted that the DP and LB were both difficult yet significantly different. As one teacher explained, in each curriculum “the approach and what is expected from the students is different.” Another described the LB as “a little bit closed-minded” but very rigorous; however, the teacher continued, the LB demands “a different type of rigor” than the DP.

The LB was also widely seen as outdated with teachers describing it as “traditional”, “from the 20’s or 30’s”, “old” and in one particular case “ancient.” One participant said that teaching it made her feel like it was 1945; the DP, on the other hand, she said made her feel like she was living in 2025.

The differences between the DP and LB were seen to be mainly due to a) the lack of teacher training and follow up by MEHE in comparison to the IB when it comes to program implementation and b) the DP’s focus on critical, creative thinking while the LB focused mainly on rote memorization

***Despite similarities in the written curricula, the LB and DP are implemented very differently.*** Although the LB was seen as outdated, teachers in five focus groups and one interview pointed out that the key differences between the DP and the LB did not result from the content of the curricula, but rather, from their pedagogical implementation. For example, while one group was discussing the lack of congruence between the two programs, one teacher talked about the DP’s focus on the Learner Profile and critical thinking and said, “actually, on the written paper of the Lebanese program, they’re there. I don’t think there is a lot of divergence between the two because, on paper, the values are there, but there’s no follow-up on teachers.”

This thought was expressed in several groups with teachers saying things like, “the Lebanese curriculum was really, essentially, initially when it was reformed, based on inquiry,” and “very aligned with the ATT.” However, teachers felt that the curriculum remained very traditional because “the teachers who are not able to catch on that change.”

Several teachers felt that a lack of teacher training was the main culprit in the gap between the LB’s written and taught curricula. One teacher specifically argued that the “government is not investing” with helping teachers transition to a more modern, inquiry-based approach that would allow them to deliver the curriculum effectively. One teacher elaborated,

I just wanted to say about the implementation of the Lebanese curriculum, that teachers are not to be blamed. It comes from the top. I mean, the IB is like that because of the follow up from the top management with all the schools. The workshops that they force you to do, the professional development that they follow through, the inspections, the visits... I mean, as long as we have none of these, then, I don't know, for Lebanese schools, implementing the Lebanese program, then no one is expected to even know.

Three different groups brought up the LB’s recent incorporation of a service element which, one teacher felt, brings it “a step closer to the culture of the IB.” One teacher brought up that, similar to other conversation about the LB, there was no actual follow up on whether or not the students had actually completed the service component. She recounted that, “I’ve been asking what proof does the Ministry of Education need that our students have done 50 hours? Nobody knows.”

***The DP promotes creative and critical thinking while the LB relies on rote learning.*** Teachers in nine focus groups widely agreed that the LB eschewed critical or creative thinking in favor of rote learning. One teacher stated, “the Lebanese curriculum does not actually provide critical thinking”, while another commented, “with the Lebanese program, what is missing is the in-depth critical thinking”

One participant argued that in the LB, “everything is about rote memory learning.” She gave the example of learning history where, in the DP, students were asked to probe and question historical narratives. Meanwhile the history course in the LB, she stated, is “pure rote memory learning. Learning the dates, learning the events, what happened, how they happened and just regurgitating information.”

One of the math teachers said, “in the DP I find that we have a lot of critical thinking; we have a lot of applied math, a lot of examples that are applied into our real-life situations. This is different from our program, the Lebanese program.”

Another difference was seen in the DP’s focus on nurturing independent learning and research skills. For example, one teacher noted, “our LB students are not required to do the same type of assessment that will require inquiry. I would say that there are deficits in that aspect; and research like with the Extended Essay.” Another said the LB “does not allow the student to experiment with things or to give opinions.”

A philosophy teacher described her experience of teaching in the LB where, she explained, students “write about the the different theories, okay? Arguments and counterarguments that they studied in class; but there is no personal opinion. There is no personal approach or personal critical thinking. So it's all based on memorization.”

While the DP exams were described as “really critical” and encouraging “creative, open-minded” and “out of the box” thinking, one teacher explained that in contrast, while preparing her students for the LB she cautions them to not “go out of the margin that is set. Or try not to be so creative and so original.”

Another complained of the languages, history and social science assessments, calling them “absolutely ridiculous. It's memorizing a book. It's spitting the information out in an exam.” “No critical thinking,” agreed another teacher in her group.

Teachers also noted the variety of assessment in the DP and how it touched on many different skills such as writing, presenting or research which was seen as encouraging creativity and critical thought. This was compared to the LB's single, end-of-program final exam period which limited the ways in which students could show mastery of skills.

Another stated, "in IB, you have everything that is tested. You have the oral, you have the written, for example, in languages. While in the Lebanese system, we don't have orals. So, it's just the written." This was seen as limiting the students' opportunities to demonstrate ability, but also indicative of the LP's narrow approach to pedagogy and learning.

Another aspect is that the IB values process over grades while the Lebanese context places a premium on grades and the sciences. In line with the academic incongruences perceived by teachers, discussions in eight focus groups and one interview centered on the difference in importance placed on grades by IB and the Lebanese context. Teachers felt that there was an overwhelmingly large focus on grades, especially in the sciences, in the Lebanese context which contradicted the IB's more measured approach to promoting process over product and giving all subjects equal weight.

The following section will look at these discussions in more detail beginning with teachers' perceptions of what they saw as the over-appreciation of grades in the Lebanese context, followed by presenting their thoughts on the premium placed on science subjects.

***In the Lebanese context, grades, as opposed to learning, are seen as a measure of success.*** Teachers in eight focus groups and one interview perceived that Lebanese society values grades over, and sometimes at the expense of, the inquiry and values-based learning promoted by the IB. One teacher described it as, "a split between the philosophy of the IB and the reality we are living. The Lebanese mentality, and the Arab mentality in particular, equates a student's academic success with their social success." Meanwhile, another said "it's

just the culture here... everyone is a number.” A third expressed that in Lebanon we, “define our children as grades.”

In spite of what was seen as the value of the IB’s pedagogical focus and approach, many teachers felt that parents enrolled their children in the DP simply because they saw it as an entryway into university. One teacher commented, “the Lebanese mentality is if my kid will get an IB diploma, he will go to sophomore. This is what they get about the IB. Nothing about open-mindedness, inquirer... they don’t care about this.”

Many teachers felt parents did not really understand the pedagogical approach of the IB and its focus on process rather than product. While one teacher expressed that some parents were genuinely “really appreciative of the IB curriculum.” A teacher in her group responded, “yeah, but I do think that still a lot of parents, it's like-- I often hear it in history, they’re like, "History is just a story. Memorize it. Get a seven." A third added that “some parents, I would say, don't really understand that it's not only the number of hours you sit at your desk and solve problems, right? It's actually an engagement. A mental engagement.”

One teacher related a conversation she had with a parent who was seeking advice on whether to enroll her daughter in the DP. The parent told her, “let me just put it straightforward to you, if she's not going to get full sevens on everything, I don't want her to.” The teacher explained, “so this is the same Lebanese mentality... they want the students to ace everything.”

This was echoed by a teacher in another group who reflected on how the focus on grades took priority over students’ ambitions. For example, maybe a student “wants to be an artist. He wants to be a car mechanic. He wants to be - I don't know - he wants to be a carpenter. So what? But we don't focus on that. We focus on achievement.”

In another discussion, one teacher noted how this focus on grades had filtered down into the psyche of her students. It’s “not only the parents,” she argued, “the students as well.”

She explained that “you start feeling that what they focus on or what is important for them now is to get a good grade.” This theme was picked up in another group where one teacher shared that “whenever you mention to the students they have an assessment, the first question is: “is it formative or summative? Do I get a grade or not a grade?” A second teacher picked up the thread of the conversation and added, “and their effort shifts depending, “oh it’s formative, whatever. It doesn’t matter”.”

Similarly, one teacher noted that students

are more interested in the outcome, not the process. To make them value the process is what we are all about, not necessarily the outcome. But I think too some of that pressure comes from home and they expect their children that they could all get high grades and go on to be engineers and doctors.

One of the CAS coordinators talked about how the academic focus in the Lebanese context diminished the value of service and CAS. Similarly, regarding the Extended Essay, another of the DP’s core components, one teacher said, “they are doing the EE just for the grades, not because they are interested.”

While most teachers directly attributed this focus on grades to the Lebanese context, a small number of did not necessarily feel that this was specific to the Lebanese context. Rather, they felt, it was a global phenomenon. Said one teacher, “this focus on grades has become really a lot. I’ve been teaching for a long time and I’ve never seen like lately, in the last years, it’s very competitive.”

Another argued that it was the nature of schools to teach students to care about their grades. He explained, “my experience is that kids want to learn, and schools do a really good job about beating it out of them.” He noted that because he taught the DP program, he was teaching students who had spent over 10 years being inculcated into the culture of grades and he didn’t think “that has to do necessarily with Lebanese culture and more with how they’ve been trained.”

*Sciences are valued over the arts.* In addition to valuing product over process, teachers reported that sciences are valued over the arts. “In the Lebanese culture,” stated one of the teachers, “there is a paradigm that, if you're good at math and science, then you could have everything.” Another argued the LB puts a premium on the sciences and that, “you have to do well enough in math and science because you're going to go to college.” All in all, teachers in seven focus groups agreed that science subjects were seen as superior to the arts.

Speaking of her experiences as a parent, one of the teachers described her approach to grades prior to becoming a DP teacher: “all my concerns were “how much did you take in math?” Or in sciences or in physics,” she explained, “because “if you don't take an excellent grade in physics, you are not going to become an engineer.” And it was wrong. Now I'm realizing that what I did with him was wrong.”

Another explained, “it is cultural because we want our kids to be high achievers in the sense that they have to be engineers and doctors and dentists.” Similarly, another participant commented, “the majority of our parents want their children to be lawyers or doctors or businessmen; very few who are just like, "I'd like to be a social worker," or, "I'd like to be a teacher.”

Teachers despaired of this pressure on students with one saying, “sometimes parents are not really realistic.”. She continued to describe how difficult that could be for students who are not able to fulfil these expectations and how these students, “would cry, and then go home without the 90. We face those issues with parents, and that’s really a difference between the culture and IB.”

A theater teacher found that advocating for his subject could sometimes be an uphill battle. He said that he was sometimes questioned about why his students spent so much time doing work for theater. He found that he had to explain to people that it was because theater “has the same coefficient of, with all my respect, math, chemistry, physics, biology, and all

the other courses. And this is the beauty of IB, that every course has the same importance. Now changing the mind-set is something different.”

Teachers questioned this focus on sciences with one making the point that “abroad they do a lot of research about what does the market need. And they do these studies and then the culture would be more accepting of different domains. But here, unfortunately, we don't have such studies.” Another commented, “look around the country. We need people from a humanities background.”

### **Despite its Values of Inclusion, Teachers Recognize that the IB is Academically and Financially Elitist**

Teachers in seven focus groups and both interviews discussed the inconsistency between the IB's inclusive values and the reality that, in Lebanon, it is only accessible to the wealthy.

One teacher stated, “I mean, we can't get away from the fact that the IB is a very elitist program because it's so expensive. I mean, if I tell you how much we pay to the IB every year, it's scary.” Another argued, “we say we're non-selective, but we are selective because of money. I mean, that's our selection tool.”

Even with the recent equivalency, one teacher mentioned that Lebanese students who do not have a second nationality are taking a greater risk if they register for the DP instead of the LB. She explained that, “the way the law is written does not really lend itself to inclusion.” Students who do not fulfil the requirements of the DP, she elaborated, risk leaving school without a degree that is eligible for equivalency by MEHE. Those students who obtain a waiver through their second nationality do not have this same concern because if they do not pass the DP, they can still graduate with their school's completion diploma. One teacher commented that these students “don't have Plan B because, for an American student, holding non-Lebanese passport, he can go Freshman but for Lebanese students, no, they'd have to repeat.

Teachers also recognized that, because of its rigor and university level expectations, the DP was academically elitist. One teacher stated, “I think, one of our greatest challenges is to push everybody up to IB standards when they are coming in from grade 10.” Another explained, “I do understand that the IB is inclusive, but sometimes we misinterpret the word inclusive. Inclusive means it can cater for any student to take the full DP, but it doesn't mean allow any student to take any high-level course that they want, because they have to meet requirement.” Another noted, “I noticed that the IB program is not for all students. If a student wants to succeed in the IB, you must at least have some of the IB profiles like open-minded, risk takers. So it's a tough program.”

### **Summary of the Results**

This section presents an overview of the results presented in this chapter. It was interesting to note that the schools with more experience had a more critical approach to discussing the DP. It was evident from the conversations with less experienced schools that it takes time for teachers to wrap their heads around the intricacies and impacts of the program.

#### **Expectations of DP Teachers.**

The ubiquity of the Learner Profile (LP), international-mindedness (IM) and the Approaches to Teaching (ATT) as pedagogical expectations was evident in the data as groups were practically unanimous in naming them as core to what was expected of them as DP teachers. They also named the pursuit of PD as a professional expectation.

In terms of the Learner Profile, teachers discussed the expectation of nurturing its values in the students through the assignments, resources and topics they chose for their classes. Not only was it widely acknowledged that teaching the LP should be threaded through their teaching, but some teachers noted that they should also be explicitly teaching it to students by directly referencing it in their interactions with students.

There was broad consensus about the expectation to model the Learner Profile with some teachers even talking about the wholesale adoption of them into one's personal value system. Admitting weakness or error, for example, or showing open-mindedness during difficult classroom discussions were popular strategies that teachers felt set positive examples of the Learner Profile traits.

Moving onto the incorporation of international-mindedness into their practice, again teachers were unanimous in the naming of this as an expectation of the IB. International-mindedness as a concept was generally conflated with open-mindedness, being aware of others and tolerance. During their discussions, teachers gave many examples of projects, assignments or resources that they used to promote and model values of international-mindedness.

In terms of the Approaches to Teaching, although very few of the teachers used that term, all groups and both interviewees gave examples of pedagogical strategies expected of them by the IB that aligned with the ATT's individual principles. Highest on the list of mentions was inquiry-based teaching; teachers were very clear that it was a requirement that they use inquiry-based teaching strategies such as independent and experiential learning, connecting to real world situations and acting as facilitators rather than teachers in the traditional sense. Teachers gave specific and varied examples of what that looked like in their subject areas and classrooms as well as noting how the framework of the DP syllabi supports this type of teaching and learning.

The next ATT in terms of mentions was the importance of fostering a collaborative spirit both in the classroom and amongst the staff. This was followed by the expectation to focus on teaching conceptual understanding rather than rote learning of facts. With the fewest mentions, ATT principles linking to local and global contexts, using formative and

summative assessment to inform teaching, and differentiation were barely mentioned across the groups.

The last expectation widely shared by teachers was the expectation that they pursue professional development (PD). Teachers' feelings about their development as a direct result of teaching in the DP, especially through self-initiated learning, was tremendously positive, especially in terms of the impact on their actual pedagogical practice and their general knowledge. As a whole, teachers demonstrated broad understanding and buy-in of the LP, ATT, international-mindedness and PD.

### **Challenges and Incongruences**

Challenges named by teachers fell into three categories. The first is the challenges teachers face in the delivery and implementation of the program because of its size and rigor. The second category is the challenges teachers face as a result of having to compensate for what they saw as the lack of preparedness in the students in taking on a program like the DP. The third category has to do with context-specific challenges teachers face in delivering on the expectations around the teaching of the Learner Profile and international-mindedness.

Challenges around the implementation of the DP centered on the difficulties in finding a balance between teaching the softer skills (LP and IM) while helping students succeed in a very assessment heavy program that, counterintuitively, explicitly rewarded grades while barely acknowledging work around the LP or IM. On one hand, teachers in every discussion despaired of not having enough time to complete the content using inquiry-based teaching methods. On the other, many teachers felt there was a clear conflict between the IB's ideology and the framework of the DP that incentivized teachers and students to sacrifice values-based learning in favor of performance on the assessments.

These challenges were felt to be bolstered by Lebanese culture which teachers feel lionizes academic performance, especially in the sciences. This, teachers felt, put added

pressure on them to deliver grades, even if it came at the expense of using the Approaches to Teaching and the nurturing of the IB's values.

In terms of student challenges, teachers felt that students are overwhelmed by the frequency and number of DP assessments. This, combined with what teachers saw as students' inability to manage themselves, meant teachers were having to work even harder to prepare students for success in the assessments. Teachers also felt that students struggled to think critically or independently, again putting more pressure on teachers to close the gap.

Teachers widely agreed that there were challenges in fulfilling the expectation of teaching international-mindedness and the values of the Learner Profile. There were three widely shared reasons for this; the first was that Lebanese society featured divisions which, by virtue of students' inheritance of family and community biases, perpetuated themselves in the student body. This, teachers felt, is exacerbated by the socioeconomical and cultural homogeneity of the student body because students were not practicing tolerance and open-mindedness in their daily lives. This, teachers felt, makes it harder for them to effectively teach these skills.

The second reason was that broaching controversial or difficult topics, seen as an effective way to teach open-mindedness, is tricky as there were many areas of sensitivity that teachers felt anxious about exploring with students. Local and regional politics were identified as examples of such topics, as was religion. The third reason was the stark differences between the values of the IB and those of the political and corporate infrastructures that students are exposed to. Teachers overwhelmingly felt that it is difficult to convince students to behave ethically when others around them are not and are being rewarded for it.

There was also a clear and widely shared feeling that the academic values of the DP contrasted with the approach of the Lebanese Baccalaureate (LB) which, teachers felt, relied

on rote learning and limited critical engagement with topics especially in history. Teachers did concede the written curricula of the two were similar; however, in what was seen as another example of governmental inadequacy, there was not enough follow up or teacher support to translate the values into the taught curriculum.

## Chapter V

### Discussion, Conclusion and Recommendations

This study aimed to uncover teachers' understandings of the IB's expectations as DP teachers, the challenges they faced in meeting those challenges, and in what ways these challenges are due to incongruences between the core values of the IB and those of the Lebanese context. The research questions are:

From the perspective of DP teachers in Lebanon

1. what are the practices and core values expected of DP teachers based on their understanding of the IB's mission statement, Learner Profile, pedagogical approaches, and DP assessment requirements?
2. what, if any, challenges do DP teachers face in meeting the IB's expectations in the Lebanese context in terms of their understanding of its pedagogical approaches, its requirements when it comes to values-based teaching and preparing students for the DP assessments?
3. in what ways are teachers' challenges due to incongruences between the core values of the IB and those commonly used in the Lebanese context?

Data were collected through the use of focus groups and interviews that included 62 DP teachers from six DP schools around Lebanon. The resulting transcripts were analyzed using thematic analysis to reveal common themes across teachers' experiences and understandings.

This study used Getzel and Guba's (1957) model of schools as social systems to frame the exploration of the gap between the structural expectations of the IB and the roles of the teachers as implementers of the IB's goals. This model sees potential for failure in a system where the implementers are unable to enact the expectations of the structural element

because of a lack of cultural alignment or understanding. Hoy and Miskell (2011) call this lack of alignment structural/cultural incongruences.

So, the objectives of this research study are a) to identify the challenges faced by teachers who are trying to fulfil the IB's expectations of DP teachers in Lebanon, b) to analyze the ways in which these challenges are due to incongruences between the value system of the IB and that of the Lebanese context and c) to make recommendations that support teachers effectively implement the DP by taking context-specific incongruences into consideration. Ideally this can help school leaders better support teachers who are transitioning to, or already teaching, the program.

While the previous chapter presented the teachers' perspectives, this chapter will consider the implications of their answers and discuss them in light of the literature presented in chapter 2. It will begin with a discussion of the results after which recommendations for practice and further research will be presented.

## **Discussion**

In the focus groups and interviews, teachers were asked what the IB's expectations were of them as DP educators. During the discussions, they were prompted to consider the IB's mission statement, the Learner Profile, the DP assessments and the IB's core values.

Teachers were encouraged to use examples to describe how they met these expectations through their practice and in their interactions with students. Teachers spoke fluently about their experiences and understandings indicating that they feel confident in their knowledge of the IB's benchmarks for them. Their answers were remarkably uniform across the focus groups and interviews suggesting that there is a clear set of shared understandings of the IB and the DP framework.

This speaks to the effectiveness of the IB's onboarding and training of DP teachers as well as the clarity of its documentation. It also reflects the shared nature of the teachers'

experiences with and interpretations of its key terms and ideas. This implies that teachers are collaborating with one another and engaging with the DP framework as collectives within their schools as opposed to working separately, each struggling to make meaning on her own.

Once teachers had spoken about the IB's expectations of them, they were asked about the challenge they faced in fulfilling them. Teachers spoke at length about difficulties they were experiencing and, again, there were strong themes connecting the different groups.

The following section will compare the teachers' understandings of the IB's expectations with the expectations uncovered in both the IB documentation and the literature that studies it. After that, the teachers' challenges will be analyzed in light of the literature around the IB and the Lebanese educational landscape.

### **Teachers' Understandings of the IB's Expectations**

Teachers' identification of using the Approaches to Teaching (ATT) as well as teaching the Learner Profile (LP) and international-mindedness (IM) as core to the IB's expectations of them is very much in line with the implicit and explicit messaging in the IB and DP documentation (Bergeron & Dean, 2013; IB, n.d.-f).

In line with comments made by Lineham (2013) and the language in the IB's documentation (IB, n.d.-f), teachers felt strongly that it was their responsibility to teach students values, not simply content. Their conversations demonstrate an awareness that the DP, in addition to being academically rigorous, aims to nurture global citizens and promote peace. This finding shows teachers' understandings of the IB's core values are consistent with the descriptions of the IB's ideological foundations as set forward by key IB figures such as Peterson (1972), Hill and Saxton (2014) and researchers who have studied the IB such as Hayden (2006) and Lineham (2013).

Although neither the IB nor the literature at large delineates exactly what international-mindedness is (Bunnell, 2008; Hayden & Wong, 1997; Kidson, Odhiambo &

Wilson, 2018; Lineham, 2013; Poonosamy, 2016), participants spoke of it as meaning open-mindedness, awareness of the outside world and tolerance. This aligns with the IB's Principles into Practices document which describes it as "an attitude of openness to, and curiosity about, the world and different cultures" (IB, 2015a, p. 6).

That teachers were able to give specific examples of how they incorporated teaching the Learner Profile and international-mindedness into their subject areas reflects the thought they put into their practice and the seriousness with which they see their role as deliverers of values-based education. As asked of them by the IB (IB, 2015a; Lepine, 2006), teachers are making use of opportunities in the syllabi to weave in resources and classroom activities that encourage the productive and open-minded debate of different viewpoints and perspectives. Participant discussions around the importance of modeling and even adopting the values of the LP and IM suggest that teachers are highly bought into the IB's ideology.

While teachers were very much in step with the literature in their discussions of the IB's core values from an ideological perspective, what teachers did not mention was the other more transactional purpose behind the founding of the DP. Only one teacher referred to the IB's leadership as making decisions that were based on financial rather than altruistic motives. This could suggest that teachers are so bought into the IB's ideology that they take for granted that these same values dictate the IB's behavior as a global organization.

In terms of the Approaches to Teaching, teachers are very much aware that the IB expects them to use specific pedagogical strategies. However, teachers spoke of the principles as discrete strategies with very few teachers actually using the title 'ATT', nor any other collective term to refer to them. This suggests that teachers do not have the same level of familiarity with the ATT as an organizing concept as they do with the Learner Profile.

Additionally, certain principles from the ATT's six principles had more brand awareness among the teachers than others indicating varying degrees of comfort or

understanding. For example, despite formative and summative assessment being an explicitly stated pedagogical principle (IB, 2015a) and the assessment-heavy nature of the course, very few teachers mentioned the expectation that they use assessment to help guide their planning. Given the frequency and number of assessments in the DP as well as the teachers' conversations about teaching to the test, it is unlikely that they are not complying with this principle. Instead, it is more likely that they are not as knowledgeable about the specifics of the ATT as the Learner Profile.

Similarly, only one teacher out of 62 mentioned differentiation. When taken with teachers feeling short for time, it is possible differentiation is falling by the wayside or teachers may be feeling ill-equipped to deal with it. Taking into consideration the still growing recognition of learning needs in Lebanon, this could also reflect a societal or cultural lack of familiarity with learning differences.

To conclude this section, teachers exhibited a strong understanding of the IB's ideology and pedagogical approach. There were very few gaps in their identification of the expectations, especially in terms of the Learner Profile and international-mindedness. However, there was uneven recognition of the different principles that make up the Approaches to Teaching.

### **Challenges Faced by Teachers and the Incongruences They Attribute Them to**

This section will focus on the challenges discussed by teachers in light of the literature on the IB and on education in the Lebanese context. While some of the challenges can be attributed to a lack of congruence between the values of the IB and those practiced in the Lebanese context, there are also clear threads across the groups which point to an additional incongruence between the IB's value-system and the realities of teaching the DP as a framework.

This finding was particularly interesting because many studies conducted in non-Western contexts attribute challenges in DP implementation to a lack of structural/cultural alignment between the IB and the local context's approach to education. In this case, the findings suggest that there is also a structural/cultural conflict within the IB itself in terms of aligning its values with the academically rigorous and assessment heavy DP.

Beyond the identification of expectations, the depth of the conversations varied based on the years of experience the teaching staff had with the DP. In discussions with schools that were relatively new to the DP, teachers needed more probing and direct questioning when it came to discussing challenges. In direct contrast, groups that had more years of experience teaching the DP were very reflective in their conversations and brought up specific issues accompanied by anecdotal examples from their own experiences. This is indicative of the complexity of the program and the time it takes for teacher to get a really in-depth understanding of it and its implications on their practice, themselves as professionals and their students. It also echoes findings by Taylor (2019) whose participants mentioned that they did not feel confident within the program until they had been teaching it for at least two years.

***Challenges due to incongruences between the value system of the IB and that of the Lebanese context.*** Interestingly, of the challenges named by teachers as being due to incongruences between the value system of the IB and that of the Lebanese context, some matched the literature's findings while others seem to be exclusive to the Lebanese context.

This section will present those challenges that arise from a lack of congruence between the values of the IB and those of the Lebanese context in the following order: a) the difficulty of addressing existing social divisions in the wider society because of a lack of regular exposure to other viewpoints and perspectives, b) navigating local sensitivities while trying to teach the LP and IM, c) the struggle of teaching the values of the LP and IM in the

face of behavior outside of the school walls and d) traditional educational and cultural parenting styles contributing to students' struggles with critical thinking and the independence expected of them by the IB.

*The difficulty of addressing existing social divisions in the wider society because of a lack of regular exposure to other viewpoints and perspectives.* Teachers found that students, and Lebanese society at large, was fragmented with minimal interaction happening across socioeconomic and cultural lines. Teachers talked about the reasons for this cultural phenomenon in different ways but it was generally felt that there was segregation, either socioeconomically or based on ethnicity, in Lebanese society that filtered down to the students and was at odds with the IB values of open-mindedness and tolerance. This incongruence, coupled with student bodies that are socioeconomically and culturally homogenous, makes teachers' attempts at fulfilling the IB's expectations around producing internationally-minded, tolerant students more challenging.

In terms of students absorbing the values of cultural or sectarian division, teachers spoke of the influence of family and community in coloring the opinions, and biases, of their students. This supports Shuayb's (2011) comments about children inheriting the residual grievances of the Civil War from their communities. The perpetuation of these divisions appears more pronounced in DP schools that operate in areas that are homogenous in terms of religion. Despite the curriculum, teachers are still bound by the politics of their environments – even if these politics counter the inclusive ethos of the IB. This was particularly evident in the comments of a CAS coordinator who discussed the difficulties she faced in creating community service activities that involved people of other religions or nationalities.

Several teachers also spoke of the racism they felt to be evident in Lebanese society and how that impacted their ability to prepare students for a global world. Although teachers feel confident that they are able to make progress with their students, because of students'

lack of regular exposure to others, it is not an easy task. These findings support the results of studies that suggest that diversity in the school ecosystem is more important to the development of international-mindedness than the curriculum (Belal, 2017; Doherty, 2009; Halicioglu, 2008; Hayden & Wong, 1997; Kanan & Baker, 2006; Lineham, 2013).

It is worth noting that the majority of schools have a fairly homogenous teaching staff as well as a homogenous student body. Because of the expense of overseas IB workshops, teachers themselves may be losing out on the benefits of negotiating key IB ideas and concepts and debating educational practices with people from other cultures and backgrounds. Similarly to the students, if teachers are not practicing the cultural negotiation required in diverse workplaces on a day to day basis, they too may be at a disadvantage when trying to deliver learning experiences that promote international and open-mindedness that have the depth expected by the IB.

In terms of socioeconomic divisions, similarly to other non-Western nations such as Mauritius, Argentina, Chile and the Gulf (Bunnell 2008; Bunnell, 2016; Kidson et al., 2018; Poonoosamy, 2010; Resnik, 2016), DP schools in Lebanon cater to the wealthy (Bunell, 2009). Studies such as Resnik's (2009) and Gardner-McTaggart's (2016) suggest that the growth of IB schools risks the reproduction of social class specifically because they cater to a wealthier subsection of society and, according to Resnik (2009) equip their students with skills that make them better suited for the job market than their peers in non-DP schools.

Because of the misdistribution of wealth and the recent ratification of the DP/LB equivalence, currently the only barrier to entry to a DP school in Lebanon is financial. Considering this, there is no reason to disagree with the notion that the DP in Lebanon would encourage a similar style of class reproduction. Although this is clearly problematic, it is not something new, but rather an exacerbation of what has been found to be Lebanon's existing

issues with the crystallization and perpetuation of socioeconomic division through the educational infrastructure (Baytiyeh, 2017; Shuayb, 2011).

However, although some teachers did acknowledge the elitism and cost of the program, none made the connection to how this would play out in terms of reducing social mobility nor in terms of channeling class reproduction through schools. They also did not comment on, as suggested by Resnik's (2009) study, that DP students were being given a set of skills that would give them more access to jobs in and outside of Lebanon than their non-DP or public-school peers.

This exclusivity runs counter to the IB's ethos which encourages integration and inclusivity. Although this particular division is socioeconomic rather than cultural, it is still a form of segregation especially in Lebanon, where there is a clear deficit in the access to quality education for those not part of the wealthy classes (CERD, 2018).

Although the teachers did not go so far as to be critical about the IB's role in perpetuating socioeconomic division, they were very concerned about students living, as so many of them phrased it, "in a bubble." Teachers felt this had a huge impact on the students' abilities to connect with those less fortunate than them and a lack of motivation to question or understand the structures that result in poverty or oppression. This attitude of apathy towards those less fortunate, some teachers felt came from students' home environments and communities. This incongruence also means that teachers have to work harder to encourage students to understand and empathize with the experiences of others.

Despite concerns about the preservation of local culture put forward in the literature (Azzi, 2018; Paris, 2003), teachers did not feel they were unable to strike a balance between incorporation of non-local resources and preserving students' knowledge of local culture. Nor did they show any concern of the Western bias the IB's critics claim is encouraged by the framework (Bunnell, 2015; Drake, 2004; Hahn, 2003; Paris, 2003; Poonoosamy, 2016).

However, as pointed out by Hughes (2009) and Poonoosamy (2010; 2016), the power dynamics that exist in post-colonial contexts can be replicated through education systems and that should be considered carefully when looking at the implementation of non-national curricula. As only two teachers out of 62 mentioned that their classroom resources and the DP exams are skewed towards Western understandings, this could imply that, since most teachers did not see an issue in the incorporation of local content, they may be exhibiting an unconscious bias allocating value to Western resources, ideas and debates.

This would explain the discrepancy between this study's findings and Azzi's (2018) case study of a DP school in Lebanon where students felt that teachers were over-representing American resources at the expense of Lebanese ones and teachers were struggling to incorporate more local content. Alternatively, as both teachers were English language A instructors, it might point to different subjects causing teachers varying degrees of difficulty when it comes to diversifying their content to include both local and international resources effectively.

Additionally, this could play into a larger theme of teachers' unquestioning positivity around the IB. There was a definite tendency to blame elements of the Lebanese context for any incongruences between the DP and the Lebanese context. This implies that many teachers see the IB's values as superior to those of the Lebanese context. This rose-colored-glasses perspective of the IB could also go some way in explaining teachers' beliefs that the implementation of the DP could have a positive impact on Lebanon both as a model to be aspired to and as a value system to teach their students. It is important to note that some teachers were explicitly positive about Lebanese culture so the over-appreciation of the IB may be indicative of teachers' frustration with elements of corruption in the Lebanese context and the extent to which this frustration is impacting their views on how its values measure up to those of the IB.

*Navigating local sensitivities while trying to teach the LP and IM.* The vague wording of the Lebanese Constitution around schools not affecting “the dignity of any of the religions or sects” (Lebanese Republic, 1995) goes a long way in explaining the anxiety exhibited by the teachers around navigating local sensitivities as they teach international and open-mindedness.

So, although IB schools are meant to transcend national narratives and issues, this particular amendment counters this ethos and is an apt symbol for how differences of opinion are sometimes dealt with in the Lebanese context and why these conversations can be so fraught with difficulty for both teachers and students. It also explains why this theme came up so clearly in this study but did not feature in any of the literature currently available on the implementation of the DP.

Research done in schools in Lebanon reveals that this is a common experience. Akar’s research on citizenship education revealed that teachers rely on “didactic pedagogies” and show “resistance towards classroom discussions so as to avoid conflicts with and among students” (2017, p. 555). Similarly, van Ommering (2015) found that teachers avoided controversial topics entirely in order to avoid courting controversy. So, it is not surprising that this same challenge would exist in the DP classroom.

Nonetheless, the sense of responsibility that the teachers have and their belief in the values of the IB is clearly pushing them to test their limits and those of their students. Those teachers who, despite misgivings and fears, push themselves to challenge students on their opinions on regional and local politics are, by the same token, also actively pushing themselves to think beyond the boundaries of their own biases. This is very much an example of teachers ‘walking the walk’ as they incorporate and model the LP and IM while challenging themselves in the same way that they challenge their students. It is also an

example of teachers actively bridging the incongruence between the values of the IB and the realities on the ground.

*The struggle of teaching the values of the LP and IM in the face of behavior outside of the school walls.* Teachers despaired of the incongruity resulting from the example being set for students in the world outside the schools, especially by politicians, and how that countered the values they were trying to teach. Their complaints about the lack of progress in educational reform are confirmed by the very real and very evident lack of reform in the education sector resulting from the placing of political agendas ahead of progress (Daher, 2012; Frayha, 2012; Shuayb, 2019; van Ommering, 2015).

It would be remiss not to note that this particular finding, although framed as being unique to Lebanon, is probably not. Both divisive political rhetoric and corporate practices that prioritize profit over principles are evident around the world and are clearly at odds with the values put forward by the IB. As a result, it is likely that this finding would probably be replicated in many contexts, albeit each with its own nuances and colors.

Nonetheless, as teachers are trying to instill the values of the Learner Profile in the students, they feel that the infighting, corruption and agenda chasing of those in power is actively working against what they are trying to do in their classrooms. This finding is not unique to DP schools and is in line with a study conducted by Akar (2017) which found that students are skeptical of the values they are being taught in their Lebanese civics class while being faced with a reality that endorses the opposite.

This incongruence between the values of the IB and the ways in which policy, governance and business is practiced in Lebanon is challenging for teachers. However, in addition to this incongruence, it is also worth talking about a related IB expectation that was not discussed at length in the focus groups: that of the whole school community modeling and endorsing its values. For example, while teachers did speak about school wide projects

such as recycling, nobody brought up whether the IB values are reflected in their wider communities. This could include, for example, treatment and pay of the custodial staff at their school or in their homes. In a context like Lebanon, which has faced widespread criticism for its Kefala system of sponsorship, which excludes certain jobs from the labor laws, there are opportunities for schools to create learning experiences for students by addressing these issues and setting positive examples around it.

The same could be said for how schools are treating other vulnerable minority groups such as supporting and protecting their LGBTQ communities; this was only brought up by one school. So, although teachers are clearly working hard to push back against many of the societal values they see as problematic, there is always the case to be made that teachers are unconsciously drawing a line between what they feel is ‘too far’ in terms of courting controversy in their ecosystems. Alternatively, this could indicate an unconsciously selective application of these values.

*Traditional educational and cultural parenting styles contribute to students’ struggles with the critical thinking and independence expected of them by the IB.* Teachers’ identification of teaching students critical thinking as a struggle mirrored the experiences of students in China (Gan, 2009), Turkey (Halicioglu, 2008) and Ecuador (Barnett, 2013). On the one hand, this is not surprising considering that the Lebanese Baccalaureate (LB) employs more traditional pedagogies that rely on rote learning and teacher-centered instructional strategies (Hilal, 2018; Jbara, 2008). On the other hand, this finding could also reflect that teachers who have come to their educational practice through a more traditional experience of learning may themselves be transitioning to and experimenting with strategies that are still relatively new to them.

The specific complaints of teachers with regards to students’ inability to be independent or manage their time was not mentioned in the literature. However, when taken

into consideration with comments from teachers about the collectivist leanings of parenting in Lebanon and the lack of independence expected from teenagers in this context, this does appear to result from a structural/cultural incongruence between the IB and the Lebanese context in terms of expectations around adolescent independence.

***Challenges due to incongruences between the IB and its DP program.*** Certain challenges identified by teachers can be attributed to an incongruence between the values of the IB and the DP framework itself. The core discrepancy here is that the DP is simply too assessment-heavy, too high stakes and too academically rigorous for it to truly be a values-based curriculum that relies entirely on student-centered pedagogies – especially as it ultimately assesses students for content and skills and does not allocate grades for values-based activities.

Incongruences named by teachers were a) the lack of time to complete the program and prepare students for the assessments while still fulfilling the expectations of the IM, LP and ATT and b) although teachers were extremely positive about their growth in the program, the workload is seen as hindering their ability to fulfil the expectations of the IB.

*The lack of time to complete the program and prepare students for the assessments while still fulfilling the expectations of the IM, LP and ATT is challenging.* Although teaching in the Lebanese Baccalaureate (LB) has been found to lack the promotion of critical thinking skills (Hilal, 2018; Jabbour, 2014; Jbara 2008), there is a parallel to be made with the DP.

Teachers were clear in their feelings that the goals of the LB curriculum were very similar to those of the DP, however a lack of training and support for LB teachers coupled with the LB assessment style is resulting in the continued use of traditional pedagogies. This is confirmed by studies conducted by Hilal (2018) and Jbara (2008).

Similarly to their descriptions of the LB, the DP teachers felt it is also very difficult to consistently incorporate inquiry based, student centered teaching because of the amount of

content that the syllabi dictated they get through and the pressure to help students get high grades which resulted in teachers teaching to the test.

This is not a surprising finding as the IB itself does recognize the challenge of balancing inquiry-based teaching with covering the content in the different subject areas (2015a). As a result, this incongruence comes in the form of heavy workloads and limited time to deliver the content of their syllabi, resulting in teachers sacrificing the pedagogical strategies expected by the IB in favor of faster, teacher-directed instruction that cater to the tests rather than the process of learning.

This is matched by similar findings by Taylor (2019) whose participants claimed unanimously that they did not have enough time to complete the course content and Dulfer (2019) who found that the lack of time could be hindering teachers' abilities to consistently provide student-centered learning experiences.

*Although teachers were extremely positive about their growth in the program, the workload is seen as hindering their ability to fulfil the expectations of the IB.* Although many studies in the literature referenced the increased workload of the DP, teachers in this study were the only ones to specifically frame this as an incongruence between the IB's values and the DP framework.

However, as mentioned earlier, teachers remained extremely pleased with the program and its impact on their growth as educators. The teachers' positivity about the DP is not anomalous. Similarly to studies conducted in Costa Rica (Mukherjee, 2018), Ecuador (Barnett, 2013), Macao, Malaysia, Qatar and Turkey (Taylor, 2019) and the US (Cook, 2017), teachers in this study lauded the DP's impact on their practice and growth despite the increased workload and stress.

Teachers were so enthusiastic about their growth, that many of them have adopted 'DP-style' teaching in their non-IB classes. Taken with their descriptions about the progress

they had experienced, the implication was that they now were in possession of a superior skill set. This reflects findings by Barnett (2013), Cook (2017) and Mukherjee (2018) who found that DP teachers in Ecuador, California and Costa Rica are also incorporating the IB's pedagogies to use in their non-IB classes based on a sense of the IB's pedagogies are better. This finding does speak to concerns by critics that the implementation of the DP could result in the replacement of indigenous teaching traditions, models of thought and knowledge systems (Hughes, 2009; Paris, 2003; Poonoosamy, 2010; Van Oord, 2007).

While the adoption of the DP-style pedagogies into non-DP classrooms could indicate the replacement of the more traditional practices associated with the LB, it can also be argued that the LB's written curriculum would be better served by the IB teaching practices. After all, the IB's ATT are essentially a match for CERD's (2018) recommendations for teacher development which include training for more effective questioning techniques, integrating real-life, problem solving and conceptual exercises and using student-centered instructional strategies to encourage higher level thinking skills.

Not to be forgotten is that both the DP and the LB owe at least part of their framework and ideology to the French Baccalaureate and Lebanon, as a post-colonial context, has arguably lost its indigenous teaching practices at some point in the ether of its colonial past. So, contrary to the concerns put forward in the literature, the replacement of traditional teaching practices in the Lebanese classroom may actually be helpful in light of the ever delayed, but always expected, reform of the educational system in Lebanon.

In sum, findings show that teachers have a strong understanding of the IB's core expectations of DP teachers in terms of the values communicated in its mission statement, its Learner Profile, the concept of international-mindedness and its Approaches to Teaching. However, although teachers show an awareness of all these expectations, they showed varying degrees of familiarity with them.

For example, teachers were extremely confident in discussions around the modeling and incorporation of both the Learner Profile and international-mindedness. However, when it came to the Approaches to Teaching, teachers spoke at length about inquiry-based teaching strategies but very little about differentiation or using formative and summative assessment data to guide their practice.

When it came to the challenges they faced in fulfilling these expectations, teachers' discussions centered around two types of incongruences. One was an incongruence that reflected a lack of alignment between the values of the IB and those of the Lebanese context. The second was a lack of alignment, or incongruence, between the values of the IB and the realities of teaching the DP curriculum. Both of these incongruences are hindering teachers' abilities to fulfil the expectations of the IB in terms of the Learner Profile, international-mindedness and teaching according to the principles of the Approaches to Teaching.

Incongruences between the values of the IB and the DP framework itself came down to the IB's aspirations of values-based, student-centered teaching and the realities of teaching the DP: a rigorous, assessment-heavy program. These incongruences were matched by findings in the literature that found that teachers around the world struggle with the amount of content they have to cover in the two-year program and the amount of work required to teach and plan for it. As with teachers in Lebanon, these teachers struggle to consistently deliver inquiry-based and student-centered teaching. This study will take into consideration the recommendations made by researchers of DP implementation in other contexts that address these same challenges.

Incongruences between the values of the IB and the Lebanese context created challenges linked to the teaching of international mindedness and the values of the Learner Profile. The primary incongruence was the widely shared notion that the ethical framework endorsed by the IB was not supported by the behavior students are exposed to outside the

school walls. This challenged teachers' abilities to teach the values of the Learner Profile as students found it difficult to understand why they should behave ethically when others weren't.

Concerns about how existing divisions in Lebanese society were seeping into the classroom and making it more difficult to meet the IB's expectations of neutrality were very evident. While the teachers were clearly frustrated by this and believed in the values of the IB, there was very little discussion about what was being done on a school level to ensure that all members of the school community behaved and were treated in line with the IB's values.

A third incongruence about the struggles of teaching adolescents to think critically and independently mirrors studies already done in Lebanon around the educational practices of the Lebanese Baccalaureate. However, it is difficult to gauge the extent to which, as teachers say, this is the result of a collectivist culture that is protective of its children. Alternatively, it is important to remember that the DP is still a relatively new program in Lebanon. So, the challenge of teaching students to think critically and independently could also be the result of teachers transitioning to a new style of teaching that they are still gaining expertise in.

### **Conclusion**

This study aimed to uncover the challenges being faced by DP teachers in fulfilling the expectations set for them by the IB and understand whether any of these challenges can be attributed to a structural/cultural incongruence between the values of the IB and those of the Lebanese context. Interestingly, in addition to incongruences between the IB and Lebanese context, the findings of this study also revealed some incongruences in terms of the feasibility of implementing the DP framework in the allocated time frame, according to the IB's expectations.

This study revealed nothing new about teaching in the Lebanese context that existing studies have not already found. Taken with Shuayb's (2019) conclusion that policy makers are not consistent enough with relying on research to shape policy, and Karami-Akkary and Rizk's finding (2011) that the challenges of teachers in the Middle East continue to be ignored by policy makers who treat them as "mere executors of... top-down directives" (p. 19), it is not surprising that there have been no substantial changes to the experiences of teachers.

Nonetheless, the Lebanon-specific challenges reveal certain gaps, or incongruences, that can be addressed in order to support teachers' successful teaching of the DP while also catering to the realities of the Lebanese context. Many of these gaps can be filled quite easily and because of the completeness of the IB's resources, syllabi and training library as well as the overlaps between the goals of the DP and those of the written LB curriculum, there is scope to argue that the IB would be a good fit for Lebanon. This statement is made with some trepidation however because anything less than an implementation that allows equal access to the program for all students and teachers, regardless of socioeconomic class, would certainly contribute to the existing perpetuation of socioeconomic division that exists in the Lebanese educational structure.

On the other hand, some of the challenges involve deep-set and difficult societal issues and call into question the IB's claim of seamless integration across contexts. The problem with the IB's claim lies in the notion that all that is needed for the DP framework to be translated across contexts is for teachers to take advantage of the flexibility of the program and incorporate local material, ideas and knowledge systems. This is a problematic notion because it presupposes that every context has its cultural heritage, educational practices and knowledge systems neatly packed up into systems that can be plugged and played at will. This is a massive oversimplification of contexts like Lebanon that are not only non-Western

but also post-colonial, post-conflict and extremely complicated in terms of the narratives that define them.

So, while there are clear incongruences between the IB and the Lebanese context, there is also an incongruence between the IB's claims of selling a program that "explores and legitimizes non-western modes of expression and thought" (Hill, 2006, p. 107) and the assumption that all contexts are explorable and can be legitimized through the simple incorporation of a few educational resources. This is, in effect, not aligned with the IB's own values of inclusivity and understanding the perspectives of others.

Nonetheless, teachers are extraordinarily positive about the program and saw it as a step up for them and for Lebanon. The way teachers spoke about the program made it clear that they were not necessarily trying to prepare the students for life in Lebanon but instead, trying to prepare their students to change Lebanon. The idealism exhibited by the teachers about the DP parallels that of the founders of the IB. In as much as the architects of the DP were idealistic about its potential to catalyze change in the world, so too are many of our teachers.

Although this study reveals differences between the two value systems, participants saw these incongruences as a roadmap for improvement in Lebanon which implies that teachers think that it is the Lebanese context which should change to reflect the IB, not the other way around. However, this does not mean that teachers do not, or any implementation of the DP in Lebanon should not, value and incorporate the many positive elements of the Lebanese context. This would result in a more nuanced, context-appropriate application of the DP in this context. This especially applies to Lebanese values which are not explicitly identified in the IB's value system but very much speak to its ethos of tolerance, acceptance and being a productive citizen of a society. These include things like Middle Eastern notions

of hospitality, the support of collectively inclined communities and the rich cultural history of Lebanon.

### **Recommendations for Practice**

Karami-Akkary (2014) reminds us of the importance of critically assessing non-national educational ideas and curricula when considering their implementation and Drake (2004) advises school leaders and policy makers to be “fully aware of the challenges posed to their current paradigms from any attempt to simply clone IB programmes and methodologies and apply them to different cultural contexts" (p. 194).

This study looked at the ways in which the values of the IB and its DP program are, or are not, aligned with those of the Lebanese context in order to consider how to best support teachers in their implementation of the program and take into consideration the unique features of Lebanon’s societal and educational landscape. Based on Karami-Akkary and Rizk’s (2011) recommendation that successful reform must include teacher input and the training of teachers to build their capacity in the target skills and competencies, this section will identify recommendations based on teachers’ experiences with trying to fulfil the expectations of the IB.

The following recommendations are aimed at providing teachers with professional development aimed towards building capacity and closing the gaps revealed in this study. Firstly, training for teachers in the facilitation of difficult discussions. This is linked to their challenges around navigating local sensitivities in the classroom. As suggested by Van Ommering (2015), this will support the effective teaching of international mindedness in a fragmented societal landscape where IB values are not reinforced outside the school.

This links to the second recommendation which is supporting the growth of international-mindedness within teaching staff. In order to combat any stagnancy resulting from the homogeneity of schools in the Lebanese context, it is recommended that teachers be

provided with professional development that puts them in touch with teachers from other cultures and countries. As out of country IB training workshops are very expensive, an alternative would be to create professional networks for teachers with sister schools in other countries. Another option would be supporting teachers in joining or using cross-cultural and education-focused social media networks.

Thirdly, context-specific workshops around the ATT and LP. Based on the results of this study, ATT principles with lower brand awareness like differentiation and using summative and formative data to guide teaching should be considered priorities in terms of teacher training. In terms of the LP, context-specific training will allow teachers should negotiate the practical meanings of the different values. For example, what does ‘tolerance’ look like in the Lebanese context? Coming to context specific understandings of the values of the LP will give teachers the confidence, and schools the coherence, when it comes to delivering on the teaching of the DP’s values-based framework.

Fourthly, Lebanon can take its cues from Turkey which offers annual ‘IB days’ with workshops offered in both English and Turkish (Halicioglu, 2008), and Ecuador (Barnett, 2013) where teachers were provided with IB training that specifically addressed their needs. This is especially useful considering the unpredictability of the availability of Arabic language workshops (IB, n.d.-h) and the opportunity to support teacher in sharing context-specific best practices around teaching the DP. Additionally, regular IB days organized by a rotating roster of schools would provide an excellent opportunity to create PD networks across the DP schools in Lebanon.

Lastly, schools should ensure that all teachers, especially those that new to the DP, are paired with a mentor teacher to help support their transition. As all schools are required to provide their teachers with a minimum amount of DP workshops, this option will supplement IB provided workshops with ongoing collaborative work with a more experienced teacher.

These training options provide schools with in and out of country professional development for their teachers that is both ongoing and can be dictated by teacher needs. Taylor (2019) found that ongoing training, access to collaborative groups with other DP teachers and mentorship was helpful for teachers' success, boding well for these strategies.

The value of using the DP framework for teacher training can be seen through the completeness of what it offers schools. Its teacher onboarding and training framework includes resources, training, highly prescribed teaching methods and syllabi. If thoughtfully incorporated into a school's PD system, it can be a valuable, cost-effective resource for empowering teachers to take ownership of their own training and fulfil their own needs.

In addition to teacher training, there are strategies involving other school stakeholders that will help with the implementation of the DP. The first is pre-DP training for students. Barnett (2013) found that teachers in Ecuador were incorporating pre-DP training for students to help ease their transition; this would alleviate some of the pressure on teachers who are struggling to bring students up to the required standards of independence and critical thought. Some teachers in this study have already been doing something along these lines on an informal basis; however, it is recommended that schools do this formally. Options used in Barnett's study are either a modified grade 10 curriculum, incorporating more activities aligned with DP pedagogies into younger grades and providing students and parents with more information about the DP. In addition to skills related to creative and critical thinking, based on the results of this study, it is recommended that students also be taught time and self-management more explicitly as part of this pre-DP training.

The second is, as recommended by Cook (2017), educating the whole school community about the DP so that all are aware of the goals and expectations of the program. This would help schools communicate with parents and other stakeholders about the role of the LP and the importance of the values of international-mindedness. It could also ensure that

all members of the schools be included in delivering and expecting treatment based on these values.

### **Recommendations for Research**

Recommendations for further research branch out in two different directions. The first is taking a closer look at whether teachers in different contexts and cultures are facing similar challenges in teaching the DP because of the incongruence between the IB's values and the nature of the DP program. Based on research done thus far, it seems as though the argument can be made that the IB could take a closer look at its programming of the DP and the extent to which the IB's values are being sacrificed at the altar of academic rigor.

The second is linked to findings of this study which suggest that the IB's claims that the DP can travel seamlessly across contexts. Based on this study, this claim is an oversimplification of a complex context like Lebanon. More work should be done in post-colonial contexts or contexts where the national identity and core infrastructures are in flux to ascertain whether there are commonalities with Lebanon.

It would also be interesting to compare teachers' experiences with the program with those of students in terms of the challenges they are facing. Now that the equivalency is in effect, further research on students' experiences of juggling the DP with the LB required courses will also be a good next step for DP-related research.

As mentioned in the limitations, this study did not parse teachers based on their cultural or academic backgrounds. A future study comparing the experiences of teachers with different backgrounds would certainly be valuable in furthering the understanding of the differences in the cultural/structural incongruences felt by teachers with different academic and cultural experiences.

## **Reflections on the Research**

I came into this research interested in exploring what teaching a Western curriculum like the DP might look like in a non-Western context like Lebanon. I thought that the lack of cultural alignment between a Western program and a non-Western context would result in areas of friction and difficulty for its teachers.

However, as I began learning more about teachers' experiences around the world and analyzing my own data, it became clear that my initial assumptions about the DP were wrong. I was surprised to discover the common threads of teachers' experiences across the world; in both Western and non-Western contexts. Teachers across the world appear to be sharing similar concerns about teaching the DP in their contexts but also similar appreciation for what they believe it brings to their practice. Teachers in Malaysia and Qatar were reporting similar experiences as teachers in the US which mirrored many of the experiences of my own participants. So, where did this put me?

Yes, teachers were and are facing challenges, but these challenges are not necessarily linked to Western curricula and non-Western contexts. Rather, they are more a function of the global educational industrial complex in general as well as the logistics of fulfilling teaching expectations that are specific to the DP regardless of context.

Once this became clear, I had to reconsider my initial ideas and allow for the data to reshape my understanding of and approach to studying the role the DP can play in different contexts. While this is a natural part of the research process, it played an important role in shaping both the development of this study and the lens through which I analyzed and presented the data.

## APPENDIX A

### THE IB LEARNER PROFILE

# IB learner profile

The aim of all IB programmes is to develop internationally minded people who, recognizing their common humanity and shared guardianship of the planet, help to create a better and more peaceful world.

As IB learners we strive to be:

#### **INQUIRERS**

We nurture our curiosity, developing skills for inquiry and research. We know how to learn independently and with others. We learn with enthusiasm and sustain our love of learning throughout life.

#### **KNOWLEDGEABLE**

We develop and use conceptual understanding, exploring knowledge across a range of disciplines. We engage with issues and ideas that have local and global significance.

#### **THINKERS**

We use critical and creative thinking skills to analyse and take responsible action on complex problems. We exercise initiative in making reasoned, ethical decisions.

#### **COMMUNICATORS**

We express ourselves confidently and creatively in more than one language and in many ways. We collaborate effectively, listening carefully to the perspectives of other individuals and groups.

#### **PRINCIPLED**

We act with integrity and honesty, with a strong sense of fairness and justice, and with respect for the dignity and rights of people everywhere. We take responsibility for our actions and their consequences.

#### **OPEN-MINDED**

We critically appreciate our own cultures and personal histories, as well as the values and traditions of others. We seek and evaluate a range of points of view, and we are willing to grow from the experience.

#### **CARING**

We show empathy, compassion and respect. We have a commitment to service, and we act to make a positive difference in the lives of others and in the world around us.

#### **RISK-TAKERS**

We approach uncertainty with forethought and determination; we work independently and cooperatively to explore new ideas and innovative strategies. We are resourceful and resilient in the face of challenges and change.

#### **BALANCED**

We understand the importance of balancing different aspects of our lives—intellectual, physical, and emotional—to achieve well-being for ourselves and others. We recognize our interdependence with other people and with the world in which we live.

#### **REFLECTIVE**

We thoughtfully consider the world and our own ideas and experience. We work to understand our strengths and weaknesses in order to support our learning and personal development.

The IB learner profile represents 10 attributes valued by IB World Schools. We believe these attributes, and others like them, can help individuals and groups become responsible members of local, national and global communities.

(IB, 2014b, p. 5)

## APPENDIX B

### LIST OF DP SCHOOLS IN LEBANON

<u>School</u>	<u>Date of DP Accreditation</u>	<u>Location</u>
American Community School (ACS)	1995	Hamra
Sagesse High School	1995	Metn
International College (IC)	2001	Hamra
German International School	2004	Dora
Antonine International School	2010	Ajaltoun
Wellspring Learning Community	2014	Ain El Remmeneh
Greenfield College (girls only)	2016	Bir Hassan
Eastwood International School	2016	Mansourieh
Brummana High School	2016	Brummana
Eastwood College	2018	Kafarshima
Makassed Houssam Eddine Hariri High School	2018	Saida
LWIS International School	2019	Keserwan
LWIS-CiS City International School	2019	Beirut

## APPENDIX C

### STRUCTURAL/CULTURAL FINDINGS USING SOCIAL SYSTEMS THEORY

IB Structural Component	IB Expectations (pedagogies & values)	Structural/Cultural Incongruences (from literature)	Structural/Cultural Incongruences (Lebanese context)
IB Mission Statement	Social responsibility International mindedness (Bergeron & Dean, 2013; Hill, 2006)	Difficulty of teaching for international thinking in schools with largely local populations (Halicioglu, 2008; Hayden & Wong, 1997)	Understanding of mission statement and implicit values
IB Learner Profile	<p>Students should be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Thinkers</li> <li>Open minded</li> <li>Risk takers</li> <li>Caring</li> <li>Balanced</li> <li>Reflective</li> <li>Knowledgeable</li> <li>Principled</li> <li>Communicators</li> </ul> <p>(IB, 2015a)</p> <p>Teachers expected to espouse and model these values through their practice and behavior (IB, 2014b)</p>	<p>Dilution of cultural values for Western ones (Kanan &amp; Baker, 2006; Paris, 2003)</p> <p>Replacing traditional student/teacher relationships in cultures with different norms (Drake, 2004)</p>	<p>Alignment with cultural values</p> <p>Awareness of or familiarity with LP.</p> <p>Discussing different narratives of modern Lebanese history (van Ommering, 2015)</p>

IB Approaches to Teaching	<p>Based on inquiry Focused on conceptual understanding Developed in local and global contexts Focused on effective teamwork and collaboration Differentiated to meet the needs of all learners Informed by assessment (formative and summative). (IB, 2015a, p. 66)</p> <p>Teacher as a facilitator Encourages reflection Collaborative Encourages creative and critical thinking (Bergeron &amp; Dean, 2013; Lepine, 2006)</p> <p>Core components: CAS, TOK, EE (Austin, 2006)</p>	<p>Juggling competing pedagogies of DP with local ministry of education requirements and exams (Doherty &amp; Shield, 2012)</p> <p>Difficulties of transitioning to Western pedagogies (Gan, 2009)</p> <p>Perception of increased workload in the DP (Barnett, 2013; Halicioglu, 2008; Lepine, 2006)</p> <p>Loss of control in the classroom (Austin, 2006)</p> <p>Difficulty of integrating local content (Poonosamy, 2016; Resnik, 2016)</p> <p>Focusing on Western knowledge systems (Hughes, 2009)</p>	<p>Pedagogies tend to be teacher focused with no scope for critical thought (Akar, 2007; Hilal, 2018; van Ommering, 2015)</p> <p>Difficulty in incorporating local content (Azzi, 2018)</p>
DP Assessment	<p>Academic rigor Individual Criteria based Variety of assessment Promote critical thinking (Hayden, 2006; IB, 2018b)</p>	<p>Juggling assessment styles of DP with local ministry of education requirements (Halicioglu, 2008; Lineham, 2013; Resnik, 2016)</p> <p>Difficulties of transitioning to Western assessment styles (Drake, 2004; Gan, 2009)</p> <p>Cultural variations in interpreting criteria (Peterson, 1983)</p>	<p>LB exams reward rote learning and teacher centric teaching (Hilal, 2018; Jbara, 2008; Kraidy &amp; Fares, 1984)</p>

## APPENDIX D

### FOCUS GROUP QUESTIONS

Focus group introduction:

Hello and thank you for agreeing to participate in this focus group. My name is Sara and I am a student completing a Master's course in Educational Administration at AUB. This focus group is part of my research study for my thesis.

My study is about the extent to which it is easy or difficult to implement the DP in the Lebanese context. What I'm trying to do in this focus group is understand your experiences in implementing the program, what you perceive to be the IB's expectations of teachers and what challenges you face in implementing the program. I'm especially interested in challenges that you feel are specific to the Lebanese context and why you think they exist.

As you know from the consent form, this aim of the focus groups is to collect, aggregate and look for patterns in teachers' answers to uncover experiences that teachers in Lebanon share. I will also be audio recording our discussion for reference and so that I can transcribe it later. Measures to ensure anonymity are explained in more detail in the consent form, however if you have any questions or would like to excuse yourself from participating at any time that is totally fine; please go ahead. My contact details are on the consent form so you can also get in touch with me after we are done or contact my thesis advisor or AUB's IRB. This discussion will take no longer than one hour.

The usefulness of the focus group lies in the group discussion and how each of your comments can lead to new ideas and thoughts from other members and in creating a space of shared understanding that you can all shape. I will ask some questions and prompt you when necessary, but this is a discussion so please do talk to one another, ask and answer each other's questions and build on each other's ideas. It's definitely helpful for everyone to contribute, but also to make space for others to contribute. All information discussed should be kept confidential and should not be disclosed to anyone.

Since we are audio recording it would be very helpful if only one person spoke at a time and if everyone put their phones on silent.

Please know that there are no right or wrong answers and different points of view are both natural and interesting! I do ask however, that all points of view are respected. Are there any questions before I start?

Let's begin.

Research Questions 1 & 2:

I'd like to start by asking about what you understand to be the practices and core values of the DP as reflected in the IB's mission statement, the Learner Profile, its pedagogical approaches, professional norms and DP assessment requirements.

I would also like to ask about, in terms of these, what, if any, challenges you face in meeting the IB's expectations in terms of its pedagogical approaches, its requirements when it comes to values-based teaching and preparing students for the DP assessments? Do you face any challenges in meeting these expectations and, if so, are any of these specific to teaching in Lebanon? Why?

1- We will take this step by step, so let's start with the mission statement.

- Based on the IB's mission statement, what do you feel are the core values and practices that the IB expects from its teachers.
- What challenges do you face in transmitting /manifesting these values the Lebanese cultural context? Why?

Probe regarding international-mindedness:

- What, in your opinion, does the IB mean by international-mindedness?
- How, in your opinion, are DP teachers expected to teach international-mindedness?

Probes regarding challenges at teaching international-mindedness:

- How easy or difficult is it to incorporate content, or experiential learning practices aimed at teaching international-mindedness? Why?
- Do you feel able to incorporate enough international content to teach international-mindedness? Why or why not?

Probe on Teaching Social responsibility:

- Using what methods, in your opinion, are DP teachers expected to teach students to be open-minded and give them a sense of social responsibility? What, if any, challenges do you face?

Probes regarding challenges on teaching Social responsibility:

- How easy or difficult is it for you and your students to handle debates in class that involve different points of view?
- To what extent do you feel students are tolerant of other cultures or ways of thinking?
- What issues are easy to get students to care about and what issues are more difficult?
- How easy or difficult is it to model the values set forward in the mission statement?

Probes for adopting a holistic approach:

- Through what practices do you think DP teachers are expected to adopt a holistic approach to dealing with students?
- What kind of relationship do you feel that IB expects you to have with students and what role are you expected to play in the classroom?

Probes regarding challenges in adopting a holistic approach:

- Do you feel you had to change the type of relationship you normally had with students in order to meet the DP's expectations of teachers? If so, how?

Probe regarding the meaning of academical rigor:

- Why do you think the IB describes itself as academically rigorous?

Probes regarding challenges at conveying and implementing academic rigor:

- How do you feel teachers and students react to the DP's style of academic rigor?

2- Let's move on to the Learner Profile.

- In your opinion, how are DP teachers expected to incorporate the values of the Learner Profile into their teaching and professional behavior?

- What are the challenges faced to incorporate the values of the Learner Profile into their teaching and professional behavior?

Possible probes on Learner Profile:

- How are DP teachers expected to use content/modeling/experiential learning in order to teach the values of the Learner Profile
- How are teachers expected to model the Learner Profile in their own professional behavior?
- How can teachers' professional and collegial relationships reflect the values of the Learner Profile?

Probes regarding challenges on Learner Profile:

- How easy or difficult is it for you to instill the values of the Learner Profile in your students? Why?
  - What attempts do you make to preserve local values and knowledge while teaching in the DP?
  - How easy or difficult is it for teachers to have open, collaborative relationships with their colleagues in this context?

3- I'd like to move on to teaching practices please.

- What words would you use to describe the IB's expectations of DP teachers in terms of teaching styles, practices and objectives?
- What are the challenges you face in enacting these practices?

Possible probes teaching practices:

- What do you think the IB means when it talks about inquiry-based learning and what is that meant to look like in class?
- What does the IB mean by learning that is connected to the real world? What would that look like in your particular course?
- What is meant by critical thinking? How are DP teachers supposed to teach critical thinking through their courses?
- How do you feel DP teachers are expected to pursue their own professional learning?

Probes about challenges enacting the DP teaching practices?

- How confident did you feel about adopting the IB's teaching approaches when you first began teaching in the program? Can you give specific examples?

4- I'd like to move on to assessment style and criteria.

- How would you describe the DP assessments and what do you feel are the objectives of this style of assessment? If it helps, you can also use examples of the criteria and assessments in your specific subjects.
- What are the challenges you faced in implementing this style of assessment?

Possible probes on implementing the DP assessment approach:

- What do you feel is the IB's intention in using a variety of different assessments in the DP and how are you as teachers expected to prepare your students for them?
- Why do you think the IB does not accommodate for group grading in the DP?
- In what ways do you think the DP assessment and criteria are meant to encourage teachers to teach critical thinking and independent learning?

Probes about challenges faced while implementing the DP assessment approach:

- How confident did you and your students feel when working with the different parts or strands of the DP criteria in your course? Which ones are easy to hard? Why do you think that is?
- How confident do you feel you or your students were in understanding and working towards the DP assessments when you/they first started in the program? Why do you feel that is?

### Research Question 3

From your perspective and based on your own experiences how congruent are the core values and professional norms of the DP compared to those commonly used in the Lebanese context?

#### Possible probes:

- To what extent do you feel the values in the Learner Profile are similar or different to those in the Lebanese context? Can you give examples?
- To what extent do you feel you are able to integrate local content into the DP curriculum requirements? Why?
  - How easy or difficult is it to preserve local values and knowledge while teaching in the DP?
  - Do you feel certain cultures (local vs internationalism, vs western) receive more attention than others? Which and why?
  - How easy or difficult is it for you to incorporate local content that is subject to accepting the views of others? Why?
  - How easy or difficult is it to work in ideas of tolerance and open-mindedness into your teaching?
- What do you perceive to be the most common obstacles faced by students who enter the DP?
  - Do any of your students or teachers do both the LB and DP assessments or move simultaneously between the two programs? If so, how easy or difficult is this for them/you?
  - Can you describe students' adoption of the CAS requirement in your school? What makes them react the way they do?
  - If you teach the TOK course, did this involve any issues for you or your students in terms of dealing certain types of questions? Why do you think that is?
- How similar or different are the teaching styles expected from the IB from those most commonly used in the Lebanese context?
  - If you had to change the way you deal with students, what changes did you have to make and why?
  - To what extent do you feel that that the implementation of the DP fulfils the IB's values of economic and academic inclusivity in this context?

#### Focus group conclusion:

Thank you for participating in this discussion. Do you feel that there are any points that we may have missed or that you would like to add detail to?

Again, thank you for your participation and please feel free to contact me with any comments or additions.



## APPENDIX E

### PHASES OF THEMATIC ANALYSIS

Phase	Description of the process
1. Familiarizing yourself with your data:	Transcribing data (if necessary), reading and re-reading the data, noting down initial ideas.
2. Generating initial codes:	Coding interesting features of the data in a systematic fashion across the entire data set, collating data relevant to each code.
3. Searching for themes:	Collating codes into potential themes, gathering all data relevant to each potential theme.
4. Reviewing themes:	Checking if the themes work in relation to the coded extracts (Level 1) and the entire data set (Level 2), generating a thematic 'map' of the analysis.
5. Defining and naming themes:	Ongoing analysis to refine the specifics of each theme, and the overall story the analysis tells, generating clear definitions and names for each theme.
6. Producing the report:	The final opportunity for analysis. Selection of vivid, compelling extract examples, final analysis of selected extracts, relating back of the analysis to the research question and literature, producing a scholarly report of the analysis.

Process	No.	Criteria
Transcription	1	The data have been transcribed to an appropriate level of detail, and the transcripts have been checked against the tapes for 'accuracy'.
Coding	2	Each data item has been given equal attention in the coding process.
	3	Themes have not been generated from a few vivid examples (an anecdotal approach), but instead the coding process has been thorough, inclusive and comprehensive.
	4	All relevant extracts for all each theme have been collated.
	5	Themes have been checked against each other and back to the original data set.
	6	Themes are internally coherent, consistent, and distinctive.
Analysis	7	Data have been analysed – interpreted, made sense of – rather than just paraphrased or described.
	8	Analysis and data match each other – the extracts illustrate the analytic claims.
	9	Analysis tells a convincing and well-organized story about the data and topic.
	10	A good balance between analytic narrative and illustrative extracts is provided.
Overall	11	Enough time has been allocated to complete all phases of the analysis adequately, without rushing a phase or giving it a once-over-lightly.
Written report	12	The assumptions about, and specific approach to, thematic analysis are clearly explicated.
	13	There is a good fit between what you claim you do, and what you show you have done – ie, described method and reported analysis are consistent.
	14	The language and concepts used in the report are consistent with the epistemological position of the analysis.
	15	The researcher is positioned as <i>active</i> in the research process; themes do not just 'emerge'.

(Clarke & Braun, 2006, p. 96)

# APPENDIX F

## EXCEL SHEET CODES

Group	Themes	Codes
FG 1	I just want to add something. I did the workshop in SMEC at AUB, the working was about comparing the lebanese curriculum and some aspects of the IB, so it's there that they need to focus on the practical skills, but this aspect of the lebanese curriculum is not actually implemented inside the classroom, but what they're trying to do is that the way the question is delivered to students, it starts with an action verb. Now, these action verbs, the way they are taught, in biology for example, when I ask a student to organize or to interpret or to come up with a conclusion, there's a certain thing that this student shouldn't answer, anything outside the question is considered is not correct. So the person who was delivering the workshop actually said, "No the action verb is a route for critical thinking." And the action verbs now are taught in a way to trigger the students into thinking rather than making the student worry about his answers. [inaudible] this. So she came up with this discussion from -, she was a teacher that actually corrects official exams in the Lebanese curriculum. So she said that it's frustrating how these teachers, when they are correcting the official exams, they start negotiating about these answers.	Teachers note the differences between the written and taught curriculum in the LP
FG 1	I mean no matter how many aspects you try to put into the process. We do teach for a test. especially when you look at, for example, the mark scheme of certain subjects. You have to be aware that their answers have to be like that. Even if their answers are correct, they might not be counted because they're not in the format or what the IB requires. So sometimes I think it's unfair. Sometimes I know when I correct things that their answer is correct but they're using a term-- they used a different terminology from what's in the mark scheme. So when it comes to the IB in the assessment, wouldn't they follow that mark scheme?	Perceived conflicts between the IB philosophy and DP framework create challenges for teachers and students
FG 1	I mean you bringing up international-mindedness is a key point. And so the IB talks about the importance of being international-minded. What does that mean and how do you put that into practice? Are you able to? How easy or difficult is it?	
FG 1	I mean, I can say that this is different from one country to another. For example, in Qatar, the government gives everyone a right to public education. So we do not worry about that. So if you want to go IB, you can go IB. Yeah. Exactly. So it might be different from one country to another, but the selection, the process of selection, would be different. If someone has money, they would do--	There is a recognition that the DP is, because of finances and/or academics, remains an exclusive or elitist program
FG 1	I mean, I remember as I said in 2000 when I was working in the committee, in the end, you just kind of sat there thinking this is hopeless because we thought we'd made some kind of progress and then this guy from the back of beyond in the north of bekaa came and started arguing about the name of the character in the story. I just thought, okay. It was incredible.	Teachers perceive incongruities between the value system of the IB/DP and that of the Lebanese context
FG 1	I think also you know that in University counseling we've been watching-- we have class and we've been watching videos about what it means to be an international student in a place like the United States or Canada. And so here in Lebanon there is Lebanese, they identify as Lebanese, but when you see these videos of people in Canada, the US, or international - they're Indian, they're coming from India, or they're coming from Africa, or they're coming from Asia and though... our students will then be grouped into this new identity as an international student there that they don't necessarily-- I think the cultural context of what that means to identify as an international student somewhere else and this new group is something that's maybe challenging for them to understand because of how they've grown up and how they see people outside of the Lebanese culture.	Difficulty effectively teaching the values of IM and LP because of the socio-economic and cultural divisions in Lebanese society and the homogeneous nature of the

The above is an image of the data with each cell color coded according to a theme and given a particular identifying code within that theme.

Expectations of the IB (RQ 1)	Themes	Codes
The IB Expects Teachers to Embrace the Values of the Learner Profile and Incorporate it into Their Teaching		Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior
		Teachers use opportunities within their own subject areas to nurture the values of the Learner Profile in their students
The IB Expects Teachers to Incorporate International Mindedness into Their Teaching		Teachers' understandings of international mindedness
		How teachers promote international mindedness in their subject areas
		Teachers naming IM as an IB expectation
		Teachers discuss the value of exposure and diversity in the development of international mindedness
Teachers are Expected to Use the Approaches to Teaching (ATT) Outlined by the IB to Shape Their Teaching Styles		Teachers foster teamwork and collaboration between students, between teachers and in student/teacher interactions
		Teachers link learning to local & global contexts & issues
		Teaching is differentiated to cater for each student
		Teachers use broad, organizing concepts (often provided by the DP) to frame learning of knowledge and skills
		Teachers use formative assessment as a tool to enhance and support learning, differentiation and to collect data on student progress and needs while preparing students for the DP summative assessments
		Teachers teach students holistically by also catering to student physical and emotional well-being (this includes supporting CAS & TOK which are seen by the IB as important supplementary modules to academic learning)
		Teachers create learning experiences using inquiry-based learning strategies such as experiential learning, using real-world connections, encouraging independent learning and acting as facilitators rather than instructors
Teachers expected to pursue PD and remaining open to their own continuous learning to be an integral and rewarding part of their role		Teachers expected to pursue PD and remaining open to their own continuous learning to be an integral and rewarding part of their role
		Teachers report feeling that they have grown and developed through participating in the DP (in appreciation)

This is the legend for research question 1. It identifies the color that matches each theme as well as the codes that come under each one.

A	B	C	D	E
G 1	But it has to be a two-way thing. You don't have to expect that from them but not model it (the Learner Profile), that you have to model it in front of them. For example, negotiate. Okay, if this is a very stressful week, can you push the exam later? And then they probably have suggestions.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior		
4				
G 1	I think that there is a requirement for DP teachers to chart their own course to some extent. They have a responsibility to demonstrate to their students that there are alternatives out there, that you have a responsibility to follow your own path.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior		
5				
G 1	Also, in Visual Arts we have these TOK questions that also relate to it because it's looking at issues of ethics. So we have activities where we read articles or look at videos and then discuss, you know, are the—what does it mean to act ethically, you know, in the field of the visual arts? What are the lines that people, you know, sort of, sort of an analysis of what is ethical and unethical behavior and what are the lines that different people cross and trying to understand some different perspectives. So to me, that relates to the mission statement too. It's about being a responsible citizen. What are you promoting? What kind of vision of others are you promoting? And there's a lot of issues about that in the visual arts right now especially who has the right to represent other people. And it's constantly in the news. I mean, just recently as far as restaurants you know, Chinese food, right? So I mean, it's something that we talk about a lot.	Teachers use opportunities within their own subject areas to nurture the values of the Learner Profile in their students		
6				
G 1	Well, just two weeks ago we had this TOK discussion about complex numbers and how mathematicians in the 1500s used to do math duels and why don't we see this now? I mean, we discussed more about the importance of collaboration and collaborative work rather than—in previous years they—they only used to hide their solutions to win the math duel or not. So we focus a lot on collaboration or how things have changed. So I think that also falls under international mindedness somehow.	Teachers use opportunities within their own subject areas to nurture the values of the Learner Profile in their students		
7				
310	Yes, I find it, because I teach French, and in the course, we have to tackle a lot of global issues also like racism and discrimination. So we openly talk about discrimination or preconceived ideas about a culture. On the contrary, we tell them, what are the French known for? What are the Lebanese known for? What is one adjective you can use to label them? And then we correct. And then, during the course, we say, "Should we do this or not?" So it's an issue that also we tackle in the French language, because we have a lot of themes to work on. So it's part of our curriculum. And this makes us teachers, I think, makes me at least, more open-minded. Because I have to go to find the information and try to lead them where I want by being open-minded and tolerant about other cultures and races.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior		
8				
310	When we talk about—I teach literature, and when we talk about different issues, for example, women's rights, gay rights, it's very controversial, but then you hear what the students think. And of course, you don't attack, even if you disagree. But you show them in your not agreeing, you have a right to your idea, however maybe we can think of something else. Maybe you can think of a different perspective.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior		
<div> <div>LP in Teaching</div> <div>IM in Teaching</div> <div>Approaches to Teaching</div> <div>Professional Development</div> <div>Legend RQ 2</div> <div>Challenges IM LP</div> <div>Rigor of Program (T)</div> <div>Rigor of Program (S)</div> </div>				

This is an example of a theme that was sorted and filtered using Excel's sort functions and copy/pasted to a new worksheet within the workbook. This theme can be further filtered to isolate each particular code within it.

Group	Point	Code	-T
FG 1	we should really hire teachers, to whom those values are just built in, like this is who they are, and they just be themselves in the classroom. They have already adopted these values. This is who they are. And as they're doing their job, the students will be able to see that it's very natural to be mindful of others. It's very natural to be mindful of your environment. So it goes back to the character of the teacher. You can't get someone who's close-minded who has lived all of his or her life in a super closed environment and then tell them, "Okay. Come. You have to teach international mindedness and you have to teach how to become open-minded, balanced, principled, etc. So if you're not all of this, you can't be an IB teacher.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior	
FG 1	But the goal is to have that and display to the students so that they're learning from it.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior	
FG 1	But it has to be a two-way thing. You don't have to expect that from them but not model it (the Learner Profile), that you have to model it in front of them. For example, negotiate. Okay, if this is a very stressful week, can you push the exam later? And then they probably have suggestions.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior	
FG 1	I think that there is a requirement for DP teachers to chart their own course to some extent. They have a responsibility to demonstrate to their students that there are alternatives out there, that you have a responsibility to follow your own path.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior	
FG 10	Yes, I find it, because I teach French, and in the course, we have to tackle a lot of global issues also like racism and discrimination. So we openly talk about discrimination or preconceived ideas about a culture. On the contrary, we tell them, what are the French known for? What are the Lebanese known for? What is one adjective you can use to label them? And then we correct. And then, during the course, we say, "Should we do this or not?" So it's an issue that also we tackle in the French language, because we have a lot of themes to work on. So it's part of our curriculum. And this makes us teachers, I think, makes me at least, more open-minded. Because I have to go to find the information and try to lead them where I want by being open-minded and tolerant about other cultures and races.	Teachers discuss the Learner Profile and the expectation that they should be espousing and modeling values of the Learner Profile through their own practice and behavior	
FG 10	When we talk about—I teach literature, and when we talk about different issues, for example, women's rights, gay rights, it's very controversial, but then you hear what the students think. And	Teachers discuss the Learner	
<div> <div>LP in Teaching</div> <div>IM in Teaching</div> <div>Approaches to Teaching</div> <div>Professional Development</div> <div>Legend RQ 2</div> <div>Challenges IM LP</div> <div>Rigor of Program (T)</div> <div>Rigor of Program (S)</div> </div>			

Each iteration and revision was saved and preserved so that a chain of evidence could be maintained and there would be transparency around the process of allocating codes and themes to the data.

## REFERENCES

- Akar, B. (2007). Citizenship education in Lebanon: An introduction into students' concepts and learning experiences. *Educate*, 7, 2-18.
- Akar, B., & Albrecht, M. (2017). Influences of nationalism on education: Revealing a dark side in Lebanon. *Nations and Nationalism*, 23(3), 547 - 570. DOI: 10.1111/nana.12316
- Austin, S. (2006). The core components. In T. Pound (Ed.), *The International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme: An introduction for teachers and managers* (pp. 147 - 170). New York: Routledge.
- Azzi, I. (2018). Reading the “international” through postcolonial theory: A case study of the adoption of the International Baccalaureate at a school in Lebanon. *The International Education Journal: Comparative Perspectives*, 17(1), 51 - 65.
- Bagnall, N. (1997). The International Baccalaureate in Australia. *Critical Studies in Education*, 38(1), 129-143. DOI: 10.1080/17508489709556294
- Balzani, M. (2010). Anthropology and the International Baccalaureate: History, practice and future challenges. *Anthropology in Action*, 17(2 - 3), 60 - 71. DOI:10.3167/aia.2010.170206
- Barnett, E. (2013). *Implementation of the Diploma Programme in Ecuador's state schools*. Retrieved from [http://www.ibo.org/contentassets/d1c0accb5b804676ae9e782b78c8bc1c/implementationofpinecuadorstateschools\\_finalreport.pdf](http://www.ibo.org/contentassets/d1c0accb5b804676ae9e782b78c8bc1c/implementationofpinecuadorstateschools_finalreport.pdf)
- Baytiyeh, H. (2017). Has the educational system in Lebanon contributed to the growing sectarian divisions? *Education and Urban Society*, 49(5), 546 – 559. DOI: 10.1177/0013124516645163

- Belal, S. (2017). Participating in the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme: Developing international mindedness and engagement with local communities. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 16(1), 18 - 35. DOI: 10.1177/1475240917702789
- Bergeron, L., & Dean, M. (2013). The IB teacher professional: Identifying, measuring and characterizing pedagogical attributes, perspectives, and beliefs. Retrieved from: [https://www.ibo.org/globalassets/publications/ib-research/continuum/theibteacherprofessional\\_final\\_march6.pdf](https://www.ibo.org/globalassets/publications/ib-research/continuum/theibteacherprofessional_final_march6.pdf)
- BouJaoude, S., Dagher, Z.R., & Refai, S. (2017). The portrayal of nature of science in Lebanese ninth grade science textbooks. In C.V. McDonald & F. Abd-El-Khalick (Eds.), *Representations of nature of Science in School Science Textbooks* (pp. 79 – 97). New York: Routledge.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Bree, R., & Gallagher, G. (2016). Using Microsoft Excel to code and thematically analyse qualitative data: A simple, cost-effective approach. *All Ireland Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 8(2), 2811-28114.
- Bunnell, T. (2008). The global growth of the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme over the first 40 years: A critical assessment. *Comparative Education*, 44(4), 409 - 424.
- Bunnell, T. (2009). The International Baccalaureate in the USA and the emerging ‘culture war’. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 30(1), 61 - 72. DOI: 10.1080/01596300802643090

- Bunnell, T. (2011). The International Baccalaureate and ‘growth scepticism’: A ‘social limits’ framework. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 21(2), 161-176. DOI: 10.1080/09620214.2011.575103
- Bunnell, T. (2015). The rise and decline of the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme in the UK. *Oxford Review of Education*, 41(3), 387 - 403. DOI: 10.1080/03054985.2015.1035703
- Bunnell, T. (2016). The dearth of International Baccalaureate schools across Africa. *Africa Education Review*, 13(2), 181-195. DOI: 10.1080/18146627.2016.1224120
- CERD. (2017). *General education for the academic year 2016 – 2017*. Retrieved from <https://www.crdp.org/files/201712220733131.pdf>
- CERD. (2018). *PISA 2015 national report: Program for international student assessment*. Retrieved from [https://www.crdp.org/pdf/uploads/PISA\\_Report\\_18-1.pdf](https://www.crdp.org/pdf/uploads/PISA_Report_18-1.pdf)
- Castleberry, A., & Nolen, A. (2018). Thematic analysis of qualitative research data: Is it as easy as it sounds? *Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning*, 10(6), 807-815. DOI:10.1016/j.cptl.2018.03.019
- Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. *The Journal of Positive Psychology*, 12(3), 297-298. DOI:10.1080/17439760.2016.1262613
- Cook, R. (2017). *The impact of the implementation of the International Baccalaureate Diploma Program on High School Teachers*. Retrieved from ProQuest LLC.
- Daher, M. (2012). On the impossibility of teaching history in Lebanon: Notes on a textbook controversy. In S. Alayan, A. Rohde & S. Dhouib (Eds.), *The Politics of Education Reform in the Middle East: Self and Other in Textbooks and Curricula* (pp 97 - 111). New York: Berghahn Books.

- Daou, R., Mikhael, M. (2018). *The educational landscape in Lebanon 2016 – 2017*. Retrieved from <http://blog.blominvestbank.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/The-Education-Landscape-in-Lebanon-2016-2017.pdf>
- Doherty, C. (2009). The appeal of the International Baccalaureate in Australia's educational market: A curriculum of choice for mobile futures. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 30(1), 73 - 89. DOI: 10.1080/01596300802643108
- Doherty, C., Mu, L., & Shield, P. (2009). Planning mobile futures: The border artistry of International Baccalaureate Diploma choosers. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 30(6), 757 - 771.
- Doherty, C., & Shield, P. (2012). Teachers' work in curricular markets: Conditions of designs and relations between the International Baccalaureate Diploma and the local curriculum. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 42(3), 414 - 441. DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-873X.2012.00596.x
- Drake, B. (2004). International education and IB programmes. Worldwide expansion and potential cultural dissonance. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 3(2), 189–205. DOI: 10.1177/14752409044387
- Dulfer, N. (2019). Differentiation in the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 18(2), 142 – 168. DOI: 10.1177/1475240919865654
- El-Mehtar, N., & Alameh, S. (2017). An analysis of the representation of nature of science in a chemistry textbook in the International Baccalaureate Diploma Program. In C.V. McDonald & F. Abd-El-Khalick (Eds.), *Representations of nature of Science in School Science Textbooks* (pp. 79 – 97). New York: Routledge.

- Fadel, R. (2018, September 21). Third of Lebanese live in poverty, experts say. *An-Nahar*. Retrieved from [www.en.annahar.com/article/865485-third-of-lebanese-live-in-poverty-experts-say](http://www.en.annahar.com/article/865485-third-of-lebanese-live-in-poverty-experts-say)
- Frayha, N. (2003). Education and social cohesion in Lebanon. *Prospects* (33)1, 77-88.
- Frayha, N. M. (2012). Educational reform in the Arab world: Directives, mechanisms and challenges in Lebanon, Syria and Oman. In S. Alayan, A. Rohde & S. Dhouib (Eds.), *The Politics of Education Reform in the Middle East: Self and Other in Textbooks and Curricula* (pp 15 - 39). New York: Berghahn Books.
- Fitzgerald, S. (2015). Perceptions of the International Baccalaureate (IB) in Ontario universities. *Canadian Journal of education*, 38(3), 1 - 34.
- Gan, A. (2009). Chinese students' adjustment to the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme: Experiences of an Australian high school. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 8(3). 283 - 304. DOI: 10.1177/1475240909345815
- Gardner-McTaggart, A. (2014). International elite, or global citizens? Equity, distinction and power: The International Baccalaureate and the rise of the South. *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, 14(1), 1 - 29. DOI: 10.1080/14767724.2014.959475
- Getzels, J., & Guba, E. (1957). Social behavior and the administrative process. *The School Review*, 65(4), 423-441. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1083752>
- Getzels, J.W., Lipham, J.M., & Campbell, R.F. (1968). *Educational administration as a social process*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Hahn, A.M. (2003). The intersection of language, power and international education: A critical discourse analysis of the International Baccalaureate . Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations Publishing. (3091253)

- Halicioglu, M. (2008). The IB diploma programme in national schools: The case of Turkey. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 7(2), 164 - 183. DOI: 10.1177/1475240908091303
- Hashwe, S.M. (2016). *Exploration of the design process and content of grade one Lebanese official Arabic curriculum*. Retrieved from AUB Libraries.
- Hayden, M. (2006). The International Baccalaureate (IB) and international education. In T. Pound (Ed.), *The International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme: An introduction for teachers and managers* (pp. 25 - 44). New York: Routledge.
- Hayden, M.C., & Wong, C.S.D. (1997). The International Baccalaureate: International education and cultural preservation. *Educational studies*, 23(3), 349 - 361.
- Hilal, Y. Y. (2018). Do Programmes Delineating Critical Thinking as a Learning Outcome Facilitate its Teaching? International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme and Lebanese Baccalaureate Programme. *Topoi*, 37, 201 - 217. DOI: 10.1007/s11245-016-9409-9
- Hill, I. (2006). Do International Baccalaureate programs internationalise or globalise? *International Education Journal*, 7(1), 98–108. Retrieved from <https://ehlt.flinders.edu.au/education/iej/articles/v7n1/hill/paper.pdf>
- Hill, I., & Saxton, S. (2014). The International Baccalaureate (IB) programme: An international gateway to higher education and beyond. *Higher Learning Research Communications*, 4(3), 42-52. DOI: 10.18870/hlrc.v4i3.123
- Hoy, W., & Miskel, C. (2011). *Educational administration: Theory, research and practice* (9<sup>th</sup> ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Hughes, C. (2009). International education and the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme A view from the perspective of postcolonial thought. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 8(2), 123 - 141. DOI: 10.1177/1475240909105201

- International Baccalaureate. (n.d.-a). *Alex Peterson*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/about-the-ib/governance-and-leadership/director-general/past-directors-general/alec-peterson/>
- International Baccalaureate. (n.d.-b). *Facts & Figures*. Retrieved from <http://www.ibo.org/about-the-ib/facts-and-figures/>
- International Baccalaureate. (n.d.-c). *Find an IB World School*. Retrieved from <https://ibo.org/programmes/find-an-ib-school/>
- International Baccalaureate. (n.d.-e). *Diploma Programme*. Retrieved from <https://ibo.org/programmes/diploma-programme/>
- International Baccalaureate. (n.d.-f). *The IB Learner Profile*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/benefits/learner-profile/>
- International Baccalaureate. (n.d.-g). *Language A: Language and literature (SL/HL)*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/programmes/diploma-programme/curriculum/language-and-literature/language-a-language-and-literature-slhl/>
- International Baccalaureate. (n.d.-h). *Workshops*. Retrieved from <https://resources.ibo.org/search/?search=workshops&lang=en&programmes=dp>
- International Baccalaureate. (2014a). *Language Policy [PDF document]*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/globalassets/ib-language-policy-en.pdf>
- International Baccalaureate. (2014b). *Programme Standards and Practices [PDF document]*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/globalassets/publications/become-an-ib-school/programme-standards-and-practices-en.pdf>
- International Baccalaureate. (2015a). *Diploma programme: From principles into practice [PDF document]*. Retrieved from [https://resources.ibo.org/dp/resource/11162-33702/data/d\\_0\\_dpyyy\\_mon\\_1504\\_1\\_e.pdf](https://resources.ibo.org/dp/resource/11162-33702/data/d_0_dpyyy_mon_1504_1_e.pdf)

- International Baccalaureate. (2015b). *What you need to know about the IB and the Diploma Programme [PDF document]*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/globalassets/digital-toolkit/presentations/1506-presentation-dp-en.pdf>
- International Baccalaureate. (2016). *Guide to school authorization: Diploma Programme [PDF document]*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/globalassets/publications/become-an-ib-school/dp-guide-school-authorization-en.pdf>
- International Baccalaureate. (2017). *The IB: an historical perspective [Powerpoint slides]*. Retrieved from <http://www.ibo.org/globalassets/digital-toolkit/presentations/1711-presentation-history-of-the-ib-en.pdf>
- International Baccalaureate. (2018a). *IB World Schools Yearbook 2018*. Retrieved from <https://cloud.3dissue.com/2389/3124/6925/IB2018/index.html#>
- International Baccalaureate. (2018b). *Assessment principles and practices - Quality assessments in a digital age [PDF document]*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibo.org/contentassets/1cdf850e366447e99b5a862aab622883/assessment-principles-and-practices-2018-en.pdf>
- Jabbour, K. K. (2014). Civic education in Lebanon. *Bulgarian Journal of Science and Education Policy*, 8(2), 392-407. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1659977530?accountid=8555>
- Jbara, A. M. (2008). Comparative study between Lebanese Baccalaureate and International Baccalaureate. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). NDU, Lebanon.
- Karami-Akkary, R., & Rizk, N. (2011). *A profile of school reform in the Arab world: Characteristics and challenges (technical report 2) [PDF document]*. Retrieved from

<https://tamamproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/TAMAM-Technical-Report-2.pdf>

Karami-Akkary, R. (2014). Facing the challenges of educational reform in the Arab world.

*Journal of Educational Change*, 15, 179 – 202. DOI: 10.1007/s10833-013-9225-6

Kanan, H., & Baker, A.M. (2006). Influence of international schools on the perception of local students' individual and collective identities, career aspirations and choice of

university. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 5(3), 251–268. DOI:

10.1177/1475240906069448

Kawulich, Barbara. (2012). Selecting a research approach: Paradigm, methodology and methods. Retrieved from

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/257944787\\_Selecting\\_a\\_research\\_approach\\_Paradigm\\_methodology\\_and\\_methods](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/257944787_Selecting_a_research_approach_Paradigm_methodology_and_methods)

Kidson, P., Odhiambo, G., & Wilson, R. (2018). The International Baccalaureate in Australia: Trends and issues. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*,

1 - 20. DOI: 10.1080/03057925.2017.1415751

Kitzinger, J. (1995). Qualitative research: Introducing focus groups. *BMJ Clinical Research* 311, 299 – 302. DOI: 10.1136/bmj.311.7000.299

Kraidy, M. & Fares, J. (1984). Taxonomical analysis of the Lebanese Baccalaureate physics and chemistry examinations. *European Journal of Science Education*, 6(1), 91 - 98.

DOI: 10.1080/0140528840060111

Lebanese Republic, House of Parliament. (1995). The Lebanese constitution [PDF file].

Retrieved from <https://www.wipo.int/edocs/lexdocs/laws/en/lb/lb018en.pdf>

Lepine, D. (2006). Individuals and societies. In T. Pound (Ed.), The International

Baccalaureate Diploma Programme: An introduction for teachers and managers (pp. 69 - 89).

- Lineham, R. (2013). Is the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme effective at delivering the International Baccalaureate mission statement? *Journal of Research in International Education*, 12(3), 259 –282. DOI: 10.1177/1475240913509765
- Maguire, M., & Delahunt, B. (2017). Doing a thematic analysis: A practical, step by step guide for learning and teaching scholars. *All Ireland Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 8(3), 3351 - 33514.
- Mukherjee, E. C. (2018). *Going global in Costa Rica: A mixed method study examining teachers of the International Baccalaureate Diploma Program and its growth in a developing country*. Retrieved from ProQuest LLC.
- Nowell, L.S., Norris, J.M., White, D.E., & Moules, N.J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16, 1 - 13.
- Paris, P. (2003). The International Baccalaureate: A case study on why students choose to do the IB. *International Education Journal*, 3(2), 232-243.
- Peel, R. (1988). Report of the Director General, Roger Peel, to the Council of Foundation. IB archives, Geneva.
- Peterson, A. D. C. (1972). The International Baccalaureate: An experiment in international education. London: George G. Harrap & Co. LTD.
- Peterson, A.D.C. (1983). Learning from experience in the International Baccalaureate program. *The Journal of General Education*, 35(1), 15-25. Retrieved from <https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.aub.edu.lb/stable/pdf/27796935.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3Aa873925612d823f60d794dc9d0848205>

- Poonoosamy, M. (2010). The International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme in post-colonial Mauritius: Reaffirming local identities and knowledges. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 30(1), 15 - 30. DOI: 10.1080/02188790903503569
- Poonoosamy, M. (2016). Aspirations and tensions in developing international mindedness: Case study of two students in an IB school in an Indian Ocean Island Nation. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 36(4), 583 - 598. DOI: 10.1080/02188791.2015.1064354
- Pound, T. (2006). The International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme (IBDP) and post-compulsory qualifications reform in England. In T. Pound (Ed.), *The International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme: An introduction for teachers and managers* (pp. 3 - 24). New York: Routledge.
- Resnik, J. (2009). Multicultural education - good for business but not for the state? The IB curriculum and global capitalism. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 57(3), 217-244. DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-8527.2009.00440.x
- Resnik, J. (2016). The development of the International Baccalaureate in Spanish speaking countries: A global comparative approach. *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, 14(2), 298-325. DOI: 10.1080/14767724.2015.1051951
- Robinson, J. (2012). Using focus groups. In S. Delamont (Ed.), *Handbook of Qualitative Research in Education* (Chapter 28). Retrieved from <https://www-elgaronline-com.ezproxy.aub.edu.lb/view/9781849805094.00037.xml>
- Shuayb, M. (2011). Developing historical understanding and skills in a content-based history curriculum in Lebanon: Case studies from four classes in Lebanon. In Shuayb, M., Akar, B., Makouk, N. and Hachicho, W. (Ed), *LAES Conference Learning and Teaching History: Lessons from and for Lebanon*, Lebanon: Beirut. Retrieved from

[http://www.laes.org/upload/editor\\_upload/file/PublishedBook/كتاب%20التاريخ/Developing%20historical-%20maha-bassel%20nistrine-%20walid.pdf](http://www.laes.org/upload/editor_upload/file/PublishedBook/كتاب%20التاريخ/Developing%20historical-%20maha-bassel%20nistrine-%20walid.pdf)

- Shuayb, M. (2019). Who shapes education reform policies in Lebanon? *A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 49(4), 548-564.  
DOI:10.1080/03057925.2018.1434409
- Spradley, J.P. (1979). *The ethnographic interview*. Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich College Publishers.
- Stake, R. E. (2006). *Multiple case study analysis*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Taylor, O. D. (2019). *Making meaning of IB approaches to teaching and learning: A phenomenological study of teachers' experiences implementing the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme*. Retrieved from ProQuest LLC.
- Terry, G., Hayfield, N., Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. In C. Willig & W. Rogers *The SAGE Handbook of qualitative research in psychology* (pp. 17-36). Retrieved from DOI: 10.4135/9781526405555.n2
- Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H., & Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing & Health Sciences*, 15(3), 398-405. DOI:10.1111/nhs.12048
- van Ommering, E. (2015). Formal history education in Lebanon: Crossroads of past conflicts and prospects for peace. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 41, 200 - 207.
- Van Oord, L. (2007). To westernize the nations? An analysis of the International Baccalaureate's philosophy of education. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 37(3), 375 - 390. DOI: 10.1080/03057640701546680

White, J. (2012). The International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme in US Catholic high schools: An answer to the church's call to global solidarity. *Journal of Catholic Education*, 15(2), 179 - 206. DOI: 10.15365/joce.1502052013

Whitehead, K. (Eds.). (2005). Advertising advantage: The International Baccalaureate, social justice and the marketisation of schooling. *Australian Association for Research in Education Annual conference*. Parramatta.